

and *Other Stories* (New York: Random House, 1996), 3–11; Anzaldúa, *Borderlands/La Frontera*, 134–35; Roediger, ed., *Black on White*, 318–49;

47. Gordon, *Bad Faith and Antiracist Racism*; Trudier Harris, *Exorcising Blackness: Historical and Literary Lynching and Burning Rituals* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1984); Robyn Wiegman, *American Anatomies: Theorizing Race and Gender* (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1995); Grace Elizabeth Hale, *Making Whiteness: The Culture of Segregation in the South, 1890–1940* (New York: Pantheon, 1998); Nell Irvin Painter, “Soul Murder and Slavery: Toward a Fully Loaded Cost Accounting,” in Linda K. Kerber, Alice Kessler Harris, and Kathryn Kish Sklar, eds., *U.S. History as Women’s History: New Feminist Essays* (Chapel Hill and London: University of North Carolina Press, 1995), 125–46.

48. Cheryl Harris, “Whiteness as Property,” 1710–91; Linda Lopez McAlister, “My Grandmother’s Passing,” and Linda M. Pierce, “Pinay White Woman,” both in Chris J. Cuomo and Kim Q. Hall, eds., *Whiteness*, 15–27 and 45–52; George Lipsitz, *The Possessive Investment in Whiteness: How White People Profit from Identity Politics* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1998), 1–23; Martha R. Mahoney, “Segregation, Whiteness, and Transformation,” *University of Pennsylvania Law Review* 143 (1995): 1659–84.

49. Matt Wray and Annalee Newitz, *White Trash: Race and Class in America* (New York and London: Routledge, 1997). The most telling discussion of “poor whites” remains Ralph Ellison, “An Extravagance of Laughter,” in *Going to the Territory*, 145–97. “Propertyless” whiteness is from Mike Hill’s “Can Whiteness Speak?” in *White Trash*, 160. See also John Hartigan’s provocative *Racial Situations: Class Predicaments of Whiteness in Detroit* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1999).

Chapter 2

1. Cheryl Harris, “Whiteness as Property,” *Harvard Law Review* 106 (June 1993), 1710–1791; Toni Morrison, *Playing in the Dark: Whiteness and the Literary Imagination* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1990); Philip Deloria, *Playing Indian* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1998); Cherrie Moraga, *The Last Generation* (Boston: South End Press, 1993); Thandeka, *Learning to Be White: Money, Race and God in America* (New York: Continuum, 1999); bell hooks, “Representations of Whiteness in the Black Imagination” in *Black Looks: Race and Representation* (Boston: South End Press, 1992), 165–79; W. E. B. Du Bois, “The Souls of White Folk,” *Independent* 69 (August 18, 1910), 339–42; Americo Paredes, *Uncle Remus con Chile* (Houston: Arte Publico Press, 1993); James Baldwin, *The Price of the Ticket* (New York: St. Martin’s Press, 1985); Ida B. Wells-Barnett, *On Lynchings: Southern Horrors, A Red Record and Mob Rule in New Orleans* (New York: Arno Press, 1969). Thanks to Ana Chavier, Joel Helfrich, Robert Baum, and Mary Murphy-Gnatz for help with this project.

2. For the texts on which soundbites were based, see Giuliani’s press releases and addresses on official websites of his administration, esp. his “Freedom of Expression Does Not Require Government Subsidization” as delivered

on WINS radio on September 26, 1999 (http://www.ci.nyc.ny.us/html/om/html/99b/me_990926.html) and his WINS address, “The First Amendment Does Not Require Public Subsidy,” on October 3, 1999 (<http://www.ci.nyc.ny.us/html/om/html/99b/mc991003.html>). For O’Connor, see “Taxpayers Pay for ‘Sick’ Art,” in *Artnewspaper.com* (October 27, 1999) at wysiwyg://116://artnewspaper.com/flash/Giulianiny.htm. Catholic League statements throughout are taken from its website, (http://catholicleague.com/99press_releases/pro399.htm). See also Peter Plagens, “Holy Elephant Dung!” *Newsweek* (October 4, 1999), 71, and Cathleen McGuigan, “A Shock Grows in Brooklyn,” *Newsweek* (October 11, 1999), 68–70.

