

## NOTES

---

*Note: Unless stated otherwise, all URLs referenced in the Notes section were active as of November 1, 2015.*

### Preface

**This book aims to reflect** Harold Bloom, “Introduction” to *From Berlin to Jerusalem: Memories of My Youth*, by Gershom Scholem (New York: Schocken Books, 1988), vii–viii, quoted in Michael Brenner, “From Self-Described Messiah to Scholar of Messianism: The Recently Published Diaries Present Young Gerhard Scholem in a New Light,” *Jewish Social Studies* 3, no. 1 (Autumn 1996): 178.

**For example, the Jewish diaspora** Melanie Kaye/Kantrowitz, *The Colors of Jews: Racial Politics and Radical Diasporism* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2007), xi.

Familiarization and defamiliarization: Jonathan Z. Smith, *Relating Religion: Essays in the Study of Religion* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004).

**For any given topic** On whether or not ancient Jewish history can ever be framed as definitive, see e.g., Edwin N. Yamauchi, “The Reconstruction of Jewish Communities during the Persian Empire,” *Journal of the Historical Society* 4, no. 1 (Winter 2004): 1–25.

An obvious shortcoming of my method is that it can potentially create a context of moral relativity that puts communal convictions on the same ground with judicious academic scholarship and substandard research. I thank Fred Astren for raising this important issue with me early on in the writing of this book.

**To paraphrase a number of scholars** Others who have explained how within their single book are a number of different books include Shaye J. D. Cohen, *From the Maccabees to the Mishnah* (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1987), xi; Arthur Green, *Seek My Face, Speak My Name: A Contemporary Jewish Theology* (Northvale, NJ: Jason Aronson, 1992), x; and James Kugel, *How to Read the Bible: A Guide to Scripture, Then and Now* (New York: Free Press, 2007), xvi.

### Introduction

**Many of us have a basic human need** On the shaping of identities, see Aaron J. Hahn Tapper, “A War of Words: Muslims, Jews, and the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict on American University Campuses,” in *Muslims and Jews in America: Commonalities, Contentions, and Complexities*, ed. Reza Aslan and Aaron J. Hahn Tapper (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 71.

**The postmodern, twenty-first-century intellectual** Charles Taylor, *Sources of the Self: The Making of the Modern Identity* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1989), in Danielle Celermajer, *The Sins of the Nation and the Ritual of Apologies* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 48n.14.

**In all of these ways** Throughout this book I use the abbreviation BCE (Before the Common Era) instead of BC (Before Christ), and CE (Common Era) instead of AD (Anno Domini, Latin for “year of our Lord” or “year of the Lord”).

**This book is based on the idea** Who or what is a Jew? It is not overly important to me whether to use the interrogative pronoun *who* or *what* when approaching the identity of a Jew (as in “who is a Jew?” or “what is a Jew?”). However, because using the pronoun *what* when referring to a group can be interpreted as a form of objectification and dehumanization, I have chosen to use *who* in throughout the book.

**We can speak in similarly plural terms** The population figures for Christians and Muslims are based on fig. 0.1, which posits a total world population baseline of seven billion individuals.

**From the perspective of this book** On expressions of Jewishness generated by self-identified non-Jews, see, e.g., Ruth Ellen Gruber, *Virtually Jewish: Reinventing Jewish Culture in Europe* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002); and Jérôme de Missolz and Frédéric Brenner, *Tykocin* (2003) [film].

**Is there any substantial link** Classification: There is a great deal of debate regarding what each one of the catego-

ries discussed in this paragraph means. For example, refer to [www.merriam-webster.com](http://www.merriam-webster.com) and [www.oxforddictionaries.com](http://www.oxforddictionaries.com) to see how some of these seemingly distinct categories are defined with reference to another category.

Religion: Emile Durkheim, *The Elementary Forms of Religious Life*, trans. Karen Fields (New York: Free Press, 1995); Jonathan Z. Smith, *Imagining Religion* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982).

Culture: Peter Burke, *What Is Cultural History?* (Malden, MA: Polity Press, 2008); Anne Phillips, *Gender and Culture* (Malden, MA: Polity Press, 2010).

Ethnicity: This category includes subforms such as “cultural ethnicity,” “structural ethnicity,” and “cognitive ethnicity”; see, e.g., Kenneth D. Wald and Bryan D. Williams, “American Jews and Israel: The Sources of Politicized Ethnic Identity,” *Nationalism and Ethnic Politics* 12 (2006): 212–214.

Nation: Homi K. Bhabha, ed., *Nation and Narration* (New York: Routledge, 2003); Anthony D. Smith, *National Identity* (Reno: University of Nevada Press, 1991).

Race: Margaret L. Andersen and Patricia Hill Collins, *Race, Class, and Gender: An Anthology* (Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Publishing, 2009); Tracy Ore, *The Social Construction of Difference and Inequality: Race, Class, Gender, and Sexuality* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 2008).

Political orientation: Wald and Williams, “American Jews and Israel,” 205–237.

Classifying Jews in more than one of these categories: To quote twentieth-century philosopher Martin Buber, “Israel is a people like no other, for it is the only people in the world which, from its earliest beginning, has been both a nation and a religious community” (Martin Buber, “Nationalism and Zion,” in idem, *Israel and the World: Essays in a Time of Crises* [Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1997], 248). This isn’t to say, of course, that the meanings of any of the categories presented in this paragraph are self-evident, nor do I mean to imply that power doesn’t undergird the construction of these groupings. For more on this last idea, see Judith Butler, *Bodies That Matter: On the Discursive Limits of “Sex”* (New York: Routledge, 1993), 18.

**One of the most common ways** For the etymology of the word *religion*, see [www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/religion](http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/religion); [www.oed.com/viewdictionaryentry/Entry/161944](http://www.oed.com/viewdictionaryentry/Entry/161944).

One interesting explanation of religion as a concept is that it is “a language made up of symbols and metaphors that allow people to communicate, to themselves and to others, the ineffable experience of faith” (Reza Aslan, “Praying for Common Ground at the Christmas-Dinner Table,” *New York Times Magazine*, December 19, 2014, [www.nytimes.com/2014/12/21/magazine/praying-for-common-ground-at-the-christmas-dinner-table.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2014/12/21/magazine/praying-for-common-ground-at-the-christmas-dinner-table.html)). However, this, too, falls short in some respects, as not all religious identities are linked to faith.

On whether there is a core set of textually based principles underpinning “the” Jewish tradition, see Jonathan Boyarin, *Thinking in Jewish* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996).

**But there are at least three basic** Observing Jewish law vs. holding particular beliefs: Shaye J. D. Cohen, *From the Maccabees to the Mishnah* (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1987), 60–103, 128–131; Menachem Kellner, *Must a Jew Believe Anything?* (Portland, OR: Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2006), 9, 26–43.

At the same time that many rabbinic authorities hold that ritual practice is more important than particular beliefs, some Jews reject this. For example, according to various interpretations of one of the most oft-cited texts of Moses Ben Maimon (Maimonides), one of the more authoritative Jewish jurists of the twelfth century, a Jew is obligated to believe in thirteen basic principles in order to stay part of the Jewish community (Kellner, *Must a Jew Believe Anything?*, 52–60).

One can also find passages that support the centrality of belief in the Talmud, an important set of sacred books that is discussed in chapter 5. See also Leora Batnitsky, *How Judaism Became a Religion: An Introduction to Modern Jewish Thought* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2013); Solomon Schechter, “The Dogmas of Judaism,” *Jewish Quarterly Review* 1, no. 1 (October 1888), 48–61; Daniel Septimus, “Must a Jew Believe in God?” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/must-a-jew-believe-in-god/](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/must-a-jew-believe-in-god/); and “What Do American Jews Believe? A Symposium,” *Commentary* 102, no. 2 (August 1996): 18–96.

**Second, one’s Jewishness cannot be judged** Eating a ham sandwich on Yom Kippur: Yitzchak Schochet, chairman of the United Kingdom’s Rabbinical Council of the United Synagogue, in Sarah Lyall, “Who Is a Jew? Court Ruling in Britain Raises Question,” *New York Times*, November 7, 2009, [www.nytimes.com/2009/11/08/world/europe/08britain.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2009/11/08/world/europe/08britain.html).

Disobeying Jewish law does not disqualify someone from being a Jew: As Steven M. Cohen and Arnold M. Eisen write in *The Jew Within*, American Jews—most of whom do not consider themselves religiously observant—largely identify as Jews based on personal attitudes and behaviors rather than communal ones, a process the authors refer to as the “sovereign self.” Such Jews turn inward in their search for meaning rather than toward the Jewish collective. See Steven M. Cohen and Arnold M. Eisen, *The Jew Within: Self, Family, and Community in America* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2000), 1–42.

**A third challenge in understanding Jews** Jewish population size: Sergio DellaPergola, “World Jewish Population, 2010,” in *Current Jewish Population Reports 2*, ed. Arnold Dashefsky, Sergio DellaPergola, and Ira Sheskin (New York: Mandell L. Berman Institute—North American Jewish Data Bank, 2010), available at [www.jewishdatabank.org/studies/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=3031](http://www.jewishdatabank.org/studies/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=3031); Melissa Newman, “Israeli Population Hits 8,904,373, Census Shows,” *Times of Israel*, September 21, 2014, [www.timesofisrael.com/israeli-population-hits-8904373-census-shows](http://www.timesofisrael.com/israeli-population-hits-8904373-census-shows); Pew Research Center, “The Global Religious Landscape,” December 18, 2012, [www.pewforum.org/2012/12/18/global-religious-landscape-exec](http://www.pewforum.org/2012/12/18/global-religious-landscape-exec); idem, “Israel and the U.S. Are Home to More than

Four-Fifths of the World's Jews," March 20, 2013, [www.pewforum.org/2013/03/20/israel-and-the-us-are-home-to-more-than-four-fifths-of-the-worlds-jews](http://www.pewforum.org/2013/03/20/israel-and-the-us-are-home-to-more-than-four-fifths-of-the-worlds-jews); idem, "A Portrait of Jewish Americans: Findings from a Pew Research Center Survey of U.S. Jews," October 1, 2013, available at [www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey](http://www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey).

Atheist and other non-religiously identified Jews: Some respondents in the 2013 Pew study "A Portrait of Jewish Americans" explicitly explained that they identify as Jews in terms of ethnicity or culture—and not religion—because they are atheists. See also Asher Arian, Ayala Keissar-Sugarmann, Dror Walter, Dahlia Scheindlin, Shaul Slepak, Tamar Hermann, and Raphael Ventura, "A Portrait of Israeli Jews: Beliefs, Observance, and Values of Israeli Jews, 2009," *Guttman Center for Surveys of the Israel Democracy Institute* (Jerusalem: Israel Democracy Institute and AVI CHAI-Israel, 2012), 50, available at <http://avichai.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/01/A-Portrait-of-Israeli-Jews.pdf>.

**That said, even if someone maintains** Some people use the terms *ethnicity* and *culture* synonymously. Some dictionaries, moreover, explain each of these terms by using the other. According to *Merriam-Webster* and the *Oxford Dictionaries*, culture is the beliefs (i.e., ways of thinking, behaving, or working), arts, and other manifestations of human intellectual achievement of a particular society, group, place, or time. As for the word's history, the term *culture* was used in the medieval period—in English, French, and Latin—to mean a cultivated piece of land ([www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/culture](http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/culture) and [www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/culture](http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/culture)). These same dictionaries define ethnicity as "the fact or state of belonging to a social group that has a common national or cultural tradition." The word *ethnic* was used in medieval English to denote an individual who was not Christian or Jewish, linked to the Greek *ethnikos* and Latin *ethnicus*, meaning heathen ([www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/ethnic](http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/ethnic) and [www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/ethnicity](http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/ethnicity)). For more on the similarities between "culture" and "ethnicity," see chapter 7.

Scholar Shaul Magid argues that Jews in the United States are actually in a "post-ethnic" phase; in other words, ethnicity is now but one aspect of an individual's identity, something that is agreed to by, rather than imposed upon, a person. The term *post-ethnicity*, Magid notes, was coined by American historian David Hollinger and first applied to the American milieu in general rather than the Jewish community in particular (Shaul Magid, "Be the Jew You Make: Jews, Judaism, and Jewishness in Post-Ethnic America," *Shm'a: A Journal of Jewish Responsibility*, March 2011, [www.shma.com/2011/03/be-the-jew-you-make-jews-judaism-and-jewishness-in-post-ethnic-america](http://www.shma.com/2011/03/be-the-jew-you-make-jews-judaism-and-jewishness-in-post-ethnic-america)). See also Shaul Magid, *American Post-Judaism: Identity and Renewal in a Postethnic Society* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2013).

**As for Jews being a nation** *Nation*: [www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/nation](http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/nation) and [www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/nation](http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/nation). See also [www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/ethnic](http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/ethnic) and [www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/ethnicity](http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/ethnicity).

[www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/ethnic](http://www.merriam-webster.com/dictionary/ethnic) and [www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/ethnicity](http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/ethnicity).

On identifying as part of the Jewish nation, see Steven M. Cohen and Ari Y. Kelman, "Beyond Distancing: Young Adult American Jews and Their Alienation from Israel" (New York: Andrea and Charles Bronfman Philanthropies, 2007), available at [www.acbp.net/pdf/pdfs-research-and-publications/Beyond\\_Distancing.pdf](http://www.acbp.net/pdf/pdfs-research-and-publications/Beyond_Distancing.pdf).

**In the twenty-first century, the idea** Race: According to *Oxford Dictionaries*, "race" is a type of category into which humankind divides itself largely based on "distinct physical characteristics." It is also defined as "a group of people sharing the same culture, history, language, etc.; an ethnic group" ([www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/race](http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/race)).

Nazism and race: United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, "Nazi Racism," [www.ushmm.org/outreach/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007679](http://www.ushmm.org/outreach/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007679); idem, "Victims of the Nazi Era: Nazi Racial Ideology," *ibid.*, . . . ModuleId=10007457.

**Although race is today often considered** On race as a social construct vs. biological fact, see, e.g., Maurianne Adams, Warren J. Blumenfeld, Carmelita Castaneda, Heather W. Hackman, Madeline L. Peters, and Ximena Zuniga, eds., *Readings for Diversity and Social Justice*, 3rd ed. (New York: Routledge, 2013), 57–62.

Genetic connection among Jews: Gianna Palmer, "Genes Tell Tale of Jewish Ties to Africa," *Jewish Daily Forward*, August 2, 2011, [forward.com/culture/140721/genes-tell-tale-of-jewish-ties-to-africa](http://forward.com/culture/140721/genes-tell-tale-of-jewish-ties-to-africa); Rita Rubin, "'Jews a Race': Genetic Theory Comes under Fierce Attack by DNA Expert," *Jewish Daily Forward*, May 7, 2013, [forward.com/articles/175912/jews-a-race-genetic-theory-comes-under-fierce-atta](http://forward.com/articles/175912/jews-a-race-genetic-theory-comes-under-fierce-atta). Some studies aim to prove a genetic connection between Jews from the lineage of priests (*cohanim*); for example, Mark G. Thomas, Tudor Parfitt, Deborah A. Weiss, Karl Skorecki, James F. Wilson, Magdel le Roux, Neil Bradman, and David B. Goldstein, "Y Chromosomes Traveling South: The Cohen Modal Haplotype and the Origins of the Lemba—the 'Black Jews of Southern Africa,'" *American Journal of Human Genetics* 66 (2000): 674–686.

**For some, demonstrating an inherent** Moshe Tendler quote: Debra Nussbaum Cohen, "The Ties That Bind," *Jewish Daily Forward*, August 11, 2011, [forward.com/culture/129991/the-ties-that-bind/#ixzz1U5HoDqup](http://forward.com/culture/129991/the-ties-that-bind/#ixzz1U5HoDqup).

**Sometimes problems internal to the Jewish community** The decision to require the DNA test was made by the Israeli consulate in St. Petersburg. Because the test was quite costly, this decision was also socioeconomically discriminatory ("Teen Told She Can't Join Birthright without DNA Test," *Times of Israel*, July 28, 2013, [www.timesofisrael.com/teen-told-she-cant-join-birthright-without-dna-test](http://www.timesofisrael.com/teen-told-she-cant-join-birthright-without-dna-test)).

**Scholar Robert Pollack contends** Robert Pollack, "The Fallacy of Biological Judaism," *Jewish Daily Forward*, March 7, 2003, <http://forward.com/articles/9406/the-fallacy-of-bio>

logical-judaism. The David Ellenson quote is from Cohen, “Ties That Bind.”

**Others, such as scholar** Steven Cohen quote: Cohen, “Ties That Bind.”

**Even if one challenges** Steven M. Cohen and Jack Wertheimer, “Whatever Happened to the Jewish People?,” *Commentary Magazine* 121, no. 6 (June 2006): 34.

**There are, of course, other notions** The closest American equivalence of a British school that is “government funded” is an American “public school.” In contrast to the public school system in the United States, there are approximately “7,000 publicly financed religious schools in Great Britain, representing Judaism as well as the Church of England, Catholicism and Islam, among others. Under a 2006 law, the schools can in busy years give preference to applicants within their own faiths, using criteria laid down by a designated religious authority” (Lyall, “Who Is a Jew?”).

Student’s mother’s conversion: Some sources say that she was converted under the auspices of the London Progressive movement (e.g., Lyall, “Who Is a Jew?”), whereas others say her conversion was conducted by the Masorti (Conservative) authorities (e.g., Steven J. Riekes, “Who Is a Jew? Reflections of an American Jewish Lawyer on the British Supreme Court Ruling Invalidating Jewish Religious Law,” in *Who Is a Jew: Reflections on History, Religion, and Culture*, ed. Leonard J. Greenspoon [Omaha, NE: Purdue University Press, 2014], 61). What is important for our purposes is that the conversion was authorized by a non-Orthodox denominational movement and, on these grounds, was rejected by an Orthodox authority.

**Over the last half-century** Story about female rabbis being the norm: This anecdote was relayed to me by Rabbi Chai Levy, guest lecturer for a course titled “Social Justice, Activism, and Jews,” University of San Francisco, October 5, 2010.

On Jews marrying non-Jews at rates as high as 70 percent, see Ben Zehavi, “Rise of ‘Jews of No Religion’ Most Significant Find of Pew Study, Says Director,” *Times of Israel*, October 3, 2013, [www.timesofisrael.com/rise-of-jews-of-no-religion-most-significant-find-of-pew-study-says-director](http://www.timesofisrael.com/rise-of-jews-of-no-religion-most-significant-find-of-pew-study-says-director).

**SPECIAL TOPIC 0.2** On Queer Studies, see Annamarie Jagose, “Queer Theory,” in *New Dictionary of the History of Ideas*, ed. Maryanne Cline Horowitz (New York: Charles Scribners and Sons, 2005), available at [www.encyclopedia.com/doc/1G2-3424300651.html](http://www.encyclopedia.com/doc/1G2-3424300651.html).

*Siddur Sha’ar Zahav*: Michael Tyler and Leslie Kane, eds., *Siddur Sha’ar Zahav* (San Francisco: Congregation Sha’ar Zahav, 2009), viii.

**Ultimately, this book seeks to question** Regarding definitive explanations of Jewish history: This is not to say that this book does not also fall into this trap to some degree. To paraphrase one scholar, one cannot talk about the problematic nature of the dominant Jewish narrative without simultaneously re-creating a new narrative to replace it (Melanie Kaye/Kantrowitz, *The Colors of Jews: Racial Politics and Radi-*

*cal Diasporism* [Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2007], 19). Perhaps it can be said that if this book does do this, it is with the awareness and explicit acknowledgment that doing so is problematic. Or, to paraphrase scholar R. Laurence Moore, my goal is not to discuss every single Jewish subcommunity that has ever existed (R. Laurence Moore, *Religious Outsiders and the Making of Americans* [New York: Oxford University Press, 1986], xiv–xv). For starters, only a rare few readers would have the patience for such a tome. Instead, I aim to mainstream some marginalized Jewish subgroups while raising the larger issue of historical marginalization.

**This objective echoes** Shira Stutman, “Night 8: WTF? The Beauty of Many Voices,” [www.8for8.net/day-8](http://www.8for8.net/day-8).

**This book also intends** Shlomo Sand, *The Invention of the Jewish People*, trans. Yael Lotan (New York: Verso, 2010).

## Chapter 1. Narratives

**From as far back as I could remember** In the context of this introductory vignette, it is not important that the body of water that Moses and the Israelites cross, as depicted in Exod. 13–15 and called *Yam Suf* (Sea of Reeds), is probably not the Red Sea. Here we are talking about biblical imagery (i.e., “truth”) and not necessarily “fact.” “Truth” and “fact” are discussed later in this chapter.

**I begin this book** Regarding the common observance of Passover in Jewish communities, see, e.g., Nancy Ammerman, “Religious Identities in Contemporary American Life: Lessons from the NJPS,” *Sociology of Religion* 67, no. 4 (December 1, 2006): 359–364; Uzi Rubhen and Shlomit Levy, “Unity and Diversity: Jewish Identification in America and Israel, 1990–2000,” *Sociology of Religion* 67, no. 4 (December 1, 2006): 391–414; Julie Wiener, “A Hands-on Flexible Holiday: U.S. Jews at Home with the Seder,” March 11, 2002, [www.interfaithfamily.com/holidays/passover\\_and\\_easter/A\\_Hands-on\\_Flexible\\_Holiday\\_US\\_Jews\\_at\\_Home\\_with\\_the\\_Seder.shtml](http://www.interfaithfamily.com/holidays/passover_and_easter/A_Hands-on_Flexible_Holiday_US_Jews_at_Home_with_the_Seder.shtml).

**One of the ways a community’s collective memory survives** On “national biography,” see Ilana Pardes, “Imagining the Birth of Ancient Israel: National Metaphors in the Bible,” in *Cultures of the Jews: Mediterranean Origins*, vol. 1, ed. David Biale (New York: Schocken Books, 2002), 9–41; and idem, *The Biography of Ancient Israel: National Narratives in the Bible* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000).

**To better understand the phenomena** This book’s basic distinction between “truth” and “fact” is a discursive mechanism used to explain how the Jewish community—like all communities—has dominant narratives that it relays to itself and others, collective stories that favor certain subnarratives over others, sometimes ignoring alternative ones altogether. Existential philosophical thought regarding “truth” in relation to ultimate reality is beyond the scope of this book. Note that the distinction I am making here is similar to, though not the same as, Hayden White’s argument in *Metahistory*:



*The Historical Imagination in Nineteenth-Century Europe* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1973). I thank Darren Kleinberg for this reference.

**Identities are constructs** Relationship between identities and “truth”: Aaron J. Hahn Tapper, “A War of Words: Muslims, Jews, and the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict on American University Campuses,” in *Muslims and Jews in America: Commonalities, Contentions, and Complexities*, ed. Reza Aslan and Aaron J. Hahn Tapper (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 74.

**More importantly perhaps** On the “truth” of the Mercator map, see Mark Monmonier, *Rhumb Lines and Map Wars: A Social History of the Mercator Projection* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004).

For other communities that put themselves at the center of their maps, see, for example, Brett Zongker, “1602 Map Unveiled, Shows China at Center of World,” January 12, 2010, [www.huffingtonpost.com/2010/01/12/1602-map-unveiled-shows-c\\_n\\_419732.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2010/01/12/1602-map-unveiled-shows-c_n_419732.html).

On maps’ ability to teach political ideas as well as spatial locations, see Jeremy Black, *Maps and History: Constructing Images of the Past* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1997).

**Using cartography to illustrate underlying problems** Marshall G.S. Hodgson, *Rethinking World History: Essays on Europe, Islam, and World History* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 3–5.

**Others think that “white America”** Peggy Orenstein, “Mixed Messenger,” *New York Times*, March 23, 2008, [www.nytimes.com/2008/03/23/magazine/23wwln-lede-t.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2008/03/23/magazine/23wwln-lede-t.html).

**This isn’t to say that Obama is not black** On Obama and the census, see Sam Roberts and Peter Baker, “Asked to Declare His Race, Obama Checks ‘Black,’” *New York Times*, April 2, 2010, [www.nytimes.com/2010/04/03/us/politics/03census.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/03/us/politics/03census.html). See also “Census form—2010,” [www.census.gov/schools/pdf/2010form\\_info.pdf](http://www.census.gov/schools/pdf/2010form_info.pdf). See also [http://www.census.gov/population/race/data/MREAD\\_1790\\_2010.html](http://www.census.gov/population/race/data/MREAD_1790_2010.html).

**The point is, social identities** On the American definition of blackness, see F. James Davis, “The One-Drop Rule Defined,” from *Who Is Black? One Nation’s Definition* (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1991), excerpted at *Frontline*, [www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/shows/jefferson/mixed/onedrop.html](http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/shows/jefferson/mixed/onedrop.html).

**It is also clear that America’s history** On racial categorization in Brazil, see, e.g., Stanley R. Bailey, *Legacies of Race: Identities, Attitudes, and Politics in Brazil* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2009).

**We can make the same points** On racial categorization of Chinese and Japanese Americans, see Gloria Heyung Chun, *Of Orphans and Warriors: Inventing Chinese American Culture and Identity* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2000); and Frank Wu, *Yellow: Race in America beyond Black and White* (New York: Basic Books, 2002).

**In other words, identities are imposed** On twenty-first-

century American constructs related to gender and sex, see, respectively, National Center for Transgender Equality, [www.transequality.org/issues](http://www.transequality.org/issues), and Advocates for Informed Choice, <http://aiclegal.org/who-we-are/faqs>.

**Betsy Ross did not actually play** Betsy Ross: In the words of Marc Leepson, author of *Flag: An American Biography* (New York: Thomas Dunne Books/St. Martin’s Press, 2005), “Every historical study has come to the same conclusion. There’s no good historical evidence that she did [make the first U.S. flag]. But that doesn’t mean she didn’t. There’s simply a lack of documentation. Most historians believe the story is apocryphal” (quoted in Ed Crews, “The Truth about Betsy Ross,” *Colonial Williamsburg Journal*, Summer 2008, [www.history.org/Foundation/journal/Summ08/betsy.cfm](http://www.history.org/Foundation/journal/Summ08/betsy.cfm)).

Rosa Parks: A number of other black American women also engaged in this same act of defiance between July 1944 and December 1955. See, e.g., Anonymous, “The Uncelebrated Grandmother of the Modern Civil Rights Movement,” *Journal of Blacks in Higher Education* 31 (Spring 2001): 50; and Barry Schwartz, “Collective Forgetting and the Symbolic Power of Oneness: The Strange Apotheosis of Rosa Parks,” *Social Psychology Quarterly* 72, no. 2 (2009): 127.

John “Bud” Fowler: “John ‘Bud’ Fowler,” *Negro Leagues Baseball Museum E-Museum*, <http://coe.k-state.edu/annex/nlbemuseum/history/players/fowler.html>; James A. Riley, *The Biographical Encyclopedia of the Negro Baseball Leagues* (New York: Carroll & Graf, 1994).

Moses Fleetwood Walker: Jessie Carney Smith and Linda T. Wynn, *Freedom Facts and Firsts: 400 Years of the African American Civil Rights Experience* (Canton, MI: Visible Ink Press, 2009), 321–322; Nudie E. Williams, “Footnote to Trivia: Moses Fleetwood Walker and the All-American Dream,” *Journal of American Culture* 11, no. 2 (Summer 1988): 65–82.

Fowler and Walker: William D. Rubinstein, “Jackie Robinson and the Integration of Major League Baseball,” *History Today* 53, no. 9 (September 2003): 20–25.

**Truth and fact also manifest** On dominant literary canons in the United States, see Harold Bloom, *The Western Canon: The Books and School of the Ages* (New York: Riverhead Trade, 1995).

**The above examples deal primarily** Catherine L. Albanese, *America: Religions and Religion*, 2nd ed. (Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Publishing Company, 1992), xx–xxi (quote) and xx–xxiv. See also Thomas A. Tweed, ed., *Retelling U.S. Religious History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 1–23. I thank Darren Kleinberg for these two references.

**But this method often** Albanese, *America*, xxii. On shaping identities in relation to another group, see Catherine Albanese, “Exchanging Selves, Exchanging Souls: Contact, Combination, and American Religious History,” in Tweed (ed.), *Retelling U.S. Religious History*, 200–226.

Levine quote: Lawrence W. Levine, “Clio, Canons, and Culture,” *Journal of American History* 80 (December 1993): 867, quoted in Thomas A. Tweed, “Introduction: Narrating U.S.

Religious History,” in Tweed (ed.), *Retelling U.S. Religious History*, 3.

**More challenging is that a community's dominant narratives** The process of constructing dominant and subordinated narratives is similar to Michel Foucault's “power-knowledge” construct. See Michel Foucault, *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972–1977*, ed. Colin Gordon (New York: Pantheon Books, 1980).

**Specifically, not until the 1960s** See Richard L. Hughes, “A Hint of Whiteness: History Textbooks and Social Construction of Race in the Wake of the Sixties,” *Social Studies* 98, no. 5 (September 2007): 201–207; Tony R. Sanchez, “The Depiction of Native Americans in Recent (1991–2004) Secondary American History Textbooks: How Far Have We Come?,” *Equity and Excellence in Education* 40 (2007): 311–320.

**Others say that the exclusion** On the American government's repeated choice not to save countries in need of support, see Samantha Power, *A Problem from Hell: America and the Age of Genocide* (New York: Harper Perennial, 2007).

**Marginalizing specific subnarratives** On “fringe” vs. “normalcy” in American religions, see R. Laurence Moore, *Religious Outsiders and the Making of Americans* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986), vii–xv, 3–21.

Tweed quote: Tweed, “Introduction,” 2.

**Contemporary Jews are descendants** Referring to dominant Jewish narratives as the “Humpty Dumpty Narrative,” scholar Tali Zerkowicz asserts that one must question whether Humpty Dumpty—or, in this case, the Jews—ever actually sat on a high (and holy) wall in the first place. See Tali Zerkowicz, “Authoring, Authority, and Authenticity: The Storying of Jewish Education,” *Shm'a: A Journal of Jewish Responsibility* (March 2010): 6–7, available at [www.shma.com/2010/03/authoring-authority-and-authenticity-the-storying-of-jewish-education](http://www.shma.com/2010/03/authoring-authority-and-authenticity-the-storying-of-jewish-education).

**Many Jews are familiar with this story** As one archeologist, Baruch Halpern, notes: “The actual evidence concerning the Exodus resembles the evidence for a unicorn” (in Hershel Shanks, William G. Dever, Baruch Halpern, and P. Kyle McCarter, Jr., *The Rise of Ancient Israel* [Washington, DC: Biblical Archaeology Society, 1992], 91; see also 87–117).

**The Jewish community is no different** Common estimates are that by the year 2042, whites will be a minority group in the United States. See, e.g., Joel Kotkin, “The Changing Demographics of America,” *Smithsonian*, August 2010, [www.smithsonianmag.com/40th-anniversary/the-changing-demographics-of-america-538284/?no-ist](http://www.smithsonianmag.com/40th-anniversary/the-changing-demographics-of-america-538284/?no-ist); and Danielle Restuccia, “A Study on the Changing Racial Makeup of ‘The Next America,’” April 13, 2014, [www.huffingtonpost.com/2014/04/13/changing-racial-makeup\\_n\\_5142462.html](http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2014/04/13/changing-racial-makeup_n_5142462.html).

Ashkenazi Jews in Israel and the United States: More precisely, male, heterosexual, Ashkenazi Jews. We could also accurately add the Jewish American community's dominant denominational affiliation (Reform), socioeconomic class (middle and upper middle class), geographical location (California and New York), and other identity categories to

the description of what social identities prevail in relation to dominant Jewish narratives. The specific homogenization of Ashkenazi identities is discussed later in this chapter.

**Ashkenazi:** Some define “Ashkenaz” as the area surrounding what are now Germany and Poland, countries whose borders have changed a number of times over the last thousand years and have historically overlapped with modern countries that were part of the Soviet Union, such as Russia. Many Jews from this region eventually migrated west, toward England and France; thus, some Ashkenazi Jews today also trace themselves back to Western Europe more broadly. The term *Ashkenaz* is found in the Torah as a proper noun rather than an adjective. Ashkenaz was Noah's great-grandson (Genesis 10:3). In the Prophets, it is the name of a kingdom to the north of the Land of Israel (Jeremiah 51:27). For more on the Torah and Prophets, see chapter 2. See also “Ashkenazi” in *Encyclopaedia Britannica*, [www.britannica.com/topic/Ashkenazi](http://www.britannica.com/topic/Ashkenazi).

**Although being a majority member** Population studies and definitions: All population studies necessitate a definition of the group being counted. Although this book's central argument is that there are multiple ways that Jews (and non-Jews) define what it means to be a Jew, in the case of these population figures I am utilizing definitions provided by other scholars. Put another way, given that much of this book explores the complex question “Who is a Jew?” for the moment I am accepting certain assumptions about Jewish identities in terms of Jews' population size. I am aware that there continue to be debates regarding the number of Jews in the United States and worldwide. Nonetheless, as the general narrative among American Jews, for example, is that there are six million Jews in the United States, I am working with that figure.

For more on the population figures mentioned, see Central Bureau of Statistics, State of Israel, “Population of Israel on the Eve of 2014—8 Million,” December 29, 2013, [www1.cbs.gov.il/reader/newhodaot/hodaa\\_template\\_eng.html?hodaa=201311357](http://www1.cbs.gov.il/reader/newhodaot/hodaa_template_eng.html?hodaa=201311357); Sergio DellaPergola, “World Jewish Population, 2013,” in *Current Jewish Population Reports* 9, ed. Arnold Dashefsky, Sergio DellaPergola, and Ira Sheskin (New York: Berman Jewish DataBank, 2013), available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=18230](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=18230); “Number of Jews in the World, with Emphasis on the United States and Israel,” *Jewish People Policy Institute* (2011), [http://jppi.org.il/uploads/Number\\_of\\_Jews\\_in\\_the\\_world\\_with\\_emphasis\\_on\\_the\\_United\\_States\\_and\\_Israel\\_EN.pdf](http://jppi.org.il/uploads/Number_of_Jews_in_the_world_with_emphasis_on_the_United_States_and_Israel_EN.pdf); and Diane Tobin, Gary A. Tobin, and Scott Rubin, *In Every Tongue: The Racial and Ethnic Diversity of the Jewish People* (San Francisco: Institute for Jewish and Community Research, 2005).

In the United States, Ashkenazi Jews have not always outnumbered other Jewish subgroups. Many scholars maintain that the population of Ashkenazi Jewish Americans began to exceed Sephardi Jewish Americans only during the eighteenth century. See, for example, Laura Arnold Leibman, *Messianism, Secrecy, and Mysticism: A New Interpretation of Early American Jewish Life* (Portland, OR: Vallentine Mitch-

ell, 2012), 21n.7. See also David de Sola Pool, *Portraits Etched in Stone: Early Jewish Settlers, 1682–1831* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1953); Jacob Radar Marcus, *The Colonial American Jew, 1492–1776*, vol. 3 (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1970); and idem, *Critical Studies in American Jewish History* (Cincinnati: AJA, 1969), 50.

**FIGURE 1.3** The data presented in this image are based on sources found in the Notes to the Introduction and Chapter 1.

**In 1500 CE, however** On the increase in the Ashkenazi population and decreasing size of other Jewish communities, see Sammy Smooha, *Israel: Pluralism and Conflict* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978), 51. Some claim that the only way the Ashkenazi population could have increased to this degree was through mass conversion of non-Jews. For instance, according to scholar Eran Elhaik, most early-twentieth-century European Jews were the descendants of Khazars, a group originating in Turkey that converted to Judaism en masse during the eighth century and migrated to Eastern Europe in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries; see also Rita Rubin, “‘Jews a Race’: Genetic Theory Comes under Fierce Attack by DNA Expert,” *Jewish Daily Forward*, May 7, 2013, <http://forward.com/articles/175912/jews-a-race-genetic-theory-comes-under-fierce-atta>.

Ashkenazi Jews in 1070 CE: Raphael Patai, *Tents of Jacob: The Diaspora Yesterday and Today* (Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1971), 79, cited in Smooha, *Israel*, 364.

Overall shift of the Ashkenazi subnarrative toward dominance: Michael Berenbaum and Fred Skolnick, eds., *Encyclopaedia Judaica*, 2nd ed., vol. 6 (Detroit: Macmillan Reference USA, 2007), 381–400.

**Take a minor controversy** On the origins of Congregations Emanu-El and Sherith Israel, see Fred Rosenbaum, *Cosmopolitans: A Social and Cultural History of the Jews of San Francisco* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2009), 1–35; and Norton B. Stern and William M. Kramer, “A Search for a First Synagogue,” *Western States Jewish Historical Quarterly* 7 (October 1974): 3–20.

Lest one think that intra-Ashkenazi schisms were limited to Germans and Poles or Northern California, the following anecdote underscores the tension between Austrian and German Jews in metropolitan New York during the first half of the twentieth century: One evening at a party in New Jersey, a Jewish student from Princeton University mentioned to someone that he knew Albert Einstein. An Austrian community leader standing nearby turned to the student and said, “Tell me, is Einstein as conceited as the rest of the German Jews?” (related in Ernest Stock, “Washington Heights’ ‘Fourth Reich,’” in *Commentary on the American Scene: Portraits of Jewish Life in America*, ed. Elliot E. Cohen [New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1953], 224–242). See also Henry L. Feingold, *A Midrash on American Jewish History* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1982).

**By approximately 1920** On the Bundists, see the “Bund” entry in *The YIVO Encyclopedia of Jews in Eastern Europe*, [www.yivoencyclopedia.org/article.aspx/Bund](http://www.yivoencyclopedia.org/article.aspx/Bund); and Tony Michels,

*A Fire in their Hearts: Yiddish Socialists in New York* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2005).

More than 3,600 such affiliations: Jacob R. Marcus, *Background for the History of the American Jew* (Cincinnati: n.p., 1969), 211–212, cited in Alice A. Butler-Smith, “Diaspora Nationality vs. Diaspora Nationalism: American Jewish Identity and Zionism after the Jewish State,” *Israel Affairs* 15, no. 2 (April 2009): 162.

**A third phenomenon that helps** On the Shoah, see Berenbaum and Skolnick, *Encyclopaedia Judaica*, 397–398; “Introduction to the Holocaust” and “Victims of the Nazi Era: Nazi Racial Ideology,” both at United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, [www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleID=10005143](http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleID=10005143) and . . . [ModuleID=10007457](http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleID=10007457), respectively; and “What is the Holocaust?” *Jewish Outreach Institute*, [www.joi.org/qa/holocaust.shtml](http://www.joi.org/qa/holocaust.shtml). See also chapter 9.

**As for the founding of the Jewish State** On Ashkenazi hegemony in Israel, see Aziza Khazzoom, *Shifting Ethnic Boundaries and Inequality in Israel: Or, How the Polish Peddler Became a German Intellectual* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2008), 19. Such an argument does not take into account the distinctions between pre-state Ashkenazi Jews and those Ashkenazi immigrants who arrived in the State of Israel in 1948 and thereafter.

**A fourth trend** On the terms *Jew* and *black* as synonyms, see Sander Gilman, *The Jew’s Body* (New York: Routledge, 1991), 99; and idem, *Making the Body Beautiful: A Cultural History of Aesthetic Surgery* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1999), 89–90. On “Jews of color,” see, e.g., Sami Shalom Chetrit, *Intra-Jewish Conflict in Israel: White Jews, Black Jews* (New York: Routledge, 2009); Melanie Kaye/Kantrowitz, *The Colors of Jews: Racial Politics and Radical Diasporism* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2007); and Tobin, Tobin, and Rubin, *In Every Tongue*. The perceived whiteness of Ashkenazi Jews in Israel relative to European and American notions of whiteness is discussed in chapter 10.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 1.1** For more on American Jewishness and whiteness, see, e.g., Karen Brodtkin, *How Jews Became White Folks and What That Says about Race in America* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1998); and Eric L. Goldstein, *The Price of Whiteness: Jews, Race, and American Identity* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2006). See also Activities, chapter 1, activity 1.

On the idea that no group can be understood without respect to an “other,” see René Girard, *Deceit, Desire, and the Novel: Self and Other in Literary Structure* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976).

**Ashkenazi ascendancy in Israel and the United States** Currently, the Israeli government’s Central Bureau of Statistics does not use the Ashkenazi/non-Ashkenazi binary to describe Jewish Israelis. Instead they use categories based on “continent of origin”: Asia, Africa, Europe, and America. See Sergio DellaPergola, “‘Sephardic and Oriental’ Jews in Israel and Western Countries: Migration, Social Change, and Identity,”



tification,” in *Sephardic Jewry and Mizrahi Jews*, ed. Peter Y. Medding (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007), 7.

**If we look at Israel in particular** The Israeli government officially designates only two chief rabbis to adjudicate all Jewish “religious affairs” for the country, one Sephardi and one Ashkenazi. Although there are a few minor government-sanctioned chief rabbis for other Jewish subcommunities, such as the Ethiopian community, ultimately the non-Ashkenazi and non-Sephardi chief community rabbis answer to one or the other of the two chief rabbis. In January 2014, however, a bill was introduced in the Israeli Parliament (Knesset) to have a single chief rabbi for the country, “independent of his ethnic origins”; if passed, it will not be implemented until 2023. See Moshe Behar, “What’s in a Name? Socio-terminological Formations and the Case for ‘Arabized-Jews,’” *Social Identities* 15, no. 6 (November 2009): 747–771; and Khazzoom, *Shifting Boundaries*, 3.

On Jewish-specific terms used to distinguish Ashkenazi Jews from non-Ashkenazi Jews following the founding of Israel, see Khazzoom, *Shifting Boundaries*, 7.

**Scholar Aziza Khazzoom** On economic disparities between various Jewish subcommunities in Israel, especially those linked to patterns that emerged shortly after the state was established in 1948, see Khazzoom, *Shifting Boundaries*, 3. As of 2004 these economic disparities were not nearly as skewed as they were in the 1950s and 1960s (DellaPergola, “Sephardic and Oriental,” 23–27).

In discussing whether Ashkenazi Jews intended to create these economic disparities, Harvey Goldberg references Dorothy Willner’s *Nation-Building and Community in Israel* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1969) in attributing the simplified categorization to “cognitive overload given the rapidity and diversity of immigration” immediately following the creation of the State of Israel (Goldberg, “From Sephardi to Mizrahi and Back Again: Changing Meanings of ‘Sephardi’ in Its Social Environments,” *Jewish Social Studies: History Culture, Society* 15, no. 1 [Fall 2008]: 177). By some accounts, the influx of immigrants to the State of Israel in the years immediately following 1948—specifically in relation to their overall population at the time—was the largest in modern history (Curator, Melbourne Museum Discovery Centre, email to author, September 7, 2014). See also Australian Bureau of Statistics, Department of Immigration & Multicultural & Indigenous Affairs (DIMIA), “The People of Victoria: Statistics from the 2001 Census”; Gavin W. Jones, “An Australian Population Policy,” Research Paper 17 (1996–1997), [www.aph.gov.au/About\\_Parliament/Parliamentary\\_Departments/Parliamentary\\_Library/pubs/rp/RP9697/97rp17](http://www.aph.gov.au/About_Parliament/Parliamentary_Departments/Parliamentary_Library/pubs/rp/RP9697/97rp17); “Post World War II Immigration in Photographs,” Collections Online, Museum Victoria, [collections.museumvictoria.com.au/articles/2959](http://collections.museumvictoria.com.au/articles/2959).

**Intentionality and agency aside** In this context, “agency” refers to the group that has shaped the terms of the conversation itself. This is briefly touched on elsewhere in this chapter, as in the section titled “Sephardi, Mizrahi, or non-Ashkenazi?”

**During the Spanish and Portuguese Inquisitions** On converts to Catholicism who returned to Judaism a few generations later, see Benzion Netanyahu, *The Marranos of Spain: From the Late 14th to the Early 16th Century*, 3rd ed. (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1999); idem, *The Origins of the Inquisition in Fifteenth-Century Spain* (New York: Random House, Inc., 1995); and idem, *Toward the Inquisition: Essays on Jewish and Converso History in Late Medieval Spain* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1997). Hereafter, I use the term *Conversos* to refer to this subgroup of Jews. In my view, the term *Crypto-Jews* implies a fictionalized nature to this subgroup’s Jewish identity, and *Marranos* is linked to Spanish words for pig or swine and filth. See Yakov Malkiel, “Hispani-Arabic *Marrano* and Its Hispano-Latin Homophone,” *Journal of the American Oriental Society* 68 (1948): 176–177, cited in Stanley M. Hordes, *A History of the Crypto-Jews of New Mexico* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2005), 6. A fourth term used for this subgroup is *Anusim*, meaning “the forced ones” (as in forced to convert to Christianity).

**As for those who were expelled** Interestingly, in 2013 the Portuguese government passed a law offering citizenship to the descendants of Jews who were expelled from Portugal in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. See Jon Krich, “Jews Win a Right of Return to Portugal Five Centuries after Inquisition,” *Time*, September 4, 2013, <http://world.time.com/2013/09/04/jews-win-a-right-of-return-to-portugal-five-centuries-after-inquisition>; Cnaan Lipshiz, “Portugal Becomes Second Country, after Israel, with a Jewish Law of Return,” *Times of Israel*, July 12, 2013, [www.timesofisrael.com/portugal-becomes-2nd-country-after-israel-with-a-jewish-law-of-return](http://www.timesofisrael.com/portugal-becomes-2nd-country-after-israel-with-a-jewish-law-of-return); idem, “In Portugal, Jewish Law of Return Moves from Facebook to Law Book,” Jewish Telegraphic Agency, July 11, 2013, [www.jta.org/2013/07/11/news-opinion/world/in-portugal-jewish-law-of-return-moves-from-facebook-to-law-book](http://www.jta.org/2013/07/11/news-opinion/world/in-portugal-jewish-law-of-return-moves-from-facebook-to-law-book). In 2015, the Spanish Parliament passed a similar law. See Raphael Minder, “Spain Approves Citizenship Path for Sephardic Jews,” *New York Times*, June 11, 2015, [www.nytimes.com/2015/06/12/world/europe/spain-approves-citizenship-path-for-sephardic-jews.html?\\_r=0](http://www.nytimes.com/2015/06/12/world/europe/spain-approves-citizenship-path-for-sephardic-jews.html?_r=0).

**For example, take the case** Jews in Morocco since the Babylonian Exile of 586 BCE, when Jews were expelled from Jerusalem and its surrounding areas: See Michael M. Laskier and Eliezer Bashan, “Morocco,” in *Jews of the Middle East and North Africa in Modern Times*, ed. Reeva S. Simon, Michael M. Laskier, and Sara Reguer (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003), 471. The Babylonian Exile is explained in more depth in chapter 3.

**Still others are descendants** Those who kept their Jewish identity a secret: For example, see Mercedes García-Arenal, *A Man of Three Worlds: Samuel Pallache, a Moroccan Jew in Catholic and Protestant Europe* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003), 40, cited in Daniel J. Schroeter, “The Shifting Boundaries of Moroccan Jewish Identities,” *Jewish Social Studies: History, Culture, Society* 15, no. 1 (Fall 2008): 152.

Russian Jews arriving in Morocco during the nineteenth century: Laskier and Bashan, “Morocco.”



Jews living in Ceuta and Melilla: Taflin Laylin, “Melilla Pics: Where Christians, Jews, and Muslims Get Along Fine,” October 1, 2012, [www.greenprophet.com/2012/10/melilla-religion-spanish-morocco](http://www.greenprophet.com/2012/10/melilla-religion-spanish-morocco). According to this article, as of 2012 there were twelve synagogues in Melilla alone.

**Further, if we look at just one subgroup** On whether fifteenth-century Sephardi Jews would have self-identified as Sephardi, see Jonathan Ray, “New Approaches to the Jewish Diaspora: The Sephardim as a Sub-Ethnic Group,” *Jewish Social Studies* 15, no. 1 (Fall 2008): 10–31; Schroeter, “Shifting Boundaries,” 149.

**It has been historically problematic** The case of Ashkenazi hegemony among Jewish Americans is different from that of Jewish Israelis. Although the Jewish American community has developed a similar binary—Ashkenazi/Sephardi—stark economic disparities between these groups did not develop in, nor have such dynamics been concretized into, American society at large (DellaPergola, “‘Sephardic and Oriental,’” 14). That said, studies on the economic situation of Jewish Americans based on one’s pre-American familial country of origin—i.e., Ashkenazi vs. Sephardi vs. Mizrahi, etc.—are few and far between. Studies on Jewish Americans only differentiate across age, geographical location, profession, and religious denomination. See, for example, Laurence Kotler-Berkowitz, *Economic Vulnerability in the American Jewish Population*, Mandell L. Berman Institute—North American Jewish Data Bank (September 2004), [www.jewishdatabank.org/studies/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=147](http://www.jewishdatabank.org/studies/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=147). According to a prominent scholar of the American Jewish community, one reason this particular intra-Jewish issue is not well studied is that the Jewish foundations that support such research tend to downplay intra-ethnic differences in order to reinforce the idea of Jewish unity (email to author, July 27, 2011).