3. Southampton City Art Gallery and Serpentine Gallery, London, *Chris Ofili* (London: Serpentine Gallery, 1998), Plate 15.

4. In the catalog cited in n. 3 above, see esp. Godfrey Worsdale, “Stereo Type,” 1–9, and Lisa G. Corrin, “Confounding the Stereotype,” 15–16. For Bowie, see www.thebee.com/bweb/iinfo118/htm. On “cruxification,” see Benjamin Ivry, “‘Modern Art Is a Load of Bullshit,’” *Salon* (online, February 10, 1999).

5. Lisa G. Corrin, “Confounding the Stereotype,” 15–16, and Worsdale, “Stereo Type,” 4–6.

6. Peter Schjeldahl, “Those Nasty Brits,” *New Yorker* 25 (October 11, 1999), 104; Redwing, “Tales of the New York Art Police,” *Revolutionary Worker*, October 10, 1999.

7. Worsdale, “Stereo Type,” 8. See also Louisa Buck, “Chris Ofili,” *Artforum* 36 (September 1997), 112; Kira Brunner, “Art, Politics, and Talk,” *Dissent* 47 (Winter 2000), 7. Thanks to Professor Barbara Mooney of University of Illinois for information on Mary’s attributes in Catholic art.

8. See Kodwo Eshun’s essay “Plug Into Ofili” in the *Chris Ofili* catalog cited in n. 3 above, esp. under “Li! Kim” and “Porn,” unpaginated.

9. On the exhibition and its marketing, see Katha Pollitt, “Catholic Bashing,” *Nation* 269 (November 1, 1999), 10; Brunner, “Art, Politics and Talk,” 7–8; Arthur Danto, “‘Sensation’ in Brooklyn,” *Nation* 269 (November 1, 1999), 25–26; “New York’s Art Attack,” *Time* 154 (October 4, 1999), 64; Plagens, “Holy Elephant Dung!” 71; Schjeldahl, “Nasty Brits,” 104–5.

10. David Barstow, “‘Sensation’ Exhibition Closes As It Opened, to Applause and Condemnation,” *New York Times*, January 10, 2000; “Brooklyn Museum: Giuliani Isn’t Its Biggest Problem” (editorial), *Minneapolis Star Tribune*, November 3, 1999.

11. See n. 2 above.

12. Pollitt, “Catholic Bashing,” 10.

13. Into the twentieth century, some Catholic immigrants dressed female children in the Virgin’s blue and white colors until their first Communion. See Peter Murphy and Candice Ward, “‘The Irish Thing’: A Conversation on the Australian and American Irish Diaspora,” *South Atlantic Quarterly* 98 (Winter-Spring 1999), 130.

14. Peggy McIntosh, “White Privilege and Male Privilege: A Personal Account of Coming to See Correspondences Through Work in Women’s Studies” (Wellesley College Center for Research on Women, Working Paper No.

189, 1988) as reprinted in Richard Delgado and Jean Stefancic, eds., *Critical White Studies: Looking Behind the Mirror* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1997), 291–99, esp. 293–94. In the same volume, see also Linda L. Ammons, “Mules, Madonnas, Babies, Bathwater: Racial Imagery and Stereotypes,” 276–79. Barbara Reynolds, “Madonna and Child Stamp Leaves False Impression,” *USA Today*, January 6, 1999; “Giuliani’s Racist Holy War Against Brooklyn Museum,” *Workers’ Vanguard*, October 15, 1999 refers extensively to the *Amsterdam News* editorial. On Milwaukee, see Stephen Grant Meyer, *As Long As They Don’t Move Next Door: Segregation and Racial Conflict in American Neighborhoods* (Lanham, MD: Rowman and Littlefield, 2000), 193.

15. Richard Dyer, *White* (London and New York: Routledge, 1997), 17 and 14–18.

16. Dyer, *White*, 66–67, 14–18, and 77. On milk and nursing in portrayals of Mary, see Marina Warner, *Alone of All Her Sex: The Myth and the Cult of the Virgin Mary* (New York: Knopf, 1976), 192; Saidiya Hartman, *Scenes of Subjection: Terror, Slavery, and Self-Making in Nineteenth Century America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997), 99–100; see also Donna Haraway, *Simians, Cyborgs, and Women: The Reinvention of Nature* (New York: Routledge, 1991), 146, on why the theorizing of gender “must simultaneously be a theory of racial difference in specific historical conditions of production and reproduction.”