Another fundamental difference between the development of Ashkenazi hegemony among Jewish Americans as opposed to Jewish Israelis is that the first Jews that came to the American British colonies were of Dutch Sephardi, not Ashkenazi, descent. Thereafter, over the subsequent three centuries, massive numbers of Jewish immigrants arrived from Europe, most notably in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries; Ashkenazi Jews have composed the majority of American Jewry ever since. Immigration to pre-state and post-state Israel was much different in this regard (see chapter 10).

For Shohat’s work, see Ella Shohat, “The Invention of the Mizrahim,” *Journal of Palestine Studies* 29, no. 1 (Autumn, 1999): 5–20; and idem, “Sephardim in Israel,” *Social Text* 19/20 (Autumn 1988): 1–35.

**As for what word should be used** Some suggest that the labels Sephardi and Mizrahi gradually became synonyms, even though there were and are a number of differences between and within each of these groups (Goldberg, “From Sephardi to Mizrahi,” 165–188). Additionally, some scholars trace the ancestors of the Jews expelled from the Iberian Peninsula in the fifteenth century (i.e., Sephardi Jews) to

Middle Eastern Jewry (i.e., Mizrahi Jews). As Smootha (*Israel*, 51), explains, “The Sephardim and Orientals have had much in common. They share the same religious style and follow the *Shulhan Arukh*, the religious corpus juris compiled by the Sephardic Rabbi Caro in Palestine in the sixteenth century. The resemblance between Orientals and Near Eastern Sephardim is much greater. Both were under the rule of the decadent Ottoman Empire. This meant cultural, economic and political stagnation, and late exposure to modern ideas. In physiognomy, demography and culture, they were like their Middle Eastern non-Jewish neighbours.”

**Edot:** Some argue that the word *edot* (communities or units), found in the term *Edot ha-Mizrah*, has played a “constraining effect in the Israeli context as it depoliticizes ethnicity and relegates it to folklore and tradition” (Yehouda Shenhav, *The Arab Jews: A Postcolonial Reading of Nationalism, Religion and Ethnicity* [Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2006], 193).

Aziza Khazzoom, email to author, July 22, 2011. I am indebted to Khazzoom for elaborating on her thesis from *Shifting Boundaries*.

**Upon reaching the core eating part** In 2014 I had a French Jewish university student of Algerian descent in one of my university classes. When we read this section of the book, she shared that she had never heard of matzah ball soup or many of the other foods on this list, and was confused by this description. In other words, among the Jews in the community in which she grew up, these Ashkenazi-dominant foods are marginal or nonexistent.

**To an outsider** On ritual being perceived as “strange,” see, e.g., Horace Miner, “Body Ritual among the Nacirema,” *American Anthropologist* 58, no. 3 (June 1956): 503–507.

**There isn’t anything intrinsically problematic** As Beverly Daniel Tatum writes, “The truth is that the dominants do not really know what the experience of the subordinates is. In contrast, the subordinates are very well informed about the dominant. Even when firsthand experience is limited by social segregation, the number of variety of images of the dominant group available through television, magazines, books, and newspapers provide subordinates with plenty of information about the dominants. The dominant worldview has saturated the culture for all to learn” (Tatum, “The Complexity of Identity: Who Am I?” in *Readings for Diversity and Social Justice*, 2nd ed., ed. Maurianne Adams, Warren J. Blumenfeld, Carmelita Castaneda, Heather W. Hackman, Madeline L. Peters, and Ximena Zuniga [New York: Routledge, 2010], 7).

**Ethiopian Jews** On Ethiopian ritual, see Adeena Sussman, “Ethiopia: The Other Exodus,” *Jewish Daily Forward*, April 15, 2005, [www.forward.com/articles/3310/ethiopia-the-other-exodus](http://www.forward.com/articles/3310/ethiopia-the-other-exodus). The Bible verses related to “possessing” such foods are Exod. 12:15, 19, 20; Exod. 13:3; and Deut. 16:3–4.

**Jews from Cochín, India** On this Cochini Indian ritual, see Nathan Katz and Ellen S. Goldberg, “Asceticism and Caste in the Passover Observances of the Cochín Jews,” *Journal of*

*the American Academy of Religion* 57, no. 1 (Spring 1989): 53–82; Gabe Levenson, “Passover in Jewtown,” *New York Jewish Week*, April 7, 2006, [www.jewishfederations.org/page.aspx?id=92111](http://www.jewishfederations.org/page.aspx?id=92111) (accessed August 2, 2011). See also chapter 7.

**Some Jews from Gibraltar, Greece, and Italy** The symbolic representation of mortar as *haroset* can be found in Shalom Buber, ed., *Shibolei Haleket Hashalem* (Vilna, 1887), 184; and Hayyim Yosef David Azulay, *Birkey Yosef, Orah Hayyim* 473: subpar. 12 (Vienna, 1860), fol. 96a—both cited in David Golinkin, “*Pesah* Potpourri: On the Origin and Development of Some Lesser-Known *Pesah* Customs,” *Insight Israel* 4, no. 8 (April 2004), published by the Schechter Institute of Jewish Studies, available at [www.kct.org/PESACH\\_POTPOURRI.htm](http://www.kct.org/PESACH_POTPOURRI.htm).

Union soldiers’ brick: Noam Zion and David Dishon, *A Different Night: The Family Participation Hagaddah* (Jerusalem: Shalom Hartman Institute, 1997), 113, cited in Golinkin, “*Pesah* Potpourri”; “Of Civil Seders in the Civil War,” *American Jewish Historical Society*, Fall 2008, special pull-out section on food: “Blessings of Freedom,” 3.

**Hungarian Jews** A discussion of Hungarian ritual can be found in Alexander Scheiber, *Yeda Am* 1, nos. 7–8 (Nissan 5711): 6, cited in Golinkin, “*Pesah* Potpourri.” See Exod. 11:2 for the biblical verse upon which this ritual is based.

**Moroccan Jews** An explanation of this Moroccan ritual is offered in Mordechai Lubelsky, “At a Seder in Casablanca,” *Day-Jewish Journal*, April 1958, cited in “Nisan: Names and Designations for Passover,” *Jewish Heritage Online Magazine*, [www.jhom.com/calendar/nisan/names.html](http://www.jhom.com/calendar/nisan/names.html).

**Some Yemenite Jews** Yemenite ritual is described in Yom Tov Lewinsky, ed., *Sefer Hamoadim: Pesah* (Tel Aviv, 1948), 389, cited in Golinkin, “*Pesah* Potpourri.”

Tunisian ritual: Goldberg, ed., *Sefer Korot Luv V’yahadutah—Higid Mordechai* (Jerusalem, 1982), 300, 303, cited in Golinkin, “*Pesah* Potpourri.”

**As for more dramatic theatrics** On this ritual within Iraqi, Kurdish, Syrian, Tunisian, and other Jewish subcommunities, see Herbert Dobrinsky, *A Treasury of Sephardic Laws and Customs* (New York: Yeshiva University Press, 1986), 256, 276–277; Lewinsky, *Sefer Hamoadim*, 395–396, 398; Asher Wasertil, ed., *Yalkut Minhagim* (Jerusalem, 1996), 177, 354, 526: all cited in Golinkin, “*Pesah* Potpourri.”

Libyan ritual: Lewinsky, *Sefer Hamoadim*, 401, cited in Golinkin, “*Pesah* Potpourri.”

Moroccan ritual: Lewinsky, *Sefer Hamoadim*, 397, cited in Golinkin, “*Pesah* Potpourri.” Yemenite ritual: R. Ya’akov Sapir, *Even Sapir*, vol. 1 (Lyck, 1866), 89a, cited in Golinkin, “*Pesah* Potpourri.”

**One ultra-Orthodox sect** On Gerrer ritual, see Akiva Ben Ezra, *Minhagei Hagim* (Jerusalem, 1962), 245, cited in Golinkin, “*Pesah* Potpourri.”

Other communities that enact this ritual: Herman Leder, *Reisher Yidn* (Washington, D.C., 1953), 73; and Scheiber, *Yeda Am* 6: both cited in Golinkin, “*Pesah* Potpourri.”

**Although there are countless *Pesah* rituals** In August

2011, the dishes found in an article titled “Passover Recipes: Delicious Dishes for You and Your Family This Passover” at one of the most reputable on-line web resources regarding Judaism, MyJewishLearning.com, came largely from the Ashkenazi community only. By November 1, 2015, although an Ashkenazi dominance in terms of dishes remained, the article of the same name now included many more non-Ashkenazi recipes than previously ([www.myjewishlearning.com/article/passover-recipes](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/passover-recipes)).

Jewish rituals on American television programs: *Curb Your Enthusiasm*, season 5, episode 7; *Family Guy*, season 8, episode 2; *Gossip Girl*, season 2, episode 21; *The Nanny*, season 4, episode 21; *Rachel Zoe Project*, season 3, episode 7; *Rugrats*, season 3, episode 23.

**Of course, Ashkenazi hegemony** The ritual of a Seder plate is described in the Talmud. Aside from the addition of an orange, other contemporary modifications are found in fig. 1.6.

**FIGURE 1.6** The three more traditional items on this Seder plate include *haroset* (below left of orange; here seemingly prepared according to a customary Ashkenazi recipe that uses apples, walnuts, honey or sugar, and/or grape juice or wine), symbolizing the mortar the Hebrew slaves used in building; *maror*, or bitter herbs (above left of orange in the form of a horseradish root; also the purple mixture at far right, a mixture of horseradish root and beets), symbolizing the bitterness the Hebrew slaves experienced; and *karpas* (a green vegetable, here in the form of parsley), symbolizing spring, the season when Passover is celebrated. Different foods are used for some of these symbolic representations, and many of these symbols have other interpretations.

**Sometime thereafter, however, she learned** Susannah Heschel originally came up with this idea after being introduced to an early feminist *Haggadah* at an American college, which suggested adding a piece of bread to the Seder plate to symbolize solidarity with Jewish lesbians. For Heschel, however, using as a symbol a food that was expressly prohibited on Passover (i.e., not kosher-for-*Pesah*) would convey just the opposite message, symbolizing instead how Jewish lesbians and gay men violate Jewish law, just as do those who eat bread on *Pesah* (Tamara Cohen, “Orange on the Seder Plate,” [www.ritualwell.org/ritual/orange-seder-plate](http://www.ritualwell.org/ritual/orange-seder-plate); and Deborah Eisehnbach-Budner and Alex Borns-Weil, “The Background to the Background of the Orange on the Seder Plate and the Ritual of Inclusion,” [www.ritualwell.org/ritual/background-background-orange-seder-plate-and-ritual-inclusion](http://www.ritualwell.org/ritual/background-background-orange-seder-plate-and-ritual-inclusion)). See also Alexandra Silver, “The Orange on the Seder Plate,” *Time Magazine*, April 18, 2011, [http://content.time.com/time/specials/packages/article/0,28804,2065531\\_2065534\\_2065733,00.html](http://content.time.com/time/specials/packages/article/0,28804,2065531_2065534_2065733,00.html).

**The Tribe** [www.moxieinstitute.org/tribe](http://www.moxieinstitute.org/tribe). Technically, whereas Tribe is a short film, Diaspora is a photo-based art project made into multiple different forms. One of the more popular ways this project is shown is via a “Diaporama,” a 20-minute slide show of approximately sixty of his photos

accompanied by an audio commentary narrated by Brenner himself. This is the project to which I am referring, though if we take all of his photos from Diaspora into account my argument is only strengthened.

**The background music is largely Klezmer** Klezmer is an Ashkenazi musical form characterized by rapid melodies and slow, sobbing sounds.

**Almost all of the photos** A single photo shows a Jewish Yemenite grandfather and grandson, amid a sea of photos depicting Ashkenazi Jews. Interestingly, this photo is from Frédéric Brenner's *Diaspora* project (see below).

**A list of historically violent episodes** Some of the exceptions focus on the Spanish and Portuguese Inquisitions, which certainly involved Sephardi Jews, and the medieval Crusades, which affected Middle Eastern Jews as well as European Jews.

**Even the way that biblical characters** One possible exception is the depiction of one of Jacob's twelve sons with kinkier hair than his siblings, which may be interpreted as resembling a hair style not stereotypical of Ashkenazi Jews.

**This is not to say that 20 percent** One of the Jews presented in the film's nine-box frame (à la *The Brady Bunch*), Vanessa Hidary—who delivers a slam poem at the end of the video—identifies as Syrian American and Sephardi, among other things (e.g., Ashkenazi). See [www.hebrewmamita.com/about](http://www.hebrewmamita.com/about) and Bridget Kevane, "Passing," *Tablet*, January 25, 2012, [www.tabletmag.com/jewish-arts-and-culture/theater-and-dance/89197/passing](http://www.tabletmag.com/jewish-arts-and-culture/theater-and-dance/89197/passing). In addition, in a sequence from *The Tribe* that uses Barbie dolls to illustrate how "sometimes [Jews] marry outside their tribe," a number of dark-skinned dolls are shown with light-skinned dolls. Given that elsewhere in the movie Barbie dolls are almost entirely light-skinned, especially when depicting Jews, it is unclear whether the filmmaker, in this sequence only, intends the non-white Barbie dolls to represent Jews and the white Barbies to represent non-Jews. Contextually, much more probable is the opposite scenario.

**Not all artists focusing** Brenner is quoted in Louis Kaplan, "'What Is Represented Is What Is at Stake': Frédéric Brenner on *jews/america/a representation*," *New Centennial Review* 4, no. 1 (Spring 2004): 100.

**What do all these people** Brenner is quoted in Kaplan, "What Is Represented," 105.

**By presenting us with images of Jews** On Scattered Among the Nations and their projects, see [www.scatteredamongthenations.org](http://www.scatteredamongthenations.org).

**As the evening concluded** "Noted some of the minor discomfort": Many *Haggadot* contain a passage asking God to enact vengeance on "those who do not know You [i.e., God]"—something with which I have personal difficulty, especially in light of how it may be interpreted by non-Jews attending a Seder. For more, see Aaron J. Tapper, "Towards a Jewish Theology of Nonviolence," *Tikkun* 20, no. 2 (March/April 2005): 56–58, available at [\[familyreunion.org/wp-content/uploads/2008/12/towards-a-jewish-theology-of-nonviolence-tikkun.pdf\]\(http://familyreunion.org/wp-content/uploads/2008/12/towards-a-jewish-theology-of-nonviolence-tikkun.pdf\).](http://abrahamic-</a></p></div><div data-bbox=)

## Chapter 2. Sinais

**Often called Jabal Mūsā** According to one tradition, the mountain upon which Moses received divinely sanctioned laws from God, such as the Ten Commandments, is called Mount Sinai (Exod. 19:20, 24:16, 31:18, and 34:2). Another tradition calls this same place Mount Horeb (Deut. 4:10, 4:15, 5:2, 9:8, 18:16, and 28:69). According to rabbinic texts, Mount Sinai and Mount Horeb are two names for the same mountain, a place also referred to as Mount Elohim (BT Shab. 89a–b; Joseph Jacobs, M. Seligsohn, and Wilhelm Bacher, "Sinai, Mount," *Jewish Encyclopedia* (1906), [www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/13766-sinai-mountain](http://www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/13766-sinai-mountain)).

Biblical passage where Moses sees God "face to face": Exod. 20:14; Deut. 5:4. Technically, according to the Torah only Moses ever sees God "face to face," no other people are given this opportunity, including the mass of Israelites surrounding Mount Sinai. In the text I am using "face to face" metaphorically in terms of the Torah describing an event where hundreds of thousands of people together experience a divine revelation.

**For my friend and me** There were many reasons we weren't sure that this was Mount Sinai. For instance, as former *yeshivah* (seminary) students, both of us remembered a prominent rabbinic tradition that Mount Sinai was small and "modest," rather than one of the highest mountains in the area.

Total number of Israelites: Several times the Torah says that "about 600,000 men on foot" left Egypt, a number that does not include women or children (Exod. 12:37, 38:26; Num. 11:21, 26:51). According to Numbers 1:45–46, at Mount Sinai there were 603,550 men over twenty who were able to "go to war in Israel." (This figure is slightly different from that found in Num. 26:51, 601,730, which reflects the number of men over twenty who were present after a plague struck the community and were thus able to "go to war in Israel.") If you take women and children into account when calculating the community's population, most estimates are that there were at least one million people present at the time of the Sinai revelation. As for the claim that this is the only massive group of people to encounter God at the same time, as opposed to God appearing before a single individual, the only suggestion of this event is the description found in the Torah. In other words, the Torah contains the only textual proof that the Torah was given to a large group of people.

Dramatic episode involving thunder, lightning, fire, smoke: Exod. 19:16–19.

"Truth" of this event: Mircea Eliade, *The Myth of the Eternal Return*, trans. Willard R. Trask (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1991), 44–48.

**Whereas most Jews probably aren't** Emile Durkheim, *The Elementary Forms of Religious Life*, trans. Karen E. Fields



(New York: Free Press, 1995), 133. Although Durkheim writes about a totem slightly differently than how I use it here, I submit that Mount Sinai is a core totem of the Jewish community.

**For Jews, the importance of Mount Sinai** On the Torah as a totem, to quote Durkheim: “But although the totemic principle has its chief residence in a specific [object], it cannot possibly be localized there. Sacredness is highly contagious, and it spreads from the totemic being to everything that directly or remotely has to do with it. . . . Little by little, sub-totems attached themselves to totems” (Durkheim, *Elementary Forms*, 224).

**Using a Durkheimian framework** Durkheim, *Elementary Forms*, 191, 208.

**The Torah’s “truth”** In the words of scholar James Kugel, “From very early times, sages and scholars in ancient Israel had made a practice of looking deeply into the meaning of these sacred writings, and, with each new generation, their insights and interpretations were passed on alongside the texts themselves. As a result, as each new age inherited what were to become the Bible’s various books from the previous age, it also inherited a body of traditions about what those texts meant” (James Kugel, *The Bible as It Was* [Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2001], ix).

Adam and his new partner, Eve: Another issue altogether is that a common way to read the narrative surrounding Adam and Eve—in particular Eve’s “birth”—is that there are two different stories presented as a single thread (i.e., Gen. 1:27 vs. 2:21–22). This is not an uncommon literary pattern in the Five Books of Moses, as will be briefly mentioned in the section Literary Criticism.

Adam’s eating the forbidden fruit (Gen. 2:16–17): Some say that Eve was also present when God gave the instruction not to eat from the Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil because, if read linearly, Eve is created in Gen. 1:27 and the tree is eaten from thereafter. Others, however, read the first narrative of Eve’s “birth” (Gen. 1:27) as a general description of the creation of Adam and Eve, and the second narrative, when Eve is created from Adam’s side (Gen. 2:21–22), as a specific description, presented after the tree is eaten from (and thus Eve was not there yet).

*Pri*, “fruit” (Gen. 3:6): Literally, the Hebrew in this verse is *mipiryo*, or “from its fruit,” where “it” refers to the tree discussed in the previous verses.

**To some degree it doesn’t matter** Biblical source: Song of Songs 2:7.

*Paradise Lost*: 9.585. Although many of the interpretations mentioned in this paragraph were made by Christians or emerged out of Christian-majority societies, such interpretations have deeply influenced Jews who have lived in these communities.

**The factuality of the matter was replaced** On depictions of biblical figures, see, e.g., Roland Boer, *Knockin’ on Heaven’s Door: The Bible and Popular Culture* (New York: Routledge, 1999); and Sara Lipton, *Images of Intolerance: The Representa-*

*tion of Jews and Judaism in the Bible* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999).

**FIGURE 2.1** The painting is currently housed in the Museo Nacional del Prado, in Madrid, Spain. In the on-line description of the painting, the fruit is referred to as an apple ([www.museodelprado.es/en/the-collection/online-gallery/online-gallery/obra/adam-and-eve](http://www.museodelprado.es/en/the-collection/online-gallery/online-gallery/obra/adam-and-eve)).

**This same process applies** Jon D. Levenson, *Sinai and Zion: An Entry into the Jewish Bible* (San Francisco: Harper San Francisco, 1985), 17–18.

**The Bible is among the oldest** No single definitive version of the so-called Old Testament: Philip R. Davies, “The Jewish Scriptural Canon in Cultural Perspective,” in McDonald and Sanders (eds.), *Canon Debate*, 50.

**Most relevant for us is the “Hebrew Bible”** The Old Testament is also called the First Testament; see Lee Martin McDonald and James A. Sanders, eds., *The Canon Debate* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson Publishers, 2002).

**SPECIAL TOPIC 2.1** Torah: Aside from serving as a synonym for the Five Books of Moses (Genesis, Exodus, Leviticus, Numbers, and Deuteronomy), and often referring to its form as a scroll, the Hebrew word *torah* can be translated as “teaching” or “instruction.” (For example, years ago I was at a synagogue celebrating the Jewish holiday *Simḥat Torah*; the rabbi leading the night’s rituals mentioned a biblical figure and said, “Now about him, I have so many *torahs*.”) There is evidence that both before and after the Five Books of Moses were canonized, the word *torah* had a much more expansive meaning than that of a scroll containing the five books alone. For a detailed discussion of the various meanings of the term *torah*, see Jacob Neusner, *Torah: From Scroll to Symbol in Formative Judaism* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1985).

Five Books of Moses: The Torah is sometimes referred to as the Five Books of Moses or the *Ḥumash*, the former term pointing to Moses’s attributed authorship or, perhaps, his status as the most important figure in four of the five books (he isn’t mentioned in Genesis), and the latter an abbreviation for the Hebrew *ḥamishah ḥumshei torah* (Five Books of Torah).

Tanakh: The tripartite division of the Bible may have been established by the Mishnaic and Talmudic rabbis. See Davies, “Jewish Scriptural Canon,” 51; and Julio C. Trebelle Barrera, “Origins of a Tripartite Old Testament Canon,” *ibid.*, 128–145.

Prophets and Writings: The books of the Prophets are as follows: Joshua, Judges, I Samuel, II Samuel, I Kings, II Kings, Isaiah, Jeremiah, Ezekiel, Hosea, Joel, Amos, Obadiah, Jonah, Micah, Nahum, Habakkuk, Zephaniah, Haggai, Zechariah, and Malachi. The books of the Writings are as follows: Psalms, Proverbs, Job, Song of Songs, Ruth, Lamentations, Ecclesiastes, Esther, Daniel, Ezra, Nehemiah, I Chronicles, and II Chronicles. Some Hebrew Bibles are made up of twenty-four rather than thirty-nine books; in such cases, the last twelve prophets, sometimes referred to as the Minor Prophets, are grouped together and presented as a single book. In addition, I and II Samuel, I and II Kings, and I and II Chronicles are each combined to form one book each, as

are Ezra and Nehemiah. Another version of the twenty-four-book volume keeps the two books of Samuel, Kings, Chronicles, and Ezra and Nehemiah separate but combines the “Five Scrolls” (Song of Songs, Ruth, Lamentations, Ecclesiastes, and Esther) into one book. See, e.g., “Bible 101,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/bible-101](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/bible-101).

**Masoretic text:** Passed down to us by a group of scholars and scribes called the Masoretes, who lived between the sixth and tenth centuries CE in the Land of Israel. See Benjamin Edidin Scolnic, “Modern Methods of Bible Study,” in *Etz Hayim: Torah and Commentary*, ed. David L. Lieber (New York: Jewish Publication Society, 1999), 1499.

**Septuagint:** Various explanations exist for the name Septuagint, Latin for seventy. One story, perpetuated by Philo (first century BCE to first century CE), Josephus (first century CE), and Augustine of Hippo (fourth century to fifth century CE), among others, is that the Greek King Ptolemy II gathered together seventy (or seventy-two) Jewish scholars to translate the Hebrew Bible into Greek. Although each worked in a separate room and were unable to communicate with one another, the translations were miraculously identical. Another tradition is that the name refers to the seventy elders mentioned in Exod. 24:1, 9. There are also various opinions as to when this version began to be called the Septuagint; see, e.g., Albert C. Sundberg, Jr., “The Septuagint: The Bible of Hellenistic Judaism,” in McDonald and Sanders (eds.), *Canon Debate*, 68–72.

**Septuagint—Different versions of the same verse:** Scolnic, “Modern Methods,” 1499–1500. Other Greek translations of the Bible from this period exist in fragmentary form; see Sundberg, “Septuagint,” 68–90.

**Bottom Line?**—Most Bible scholars work from the Masoretic version exclusively: Emanuel Tov, “The Status of the Masoretic Text in Modern Text Editions of the Hebrew Bible: The Relevance of Canon,” in McDonald and Sanders (eds.), *Canon Debate*, 234–251.

**Before getting into the specifics** The word *canon*, like the Greek *kanōn*, is derived from the Semitic word *kaneh*, meaning measuring rod or stick (McDonald and Sanders, “Introduction,” in *Canon Debate*, 11; Eugene Ulrich, “The Notion and Definition of Canon,” *ibid.*, 22). We do not know definitively when the notion of the canonization of texts emerged or where it originated (Davies, “Jewish Scriptural Canon,” 37).

**Nevertheless, more often than not** On the immutable perception of canons, see Jonathan Z. Smith, *Imagining Religion: From Babylon to Jonestown* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982), 36–52, in particular 44, 48. This book’s definition of a canon is generally unique relative to that of scholars who study ancient texts and have narrower definitions of this concept. See McDonald and Sanders (eds.), *Canon Debate*.

**Since scholars began applying** On the Bible being written in stages, see McDonald and Sanders, “Introduction,” 4.

Compilation between the second century BCE and the first century CE: Ingrid Hjelm, “Samaria, Samaritans, and the

Composition of the Hebrew Bible,” in *Samaritans: Past and Present*, ed. Menachem Mor and Friedrich V. Reiterer (New York: Walter de Gruyter, 2010), 91.

Compilation during the first two centuries CE: Joel Rosenberg, “Bible: A. Biblical Narrative,” in *Back to the Sources: Reading the Classic Jewish Texts*, ed. Barry Holtz (New York: Simon & Schuster Paperbacks, 2006), 33.

Lieberman reference: Saul Lieberman, *Hellenism in Jewish Palestine* (New York: Jewish Theological Seminary of America, 1950), 20–46.

Cohen reference: Shaye J. D. Cohen, *From the Maccabees to the Mishnah* (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1989), 189.

**We don’t know who canonized** On intra-Judean conflict regarding interpretation, see Cohen, *From the Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 133–134. Many scholars assume that these distinct Judean subcommunities all used the same canonized biblical text (*ibid.*, 228–231).

**The unearthing of such texts** Other important ancient Middle Eastern texts that did not make it into the biblical canon include 1 Esdras, 1 and 2 Maccabees, 1 Enoch, the Book of Jubilees, the Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs, the Testament of Moses, and the Wisdom of Solomon. Some theorize that these books were understood by their ancient readers as closer to history than to revealed truth and so were kept separate. See, e.g., James C. VanderKam, *An Introduction to Early Judaism* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2001).

Different versions of the Bible: Associated Press, “Israeli Scholar Completes ‘Mission’ to Fix Bible,” August 10, 2012, [www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4266007,00.html](http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4266007,00.html); Associated Press, “Jewish Scholars Trace Bible’s Evolution,” August 17, 2011, [www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4108569,00.html](http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4108569,00.html).

Bibles written in Aramaic: Cohen, *From the Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 210–211. The earliest extensive list of the biblical canon linked to the Jewish community is referred to in the Babylonian Talmud, which is dated to somewhere between the third and eighth centuries CE.

**Not only do we not know** On the speculated ages of these texts, see Richard Elliott Friedman, *Who Wrote the Bible?* (San Francisco: HarperOne, 1987); and James Kugel, *How to Read the Bible: A Guide to Scripture, Then and Now* (New York: Free Press, 2007), 5.

**In an attempt to reconcile biblical stories** A number of historians of the ancient Middle East maintain that the Bible, in terms of serving as a historical document, especially as related to premonarchical Israel, is “worthless.” This is in part because a great deal of archaeological evidence disputes the biblical account. See, e.g., Alfred J. Andrea and Carolyn Neel, eds., “Israelite Cities,” in *World History Encyclopedia*, vol. 5 (Santa Barbara, CA: ABC-CLIO, 2011), 47–49; Stanley Isser, “Chronology,” in *Encyclopaedia Judaica*, 2nd ed., vol. 4, ed. Michael Berenbaum and Fred Skolnik (Detroit: Macmillan Reference USA, 2007), 704–707; Hershel Shanks, William G. Dever, Baruch Halpern, and P. Kyle McCarter, Jr., *The Rise*

of *Ancient Israel* (Washington, DC: Biblical Archaeology Society, 1992), 5–23.

The theory about the connection between this ancient container and the biblical David, along with its critique, can be found in Matthew Kalman, “Raiders of the Lost Relics,” *Chronicle of Higher Education*, June 18, 2012, <http://chronicle.com/article/Raiders-of-the-Lost-Relics/132247>.

**In the end, as with many other questions** Regarding the unknown origins of the Bible, as Kugel (*How to Read the Bible*, 46) writes: “People used to think X about this or that biblical figure or story or law or prophecy, but now modern scholars claim that Y is actually the case.” He goes on to add that today’s Y may well be replaced by tomorrow’s Z.

Regarding Heschel’s thinking, see Abraham Joshua Heschel, *God in Search of Man* (New York: Farrar Straus Giroux, 1976).

Understanding the Torah as the collective response to the experience at Mount Sinai is one way to describe how the great late-nineteenth- and early-twentieth-century Jewish philosopher Franz Rosenzweig understood the Torah. See Neil Gillman, *Sacred Fragments: Recovering Theology for the Modern Jew* (New York: Jewish Publication Society, 1990), 50.

**Perhaps the biggest question of all** On the irreconcilability of these two ends of the spectrum, see Kugel, *How to Read the Bible*, 681. For a critique of this position, including an argument that Kugel actually reconciles these two seemingly disparate perspectives in his own scholarship, see Benjamin D. Sommer, “Two Introductions to Scripture: James Kugel and the Possibility of Biblical Theology,” *Jewish Quarterly Review* 100, no. 1 (Winter 2010): 153–182.

**Among those who believe the Bible** God gave the Torah to Moses on Mount Sinai, word for word: According to one of the last verses of the Torah: “Moses wrote down this teaching and gave it to the priests, sons of Levi, who carried the Ark of God’s covenant, and to all the elders of Israel” (Deut. 31:9). If one understands “this teaching” to mean the Torah, as do those voices found in the Mishnah and Talmud, one difficulty arises in the fact that Moses dies five verses before the Torah ends (i.e., he dies in Deut. 34:7, yet the text’s last verse is 34:12). Among the various traditional explanations for this discrepancy, two threads prevail: one is that God told Moses about his impending death in advance, so he was able to transcribe his death before it happened; another is that Moses’s successor, Joshua, wrote the last few verses down (BT Baba Batra 15a; JT Peah 17a).

Revelation and inspiration of the Prophets and Writings, respectively: Stephen M. Wylen, *Settings of Silver: An Introduction to Judaism* (New York: Paulist Press, 1989), 12.

Talmudic authorities and the fictionality of specific books found in the Writings: BT Baba Batra 15a.

**For those who believe in the Torah’s divine nature** On human error vs. divine infallibility, see Kugel, *How to Read the Bible*, 14–16.

**Those who maintain** Of course, there are people who believe the Torah is both sacred (if not necessarily divine)

and human-made. Some even argue that seeming inconsistencies and repetitions in the text were inserted purposely by the author(s) to reflect a more multivalent message. See, e.g., Robert Alter, *The Art of Biblical Narrative* (New York: Basic Books, 1981).

**Today’s biblical scholars often echo** On eighteenth- and nineteenth-century scholars who challenged the divinity of the Bible publicly, see Jacob Milgrom, “The Nature of Revelation and Mosaic Origins,” in *Etz Hayim*, 1405–1407.

**This challenge to the divine** One eleventh-century biblical commentator of note was Isaac ibn Yashush, who lived in the Iberian Peninsula (today’s Spain); see Friedman, *Who Wrote the Bible?*, 18–19.

**Perhaps the two most noteworthy Europeans** Thomas Hobbes, *Leviathan*, ed. C. B. Macpherson (New York: Penguin Classics, 1985); Baruch Spinoza, *A Theologico-Political Treatise*, trans. R. H. M. Elwes (New York: Dover Publishers, Inc., 1951).

**Putting aside lone voices** Kugel, *How to Read the Bible*, 664; see also 663–668.

**In other words, modern biblical criticism** Scholars of biblical criticism today often credit their nineteenth-century European predecessors for their initial findings, despite having starkly different core assumptions (i.e., today’s scholars commonly start with the assumption that humans wrote the Torah). As one contemporary scholar explains, “Despite the current trend to disqualify the pioneering work of Julius Wellhausen (1844–1918) on ideological or philosophical grounds, his classic formulation of the documentary hypothesis remains the point of departure for any investigation of the literary development of the Pentateuch. . . . Current scholarship on the Pentateuch sees the origin of the literary complex no longer in four sources woven together by a redactor. Rather its origins lay in several smaller individual narratives as well as in the legal material” (Anselm C. Hagedorn, “Taking the Pentateuch to the Twenty-first Century,” *Expository Times: International Journal of Biblical Studies, Theology and Ministry* 119, no. 2 [November 2007]: 53–58).

**Another way to frame this discussion** On analyzing the Bible as if it were any other text, see Scolnic, “Modern Methods,” 1499–1503.

Other Middle Eastern and African communities with similar stories to those found in the Bible: See Amar Annus, “On the Origin of Watchers: A Comparative Study of the Antediluvian Wisdom in Mesopotamian and Jewish Traditions,” *Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha* 19, no. 4 (2010): 277–320; David Carr, “Torah on the Heart: Literary Jewish Textuality within Its Ancient Near Eastern Context,” *Oral Tradition* 25, no. 1 (March 2010): 17–40. See also Friedman, *Who Wrote the Bible?*; Holtz, *Back to the Sources*; Kugel, *How to Read the Bible*; George Robinson, *Essential Torah: A Complete Guide to the Five Books of Moses* (New York: Schocken Books, 2006).

**Although the editing process** On the Bible as a text of “national history,” see Friedman, *Who Wrote the Bible?*, 230–233; Rosenberg, “Bible,” 36.

Making the Torah more understandable to those living at



the time: John Barton and John Muddiman, eds., *The Oxford Bible Commentary: The Pentateuch* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2001), 45.

**The Documentary Hypothesis** For more on normative understandings of the Mishnah, see H. L. Strack and Günter Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud and Midrash*, trans. Markus Bockmuehl (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1996), 108–148. For recent reexaminations of the Mishnah, specifically approaches designating it not as a legal text but as an expression of the thought of its day, see Christine Hayes, “What Is (the) Mishnah? Concluding Observations,” *Association of Jewish Studies Review* 32, no. 2 (November 2008): 291–297; Ishay Rosen-Zvi, “Orality, Narrative, Rhetoric: New Directions in Mishnah Research,” *Association of Jewish Studies Review* 32, no. 2 (November 2008): 235–249. See also chapter 5.

According to Jacob Neusner, the earliest source stating that the Mishnah is part of the Oral Torah is the Jerusalem Talmud; see Neusner, *Judaism and Christianity in the Age of Constantine* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987), 133. This is explored in more detail in chapter 5.

**The distinction between the Written Torah** The quote is from Solomon Buber, ed., *Midrash Tanhuma* (Wilna, 1885), Ki Tissa 34, 58b, in Elliot N. Dorff and Arthur Rosett, *A Living Tree: The Roots and Growth of Jewish Law* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1988), 20.

**Some maintain that the Oral Torah** Regarding Menachem Mendel of Rymanov, see Gershom Scholem, *On the Kabbalah and Its Symbolism*, trans. Ralph Manheim (New York: Schocken Books, 1965), 30.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 2.2** Laws surrounding tefillin: Jeffrey H. Tigay, “T’fillin and M’zuzot,” in *Etz Hayim*, 1464–1466.

During daily morning prayers: Figures 2.2 and 5.3 aside, according to the rabbinic authorities at the seminary where I studied at the time, females in their women’s-affiliate school were prohibited from wearing tefillin, despite Orthodox halakhic [acc. to Jewish law] interpretations to the contrary. A side note is that all Jews are halakhically prohibited from wearing tefillin on the Jewish Sabbath, *Shabbat*.

Torah verses: Exod. 13:9, 16; Deut. 6:8, 11:18.

**Most non-Orthodox Jews** On the historical development of the Oral Torah, see Eliezer Berkovits, *Not in Heaven: The Nature and Function of Halakha* (New York: Ktav Publishing, 1983); Binyamin Lau, *The Sages: Character, Context, and Creativity*, vol. 1: *The Second Temple Period*, trans. Michael Prawer (Jerusalem: Maggid Books, 2013); Michael Rosensweig, “Mesorah as Halachic Source and Sensibility,” *Jewish Action: The Magazine of Orthodox Judaism*, May 26, 2011, [www.ou.org/jewish\\_action/05/2011/mesorah\\_as\\_halachic\\_source\\_and\\_sensibility](http://www.ou.org/jewish_action/05/2011/mesorah_as_halachic_source_and_sensibility); and Norman Solomon, *Torah from Heaven: The Reconstruction of Faith* (Portland, OR: Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2012).

Talmudic claim that the Mishnah is the Oral Torah: Neusner, *Judaism and Christianity*, 135–137; idem, *Torah*, 17–19. That said, there are passages in the Mishnah claiming that the laws described are definitive because, according to the

Prophets, Moses received the explanation for them on Mount Sinai and passed these traditions on to future generations (M. Pe’ah 2:6).

**The Talmudic rabbis believed** On the legitimate interpreters of the Torah, see Daniel Gordis, “Revelation: Biblical and Rabbinic Perspectives,” in *Etz Hayim*, 1394–1398; Neusner, *Judaism and Christianity*, 133–135; Paul Socken, ed., *Why Study Talmud in the Twenty-first Century: The Relevance of the Ancient Jewish Text to Our World* (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2009). See also BT Baba Metziah 59b.

**Scholar Michael Fishbane** Michael Fishbane, *The Garments of Torah: Essays in Biblical Interpretation* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1989), 3–4.

Revelation as ongoing: For example, as explained by twentieth- and twenty-first-century Modern Orthodox Rabbi David Hartman: “When Jews built their civilization around a sacred text, they viewed the text not as a closed and final word, but as a starting point for creative interpretation” (David Hartman, *A Living Covenant* [Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 1997], 222, quoted in Danielle Celermajer, *The Sins of the Nation and the Ritual of Apologies* [New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009], 102). In support of this idea, some also cite a centuries-old prayer said before one recites from a Torah scroll, “Blessed be God who gives us the Torah,” pointing to the present tense of the verb rather than past (Celermajer, *Sins of the Nation*, 82).

**This is a dominant idea in the Reform movement** On Reform as the largest American movement, see Pew Research Center, “U.S. Religious Landscape Survey,” February 2008, [www.pewforum.org/files/2013/05/report-religious-landscape-study-full.pdf](http://www.pewforum.org/files/2013/05/report-religious-landscape-study-full.pdf).

“Revelation is a continuous process”: From “The Columbus Platform: The Guiding Principles of Reform Judaism” (1937), available at [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/Judaism/Columbus\\_platform.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/Judaism/Columbus_platform.html). The Reform movement echoed the first part of this statement in their 1999 platform, saying: “We cherish the truths revealed in Torah, God’s ongoing revelation to our people and the record of our people’s relationship with God” (Central Conference of American Rabbis, “A Statement of Principles for Reform Judaism,” adopted at the 1999 Pittsburgh convention, [www.ccarnet.org/rabbis-speak/platforms/statement-principles-reform-judaism](http://www.ccarnet.org/rabbis-speak/platforms/statement-principles-reform-judaism)).

Solomon Schechter: This is one reading of Solomon Schechter’s position; see Allen Selis, “Jewish Denominations on Revelation: From Sinai to Schism,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-denominations-on-revelation](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-denominations-on-revelation).

Martin Buber and Franz Rosenzweig: Elliot N. Dorff, “Medieval and Modern Theories of Revelation,” in *Etz Hayim*, 1399–1405; Steven Kepnes, “Revelation as Torah: From an Existential to a Postliberal Judaism,” *Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy* 10, no. 1 (October 2000): 224–237.

**Whatever position one takes** The Hebrew term for the Children—or Sons—of Israel is *bnei yisrael*. In Gen. 35:10, Jacob’s name is changed to Israel. Hence, the biblical Isra-

elites are the descendants of Jacob's twelve sons. (Jacob's daughter, Dinah, is excluded.)

On Moses and the Israelites, see Friedman, *Who Wrote the Bible?*, 35–36; Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 15–86. Although the Torah often refers to Moses, a member of the Israelite tribe of Levi, as a Hebrew, there is also a reference to one of Moses's forefathers having been an Aramean who went down to Egypt (Num. 26:5). Sometimes this is interpreted as referring to Abraham's grandson Jacob, which has led some to speculate that Abraham was Aramean as well. More definitively, we are told that Jacob's mother, Rebekah, was of Aramean descent through her father, Betuel (Gen. 25:20, 28:5). Other times Moses's Aramean ancestry is linked to Abraham only, who goes down to Egypt in Gen. 26:1–4.

**As for the second and third sections** On categorizing the Bible, see Kugel, *How to Read the Bible*, 5–7.

**Another way to organize** Holtz, *Back to the Sources*, 11–127.

**Two of the many ways** The word *mitzvot* (sing. *mitzvah*) is also commonly translated as “commandments,” as in the Ten Commandments, or (inaccurately) “good deeds.”

According to virtually all understandings of Jewish law today, whereas a Jew is obligated to perform 613 mitzvot, a non-Jew is required to follow the Seven Mitzvot of the Sons of Noah. See Michael Kress, “The Modern Noahide Movement,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-modern-noahide-movement](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-modern-noahide-movement); Jeffrey Spitzer, “The Noahide Laws,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-noahide-laws](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-noahide-laws).

**The Talmud cites only one individual** Rabbi Simlai (BT Makkot 23b).

On the 613 mitzvot as “common knowledge”: BT Nedarim 25a; BT Shevuoth 29a.

**In fact, the same passage** On different accountings of the mitzvot, see BT Makkot 24a.

**Over time Jewish authorities** Some divide the mitzvot into those laws that are ethical and those that are ritualistic. Others delineate between those observances carried out between humans and those between humans and God. Still others frame them in terms of being either casuistic or apodictic, with the former manifesting in terms of “if/when . . . then” statements, legal formulae quite similar to those from other ancient Middle East textual traditions (and usually including punishment/reward), and the latter seen as directives—“you shall/shall not do such and such”—something unique among other ancient Middle East communities (and usually framed using the second person pronoun with no mention about punishment or reward). See Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 46–48, 50–56.

On 613 becoming the dominant understanding of the number of mitzvot, see Louis Jacobs, “Classical Understandings of *Mitzvot* and Their Reasons,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/classical-understandings-of-mitzvot-and-their-reasons](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/classical-understandings-of-mitzvot-and-their-reasons).

**For Jews, the Torah is the core** On the Prophets and Writings as containing the first interpretations of the Torah,

see James Kugel, lecture, “Early Biblical Interpretation,” Harvard University, February 8, 2000.

**Some Jews even maintain** Torah as “blueprint for creation”: BT Nedarim 39b; BT Pesachim 54a.

Mishnaic rabbi: M. Avot 5:26.

**Many Jews across the globe** According to the dominant rabbinic interpretation of the Torah, the halakhic calendar year is a combination of a solar and a lunar cycle. This ensures that Jewish holidays always land in the same general time of year. For more on this unique system, see “Jewish Calendar: Solar and Lunar,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-calendar-solar-and-lunar/](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-calendar-solar-and-lunar/).

Annual cyclical reading of the Torah: Whereas many Jewish communities that engage in regular Torah study read one section of the Five Books of Moses every week (with fifty-four sections, this requires that during two weeks of the year a double section be read), some communities read one-third of each section every week, which means it takes them three years to complete the entire text. Both traditions are found in the Talmud. See Joseph Jacobs, “Triennial Cycle,” *Jewish Encyclopedia* (1906), [www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/14508-triennial-cycle](http://www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/14508-triennial-cycle); Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction*, 241–243. Some scholars, however, maintain that there were communities in the Land of Israel that read through the Torah not over the course of one or three years, but rather three and a half or four years; see Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction*, 241.

Torah made from animal skin: Robinson, *Essential Torah*, 9–21.

Making the Torah ink: BT Baba Batra 14b.

**FIGURE 2.2** *Minyan*: See chapter 8 for different denominational interpretations of the composition of a minyan.

For a critique of this image from an egalitarian perspective, see Renee Ghert-Zand, “Why the *Tefillin* Barbie *Minyan* Gives Me the Creeps,” *Jewish Daily Forward*, September 29, 2010, <http://forward.com/sisterhood/131752/why-the-tefillin-barbie-minyan-gives-me-the-creeps>.

During 2013 and 2014, Jewish media sources reported a small number of isolated situations where Orthodox Jewish women chose to wear tefillin in prayer settings. See, e.g., Maya Shwayder, “Orthodox Day Schools to Allow Women to Don *Tefillin* at Daily *Minyan*,” *Jerusalem Post*, January 23, 2014, [www.jpost.com/Jewish-World/Jewish-News/Orthodox-day-schools-to-allow-women-to-don-tefillin-at-daily-minyan-339090](http://www.jpost.com/Jewish-World/Jewish-News/Orthodox-day-schools-to-allow-women-to-don-tefillin-at-daily-minyan-339090).

**FIGURE 2.3** Jen Taylor Friedman also designed figure 2.2, *Minyan of Tefillin Barbie*.

**Jewish law states** Transmission of Oral Torah from Moses to the Mishnaic rabbis: M. Avot 1:1.

**If one's first visit to a synagogue** Third Commandment/Directive: Exod. 20:4–5.

*Heikhal* or *eikhal*: “Ark,” *JewishVirtualLibrary*, [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/judaica/ejud\\_0002\\_0002\\_0\\_01315.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/judaica/ejud_0002_0002_0_01315.html).

**This is but one example** One example of *logos* as the word of God is the Christian Bible's book of John.

**Another way to understand the observance** Although the Torah begins with the creation of the world, it also states that the first month of the Hebrew calendar year is Nissan (Exod. 12:1–2), the month in which the biblical Israelites fled Pharaoh and his soldiers by escaping into the Sinai desert, as well as the month in which Pesah is observed. By the time of the Mishnah, however, rabbinic authorities claimed that the start of the Jewish calendar year, which begins with the annual holiday Rosh Hashanah, is Tishrei, not Nissan—even though the Torah describes Tishrei as the seventh month (M. Rosh Hashanah 1:1). To make matters slightly more complicated, the rabbis of the Mishnah explain this seeming contradiction by noting that there are four possible times to start a new year in the Jewish calendar, two each falling in Tishrei and Nissan (BT Rosh Hashanah 2a–4b).

“Cosmogonic time” and reactualizing God's cosmic plan through ritual: Eliade, *Myth of Eternal Return*, 51–92.

**Annually reenacting events in the Torah** On ritual as a return to an original event, see Robert A. Segal, *Theorizing about Myth* (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1999), 22. Note that this isn't to say that a religious tradition cannot have rituals that are both historical and ahistorical simultaneously (Eliade, *Myth of Eternal Return*, 104–105).

**The Torah's dominant narrative** Aside from the descriptions found in the Bible, we know that other societies mentioned therein were also patriarchal. See, e.g., Tikva Frymer-Kensky, “The Bible and Women's Studies,” in *Feminist Perspectives on Jewish Studies*, ed. Lynn Davidman and Shelly Tenenbaum (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1994), 16–39, who points to various contemporary methods of reading the Bible that are nonpatriarchal (24–31). Even if one argues that there were female-inclusive or even female-centric understandings of the Torah prior to the latter half of the twentieth century, such as those found in the sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Torah commentary *Tze'nah U'r'enh*, it was not until the last few decades that these texts emerged as part of a new genre of Jewish writing (Robinson, *Essential Torah*, 194–195).

Only since the 1990s: Some of the scholars referred to here are addressed in detail in chapter 5.

**It is well accepted** Tamar Ross, in Robinson, *Essential Torah*, 210.

**Of course, male dominance** The first study mentioned analyzed 250 children's books, whereas the second looked at 3,500; see Motoko Rich, “For Young Latino Readers, an Image Is Missing,” *New York Times*, December 5, 2012.

Marginalizing specific voices: Consider the manifestation of hegemony in such disparate realms as the American criminal justice system and the video game industry. See, e.g., Paul Crawshaw, Alex Scott-Samuel, and Debbi Stanistreet, “Masculinities, Hegemony, and Structural Violence,” *Criminal Justice Matters* 81, no. 1 (September 2010): 2–4; Janet C. Dunlop, “The U.S. Video Game Industry: Analyzing Representation

of Gender and Race,” *International Journal of Technology and Human Interaction* 3, no. 2 (April 2007): 96–109.

**A great deal of Jewish life** Prophets referencing characters in the Torah: E.g., Mal. 1:2.

References in Isaiah: E.g., Abraham—Isa. 29:22, 41:8, 51:2, 63:16; Sarah—51:2; Jacob—27:6, 29:22, 41:8, 44:1, 45:4.

Talmudic interpretation of Isaiah referencing the mitzvot: BT Makkot 23b–24a, Sanhedrin 81a.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 2.3** Texts in order from left to right: Nahum M. Sarna, trans. and ed., *The JPS Torah Commentary: Genesis* (New York: The Jewish Publication Society, 1989), 31–34; Wayne E. Meeks, ed., *The HarperCollins Study Bible, New Revised Standard Version* (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, 1993), 10–11; Everett Fox, trans., *The Five Books of Moses* (New York: Schocken Books, 1995), 24–27.