17. See the introduction to David Roediger, ed., *Black on White: Black Writers on What It Means to Be White* (New York: Schocken Book, 1998), 3–26; Kymberly N. Pinder, “Our Father, God; Our Brother, Christ; Or Are We ‘Bastard Kin?’: Images of Christ in African American Painting,” *African American Review*, 31 (1997) 223–33; Mary Murphy-Gnatz, “Henry O. Tanner, Romare Bearden, and Chris Ofili: Art and Re-presentations of Blackness Syncretized with the White Ooze” (unpublished seminar paper, University of Minnesota, 1999); Judith Wilson, “Getting Down to Get Over: Romare Bearden’s Use of Pornography and the Problem of the Black Female Body in Afro-U.S. Art,” in Michele Wallace and Gina Dent, eds., *Black Popular Culture* (Seattle: Bay Press, 1983); Albert B. Cleage, Jr., *The Black Messiah* (New York: Sheed and Ward, 1968); Alain Locke, *The New Negro* (New York: Boni, 1925), frontispiece. On Samuel Cox, see Leslie Harris’s forthcoming *In the Shadow of Slavery: African Americans, Class, Community and Political Activism in New York City*.

18. Jorge Amado, *Tent of Miracles*, trans. by Barbara Shelby (New York: Knopf, 1971); Arnold Rampersad and David Roessel, eds., *The Collected Poems of Langston Hughes* (New York: Knopf, 1994), 143.

19. For the official biography, see http://hom.nyc.gov/portal/index.jsp?pageID=nyc_mayor&catID=1194; cf. “Rudy’s White World,” *Village Voice*, January 20–26, 1999.

20. Wayne Barrett with Adam Fifield, *Rudy!: An Investigative Biography of Rudolph Giuliani* (New York: Basic Books, 2000), 22–32. See below on the import of the casting by Lee.

21. James Barrett and David Roediger “Inbetween Peoples: Race, Nationality and the ‘New Immigrant’ Working Class,” *Journal of American Ethnic*

History 16 (Spring 1997), 3–44; Rudolph Vecoli, “Are Italian Americans Just White Folks?” *Italian Americana* 13 (Summer 1995), 149–65; Robert Orsi, “The Religious Boundaries of an Inbetween People: Street Feste and the Problem of the Dark-Skinned Other in Italian Harlem, 1920–1990,” *American Quarterly* 44 (September 1992), 313–47; Barrett with Fifield, *Rudy!*, 18–19.

22. Noel Ignatiev, *How the Irish Became White* (New York and London: Routledge, 1995); Karen Brodtkin, *How Jews Became White Folks* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1998); James Baldwin, “On Being ‘White’ . . . and Other Lies,” *Essence* (April 1984), 90–92; Barrett and Roediger, “Inbetween Peoples,” 3–44. Matthew Frye Jacobson, *Whiteness of a Different Color: European Immigrants and the Alchemy of Race* (Cambridge, MA, and London: Harvard University Press, 1998), esp. 56–62; David Richards, *Italian American: The Racializing of an Ethnic Identity* (New York: New York University Press, 1999).

23. Lucia Chiavola Birbaum, *Black Madonnas: Feminism, Religion and Politics in Italy* (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1993); Salvatore Salerno, “The Black Madonna and Italian American Identity” (unpublished paper, Metropolitan State University, 1985); Richards, *Italian American*, 210–11; Warner, *Alone of All Her Sex*, 267 and 274–75; Leonard Covello, *The Social Background of the Italo-American Child: A Study of Southern Italian Family Mores and Their Effect on the School System in Italy and America* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1967), 121.

24. Leonard Moss and Stephen C. Cappannari, “In Quest of the Black Virgin: She Is Black Because She Is Black,” in James J. Preston, ed., *Mother Worship: Theme and Variations* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1982), 53–74; Moss and Cappannari, “The Black Madonna: An Example of Cultural Borrowing,” *Scientific Monthly* 73 (1953), 319–24.