**While some might say** As stated in one ancient Jewish text, “One who translates a verse literally is a liar; one who adds to it is a blasphemer” (BT Kid. 49, based on Daniel C. Matt, trans., *The Zohar*, Pritzker ed., vol. 1 [Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2004], xviii).

**Over the years, Jews have developed** Homiletical: A homily is a short talk on a religious or moral topic, commonly rooted in biblical texts, such as a sermon delivered by a rabbi.

These four methods of interpretation: According to scholar A. van der Heide, although there are general understandings of the terms *pshat*, *drash*, *remez*, and *sod* today, it is difficult to accurately define them decisively over time (A. van der Heide, “PARDES: Methodological Reflections on the Theory of the Four Senses,” *Journal of Jewish Studies* 34, no. 2 [1983]: 156). Scholar Zvi Zohar agrees, noting that Maimonides, for instance, contests the translation of *pshat* as “literal,” pointing out that the biblical description of God having an “outstretched arm” cannot be understood literally but only has a metaphorical meaning, “with great power” (Zvi Zohar, email message to author, February 2, 2015).

In its form as an acronym for *peshat*, *remez*, *drash*, and *sod*, many today incorrectly attribute the term PaRDeS to the Talmud, where the word appears in the context of a story told about four individuals who “go into *pardes*,” which some understand to mean an orchard (BT Hag. 14b). Although the Talmud introduces the general notion that verses of Torah can be interpreted in multiple ways (i.e., BT Sanhedrin 34a based on Jer. 23:29 and Num Rab. 13:15, which states that there are seventy ways of interpreting the Torah), it does not introduce these four ways in particular.

As for theories on the origins of these four methods of interpretation, some maintain that Christians and/or Muslims should be credited as the originators. See, e.g., Frederick E. Greenspahn, “The Significance of Hebrew Philology for the Development of a Literal and Historical Jewish Bible Interpretation,” in *Hebrew Bible Old Testament: The History of Its Interpretation*, vol. 1, part 2, ed. Magne Sæbo (Göttingen, Ger.: Vandenhoeck und Ruprecht, 2000), 56–57; Erwin I.J. Rosenthal, “Anti-Christian Polemic in Medieval Bible



Commentaries,” *Journal of Jewish Studies* 11, nos. 3–4 (1960): 115–135.

**Applying these methods to verses** For example, Everett Fox integrates this interpretation into his translation (i.e., that Cain and Abel are twins), but the JPS and HarperCollins translations do not. See also Sarna (trans. and ed.), *JPS Torah Commentary*, 32, note for “his brother.”

**As for a drash understanding** Midrash of Cain being born a twin (who was not Abel) and Abel being born a triplet: Gen. Rab. 22:1–4.

**As for an interpretive approach** Source of this sōd reading of the Torah: Zohar 2:167b–2:168a, in Daniel C. Matt, trans. and comm., *The Zohar*, Pritzker ed., vol. 5 (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2009), 472–473. This tradition is also based on a passage from BT Shab. 146a. See also special topic 6.3.

**As scholar** Judith Plaskow, “The Right Is Theological,” in *On Being a Jewish Feminist*, ed. Susannah Heschel (New York: Schocken, 1983), 228.

Daly quote: Mary Daly, *Beyond God the Father* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1973), in Heschel (ed.), *On Being a Jewish Feminist*, xxi.

Torah referring to God using male terms: Hebrew is a gendered language such that nouns and verbs are always feminine or masculine. Only one time in the Torah is God not referred to using a male pronoun: in the book of Genesis, when it says that humans are created in God’s image, the text uses the first person plural pronoun *we* (Gen. 1:27).

Languages where masculine terms are the norm: Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza, *In Memory of Her: A Feminist Theological Reconstruction of Christian Origins* (New York: Crossroad, 1998), xix. Or take the following: “The Jewish theology we so uncritically accept as ‘Jewish’ was written by men for men. Yet it is never referred to as ‘male theology.’ On the other hand, when women write theology that takes into account their experiences, their needs, the impact of male theology on their lives, their work is labeled ‘feminist theology’” (Donna Berman, “Major Trends in Feminist Theology: The Work of Rachel Adler, Judith Plaskow, and Rebecca Alpert,” in *New Jewish Feminism: Probing the Past, Forging the Future*, ed. Elyse Goldstein [Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 2009], 12).

**In other words, the fact that** This statement by Plaskow continues as follows: “The long-suppressed femaleness of God, acknowledged in the mystical tradition, but even here shaped and articulated by men, must be recovered and reexplored and reintegrated into the Godhead” (Plaskow, “The Right Is Theological,” 231–232). Going still further, Plaskow calls for an acknowledgment of “the profound injustice of Torah itself” (Plaskow, *Standing Again*, 226). See also chapter 5 for more on Plaskow and her understanding of male hegemony in terms of halakhah.

**In contrast, scholar** Rachel Adler, *Engendering Judaism: An Inclusive Theology and Ethics* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1998), 101. Building on Robert Cover’s renowned essay “Nomos and

Narrative,” Adler refers to the context in which Jews speak about God as the Jewish *nomos* (xiv–xv, 96–99). See Robert Cover, “Nomos and Narrative,” in *Narrative, Violence, and the Law*, ed. Martha Minow, Michael Ryan, and Austin Sarat (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1995), 95–172. See also chapter 5 for more on Adler and her understanding of male hegemony in terms of halakhah.

**Aside from God** Seth’s birth: Gen. 4:25.

**In the narrative about Jacob** Jacob’s name change to Israel: Gen. 32:29. See also M. Avot 5:2–3.

The “mixed multitude”: Exod. 12:37–38. One scholar argues that evidence points to no more than 75,000 Israelites living in thirteenth-century BCE Land of Israel; see Shanks et al., *Rise of Ancient Israel*, 43.

**One way to understand** On Jewish Israeli understandings of Jews being chosen by God due to their extraordinary characteristics, see Asher Arian et al., “A Portrait of Israeli Jews: Beliefs, Observance, and Values of Israeli Jews, 2009,” *Guttman Center for Surveys of the Israel Democracy Institute* (Jerusalem: Israel Democracy Institute and AVI CHAI-Israel, 2012), 50–51, available at [avichai.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/01/A-Portrait-of-Israeli-Jews.pdf](http://avichai.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/01/A-Portrait-of-Israeli-Jews.pdf); Ami Kaufman, “Poll: 70% of Israeli Jews Believe Jews are ‘Chosen People,’” January 27, 2012, [972mag.com/poll-shows-israel-slowly-but-surely-turning-into-a-theocracy/33989](http://972mag.com/poll-shows-israel-slowly-but-surely-turning-into-a-theocracy/33989).

More on chosenness: Raphael Jospe, “The Concept of the Chosen People,” *Judaism* 43, no. 2 (Spring 1994): 127–148; Jacob Neusner, *Messiah in Context: Israel’s History and Destiny in Formative Judaism* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1984), 204–212; “What Do American Jews Believe? A Symposium,” *Commentary* (August 1996): 18–96.

**It is easy to grasp** Contextualized within the rest of the Torah narrative, a reader might easily assume that God chose Abraham because he was an extraordinary person with one-of-a-kind kindness. Abraham’s uniqueness is also discussed below, in the section titled “Chosenness as Choosing Different Things.”

**The idea of the Israelites’ uniqueness** Repeated elsewhere in the Torah: Exod. 19:5; Deut. 14:2, 26:18.

**One of many rabbinic texts** Simeon ben Yohai quote: Lev. Rab. 13:2, in Hayim Nahman Bialik and Yehoshua Hana Ravnitzky, eds., *The Book of Legends: Legends from the Talmud and Midrash*, trans. William G. Braude (New York: Schocken Books, 1992), 106.

Other prayers voicing gratitude for God having chosen Jews: Dan Cohn-Sherbock, *Judaism: History, Belief and Practice* (London: Routledge, 2003), 426–431.

**The eleventh- and twelfth-century philosopher** Yehuda Halevi, *The Kuzari: In Defense of the Despised Faith*, trans. N. Daniel Korobkin (Northvale, NJ: Jason Aronson Inc., 1998), 15, 35–38, 45–48, 98, 203.

Becoming tainted with impurity: Halevi, *The Kuzari*, 92.

Texts focusing on the unique humility of Jews: “[The verse] ‘It was not because you were greater than any people that the Lord set His love upon you and chose you, but because

you were ‘the humblest of all peoples’ (Deut. 7:7) means that the Holy One said to Israel: I love you because even when I shower greatness upon you, you humble yourselves before me” (BT Hul. 89a, in Bialik and Ravnitzky [eds.], *Book of Legends*, 335).

Medieval scholars who echoed similar ideas: Cohn-Sherbock, *Judaism*, 427.

**In contrast, a number of contemporary Jews** On Kaplan’s rejection of chosenness, see Mordecai M. Kaplan, *The Future of the American Jew* (New York: Macmillan, 1948), 211–230.

Baruch Spinoza reference: Spinoza, *A Theologico-Political Treatise*, 43–56, esp. 55.

**The following statement, made by scholar** Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 10–11.

**All of this said, such voices** On Abraham’s rational path to monotheism, see Jospe, “The Concept of the Chosen People.”

**Another thread in this school** The idea that God came to the Jews after all other nations (Sifrei, Deut. 343) is a midrash (see chapter 5) on a phrase from Exod. 24:7 that also appears in Exod. 19:8. See Bialik and Ravnitzky, *Book of Legends*, 78–79.

Israelites choosing God’s laws rather than God choosing them: This tradition usually builds on the biblical phrase *‘am segulah* (Deut. 7:6), often translated as “a treasured nation.” See, e.g., Samson Raphael Hirsch’s commentary on Exod. 19 and Deut. 7, 14 in *Collected Writings of Rabbi Samson Raphael Hirsch* (Nanuet, NY: Feldheim Publishers, 1997). Some also cite the phrase *or la-goyim*, “a light unto the nations,” though this term does not appear in the Hebrew Bible. The closest biblical rendering, which appears in Isa. 42:6 and 49:6, is *le-or hagoyim*, or “a light of the nations” (Jospe, “The Concept and the Chosen People”).

**According to yet another trend** God picked up Mount Sinai: BT Shabbat 88a, in Bialik and Ravnitzky (eds.), *The Book of Legends*, 79.

**All of these positions are founded** A biblical source that all Jewish souls were present at Mount Sinai: Deut. 29:13–14. Rabbinic sources: Midrash Tanchuma, Nitzavim 3; Rashi and Sforno on Deut. 29:14.

“Great voice that never stopped”: Benjamin D. Sommer, “The Religion of Torah,” in *Theology in Our Time: A New Generation Explores the Foundations and the Future of Jewish Belief*, ed. Elliot J. Cosgrove (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 2010), 71–78.

**Perhaps the greatest challenge** Tension between an unchanging text and ever-changing interpretations: As scholar Judith Plaskow writes, “Revelation may surprise us and destroy our preconceptions, but it must compete with language already in place” (Plaskow, *Standing Again*, 20).

**Over the last fifteen years** On the emergence of queer Jewish voices, see, e.g., Rebecca T. Alpert, Sue Levi Elwell, and Shirly Idelson, eds., *Lesbian Rabbis: The First Generation* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2001); Evelyn Torton

Beck, ed., *Nice Jewish Girls: A Lesbian Anthology* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1989); Daniel Boyarin, Daniel Itzkovitz, and Ann Pellegrini, eds., *Queer Theory and the Jewish Question* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003); Noach Dzmura, ed., *Balancing on the Mehitza: Transgender in Jewish Community* (Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic Books, 2010); Gregg Drinkwater, Joshua Lesser, and David Shneer, eds., *Torah Queeries: Weekly Commentaries on the Hebrew Bible* (New York: New York University Press, 2009); Miriam Kabakov, ed., *Keep Your Wives Away from Them* (Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic Books, 2010); Joy Ladin, *Through the Door of Life: A Jewish Journey between Genders* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2012); Andrew Ramer, *Queering the Text: Biblical, Medieval, and Modern Jewish Stories* (Maple Shade, NJ: White Crane Books, 2010); Lawrence Shimel, *Found Tribe: Jewish Coming Out Stories* (Santa Fe, NM: Sherman Asher Publishing, 2002); and David Shneer and Caryn Aviv, eds., *Queer Jews* (New York: Routledge, 2002).

### Chapter 3. Zions

This chapter addresses contemporary notions of Zionism, reborn and popularized toward the end of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, only in a cursory fashion. Instead, its focus is the idea of “Zion” and not the various ideologies called Zionism. Distinct understandings of contemporary Zionism are explored in chapter 10.

**I was in one of the oldest synagogues** For the history of the founding of Congregation Sherith Israel, see Fred Rosenbaum, *Cosmopolitans: A Social and Cultural History of the Jews of the San Francisco Bay Area* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2009), 16–17.

Founded by Orthodox Jews: As explained in chapter 8, the synagogue’s founders may not have identified as Orthodox, per se. Either way, retroactively, their ritual practices fall into contemporary understandings of the movement called Orthodoxy.

**One way that Jews have been able** On Jews’ “portable identity,” see Frédéric Brenner, *Diaspora* (2003) [DVD].

**Another way lies in** This is to say nothing about the way that Zion replaced, or perhaps displaced, Sinai. See, e.g., Hershel Shanks, William G. Dever, Baruch Halpern, and P. Kyle McCarter, Jr., *The Rise of Ancient Israel* (Washington, DC: Biblical Archaeology Society, 1992), 128.

**But on closer inspection** Flags depicted in stained glass: “Sherith Israel Stained Glass Windows,” exhibit wall text, “California Dreaming: Jewish Life in the Bay Area from the Gold Rush to the Present,” Contemporary Jewish Museum, Nov. 17, 2011–April 28, 2013, courtesy of Claire Frost, curatorial assistant, email to author, April 24, 2013.

**In this stained glass picture** *Di Goldene Medina*: Some transliterate this phrase as *di Goldene Medine*.

On the connection between this Yiddish phrase and the notions of freedom, justice, and opportunity, see Rosen-

baum, *Cosmopolitans*, 107–108; Leo Rosten, *The Joys of Yiddish* (New York: Random House, Inc., 2001), 128; Daniel Schifren, “Then and Now: Window Reflects New Promised Land,” May 24, 2012, [www.jweekly.com/article/full/65321/then-and-now-window-reflects-new-promised-land](http://www.jweekly.com/article/full/65321/then-and-now-window-reflects-new-promised-land).

San Francisco as the new Jerusalem: As scholar Marc Dollinger explains, “This really was the promised land. The first Jews in San Francisco considered their city to be the new Jerusalem” (Emma Silvers, “‘California Dreaming’ Exhibit Celebrates Pioneering Jewish Spirit of the West,” November 10, 2011, [www.jweekly.com/article/full/63439/exhibit-celebrates-pioneering-jewish-spirit-of-the-west](http://www.jweekly.com/article/full/63439/exhibit-celebrates-pioneering-jewish-spirit-of-the-west)). Similarly, a great deal of evidence suggests that many American Jews considered the United States to be Zion. Take the following statement, made by a Jewish American in 1949: “For Americans, America is Zion; but for Jews even the achievement of a Jewish state does not make Zion attained” (Daniel J. Boorstin, “A Dialogue of Two Histories: Jewish Contributions to America in a New Light,” *Commentary*, October 1949, 313). See also Alice A. Butler-Smith, “Diaspora Nationality vs. Diaspora Nationalism: American Jewish Identity and Zionism after the Jewish State,” *Israel Affairs* 15, no. 2 (April 2009): 164–165.

**Although the concept of Zion** As is discussed later in this chapter, Israel and Zion are often used synonymously. On Jefferson’s idea of putting *Israel* on the seal of the United States of America, see Edward Alexander, “Where Is Zion?,” in *Israel and Zion in American Judaism: The Zionist Fulfillment*, ed. Jacob Neusner (New York: Garland Publishing, 1993), 13; Ava Fran Kahn and Ellen Eisenberg, “Western Reality: Jewish Diversity during the ‘German’ Period,” *American Jewish History* 92, no. 4 (December 2004): 455–479.

**One dominant Jewish narrative today** The term “Land of Israel” doesn’t appear in the Bible until 1 Sam. 13:19. Thereafter, it is repeated in the book of Ezekiel, among other places.

Zion as nexus of God and humanity: Jon D. Levenson, *Sinai and Zion: An Entry into the Jewish Bible* (San Francisco: Harper San Francisco, 1985), 122–123.

**In *The Starfish and the Spider*** Ori Brafman and Rod A. Beckstrom, *The Starfish and the Spider: The Unstoppable Power of Leaderless Organizations* (New York: Portfolio, 2006), 35.

Technically, starfish (referred to by marine scientists as sea stars) require at least part of the central disk to be intact in order to regenerate; see National Geographic, “Starfish [Sea Star],” <http://animals.nationalgeographic.com/animals/invertebrates/starfish>.

**Most twenty-first-century communities** For the term “diasporic Jews,” see, e.g., Doreen Carvajal, “A Tepid ‘Welcome Back’ for Spanish Jews,” *New York Times*, December 8, 2012, [www.nytimes.com/2012/12/09/sunday-review/a-tepid-welcome-back-for-spanish-jews.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2012/12/09/sunday-review/a-tepid-welcome-back-for-spanish-jews.html); Michael Frank, “A Haunting Legacy in Provence,” *New York Times*, December 17, 2000, [www.nytimes.com/2000/12/17/travel/a-haunting-legacy-in-provence.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2000/12/17/travel/a-haunting-legacy-in-provence.html); Martha Schwendener, “The Diaspora is Mixed,” *New York Times*, March 22, 2012,

[www.nytimes.com/2012/03/23/arts/design/the-diaspora-is-remixed.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2012/03/23/arts/design/the-diaspora-is-remixed.html).

**Take, for example, some of the evidence** Charles London, *Far from Zion: In Search of a Global Jewish Community* (New York: William Morrow, 2009), 142, 154–155.

**London observed this same phenomenon** As London notes about Ugandan Jews, Nabugoye Hill was “their own version of the promised land” (London, *Far from Zion*, 172). In the words of one man: “We are Ugandans and we are Jews. But for us, this, Nabugoye, is like our Jerusalem” (ibid., 184–185).

Iran as Jerusalem, Zion, or Promised Land: Consider the following statements, made by Jews in Iran: “The Muslims of Iran have their city of Qom. The Jews [of Iran] have Shiraz. It is our Jerusalem” (London, *Far from Zion*, 217); “‘Would you ever move to Israel?’ we asked him. ‘Me?’ he scratched his head and laughed. ‘No. I like it there; it’s okay. But this is my home, here in Iran. This is where I am comfortable. You have heard the old saying about this city? ‘Esfahan is half the world’” (ibid., 219).

Cuba as Jerusalem, Zion, or Promised Land: As one Cuban Jew told London, “I love Israel, but Cuba is my home. I love it here . . . it is where I am most comfortable. It’s a special place. There is nowhere in the world like Cuba. Or like Israel. They are similar in that way” (London, *Far from Zion*, 248).

**Of course, these countries** For example, Vilna, Lithuania, was known for centuries as “Jerusalem” or the “Jerusalem of Lithuania.”

Brenner references: Frédéric Brenner, email to author, February 12, 2013.

Uzbekistani Jewish custom: Sidra D. Ezrahi, *Booking Passage: Exile and Homecoming in the Modern Jewish Imagination* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000), 236–237.

Saying “Next Year in Jerusalem” even when one is in Jerusalem itself points to physical and metaphysical understandings of Jerusalem.

**As London explains** Charles London, email to author, February 20, 2013.

**London’s book reinforces the notion** London’s reinforcement of the notion of Israel as Zion and of Zion as lying outside the Land of Israel is reflected in the title of his final chapter, “Zion,” which discusses Jews in Israel, as well as in passages such as the following: “[Cuban] Jews who moved to Israel were not seen as abandoning the revolution but as returning to their national homeland” (London, *Far from Zion*, 237). Elsewhere London uses the term *diaspora* when referring to geographical locations outside the State of Israel (ibid., 126, 199) and *Zion* in lieu of the State of Israel, as in “a return to Zion,” or *Promised Land* (ibid., 186–187).

“Anchor and ship” quote: Charles London, email to author, February 20, 2013.

**One of the most common ways** Jonathan Z. Smith, *To Take Place: Toward Theory in Ritual* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992), 109. For Catherine Bell, a scholar of ritual studies, Smith’s ideas regarding ritual are correct. In



her seminal work, *Ritual*, Bell asserts that “talk about ritual may reveal more about the speakers than about the bespoken.” She continues: “The theoretical construction of ritual becomes a reflection of the theorist’s method and the motor of discourse in which the concerns of the theorist take center stage.” Thus, similar to Smith, Bell argues that rituals do not surround ontologically sacred events or actions, but rather make those events or actions sacred (Catherine Bell, *Ritual: Perspectives and Dimensions* [New York: Oxford University Press, 1997], xi, 81).

**As an example of how an object** Marcel Vogel and Masaru Emoto have conducted research to determine whether the molecular structure of water that has and has not been blessed differs. The 2006 documentary *Water: The Great Mystery*, by Saida Medvedeva and Vasilii Anisimov, includes some of Emoto’s research on this topic. I thank Gabe Goldman and Andrew Ramer for bringing this research to my attention.

As Smith elaborates, “A ritual object or action becomes sacred by having attention focused on it in a highly marked way. From such a point of view, there is nothing that is inherently sacred or profane. These are not substantive categories, but rather situational ones. Sacrality is, above all, a category of emplacement” (Smith, *To Take Place*, 104).

**For the Jewish community, Zion** King David’s taking of Zion from the Jebusites is told in 2 Sam. 5:6–10. Although the prebiblical meanings of the word *zion* are uncertain, suggestions include a rock, stronghold, dry place, and running water; see Michael Berenbaum and Fred Skolnick, eds., “Zion,” in *Encyclopedia Judaica*, 2nd ed., vol. 21 (Detroit: Macmillan, 2007), 538.

Historicity of the Bible: Richard Elliott Friedman, *Who Wrote the Bible?* (San Francisco: HarperOne, 1987), 39–40.

1000 BCE: Shanks et al., *Rise of Ancient Israel*, 7. This date is not universally accepted, however (ibid., 90–91). There is a multiplicity of opinion as to the accuracy of the Bible’s dating system.

**From this point forward, Zion** Synonymy of Zion and Jerusalem: Isa. 1:27.

Synonymy of Zion and Jerusalem via the terms *Temple* or *Temple Mount*: Joel 4:17, 21; Ps. 2–3.

“Dwelling place of God”: Ps. 76:3.

“Mountain of God”: Isa. 2:3, Ps. 2:6, 48:11. That said, in one passage, 1 Kings 8:1, when Solomon brings the ark from Zion to the Temple, the text suggests that, at least at times, Zion and the Temple were two distinct locations; see W. R. F. Browning, ed., *A Dictionary of the Bible*, 2nd ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012); also Berenbaum and Skolnick, “Zion.”

Zion as Land of Israel at large, during the Assyrian exile: Isa. 51: 3, 57:13; Ps. 137; Lam. 1:1, 17. Other times Jerusalem refers to the larger area of land that the tribe of Judah controls, also known as the southern kingdom, which includes Jerusalem; thus, Zion comes to symbolize this as well.

Synonymy of “God’s people” and Zion: Isa. 51:16; Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 137.

Israelites as “daughter of Zion”: IV Ezra 10:7; I Bar. 4:9; II Bar. 3:1. The Israelites are also referred thus in other sources, such as a number of texts falling under the genre of *midrashim*, a genre explained in chapter 5 (e.g., PR 26:131b; Yal. Mak. on Ps. 147:2, no. 4 in the name of the Tanh.).

**In other words, at least during their early history** Zion as a place where Yahweh dwells: John H. Hayes and J. Maxwell Miller, eds., *Israelite and Judean History* (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1971), 373. For example, Ps. 46, 48, 76, 78:68–72, 89:19–29 and 35–37; Isa. 14:32.

Zion’s eclipsing of Sinai: Isa. 8:18, 14:32. See also Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 91.

**Not only is David the first** Building God a “house to dwell in”: 2 Sam. 7:5.

Solomon, not David, built the Temple: Despite paintings and other visual depictions to the contrary, the building that Solomon built—the Temple—was probably not particularly large; it was only about 90 feet long and 30 feet wide, smaller than even Solomon’s own palace (Friedman, *Who Wrote the Bible?*, 42–43).

God, not Solomon, built the Temple: Ps. 78:69.

Tabernacle and Ark housed in Shiloh: Friedman, *Who Wrote the Bible?*, 47.

Temple in Shiloh before David was born: 1 Sam. 3:3, in Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 96.

David building Temple in Jerusalem before Solomon’s birth: 2 Sam. 12:20, in Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 96.

**Although neither David nor Solomon** From this point forward when I write “the Temple” I am referring to the temple built, and later rebuilt, in Jerusalem, an area commonly called *Har Habayit* (Mount of the House) by Jews and *Al-Haram al-Sharif* (the Noble Sanctuary) by Muslims. In these instances I capitalize the term *Temple*, whereas when referring to other sacred sites (other temples) I do not. This is a normative practice in scholarship surrounding this ancient period and the perceived hierarchy of these places.

Mount Moriah: Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 94–95.

Entire world created from Zion: BT Yoma 54b.

Mount Zion foundation stone as epicenter of creation and Zion as the world’s belly button: Tan. Kedoshim 10, in Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 118.

**To backtrack for a moment** God’s promise that Abraham’s descendants will inherit land: Gen. 15:18–21. Different boundaries of this area are expressed in Num. 34:1–15, in addition to Deut. 11:24. See also Josh. 1:4; Ezek. 47:13–20.

Jacob’s name changed to Israel: Gen. 35:10.

Ambiguity of the borders of the Land of Israel: The Torah offers different descriptions of the land promised to Abraham and his descendants. Modern scholars, however, rarely match these accounts with contemporary geography. See, e.g., Jacob Milgrom, ed. and trans., *The JPS Torah Commentary: Numbers* (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 1990), 284; Nahum M. Sarna, ed. and trans., *The JPS Torah Commentary: Genesis* (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 1989), 117, note for “great river.”

**FIGURE 3.3** This family tree is one of many possible interpretations of the Genesis narrative. For example, the *pshat* of the text (see chapter 2) never specifies who Sarah's parents are; in Gen. 20:2, Abraham says she is his sister. According to the Talmud, Sarah is the same person as Iscah, the daughter of Haran (Abraham's brother), which would make Sarah Abraham's niece (BT Sanhedrin 69b). Similarly, according to a medieval commentator, Rashi, Hagar and Keturah are the same person (Rashi on Gen. 25:1 citing *Genesis: Midrash Rabbah* 61:4).

**For centuries, both prior to David's reign** On Hezekiah's reign, see Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 441–451. The book of Isaiah focuses Isaiah's prophecies on Zion and Solomon's temple, perhaps more than any other biblical figure; see Martin Buber, *On Zion: The History of an Idea* (London: Horovitz Publishing Co., 1973), 31–35.

Northern tribes: Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 188.

Lost tribes: When people speak about the Lost Tribes of Israel, usually counted as ten in number, they commonly date their beginnings to the exile caused by the Assyrians. But some maintain that the post-Solomon dispersed kingdom of Israel was made up of only nine tribes: Reuben, Manasheh, Ephraim, Gad, Asher, Dan, Naphtali, Zebulun, and Issachar. In this counting, the other three tribes—Judah, Simeon, and Benjamin—were located in the south, and eventually the latter two were absorbed into Judah. See Eric Maroney, *The Other Zions: The Lost Histories of Jewish Nations* (Lanham, MD: Roman & Littlefield, 2009), 12.

#### According to a number of ancient nonbiblical sources

On centers of power outside Jerusalem (e.g., Shechem, Tirzah, and Beth-shean), see Shawn Aster, "The Book of Kings: Religion Meets Geo-Politics, Ancient Style," [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-book-of-kings-religion-meets-geo-politics-ancient-style](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-book-of-kings-religion-meets-geo-politics-ancient-style). See also Maroney, *The Other Zions*, 20.

Dan and Bethel as centers of power: Friedman, *Who Wrote the Bible?*, 46.

Multiple hubs: The division of the Israelite tribes into two regions, Israel and Judah, existed prior to the ninth century BCE. According to the Bible, David was the first king who was able to unite the tribes living in the Land of Israel, followed by his son, Solomon. Thereafter, the tribes were never united again.

1 and 2 Chronicles and Jerusalem as the central Israelite city: Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 439.

**A great deal of theory** On the idea of the latest event replacing all previous ones, see Doron Mendels, *The Land of Israel as a Political Concept in Hasmonean Literature* (Tübingen, Ger.: J. C. B. Mohr, 1987).

**Putting aside multiple different population centers** On Canaanites, Philistines, and Israelites as a "composite culture," see Shanks et al., *Rise of Ancient Israel*, 52–54; also 27–60, 149.

**Others disagree with these claims** On Asherah as Yahweh or El's consort, see Shanks et al., *Rise of Ancient Israel*, 137.

Prohibitions of marrying non-Israelites: Exod. 34:15–16; Deut. 7:3–4.

#### At the time when the northern and southern kingdoms

On the meaning of the ancient term *yehūdi*, see Shaye J. D. Cohen, *The Beginnings of Jewishness: Boundaries, Varieties, Uncertainties* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999), 69–106.

**According to scholar Shaye Cohen** On multiple Judean subidentities, see Cohen, *Beginnings of Jewishness*, 3, 69–106.

"Jew" vs. "Israelite" vs. "Hebrew": As recently as 1900, the U.S. government officially referred to Jews as part of the "Hebrew race" when calculating immigration statistics; see Butler-Smith, "Diaspora Nationality," 161.

**Even by the period of Roman rule** Non-Judean circumcision: Cohen, *Beginnings of Jewishness*, 115–119.

"Corporeally, visually, linguistically, and socially": Cohen, *Beginnings of Jewishness*, 37.

Hasmoneans: See chapter 7.

Defining male Jewishness based on circumcision: Cohen, *Beginnings of Jewishness*, 39–68.

**In the eighth century** Some date the Assyrian Exile to 733 BCE rather than 722; see, e.g., Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 422–434, 481.

Assyrian Empire: Many scholars of the ancient Middle East refer to these eighth-century BCE conquerors as "Neo-Assyrians" rather than "Assyrians." For simplicity, throughout this book I use the perhaps less precise but more common label "Assyrian."

Those permitted to stay: Isa. 7:8; Ezra 4:2, 10; Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 434.

Common Assyrian practices: Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 434; Maroney, *The Other Zions*, 19.

Northern kingdom subgroup fled to Judah: Friedman, *Who Wrote the Bible?*, 49.

Term *diaspora*: The etymology is from Robin Cohen, *Global Diasporas: An Introduction* (London: Taylor & Francis e-Library, 2001), ix.

Dispersion from city of Samaria: It was during this exile that many of the biblical prophets cut their teeth, so to speak, voicing their grief and misery at having been exiled from their homeland by the Assyrians.

**In the decades after** On Judeans embracing Assyrian and Canaanite rituals, see 2 Kings 21; Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 420; John W. Miller, *Meet the Prophets: A Beginner's Guide to the Books of the Biblical Prophets, Their Meaning Then and Now* (New York: Paulist Press, 1987), 142–143; Michael Edward Stone, *Scriptures, Sects, and Visions* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1980), 14.

Revival of Judean national customs: Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 438.

**Approximately 125 years later** Technically, between the Assyrians and the Babylonians, the Egyptians also ruled over the Judeans, and, depending on where you draw the Judean border, even the Chaldeans reigned for a spell (Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 385–415).

**Perhaps the preeminence of the year 586 BCE** Although Babylonians had conquered the area prior, and they damaged the Temple before 586 BCE, only in this year, goes the argument, was the Temple thoroughly destroyed and the Judeans prohibited from rebuilding it. Another reason for focusing on 586 rather than 722 BCE as the beginning of the Jewish diaspora might be that in the 700s, under the Assyrians, the northern tribes that were forcibly relocated allegedly disappeared altogether (the so-called lost tribes of Israel). One problem with this theory is that many sources claim these Israelites were in fact dispersed by the Assyrians to Mesopotamia, where they thrived (i.e., they weren't "lost"). Others contend that those exiled at the hands of the Babylonians (c. 586 BCE) were sent to similar places as those exiled by Assyrians in 722 BCE; these sources cannot be verified, however, especially those that include precise numbers of Israelites relocated. See Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 480–488.

Lack of evidence that a majority of Judeans were exiled: Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 470–479.

**A little less than fifty years after** Some scholars discredit ancient sources that paint Cyrus in a positive light because they are both incomplete and overly detailed; in the latter case, these texts credit Cyrus with giving precise measurements for the Temple to be rebuilt, something no Persian king would have been so keen on pointing out because it was a non-Persian structure. Putting aside whether Cyrus actually decreed Judeans could return to Jerusalem under the blanket of what today would be framed as a form of "freedom of religion," many hold that the period when Judeans lived under Persian rule was far from ideal. Some archeologists point to ancient sites as evidence that Judean communities were involved in major military actions against the Persians, suggesting power struggles between the two communities.

Even events that have textual support, such as those described in the books of Ezra and Nehemiah, are highly debatable. For starters, the chronological order laid out in these two biblical books is problematic. For example, the latter book says that Nehemiah was given permission by the Persian king (not Cyrus, apparently, but Artaxerxes) to rebuild the walls of Jerusalem, but Ezra, who is supposed to have preceded Nehemiah, finds the walls already built upon his arrival. See Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 498–509.

**According to the Bible, during this same time** "Teaching of God": According to Ezra 7, Ezra had special permission from the Persian king to claim authority over the Judeans still living in Judea. See Shaye J. D. Cohen, *From the Maccabees to the Mishnah* (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1987), 105.

The Five Books of Moses or a version thereof: John W. Betlyon, "A People Transformed: Palestine in the Persian Period," *Near Eastern Archaeology* 68, nos. 1–2 (2005): 4–5; Friedman, *Who Wrote the Bible?*, 159. See also Neh. 8.

Parts of Torah had been lost: See 2 Kings 22:7 for another example of a proto-Jewish communal leader, a high priest,

who found a lost text, called "the book of the Law," and returned it to the people.

**Once the Temple was rebuilt** According to some, following the Babylonian Exile—particularly after the reconstruction of the Temple—one lineage from the tribe of Levi, the Zadokites, gained disproportionate power within the priestly class, which lasted through the second century BCE. Others go further, maintaining that regardless of which lineage controlled the priestly caste, corruption and struggles over political power ruled the day. Such theories focus more on the political ramifications of these intra-proto-Jewish tensions than whether or not the Temple was the "dwelling place of God." See, e.g., Gabriele Boccaccini, *Roots of Rabbinic Judaism: An Intellectual History, from Ezekiel to Daniel* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2002), 43–209.

Earthly nexus: For some, there is a sharp contradiction between God's ability to be accessible only in a specific, finite place juxtaposed to God's omnipresence. It seems that for the proto-Jews this was not a problem. See Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 138–139.

Eden and the Temple: For example, Ezek. 28: 13–14; Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 128–130.

Ezra as a "biblical fabrication": Boccaccini, *Roots of Rabbinic Judaism*, 49–50.

**Whatever actually happened** On the idea that Egyptian Judeans stayed put, see Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 488.

Returning or moving "back": The use of the word *back*, as in "back to Zion," presumes that Egyptian Judeans ever lived in Jerusalem in the first place. Even though some Egyptian Judeans may have relocated to Egypt from Jerusalem, some surely lived in other locations in the Land of Israel prior to their relocation. Then there is the question of when these subgroups may have arrived in Egypt in the first place: perhaps in the eighth century BCE, perhaps the sixth, perhaps another time altogether.

Judeans who stayed in Babylonia: Isaiah Gafni, "Jews in Babylon: The Original Diaspora Community," [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jews-in-babylon](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jews-in-babylon); Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 480–488.

Judeans helping to start new communities: Robert M. Seltzer, "Jewish Diaspora," [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-diaspora](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-diaspora).

**Some Babylonian Judeans** On living in Babylon being akin to living in Israel, Rabbi Judah cites Zech. 2:11 as evidence, a biblical verse that can be translated as "Escape, oh Zion, who dwells with the daughters of Babel" (BT Ketuvot 110b–111a). Some argue, however, that this statement reflects the fear that some of Babylon's most important Jewish leaders and intellectuals would leave for Jerusalem, thus depriving the Babylonian Jewish community of central communal figures; see, e.g., Judah M. Eisenberg, "American Jews and Israel: Two Views," in Neusner (ed.), *Israel and Zion in American Judaism*, 30–35.

**If the books of Ezra and Nehemiah** The number of peo-



ple who moved to the Land of Israel at this time is thought to be small. According to one scholar, the estimated population of Jerusalem at the time was, at best, 3,000, in contrast to what is written in the book of Ezra, which states that 40,000 individuals returned to Judah. See Shawn Aster, “Ezra and Nehemiah,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/ezra-nehemiah](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/ezra-nehemiah); Charles Carter, *The Emergence of Yehud in the Persian Period*, quoted in Betlyon, “A People Transformed,” 7. Scholar Shaye Cohen notes that following the exiles of 722 and 586 BCE, the tribal system of Israelites was destroyed “beyond repair,” with families returning either individually or as part of slightly larger collectives or clans, but no longer as tribes (*Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 115–116). Such a theory complicates the ability to reconstruct any statistical figures from this era.

**Many maintain that before the Second Temple** “At least four other sites”: Some contend that a fifth temple existed during this era in Arad, a town located in what is today the State of Israel, which may even have been patterned after the Jerusalem Temple. See, e.g., Stone, *Scriptures, Sects, and Visions*, 77–78.

**The first two temples were in Egypt** Some argue that the Tobiad sanctuary was a palace, not a temple, built under the direction of a priestly family evicted from Jerusalem by Nehemiah. For more information, see Boccaccini, *Roots of Rabbinic Judaism*, 86–87; Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 550; Vanderkam, *Introduction to Early Judaism*, 14–15; Edwin M. Yamauchi, “The Reconstruction of Jewish Communities during the Persian Empire,” *Journal of the Historical Society* 4, no. 1 (Winter 2004): 1–27.

**Samaritan temple:** James C. Vanderkam, *An Introduction to Early Judaism* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2001), 192–193. See also chapter 11.

**Nonetheless, a dominant trend** Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 106; Vanderkam, *Introduction to Early Judaism*, 203. The Second Temple garnered more attention and was more important to the Judean community than the First Temple, despite the fact that the first had been authenticated by God (i.e., in a pillar of smoke, as described in the book of Chronicles) and was built by a Judean king rather than a king widely accepted as not fully Judean (Herod). See Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 131.

**Located on Elephantine Island** For archeological evidence of the Elephantine temple, see Mark W. Hamilton, “Who Was the Jew? Jewish Ethnicity during the Achaemenid Period,” *Restoration Quarterly* 37, no. 5 (1995): 102–117; Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 486–488, 493–495, 532–535; Dan Mendelsohn Aviv, *End of the Jews: Radical Breaks, Remakes, and What Comes Next* (Toronto: Key Publishing House, 2012), 29; Shanks et al., *Rise of Ancient Israel*, 139; Vanderkam, *Introduction to Early Judaism*, 147–150. Hamilton also discusses the porous ethnic identities of proto-Jews and Arameans in Elephantine.

**According to the first-century CE historian Josephus** On the Oniad temple, see Fausto Parente, “Onias III’s Death and

the Founding of the Temple of Leontopolis,” in *Josephus and the History of the Greco-Roman Period*, ed. Fausto Parente and Joseph Sievers (Leiden: Brill, 1994), 69–89. No specific rabbis prohibited sacrifices in this Egypt-based temple; M. Menahot 13:10. See also Stephen Rosenberg, “Two Jewish Temples in Antiquity in Egypt,” *Bulletin of the Anglo-Israel Archaeological Society* 19–20 (2001–2002): 182–184.

**Oniad Levite and priest rituals:** Robert Hayward, “The Jewish Temple at Leontopolis—A Reconsideration,” *Journal of Jewish Studies* 33, nos. 1–2 (1982): 429–443.

**The difficulty of establishing** On the Elephantine and Oniad temples, see Jacob J. Petuchowski, “Diaspora Judaism—An Abnormality? The Testimony of History,” in Neusner (ed.), *Israel and Zion in American Judaism*, 125–136. It should also be noted that Philo doesn’t mention anything about the various messianic figures from first-century CE Palestine, either, yet scholars are largely in agreement that Jesus, among others, was present at the time (see Notes, chapter 4, “Whatever the reasons”).

**Third is the Tobiad temple** The legitimacy of this temple remains under dispute. Some scholars speculate that it was an unfinished castle, not a temple. Others say that the name Tobiah or Tobias was the Jewish name of another person altogether, Hyrcanus, who lived during the Hasmonean period. For more information, see Boccaccini, *Roots of Rabbinic Judaism*, 86–87; Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 550; Vanderkam, *Introduction to Early Judaism*, 14–15; Yamauchi, “Reconstruction.”

**Torah mentioning Mount Gerizim and not Zion:** In *From the Maccabees to the Mishnah* (169), Cohen argues that the temple on Mount Gerizim was not in competition with the Jerusalem Temple, even for Samaritans. Others cite archeological evidence to contend that there was a sacred center on Mount Gerizim prior to there being one in Jerusalem. At any rate, we cannot say with certainty whether this temple was Samaritan, Israelite, and/or Canaanite (Fred Astren, email to author, June 7, 2012; see also Nathan Schur, *History of the Samaritans* [New York: Verlag Peter Lang, 1989], 17–33). Some scholars maintain that the oldest evidence pointing to a distinct community living on Mount Gerizim dates to the sixth century BCE (e.g., Ingrid Hjelm, “What Do Samaritans and Jews Have in Common? Recent Trends in Samaritan Studies,” *Currents in Biblical Research* 3, no. 1 [October 2004]: 9–59). To make matters even more complicated, the familial relationship between the Samaritans and the Judeans is far from clear, as is discussed further in chapter 11. See also Yairah Amit, “The Samaritans—Biblical Positions in the Service of Modern Politics,” in *Samaritans: Past and Present*, ed. Menachem Mor and Friedrich V. Reiterer (New York: Walter de Gruyter, 2010), 247–266.

**By the time the Romans defeated the Greeks** From this point forward I will be using the signifier “Jew,” as opposed to proto-Jew, Judean, or similar terms.

Jews who lived in Greek and Roman Palestine: The Jewish subcommunities living in first-century Palestine are explored in chapters 4, 7, and 8. As for using the name Pales-

tine for this region during this era, some claim this region's name wasn't changed to Palestine until the second century CE (e.g., Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 215).

Ancient Alexandria with highest Jewish population: Robert Gordis, *Judaism for the Modern Age* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Cudahy, 1955), 110f, cited in Petuchowski, "Diaspora Judaism," 131.

**In the first century CE, many outside** No major call to return to Jerusalem: Gordis, *Judaism for the Modern Age*.

Identification as part of the same macrocommunity: According to a third-century CE Roman historian, Babylonian Jews provided aid to Palestinian Jews who were fighting the Romans, pointing to a communal identification among Jews; see Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 26.

**Setting aside the lack of uniformity** It is commonly held that the Jerusalem Temple was the primary site where Judeans performed animal sacrifices, especially on particular holidays; see Vanderkam, *Introduction to Early Judaism*, 204–208. Scholar Jacob Milgrom argues that "no single theory can encompass the sacrificial system of any society," whether the ancient Israelites or another group (Jacob Milgrom, ed., *Leviticus: A New Translation with Introduction and Commentary*, vol. 3 [New York: Doubleday, 1991], 440–442, cited in Danielle Celermajer, *The Sins of the Nation and the Ritual of Apologies* [New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009], 74n.20).

Verbal prayer: We aren't sure when verbal prayer became a dominant form of Jewish ritual worship, especially once it included the practice of saying specific prayers at set times of day; see, e.g., Vanderkam, *Introduction to Early Judaism*, 209–211.

**Some believe that only after** On the existence of synagogues pre-70 CE, see Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 109–116, 222–224; Vanderkam, *Introduction to Early Judaism*, 212–213; Yamauchi, "Reconstruction," 2.

**Just how one defines a synagogue** One could argue, of course, that although synagogues existed prior to the destruction of the Second Temple they only began to spread across the Jewish world post-70 CE.

Synagogue architecture reflecting Temple architecture: Since the seventeenth century CE, American synagogues have largely been designed to mirror the architecture of the inner sections of the Temple. See Laura Arnold Leibman, *Messianism, Secrecy, and Mysticism: A New Interpretation of Early American Jewish Life* (Portland, OR: Vallentine Mitchell, 2012), 57–82.

**Another important shift in post-70 CE Jewish practice** Talmudic story of Yochanan ben Zakkai sneaking out of Jerusalem: BT Gittin 56b.

**Because in contemporary scholarship the Pharisees** On the fabrication of this Talmudic story, see Daniel Boyarin, *Border Lines: The Partition of Judaeo-Christianity* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004), 151–201; Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 157–158; Jacob Neusner, *Developments of a Legend: Studies on the Traditions Concerning Rabban Yohanan ben Zakkai* (Leiden, Neth.: Brill, 1970); idem, *Read-*

*ing and Believing: Ancient Judaism and Contemporary Gullibility* (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1986).

Other things aside from the end of animal sacrifices: Even though he does not support the idea that Ben Zakkai was responsible for launching the post-Temple rabbinic period, Shaye Cohen holds that factionally-attributable labels disappeared from Jewish texts at around this same time, such as Pharisee, Sadducee, and the Houses or Schools of Hillel and Shammai, the latter two names found in the Talmud and used to denote distinct schools of thought. Cohen writes that it is possible the Houses of Hillel and Shammai were actually different subgroups of Pharisees. Perhaps most importantly, though, Cohen disputes the idea that post-Yavneh the Pharisaic community thrived while all other Jewish subgroups in Roman Palestine died off. Instead he asserts that the Yavneh rabbis opened the community up to greater inclusion, instilling the ethos of agreeing to disagree, the idea that divergent opinions can be valid simultaneously. See Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 157–158; idem, "The Significance of Yavneh: Pharisees, Rabbis, and the End of Sectarianism," in *Origins of Judaism: The Pharisees and Other Sects*, vol. 2, part 1, ed. Jacob Neusner (New York: Garland Publishing, 1990), 101–127; see also chapter 5.

**The destruction of the Second Temple** The book of Ezra refers to the Judeans who returned to Jerusalem and its environs from Babylonia as "members of the exile" or "the congregation of the exile." Thus, the term *exile* was used by members of the ancient Judean community itself (Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 140).

Whereas some Jews distinguish between exile and dispersion by using two different Hebrew words, *galut* and *golah*, I contend that for most American Jews *galut* has come to mean both. See Howard Wettstein, ed., *Diasporas and Exiles: Varieties of Jewish Identity* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002).

Other understandings of term *diaspora*: The explanations of exile and diaspora in this paragraph are working definitions; the terms have multiple other meanings. See, e.g., Rogers Brubaker, "The 'Diaspora' Diaspora," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 28, no. 1 (January 2005): 1–19; William Safran, "The Jewish Diaspora in a Comparative and Theoretical Perspective," *Israel Studies* 10, no. 1 (Spring 2005): 36–60.

Gendered use of term *diaspora*: Some scholars look at how the ideas of territorial scattering and dissemination of sperm are interrelated, while others look at the ways that metaphors regarding roots, seed, and familial growth are used in both Diaspora Studies and clinical discussions around human procreation. See, e.g., Cohen, *Global Diasporas*, 177; Stefan Helmrich, "Kinship, Nation, and Paul Gilroy's Concept of Diaspora," *Diaspora* 2, no. 2 (1992): 243–249; Liisa Malkki, "National Geographic: The Rooting of Peoples and the Territorialization of National Identity among Scholars and Refugees," *Cultural Anthropology* 7, no. 1 (February 1992): 24–44.

**When a group is forced** Emanuel Gamoran, in "Diaspora vs. Exile," *The Reconstructionist* 9, no. 8 (May 28, 1943): 12–16, argues that Jews should be much more sensitive when choos-

ing between the terms *exile* and *diaspora*. Significantly, this article was published five years prior to the founding of the State of Israel.

**In the case of the Jewish community** James Clifford, "Diasporas," *Cultural Anthropology* 9 (1994): 302–338; idem, *Routes: Travel and Translation in the Late Twentieth Century* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1997); Arnold M. Eisen, *Galut: Modern Jewish Reflection on Homelessness and Homecoming* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1986); Paul Gilroy, "It Ain't Where You're From, It's Where You're At: The Dialectics of Diasporic Identification," *Third Text* 13 (Winter 1991): 3–16; Khachig Tololyan, "Rethinking Diaspora(s): Stateless Power in the Transnational Moment," *Diaspora* 5, no. 1 (1996): 3–36. Among those American Jews who fear that the State of Israel may not exist in the near future is a sizable subgroup who have no plans to move to Israel in order to support the country in person but instead choose to remain in the United States.

**Indeed, historical examples abound** On wanting to return to Poland or Russia rather than immigrating to Israel, see Taylor Spence, "Jeffersonian Jews: The Jewish Agrarian Diaspora and the Assimilative Power of the Western Land, 1882–1930," *Western Historical Review* 41 (Autumn 2010): 335, and 327–351 generally.