25. Salerno, “Black Madonna.” At least one historian has suggested that Black Madonnas in Italy helped make Italian Americans more tolerant of African Americans in the United States. If so, the tolerance may have been quite specific as to time and place (turn-of-the-century Louisiana). See Richard Gambino’s argument on tolerance and Madonnas as cited in Orsi, “Religious Boundaries,” 342, n. 3. On Madonna and race, see hooks, “Madonna: Plantation Mistress or Soul Sister,” in *Black Looks*, 157–64, and “Pepsi Cancels Madonna Ad,” *New York Times*, April 5, 1989 and Elaine Louie, “Stylemakers,” *New York Times*, April 9, 1989.

26. Orsi, “Religious Boundaries,” 329 and passim; Covello, *Social Background*, 122 and 127.

27. Orsi, “Religious Boundaries,” 331 and passim; John Coulsom, ed., *The Saints: A Concise Biographical Dictionary* (New York: Hawthorn Books, 1958), 114. Barrett with Fifield, *Rudy!*, 17–18; Anthony D’Angelo, “Italian Harlem’s Saint Benedict the Moor,” in Mary Jo Bona and Anthony Julian Tamburri, eds., *Through the Looking Glass: Italian and Italian American Images in the Media* (Chicago: American Italian Historical Association, 1996), 236–39; on Marcantonio, see Gerald Meyer, *Vito Marcantonio: Radical Politician, 1902–1954* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1989), esp. 76–77 and 149–62. Thanks to Sal Salerno for providing photos of San Benedetto and information on St. Ann’s.

28. "New York's Art Attack," 64.

29. Wayne Barrett, "Rudy's Brooklyn Rampage: Papal Pandering," *Village Voice*, October 6-12, 1999.

30. Barrett, "Rudy's Brooklyn Rampage"; "Giuliani vs. Offensive Art," *Chicago Tribune*, February 27, 2001; Marc Humbert, "Aide: Giuliani Not Rethinking Abortion," at <http://www.cnn.com/ALLPOLITICS/> (August 18, 1999) from Associated Press wire; Richard Pérez-Peña, "Conservative Party Leader Says Republicans Can Do Better Than Giuliani," *New York Times*, February 8, 2000. For Giuliani's attack on the photograph of a Black female Jesus, see "Amidst Strong Debate, Mild Curiosity at the Exhibition," *New York Times*, February 17, 2000.

31. See, however, Barrett, "Rudy's Brooklyn Rampage." On Giuliani's marital problems, see Elisabeth Bumiller, "Giuliani and Wife of 16 Years Say They Will Seek Separation," *New York Times*, May 11, 2000, A-1.

32. On "Evans, Novak, Shields and Hunt," October 10, 1999; Catholic News Service (St. Paul), *Catholic Spirit*, October 14, 1999; Catholic League, "Catholics to Rally at Brooklyn Museum of Art," September 29, 1999.

33. Quoted in Barrett, "Rudy's Brooklyn Rampage."

34. Nabil Hanna, "Sensation and Endurance," sermon at St. George Orthodox Church in Indianapolis on October 10, 1999, at <http://www.stgindy.org>; "Giuliani's Racist Holy War Against Brooklyn Museum," *Workers' Vanguard*, October 15, 1999.

35. "Virgin Mary Painting Vandalized with Paint," Minneapolis *Star Tribune*, December 17, 1999.

36. Giuliani as quoted in Pollitt, "Catholic Bashing," 10. Dyer, *White*, 75-76, nicely sums up some of the psychoanalytic literature. See also Joel Kovel, *White Racism: A Psychohistory* (New York: Pantheon, 1970), 87-133; Sandor Ferenczi, "The Origins of Interest in Money," in *Contributions to Psychoanalysis* (Boston, R.C. Badger, 1916); Otto Fenichel, "The Drive to Amass Wealth," *Psychoanalytical Quarterly* 7 (1938); David Haight, "Is Money a Four-Letter Word?" *Psychoanalytic Review* 64 (1977), 621-29.

37. Giuliani on "Evans, Novak, Shields and Hunt," October 10, 1999; Worsdale, "Stereo Type," 7.

38. Michael Omi and Howard Winant, *Racial Formation in the United States* (New York and London: Routledge, 1994). See also Rochelle L. Stanfield, "The Wedge Issue," *National Journal*, April 1, 1995, 790-92.

39. The full name is Catholic League for Religious and Civil Rights; Giuliani, "The First Amendment Does Not Require Public Subsidy."