Kobrin quote: Rebecca Kobrin, "Rewriting the Diaspora: Images of Eastern Europe in the Bialystok Landsmanshaft Press, 1921–45," *Jewish Social Studies: History, Culture, Society* 12, no. 3 (Spring/Summer 2006): 4.

**As scholar Arnold Eisen aptly argues** Some rabbis of the Mishnah and Talmud felt that returning to Zion (in this case meaning the Land of Israel) was equivalent to the fulfillment of biblical law; see Eisen, *Galut*, 3–56, 69–90.

**Take, for example, a rabbinic interpretation** On the symbolism of the rock Jacob used as a pillow, see Gen. Rab. 49:4, in Ezrahi, *Booking Passage*, 12–13.

Experiencing exile while in the Land of Israel: Eisen, *Galut*, 3–56, 69–90, esp. 86.

Buber quote: Martin Buber, *On Zion: The History of an Idea*, trans. Stanley Goodman (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 1997), 59–108, 111–122. In this collection of essays, Buber approaches exile metaphorically, seeing it as an existential state in relation to God.

Rosenzweig quote: Franz Rosenzweig, *The Star of Redemption*, trans. William W. Hallo (Notre Dame, IN: Notre Dame University Press, 1985), 299–300, cited in Assaf Sagiv, "George Steiner's Jewish Problem," *Azure* 15 (Summer 2003): 138.

**This idea is also described** In this situation, the *Zohar* describes God as the *Shechinah* or Divine Presence. See Arthur Green, "Introduction," in Daniel C. Matt, trans. and comm., *The Zohar*, Pritzker ed., vol. 1 (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2004), lxvii–lxix; see also chapter 6.

**Because Diaspora and Zion have become** For example, the privileging of Zion over the Diaspora is reflected in the Israeli school system. See, e.g., Tali Tadmor-Shimony, "Yearning for Zion in Israeli Education: Creating a Common

National Identity," *Journal of Jewish Identities* 6, no. 1 (January 2013): 1–21.

**Jewish Israelis in particular** Dina Porat, "Forging Zionist Identity Prior to 1948—Against which Counter-Identity," in *Israeli and Palestinian Narratives of Conflict: History's Double Helix*, ed. Robert Rotberg (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2006), 61.

**Many American Jews have been disturbed** David Ben-Gurion and Jacob Blaustein, "An Exchange of Views," *American Jewish Year Book* 53 (1952): 564–568.

**Despite such protests** Many authors, scholars and otherwise, accept that the binary of Zion/Diaspora is "true," stating, for example, that Zion is the "centre of the Jewish people" (Gabriel Sheffer, "Homeland and Diaspora: An Analytical Perspective on Israeli-Jewish Diaspora Relations," *Ethnopolitics* 9, nos. 3–4 [September–November 2010]: 384; see also 379–399). Meanwhile, Jewish Israeli writer Hillel Halkin, in an attempt to reinforce the idea that Zion and Diaspora are opposites, writes that "Diaspora Jewry is doomed." He notes, "There is, or at least should be, an unavoidable tension in the relationship between an Israeli and a Diaspora Jew, a relationship which is ideally an adversary one since the Israeli is living in a community of faith which holds that it alone is the natural place for a Jew to live." As for the idea that the Jewish world can have two centers, Halkin likens it to "a twin star whose two halves circle each other around a gravitational point." Later, he remarks: "A better comparison might be between two planets, one teeming with new if embattled life, the other atmospherically exhausted, on its way to being dead as the moon" (Hillel Halkin, *Letters to an American Jewish Friend: A Zionist's Polemic* [New York: Jewish Publication Society, 1977], 42, 18, 31, 71, quoted in Helene Meyers, "On Homelands and Home-Making: Rebecca Goldstein's *Mazel*," *Journal of Modern Literature* 33, no. 3 [Spring 2010]: 132).

Daniel and Jonathan Boyarin "propose a privileging of Diaspora" over Zion, as the diaspora is "a theoretical and historical model to replace national self-determination" (Daniel Boyarin and Jonathan Boyarin, "Diaspora: Generation and the Ground of Jewish Identity," *Critical Inquiry* 19 [Summer 1993]: 723, 711). They are also averse to the idea of a Jewish-identified nation-state. In their words, the establishment of Israel is "the subversion of Jewish culture and not its culmination" (*ibid.*, 712).

**Of course, the Jewish genocide or Shoah** Ezrahi, *Booking Passage*, 17, 10.

**In response to this idea** Rebecca Goldstein, *Mazel* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2002), 224, quoted in Meyers, "On Homelands," 136.

**In addition, when comparing American and Israeli Jewry** In fact, "whereas two-thirds of adult Canadian Jews and nearly three-quarters of French and Australian Jews have been to Israel, only 35 percent of American Jews have visited even once" (Jack Wertheimer, "The Truth about American Jews and Israel," *Commentary*, June 1, 2009, avail-



able at [www.jtsa.edu/News/Top\\_Stories/Commentary-Jack\\_Wertheimer\\_6109.xml](http://www.jtsa.edu/News/Top_Stories/Commentary-Jack_Wertheimer_6109.xml)).

Jews moving from Israel to the United States: Jacob Neusner, *Israel in American Judaism*, xi.

Jews moving to Moscow from Israel: Caryn Aviv and David Shneer, *New Jews: The End of the Jewish Diaspora* (New York: New York University Press, 2005), xv.

Zion as outside of place and time: Eisen, *Galut*, 175.

**Nonetheless, the Zion/Diaspora dyad** Since the eighteenth century the Reform movement has officially stated that they do not mean the words “ingathering of the exiles” literally; at times, they have removed the language from their prayer books altogether. Most Jews who affiliate with the Reform movement are not aware of such official positions, making this fact somewhat irrelevant to the “truth” of the matter.

Prayers for a metaphorical return: Petuchowski, “Diaspora Judaism,” 131.

Ideas exist in tandem: Aviv and Shneer, *New Jews*.

#### **Part of the problem with the Zion/Diaspora framework**

In 2005, the Israeli Parliament passed the “*Beit Hatfutsot* Law,” which defines this museum as “the National Center for Jewish communities in Israel and around the world” (Sharon Udasin, “Rebirth of a Tel Aviv Legend,” *Jerusalem Post*, December 24, 2010, [www.jpost.com/Magazine/Features/Rebirth-of-a-Tel-Aviv-legend](http://www.jpost.com/Magazine/Features/Rebirth-of-a-Tel-Aviv-legend)).

**If you go to Jerusalem today** On the location of “Mount Zion” as southwest of the ancient site of Zion, see Levenson, *Sinai and Zion*, 92.

**And yet Zion does exist** Zion as existential exile:

Although not explored in this chapter, one idea from the Jewish mystical tradition is that humanity exists in *galut* due to a rupture between the feminine and masculine forms of God. Only once this chasm is healed will humanity become reunified. See Rita M. Gross, “Steps Toward Feminine Imagery of Deity in Jewish Theology,” in *On Being a Jewish Feminist: A Reader*, ed. Susannah Heschel (New York: Schocken Books, 1995), 234.

**Even Jews who immigrate to Israel** David Oren, “Longing For a Lost Country,” *Haaretz*, April 9, 1982, quoted in Hagai Ram, “Caught between Orientalism and Aryanism, Exile and Homeland: The Jews of Iran in Zionist/Israeli Imagination,” *HAGAR Studies in Culture, Polity and Identities* 8, no. 1 (2008): 96.

Iraqi Jews feeling exiled in Israel: Zvi Ben-Dor, “Invisible Exile: Iraqi Jews in Israel,” *Journal of the Interdisciplinary Crossroads* 3, no. 1 (April 2006): 135–162. See also chapter 5.

**No matter where a Jew lives** Milton Konvitz, “Zionism: Homecoming or Homelessness,” *Judaism* (Summer 1956): 206.

**Zion, like any homeland** Alex Weingrod and André Levy, “Paradoxes of Homecoming: The Jews and Their Diasporas,” *Anthropological Quarterly* 79, no. 4 (2006): 710.

**As for whether Zion is ever literal** Technically, at the

point in the biblical narrative where the Israelites find themselves outside of and looking into the Land of Israel (or Zion), the region could also be called Canaan, among other names, instead of the Land of Israel.

**In the twenty-first century** Erich S. Gruen, “Diaspora and Homeland,” in Wettstein (ed.), *Diasporas and Exiles*, 18–46.

Struggle with exile as part of what it means to be a Jew: Howard Wettstein, “Introduction,” in Wettstein (ed.), *Diasporas and Exiles*, 2.

**Maybe the paradoxes related** Frédéric Brenner, *Diaspora: Homelands in Exile* (New York: HarperCollins Publishers, Inc., 2003), xii.

**In other words, Jews’ identities** Isaiah Berlin, quoted in Stephen J. Whitfield, *In Search of American Jewish Culture* (Waltham, MA: University Press of New England, 1999), 14. Regarding another important twentieth-century Jew with a potentially similar ideological orientation, Whitfield adds: “Rabbi Joseph B. Soloveitchik of Boston—perhaps justifying his own refusal to live in Israel—described *Galut* (Exile) as ‘the essence of the Jewish people,’ with its triggering antecedents in the expulsion from Eden. It may not be accidental that his writings are pervaded by references to homelessness and loneliness” (ibid.).

## **Chapter 4. Messiahs**

**In December 1994** Chapter 8 has more on the various submovements within Orthodox Judaism. Along with Aish Hatorah, Chabad is one of the best-known Jewish missionary groups conducting outreach exclusively toward other Jews. See, e.g., Aaron Joshua Tapper, “The ‘Cult’ of Aish Hatorah: *Ba’alei Teshuva* and the New Religious Movement Phenomenon,” *Jewish Journal of Sociology* 44, nos. 1–2 (2002): 5–29. For more on Chabad, see Samuel Heilman and Menachem Friedman, *The Rebbe: The Life and Afterlife of Menachem Mendel Schneerson* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2012); Harris Lenowitz, *The Jewish Messiahs: From the Galilee to Crown Heights* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998), 215–223.

**For me, the most striking thing** Although not all members of the Lubavitch movement believed Schneerson was the messiah when he was alive, many, if not most, did. Since Schneerson’s death the question of whether he could or should be referred to as the messiah has continued to be debated within Chabad. Some seem to have accepted that he was not the messiah, among other reasons because he did not bring about the building of the Third Temple in Jerusalem. Others within Chabad circles, however, still call him the messiah. A subdivision within this latter group commonly speak about Schneerson in the present tense, as if he were still alive. Each year a few full-page advertisements appear in international newspapers, such as the *New York Times*, to this effect.

As one Chabad rabbi, Shlomo Ezagui, said in a 2012 interview, almost eighteen years after the Rebbe’s death:

I believe that the Lubavitcher rebbe, Rabbi Schneerson, is the *mashiach* [messiah], though I realize that there is a controversy about this within Chabad. The Talmud says that if the *mashiach* is alive, it will be Rabbi Yehuda, but if he's chosen among the dead, it will be someone like the prophet Daniel. This shows us that the *mashiach* can come from the dead and in fact, there are many different classic sources that talk about the *mashiach* as rising from the dead. It's not that extraordinary: one of the 13 principles of faith is belief in the resurrection of the dead. I just feel, hope, and pray that it happens soon. Even within Chabad, there are a lot of people who have doubts, and when the rebbe died, I also had many questions. The rebbe's death shook up a lot of people, and not everyone was able to resolve their questions and move on with greater faith. (Daphna Berman, Sarah Gregor et al., "What Does the Concept of Messiah Mean Today?" *Moment Magazine*, March/April 2012, [www.momentmag.com/what-does-the-concept-of-the-messiah-mean-today](http://www.momentmag.com/what-does-the-concept-of-the-messiah-mean-today))

**Despite having many positive things to say** Norman Lamm is quoted in Sue Fishkoff, *The Rebbe's Army: Inside the World of Chabad-Lubavitch* (New York: Schocken Books, 2003), 263. He was formerly the president of Yeshiva University (see chapter 8).

**Putting aside some contemporary Jewish discomfort** This chapter tangentially explores nuances between the notions of "messiah," "messianic idea," "messianic age," and "messianic movement." For example, Moshe Idel (*Messianic Mystics* [New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1998], 262–265) asserts that scholars are too eager to describe an isolated example of a Jewish messiah as a full-on "messianic movement." Although these distinctions are important, this book addresses these signifiers in a basic manner only. See also Haim Hillel Ben-Sasson, "Messianic Movements," in *Encyclopaedia Judaica*, second ed., vol. 14., ed. Michael Berenbaum and Fred Skolnik (Detroit: Macmillan Reference USA, 2007), 115–122; Jerry Rabow, *50 Jewish Messiahs* (Jerusalem: Gefen Publishing House, 2002).

**Along with the belief in the messiah** On saints or holy men serving as *axes mundi*, see, e.g., Arthur Green, "The *Zaddiq* as *Axis Mundi* in Later Judaism," *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 45, no. 3 (1977): 327–347.

**Some might argue that the messianic idea** A great deal of evidence exists to support the idea that belief in a messianic age continues to be actively present in many Jews' lives. See, e.g., the following studies, which focus on American and Israeli Jews: Asher Arian and Ayala Keissar-Sugarman, "A Portrait of Israeli Jews: Beliefs, Observance, and Values of Israeli Jews," *The AVI CHAI—Israel Foundation and the Israel Democracy Institute* (2009), available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=13289](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=13289); Steven M. Cohen and Leonard Fein, *American Jews and Their Social Justice Involvement: Evidence from a National Survey*, Amos—The National Jewish Partnership for Social Justice (November 21, 2001), available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=4593](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=4593); Robert P. Jones and Daniel Cox, "Chosen for What? Jewish Values in 2012: Findings from the 2012 Jewish Values Survey" (Washington, DC: Public Religion Research Institute, 2012), available at <http://publicreligion>

[.org/site/wp-content/uploads/2012/04/Jewish-Values-Report.pdf](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=5127); Yehudah Mirsky, "Tikkun Olam: Basic Questions and Policy Directions," *Facing Tomorrow, Jewish People Policy Institute*, 2008, 213–229, available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=5127](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=5127).

**Most commonly translated as "messiah"** One who is anointed: According to the Oxford English Dictionary, the verb *anoint* literally means to smear, rub, or moisten someone or something with an ointment, oil, or grease, and figuratively to besmear someone with flattery; see Angus Stevenson and Christine A. Lindberg, eds., *New Oxford American Dictionary*, 3rd ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), available at [www.oxfordreference.com/view/10.1093/acref/9780195392883.001.0001/m\\_en\\_us1221995](http://www.oxfordreference.com/view/10.1093/acref/9780195392883.001.0001/m_en_us1221995). See also, Philip J. Glasser, "The Meaning of Messiah: An Examination of Anointing in the Hebrew Bible and the Ancient Near East" (Honors Thesis, Dartmouth College, 1998).

Anointing a person rather than a ritual object: For example, Gen. 31:13.

Moses's anointing of Aaron: Exod. 28:41. See also, e.g., Exod. 29:21, 30:30, 40:13; Lev. 8:12. The first time Moses anoints Aaron there is no mention of oil (i.e., Moses is simply instructed to anoint Aaron, without a precise procedure outlined). In examples thereafter, however, the verb *anoint* is accompanied with the directive to use "anointing oil."

Other priests anointed in the Torah: For example, a verse from the third book of the Torah, Leviticus, describes a seemingly related ritual whereby the Israelite community's high priest, unnamed, is anointed; see Lev. 4:3, 5, 16, 6:15, 32, 21:10.

**After the Five Books of Moses** God tells the prophet Samuel that Saul and David need to be anointed prior to their becoming kings: For example, 1 Sam. 15:1, 24:6, 26:11 (Saul); 1 Sam. 16:3, 2 Sam. 2:4, 5:3 (David). The term *mashiah* is also used to describe a ruler or prince, as in *mashiah nagid* (the messiah prince), exemplified in 1 Sam. 9:16 and Dan. 9:25, among other places.

It then appears in the Bible only a handful of other times: For example, 1 Kings 19:15 (King Haza'el); 2 Kings 9:3 (Yehu); Isa. 45:1 (Cyrus), 61:1 (Isaiah). There are also a number of references in the Psalms and 1 and 2 Chronicles.

According to one counting, the term *mashiah* appears 39 times in the Bible, once in reference to Cyrus and 38 times in relation to Israelite and Judean kings or priests, with about 30 of these referring to kings only; see Leo Landman, ed., *Messianism in the Talmudic Era* (New York: Ktav Publishing House, Inc., 1979), xii. Other calculations are similar; e.g., William Scott Green, "Introduction: Messiah in Judaism," in *Judaisms and Their Messiahs at the Turn of the Christian Era*, ed. Jacob Neusner, William Scott Green, and Ernest S. Frerichs (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1987), 2. Some think that new understandings of the word *mashiah* emerged as a result of Israelite and Judean contact with Persian Zoroastrians (Landman [ed.], *Messianism*, xiii–xiv).

It's important to note that Cyrus is not the only non-Judean (or non-Jew) to be called "messiah" by Jews; see, e.g.,

Charles Berlin, "A Sixteenth-Century Hebrew Chronicle of the Ottoman Empire," in *Studies in Jewish Bibliography, History, and Literature in Honor of I. Edward Kiev*, ed. Charles Berlin (New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1971).

That said, the word *mashiah* appears in the Hebrew Bible in other linguistic forms, such as *mashaḥ* (v.—to rub, smear, paint, anoint a liquid, such as oil, or consecrate): Exod. 29:36, 30:26, 40:9, 10, 11, 13, 15, 15; Lev. 7:36, 8:10, 11, 12, 16:32; Num. 7:1, 1, 10, 84, 88, 35:25; Judg. 9:8, 15; 1 Sam. 9:16, 10:1, 15:17, 16:12, 13; 2 Sam. 2:7, 3:39, 5:17, 12:7, 19:11; 1 Kings 1:34, 39, 45; 2 Kings 9:6, 12, 11:12, 23:30; Isa. 21:5, 61:1; Amos 6:6; Ps. 89:21; Dan. 9:24; 1 Chron. 11:3, 14:8, 29:22; 2 Chron. 22:7, 23:11; *mishḥah* (n., adj.—a consecrated amount of ointment, such as oil): Exod. 29:2, 7, 31:11, 35:8, 37:29, 39:38, 40:9; Lev. 2:4, 7:12, 8:10, 12; Num. 3:3, 6:15; and *mishḥ*, *mishḥo*, *mishḥay*, and *mishḥi* (v., adj.—God's anointed one): 1 Sam. 2:10, 2:35, 24:6; 2 Sam. 22:51, 23:1; Isa. 45:1, 1 Chron. 16:22. Once, in Jer. 22:14, it is used to mean something seemingly different, i.e., to have been painted or to have been smeared).

Anointing someone as a signification of taking on a new role, whether high priest, king, or prophet: See, e.g., 1 Kings 19:16.

**Other ancient Middle Eastern texts** Although it can be argued that most other Middle Eastern texts that touch on the messianic idea don't describe a messiah per se, these non-canonical texts remind us that the Bible is not the only book from this period to allude to messianism. As for those non-biblical texts often dated to first-century CE Palestine, the book of Enoch echoes the notion of the messiah, understood as a judge of the wicked, as do passages in 4 Ezra. See, e.g., James Drummond, *The Jewish Messiah* (London: Longmans, Green, 1877); Michael E. Stone, "The Question of the Messiah in 4 Ezra," in Neusner et al. (eds.), *Judaisms and Their Messiahs*, 209–224. Similar descriptions can be found in the Testament of the Twelve Patriarchs; see Joseph Jacobs and Moses Bittenwieser, "Messiah," *Jewish Encyclopedia* (1906), [www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/10729-messiah](http://www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/10729-messiah); Michael A. Knibb, *Essays on the Book of Enoch and Other Jewish Texts and Traditions* (Boston: Brill, 2009), 307–312. Other texts mentioning the messiah and messianic age from the same general era, but commonly dated to the first and second centuries BCE and not CE and which don't use the Hebrew word *mashiah*, include Ben Sira, 2 Baruch, 2 Esdras, Sirach, and Tobit (Drummond, *The Jewish Messiah*) and a number of passages from the Dead Sea Scrolls (Raymond E. Brown, "The Messianism of Qumran," *Catholic Biblical Quarterly* 19 [1957]: 53–82).

The Sibylline Oracles and the "blessed man": Andrew Chester, *Messiah and Exaltation* (Tübingen, Ger.: Mohr Siebeck, 2007), 397–406 and 471–496, esp. 479–488.

Assyrian, Babylonian, or Persian origins: Hugo Gressman, "The Sources of Israel's Messianic Hope," in Landman (ed.), *Messianism*, 19–23.

Buber reference: Martin Buber, "Renewal of Judaism," in *On Judaism*, ed. Nahum Glazer (New York: Schocken Books, 1972), 50, cited in Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 321–322.

**As for different ways to become anointed** On Elijah anointing Elisha, see, e.g., 1 Sam. 24:6.

Being anointed as protection by God: 1 Kings 19:16.

**The communal functions these anointed figures serve** God communicates the prophecy of someone from the "seed" of David "build[ing] a house" in God's name to Nathan, who shares it with David (2 Sam. 7:12–13); David then repeats it back to God (2 Sam. 22:51). See also Jer. 23:5, 33:15; Amos 9:11. Thereafter, prophets refer to the messiah not just as descending from David but by the name David (Hosea 3:5; Joseph Klausner, "The Source and Beginnings of the Messianic Idea," in Landman (ed.), *Messianism*, 33).

Resurrection of the dead: For example, Ezek. 37:1–14.

Period of great destruction: For example, Ezek. 38–39.

Return to the laws of Moses: For example, Mal. 3:22–24. According to scholar Harris Lenowitz, these biblical passages underscore two major features of a messiah: (1) the figure needs to be related to David or, more precisely, as it says in Isaiah, his father, Jesse, and (2) perhaps counter-intuitively, there is no directive to anoint this figure with oil. In Lenowitz's words, this allows the messianic figure to empty himself out, "discarding his former self in order to become an object of holy ritual service. In other words, the transformative power that previously resided in the oil used to anoint the messiah is now embodied in the messiah himself, allowing him to be 'reborn'" (Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 13). This gave postbiblical messiahs the maneuverability to reinvent themselves in different ways, while simultaneously maintaining certain baseline characteristics (*ibid.*, 9–14, esp. 12).

**Additional books of prophets** Christians rely on passages from the book of Daniel to support their descriptions of the messiah much more than do Jews; see Drummond, *Jewish Messiah*; also Zech. 3:8, 6:12.

Passage in book of Haggai: See, e.g., Hag. 2:9.

Prophecy that Zerubbabel will finish God's house: See e.g., Zech. 4:14. There is also a tradition that Zerubbabel didn't die but disappeared, a concept linked to his messianic potential (Ben-Sasson, "Messianic Movements," 117–118). Note that for some, there is a connection between Zerubbabel and a messianic age but not him and an individual messiah.

**A number of scholars argue** The messianic idea as not a strictly postbiblical phenomenon: Johan Lust, *Messianism and the Septuagint: Collected Essays*, ed. Kate Hauspie (Leuven, Bel.: Leuven University Press, 2004), 9 (also 9n.2, for a list of other scholars who support this argument).

Messianic understandings of the Greeks and Romans: Joseph Klausner, "The Jewish and Christian Messiah," in *The Messianic Idea in Israel: From Its Beginning to the Completion of the Mishnah*, ed. Joseph Klausner, trans. W. F. Stinespring (New York: Macmillan, 1955), 483–502; *idem*, "Source and Beginnings," 26–27.

**Over time the messianic idea changed further** Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 39–47.

**Prior to the Talmud** Jacob Neusner, "Mishnah and Messiah," in Neusner et al. (eds.), *Judaisms and Their Messiahs*, 226



(quote), also 265–282; idem, *Messiah in Context: Israel's History and Destiny in Formative Judaism* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1984), 25–31. Some argue that the supernatural aspect of the messianic idea didn't spread until after the Second Temple was destroyed; e.g., Solomon Zeitlin, "The Origin of the Idea of the Messiah," in Landman (ed.), *Messianism*, 457–458. Zeitlin says that this concept emerged from a specific first-century CE Palestinian Jewish group, whom he refers to as "Apocalyptic Pharisees" (ibid., 459). See chapter 8 for more on the Pharisees.

Mishnah's two explicit references to the messiah: Landman (ed.), *Messianism*, xxxii; Neusner, "Mishnah and Messiah," in Neusner et al. (eds.), *Judaisms and Their Messiahs*, 270, 275–276. The messiah is also mentioned in texts called *beraitot* (sing. *beraita*), non-Mishnaic traditions that were incorporated into the Mishnah (chapter 5).