40. The most celebrated discussion of this phenomenon remains Thomas Bryne Edsall and Mary Edsall, *Chain Reaction: The Impact of Race, Rights and Taxes on American Politics* (New York: Norton, 1972). On Giuliani's own deftness at playing the race card, see Richard Goldstein, "The R-Word," *Village Voice*, April 6, 1999.

41. Doug Hartmann and Darren Wheelock, "Midnight Basketball and the 1994 Crime Bill Debates: The Cultural Politics of Race, Crime and Public Policy" (unpublished paper, American Sociological Association meetings, Washington, DC, August 2000).

42. See Martin Gilens, *Why Americans Hate Welfare: Race, Media, and the Politics of Antipoverty Policy* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999), 120; David Roediger, *Towards the Abolition of Whiteness: Essays on Race, Politics and Working Class History* (New York and London: Verso, 1994), 8; James Dao, “Master of Political Attack Ads Is Under Attack Himself,” *New York Times*, September 15, 2000, A-22; Monte Poliakowsky, “Racial Politics in the 1988 Presidential Election,” *The Black Scholar* (January 1989), 32–35 and “Among the New Words,” *American Speech* 68 (1993), 202–3.

43. Schjeldahl, “Those Nasty Brits,” 104; Pollitt, “Catholic Bashing,” 10.

44. Plagens, “Holy Elephant Dung!” 71 quotes Ofili; Hortense Spillers, “Interstices: A Small Drama of Words,” in Carol Vance, ed., *Pleasure and Danger: Exploring Female Sexuality* (New York: Pandora, 1984), 73–100; Tricia Rose, “Rewriting the Pleasure/Danger Dialectic: Black Female Teenage Sexuality in the Popular Imagination,” in Elizabeth Long, ed., *From Sociology to Cultural Studies: New Perspectives* (New York: Blackwell, 1997), 185–202; Rose, “‘Two Inches or a Yard’: Silencing Black Women’s Sexual Expression,” in Ella Shohat, ed., *Talking Visions: Multicultural Feminism in a Transnational Age* (Cambridge, MA: M.I.T. Press, 1999), 316–23. The religious historian Jaroslav Pelikan has argued that in more mainstream contexts, empowering images of Mary have hinged on women identifying “with her humility, yes; but also with her defiance and her victory.” See Pelikan, *Mary Through the Centuries: Her Place in the History of Culture* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1996), 219.

45. Rose, “Two Inches or a Yard,” 323.

46. Roediger, *Abolition*, 14–15, reviews Clinton’s use of attacks on the hip hop artist Sister Souljah to distance himself from Jesse Jackson and to win white votes. See also Manning Marable, “U.S. Commentary: At the End of the Rainbow,” *Race and Class* 34 (October–December, 1992), 79, and Philip A. Klinkner, “Bill Clinton and the Politics of the New Liberalism,” in Adolph Reed, Jr., ed., *Without Justice for All: The New Liberalism and Our Retreat from Racial Equality* (Boulder, CO: Westview, 1999), 16–18. For the original controversy, see *Washington Post*, May 13, 1992, B-1, and *New York Times*, June 15, 1992, A-22.

47. Pollitt, “Catholic Bashing,” 10; Pérez-Peña, “Conservative Party Leader”; *New York Times*, May 20, 2000.

48. Pérez-Peña, “Conservative Party Leader.”

49. Brunner, “Art, Politics and Talk,” 7; “Artistic Freedom: See You in Court,” *Economist* (U.S.), 353 (October 2, 1999), 94; Barstow, “Exhibition Closes.”

50. Laolu Akande, “Ofili’s Painting as New African Art?” *NigeriaWorld News* (online) at <http://nigeriaworld.com/news/daily/oct/111/html>. Related to the issues raised by Akande (and by Professor Niyi Osundare of the University of New Orleans in Akande’s article) are reservations concerning Ofili’s ease with hybridity that were expressed, in my view too flatly, in Niru Ratnam, “Chris Ofili and Limits of Hybridity,” *New Left Review* 235 (May–June 1999), 153–59. Also noteworthy is Mary Schmidt Campbell’s “Collisions at a Museum,” *Nation*, 259 (November 22, 1999), 5–6.