Horsley quote: Richard A. Horsley, "'Messianic' Figures and Movements in First-Century Palestine," in *The Messiah: Developments in Earliest Judaism and Christianity*, ed. James H. Charlesworth (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1992), 278–279.

**As for why the meaning of the messiah** "The emergence of the Messianic idea as viable and vital was not evolutionary and developmental. It was mutational. It did not follow as an imminent necessity from biblical Judaism. It was not spawned directly by the visions of Israel's prophets. It emerged spontaneously as a solution to a series of problems that Judaism had to face in the Graeco-Roman world, problems for which there were no direct solutions in the Pentateuch" (Ellis Rivkin, "The Meaning of Messiah in Jewish Thought," *Union Seminary Quarterly Review* 26, no. 4 [Summer 1971]: 384).

Some argue that eschatology (belief in the end of days) connected to the messianic idea emerged during the Maccabean era, in the second and first centuries BCE, even though the term *mashiah* doesn't appear in 1 and 2 Maccabees. See, e.g., John J. Collins, "Messianism in the Maccabean Period," in Neusner et al. (eds.), *Judaisms and Their Messiahs*, 97–109; Jonathan A. Goldstein, "Biblical Promises and 1 and 2 Maccabees," ibid., 69–96. Some hold that these ideas became central to the Jewish Palestinian community at the same time that they emerged among non-Jews, often emerging from those communities who ruled over the Jewish minority (Jacobs and Bittenwieser, "Messiah").

Messianic idea reemerging during times of intra-communal conflict: See, e.g., Jacob Neusner, "Power," in Landman (ed.), *Messianism*, 397–424. Neusner goes so far as to say, "In the background of every Jewish act of political or religious violence lies the Messianic expectation" (ibid., 423). Responding to those who challenge this theory, scholar Rachel Elijor argues that the Lubavitch belief that their Rebbe, Schneerson, was the messiah was a reaction to the Shoah of World War II; see Rachel Elijor, "The Lubavitch Messianic Resurgence," in *Toward the Millennium: Messianic Expectations from the Bible to Waco*, ed. Peter Schafer and Mark R. Cohen (Leiden, Neth.: Brill, 1998), 385.

Weakness of argument that the messianic idea reemerges during times of struggle: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 8.

**Whatever the reasons** Quote about dominant approaches to the messiah: Lust, *Messianism*, 10.

It is worth mentioning that the renowned Alexandrian Jew Philo (first century BCE to first century CE) does not discuss the messiah in any of his writings. Although two of the most prominent twentieth-century scholars of Philo, Harry Wolfson and Erwin Goodenough, argue that Philo writes in a number of instances about a messianic age—not an individual messiah—scholar Richard Hecht challenges their arguments, contending that "both made the error of creating their portrayal of Philo's Messiah from ideas broken from their textual and social contexts" (Richard D. Hecht, "Philo and Messiah," in Neusner et al. [eds.], *Judaisms and Their Messiahs*, 162).

**A number of texts from the Talmud** Unless otherwise noted, all of the references from this paragraph come from BT San. 97a–99a.

Lack of homogeneity regarding the messianic idea: During the medieval period, for instance, there was a range of speculation regarding the messiah, specifically among those Jews living in Western Europe, North Africa, and the Middle East. See, e.g., Salo Wittmayer Baron, "Reappearance of Pseudo-Messiahs," in *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements and Personalities in Jewish History*, ed. Marc Saperstein (New York: New York University Press, 1992), 234–249; Gerson D. Cohen, "Messianic Postures of Ashkenazim and Sephardim," in ibid., 202–233.

One opinion is found in a diary entry of writer Franz Kafka, dated December 4, 1917: "The Messiah will come only when he is no longer necessary; he will come only on the day after his arrival; he will come, not on the last day, but on the very last" (Franz Kafka, *Parables and Paradoxes* [New York: Schocken Books, 1971], 81, quoted in Elliot R. Wolfson, *Open Secret: Postmessianic Messianism and the Mystical Revision of Menahem Mendel Schneerson* [New York: Columbia University Press, 2009], 268; also in Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 324).

Some said the messiah would be a king, others a rabbi: Neusner, *Messiah in Context*, 90–98, 130, 188–191.

Hillel's disbelief that the messiah will ever come: BT San. 98b–99a. According to Hillel, there will be no messiah because he already came. Some interpret Hillel quite differently, however, as in: "There is no Messiah for Israel because they ate him up in the days of Hezekiah," perhaps best understood as a "mocking reference to the [Christian idea of the] eucharist" (Morton Smith, "Messiahs: Robbers, Jurists, Prophets, and Magicians," in Saperstein [ed.], *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 74).

**Some say that the messiah's coming** According to one source, for example, the Jewish community can hasten the messiah if all together they observe a single Sabbath properly (JT Ta. 1:3b; Ex. Rab. 25:121). According to another, they need to follow two consecutive Sabbaths in order for the world to be redeemed (BT Sab. 118b).

Jews coming "back to Israel": The use of the word *back*, as

in Jews worldwide going “back to the Land of Israel,” presumes not a literal traveling of Jews to the Land or State of Israel, but a metaphorical return as most Jews today have never even been to Israel, let alone lived there and left at some point. The “return” in this sense is in relation to today’s Jews being descendants of Jews (or proto-Jews) who once lived there; hence, it would be as if the Jewish *family*, as such, is returning.

“Ingathering of the exiles”: According to Gershom Scholem, the idea that during the messianic era Jews would “return” to the Land of Israel emerged during the medieval period. In his words, “The Messianic ideal of the prophets of the Bible and other classical Jewish sources provided no precedent for this view” (Gershom Scholem, “The Messianic Idea in Kabbalism,” in *The Messianic Idea in Judaism* [New York: Schocken Books, 1971], 37).

Messiah’s name: BT Pesahim 54; BT Nedarim 39b; *Derekh Eretz Zuta*, *Pereq Hashalom*.

**One of the individuals that Talmudic rabbis** BT San. 94a.

**Also mentioned in the Talmud** Bar Kokhba: JT Taanit 4:3; Lam. Rab. II, 2, no. 4. Rabbi Akiba may have called him by the name Bar Kokhba rather than Bar Kosiba based on a verse from the Torah that he interpreted to allude to the messiah, which is explained in the Talmud: “A star [*kokhav*] has come out of Jacob, and a staff will arise from Israel that will destroy the princes of Moab and uproot all of the descendants of Seth” (Num. 24:17). *Kokhav*, the masculine form of *kokhba*, is the Aramaic word for star. Many maintain that the Talmudic passage explaining why Akiba believed Bar Kokhba was the messiah was written after Bar Kokhba died. Later rabbinic traditions sometimes refer to him as Bar Koziba instead of Bar Kosiba, loosely translated as son of the lie or liar; see Richard A. Horsley, “Popular Prophetic Movements at the Time of Jesus: Their Principal Features and Social Origins,” *Journal for the Study of the New Testament* 26 (1986): 3–27, reprinted in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 104. Bar Kokhba himself apparently never claimed to be the messiah; see Leo Milkenberg, “Bar Kokhba Coins and Documents,” *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology* 84 (1980): 311–335.

**More to the point** Messiah’s uncanny smelling ability: BT San. 93b. Using a linguistic wordplay based on a passage from Isa. 11:2–3, one tradition is that the messiah will have the ability to judge others based on his extraordinary abilities, in this case not simply having the ability to judge others based on what he sees or hears but what he smells.

Yochanan ben Zakkai quote: *Avot D’Rabbi Natan*, 31b (version B), in Anthony J. Saldarini, trans. and comm., *The Fathers According to Rabbi Nathan—Abot De Rabbi Nathan, Version B* (Leiden, Neth.: E.J. Brill, 1975), 182.

**Around this same time** Some hold that a text from the Dead Sea Scrolls may be the earliest evidence of the tradition of a second messiah, specifically an Aramaic translation and paraphrasing, or *targum*, of the Song of Songs dated to the first century CE. (As the Dead Sea Scrolls are dated from 200

BCE through 200 CE, it is difficult to assess precisely when this text was written.) This text says, “Your two deliverers, who are destined to set you free, messiah son of David and messiah son of Ephraim, are like Moses and Aaron” (Tg. Shir Hashirim 4:5). The latter messiah mentioned is more commonly referred to as the messiah son of Joseph; as explained in Genesis, Ephraim’s father was Joseph. See Israel Knohl, *The Messiah before Jesus: The Suffering Servant of the Dead Sea Scrolls*, trans. David Maisel (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000); Byron L. Sherwin, “‘Who Do You Say That I Am?’ (Mark 8:29): A New Jewish View of Jesus,” *Journal of Ecumenical Studies* 31, no. 3–4 (Summer–Fall 1994): 255–267, esp. 255; Geza Vermes, *The Complete Dead Sea Scrolls in English* (New York: Penguin Books, 1995), 7, 60, 353–356.

Messiah son of Joseph: See, e.g., BT Sukkah 52a.

Justifying Rabbi Akiba’s mistake: The reasons and timing behind the tradition of the messiah son of Joseph are irrelevant for our purposes. Much more important is the fact that this new layer regarding the messianic idea was added to the previously existent canon. See Richard Gottheil and Samuel Krauss, “Bar Kokba and Bar Kokba War,” *Jewish Encyclopedia* (1906), [www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/2471-bar-kokba-and-bar-kokba-war](http://www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/2471-bar-kokba-and-bar-kokba-war); Joseph Heinemann, “The Messiah of Ephraim and the Premature Exodus of the Tribe of Ephraim,” *Harvard Theological Review* 68 (January 1975): 1–15; Klausner, “Jewish and Christian Messiah”; David C. Mitchell, “Messiah Ben Joseph: A Sacrifice of Atonement for Israel,” *Review of Rabbinic Judaism* 10, no. 1 (2007): 77–94; Charles C. Torrey, “The Messiah Son of Ephraim,” *Journal of Biblical Literature* 66, no. 3 (1947): 253–277.

Tradition that messiah son of Joseph emerged in relation to Jesus: Sherwin, “‘Who Do You Say That I Am?’” 263–264.

Further development of this theory between the eighth and thirteenth centuries CE: Mitchell, “Messiah Ben Joseph”; Torrey, “Messiah Son of Ephraim.”

**Of those who either claimed** On Jesus the Jew, see John Dominic Crossan, *The Historical Jesus: The Life of a Mediterranean Peasant* (New York: HarperCollins, 1991); Steven L. Jacobs, “A Jewish Response to Byron L. Sherwin’s ‘A New Jewish View of Jesus,’” *Journal of Ecumenical Studies* 32, no. 2 (Spring 1995): 263–267; Bernard Martin, “Do We Need a New Jewish View of Jesus?,” *The Reconstructionist*, March 20, 1964, 7–13; Sherwin, “‘Who Do You Say That I Am?’”

Messiahs in Israel after Bar Kokhba: Following Bar Kokhba, the next messianic figure to arise in the Land of Israel emerged well over one thousand years later, in the sixteenth century; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 33.

Talmudic passages that dismiss both Bar Kokhba and Jesus: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 32–33. In tandem with the rise and spread of Christianity as a separate religion from Judaism, a number of texts emerged within the Jewish community that explicitly dismissed Jesus as not just a failed or false messiah but as a heretical figure altogether (see *ibid.*, 48–49).

Accusing Jews of killing the messiah: See, e.g., Elizabeth Dilling, *The Plot against Christianity* (Lincoln, NE: Elizabeth Dilling Foundation, 1964); David Duke, *My Awakening* (Cov-

ington, LA: Free Speech Press, 1998); Israel Shahak, *Jewish History, Jewish Religion: The Weight of Three Thousand Years* (Boulder, CO: Pluto Press, 1994).

**The belief that Jesus was the messiah** On calling Jesus the messiah postmortem, see Rivkin, “Meaning of Messiah,” 383.

Christian Jews: See chapters 5 and 8.

Biblical passages supporting the messianic idea: See, e.g., J. H. Charlesworth, “From Jewish Messianology to Christian Christology, Some Caveats and Perspectives,” in Neusner et al. (eds.), *Judaisms and Their Messiahs*, 225–264; idem, *Messiah*; A. J. B. Higgins, “Jewish Messianic Belief in Justin Martyr’s *Dialogue with Trypho*,” in Landman (ed.), *Messianism*, 182–189; Howard Clark Kee, “Christology in Mark’s Gospel,” in Neusner et al. (eds.), *Judaisms and Their Messiahs*, 187–208; Klausner, “Allusions to the Messianic Idea in the Pentateuch and Former Prophets,” in Landman (ed.), *Messianism*, 190–199; idem, “Jewish and Christian Messiah”; idem, “The Name and Personality of the Messiah,” in Landman (ed.), *Messianism*, 215–226; George Macrae, “Messiah and Gospel,” in Neusner et al. (eds.), *Judaisms and Their Messiahs*, 169–185.

Messiah resurrected postmortem: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 32–35. This said, two messiahs before Jesus had similar mysteries connected to the end to their physical lives, with Elijah going up to “heaven” and Zerubbabel disappearing (ibid., 47).

**It is critical to point out** Daniel Boyarin, *The Jewish Gospels: The Story of the Jewish Christ* (New York: New Press, 2012), 1–2, also 12–14.

**In other words, in relation to Jesus** One group, for example, called Minei or Nazarenes, was condemned by the Pharisaic Jews as well as the Nicene rulers of the Church (those involved in the Council of Nicea, where a number of Christian ideas and beliefs were decided upon) as being neither Jewish nor Christian (Jerome, *Correspondence*, ed. Isidorus Hilberg [Vienna: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, 1996], 55:381–382, in Boyarin, *Jewish Gospels*, 15–19).

On “proselytes, God-fearers, and *gerim*,” see Boyarin, *Jewish Gospels*, 23, citing Craig C. Hill, “The Jerusalem Church,” in *Jewish Christianity Reconsidered: Rethinking Ancient Groups and Texts*, ed. Matt Jackson-McCab (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2007), 50. Boyarin continues: “The ‘proselytes’ were non-Jews who completely threw their lot in with the Jewish people and became Jews, while the ‘God-fearers’ remained identified as Greeks and pagans but adhered to the God of Israel and the synagogue because they admired the religion of the one God. The *gerim*, sojourners or resident aliens, were Gentiles who lived among Jews in ‘their’ land” (ibid.).

**Boyarin also argues** It isn’t clear that the main thing separating Christian Jews from non-Christian Jews was the belief in Jesus as the messiah. In Boyarin’s words, “Jews who didn’t accept Jesus of Nazareth shared many ideas with Jews who did, including ideas that today mark off any absolute difference between two religions, Judaism and Christianity.

Some of these ideas were very close, if not identical, to the ideas of the Father and the Son and even the reincarnation” (Boyarin, *Jewish Gospels*, 24).

**One thing we can say** Neusner, *Messiah in Context*, xv; see also x–xi.

**In addition to Jesus** Some assume that Josephus claimed Vespasian was the messiah in an obsequious effort to gain favor with his Roman superiors; see, e.g., Henry Preserved Smith, “The Origin of the Messianic Hope in Israel,” in Landman (ed.), *Messianism*, 75).

For a scholarly debate on how best to frame these figures—whether we should interpret Josephus’s use of the label *messiah* to mean “king,” “leader,” “magician,” “messianic prophet,” “prophet,” “rebel,” “robber,” “sign-prophet,” or “teacher”—or whether we should even categorize all of these individuals using the same rubric, see Horsley, “‘Like One of the Prophets of Old’: Two Types of Popular Prophets at the Time of Jesus,” *Catholic Biblical Quarterly* 47, no. 3 (1985): 435–463, esp. 446–461; idem, “‘Messianic’ Figures and Movements,” in Charlesworth (ed.), *The Messiah*, 278–279; idem, “Popular Prophetic Movements,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 83–110; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 25–29; Smith, “Messiahs: Robbers, Jurists, Prophets, and Magicians,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 73–82. No matter what label these individuals get, there is wide acceptance that most, if not all, of them emerged among the poor masses rather than the powerful elite. Some also place Herod in the category of messianic figures from this time; e.g., Steven Bowman, “Mock *Aqedah* or *Mashiah*? Imagining Herod in *Sepher Yosippon*,” *European Journal of Jewish Studies* 2, no. 1 (2008): 34–40.

Evidence that an eschatological understanding of the messiah existed prior to Jesus: Horsley, “‘Like One of the Prophets of Old,’” 437. See also Acts 21:37–40. It is also possible that eschatological ideas that are said to be present in the Bible, such as those found throughout the Talmud, are actually interpretations of these sacred texts that link the messianic idea to the “end of days.” For one of many scholars who disagrees with this contention, see Gershom Scholem, “Toward an Understanding of the Messianic Idea in Judaism,” in *Messianic Idea in Judaism*, 1–36.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 4.1** Fifth-century Crete: Salo Wittmayer Baron, “Messianic and Sectarian Movements,” in *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements and Personalities in Jewish History*, ed. Marc Saperstein (New York: New York University Press, 1992), 162–163; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 63.

Seventh-century Syria: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 64.

Eighth-century Syria and Persia: Baron, “Messianic and Sectarian Movements,” 165–186; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 70–79. Israel Friedlaender (“Shiitic Influences on Jewish Sectarianism,” in Saperstein [ed.], *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 113–161) notes the profound role Shiite Islam played in influencing the belief systems of the Jewish followers of these three figures.

Eleventh-century France: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 65.

Eleventh-century Spain: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 65.



Eleventh-century Morocco: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 65–66.

Eleventh-century Syria or Egypt: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 67–68.

Twelfth-century Baghdad: S. D. Goitein, “A Report on Messianic Troubles in Baghdad in 1120–21,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 189–201.

Twelfth-century Morocco: Gerson D. Cohen, “Messianic Postures of Ashkenazim and Sephardim,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 205–206.

Twelfth-century Spain: Salo Wittmayer Baron, “Reappearance of Pseudo-Messiahs,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 237; Cohen, “Messianic Postures,” 205.

Twelfth-century Kurdistan: Baron, “Reappearance of Pseudo-Messiahs,” 237–241; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 81–91.

Thirteenth-century figure: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 94–96.

Fifteenth-century Yemen: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 229–231.

Sixteenth-century Austria: In spite of today’s Ashkenazi hegemony, it wasn’t until the sixteenth century, with Asher Lemlein, that an Ashkenazi Jew was added to the canon of Jewish messiahs (Ben-Sasson, “Messianic Movements”; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*).

Sixteenth-century Land of Israel: Ben-Sasson, “Messianic Movements,” 121; Lawrence Fine, *Physician of the Soul, Healer of the Cosmos: Isaac Luria and His Kabbalistic Fellowship* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2003), 322–326; Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 164–182; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 125–136.

Sixteenth-century Spain and Portugal: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 97–123.

Sixteenth- and seventeenth-century Land of Israel: Ben-Sasson, “Messianic Movements,” 121; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 136–147.

Seventeenth-century Turkey: Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 183–211; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 149–165; Yehuda Liebes, *Studies in Jewish Myth and Messianism*, trans. Batya Stein (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993), 93–113; Gershom Scholem, *Sabbatai Sevi: The Mystical Messiah*, trans. R. J. Zwi Werblowsky (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1976).

Seventeenth-century Yemen: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 231–235.

Eighteenth-century Ukraine and Russia: Benzion Dinur, “The Messianic-Prophetic Role of the Baal Shem Tov,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 377–388; Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 212–236; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 199–209.

Eighteenth-century Turkey and Poland: Jacob Frank claimed to be the reincarnation of Sabbatai Tzi. Like previous figures before him, he was harshly shunned by fellow Jews. According to some, on his deathbed he proclaimed that his daughter, Ewa, was to be his successor. Her following wasn’t as strong as her father’s, and, like her father before her, she was discounted by most Jews and said to have been a phony.

See Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 167–197; Rabow, *50 Jewish Messiahs*, 123–133.

Eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Poland: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 195–197.

Eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Russia: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 210.

Eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Ukraine: Arthur Green, “Nahman of Bratslav’s Messianic Strivings,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 389–432; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 192, 204–209; Liebes, *Studies in Jewish Myth*, 115–150.

Nineteenth-century Ukraine: Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 244–247; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 209–214.

Nineteenth- and twentieth-century Yemen: Bat-Zion Eraqi Klorman, *The Jews of Yemen in the Nineteenth Century: A Portrait of a Messianic Community* (New York: E. J. Brill, 1993); idem, “The Messiah Shukr Kuḥayl II (1868–75) and His Tithe (*Ma’ašer*): Ideology and Practice as a Means to Hasten Redemption,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 456–472; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 235–262.

Nineteenth- and twentieth-century Western Europe: There are a few passages in Theodor Herzl’s diaries where he either claims to be the messiah or says that other Jews consider him to be the messiah. See, e.g., Ariel Feldestein, “Textbooks as Memory-Shapers: Structuring the Image of Theodor Herzl in Textbooks as Part of Israeli Collective Memory in the 1950s,” *Israel Affairs* 13, no. 1 (January 2007): 87; Theodor Herzl, *The Complete Diaries of Theodor Herzl*, vol. 3, 960, in David Vital, *The Origins of Zionism* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1975), 244; Robert Solomon Wistrich, “Theodor Herzl: Zionist Icon, Myth-Maker, and Social Utopian,” *Israel Affairs* 1, no. 3 (1995): 1–37. In one instance, the Messiah reveals himself to Herzl in a dream, and says that Herzl needs to tell Jews that the Messiah is coming (Feldestein, “Textbooks as Memory-Shapers,” 84). In another, Herzl tells his grandmother that Elijah appeared to him and said that the soul of the messiah was inside him (*ibid.*, 93n.14).

Nineteenth- and twentieth-century Western Europe, Israel, and Palestine: According to his personal diary, between May and September 1915, when he was seventeen years old, Gershom Scholem believed he was the messiah and the young Martin Buber was Nathan of Gaza to his Sabbatai Tzvi, an analogy that will make more sense after the discussion of Tzvi later in this chapter. See Michael Brenner, “From Self-Described Messiah to Scholar of Messianism: The Recently Published Diaries Present Young Gerhard Scholem in a New Light,” *Jewish Social Studies* 3, no. 1 (Autumn 1996): 177–182.

**Some of these figures** For characteristics and/or actions attributed to messianic figures, see Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 270–271.

**Some of these figures were accompanied** Some changed their name: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 267.

Sabbatai Tzvi’s geographically widespread community: Gershom Scholem, “Sabbatai Sevi: The Mystical Messiah,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 290.

According to one scholar, from the time of the destruction of the Second Temple through the seventeenth century and the emergence of Sabbatai Tzvi, rabbinic authorities consistently rejected all of these messianic movements; see Gerson D. Cohen, *Messianic Postures of Ashkenazim and Sephardim (Prior to Sabbatai Tzvi)*, Leo Baeck Memorial Lecture IX (New York, 1967), cited in Gershom Scholem, “The Crisis of Tradition in Jewish Messianism,” in *Messianic Idea in Judaism*, 56.

Neusner quote: Neusner, *Messiah in Context*, xi–xiii.

**Some challenge the idea** Horsley, “Popular Messianic Movements,” 98.

Comparative analysis of messianic figures: For comparative messianic work focused on Jewish and non-Jewish figures, e.g. between the Christian Jewish movement of the first few centuries CE and the Sabbatian movement of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, see W.D. Davies, “From Schweitzer to Scholem: Reflections on Sabbatai Svi,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 335–374.

**Certain academics maintain** On the broadening of ideas related to messianic figures, see, e.g., Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 67; Eliezer Schweid, “Jewish Messianism: Metamorphoses of an Idea,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 62–64. Maimonides is famous for saying that the messiah will not have to perform “signs and wonders” or “revive the dead. . . . Let no one think that in the days of the Messiah any of the laws of nature will be set aside, or any innovation be introduced into creation” (MT 13:1, in Menachem Kellner, *Maimonides on the “Decline of the Generations” and the Nature of Rabbinic Authority* [Albany: State University of New York Press, 1996], 75). This idea was also expressed some one thousand years prior, in the Babylonian Talmud (BT San. 91b). Maimonides is credited with both elevating the belief in the messiah to a core Jewish belief and proposing that there were all too many false messiahs, both alive during his lifetime and preceding him. He also thought that the messiah would have a long life and then die, akin to an average human lifespan, rather than have supernatural abilities such as immortality. See Ben-Sasson, “Messianic Movements,” 117.

Narrowing of ideas related to messianic figures: During the seventh through ninth centuries CE in the Middle East, for instance, Jewish communities’ understanding of the relationship between the messiah son of Joseph and the messiah son of David stabilized. The former messiah became accepted as the precursor to the latter, an idea originally found in the Talmud. See Sherwin, “‘Who Do You Say That I Am?’” 263n.18.

**An important idea that emerged** Sheol: For example, *Sheolah*—Gen. 37:35, 42:38; *Sheol*—Deut. 32:22; 2 Sam. 22:6; Isa. 5:14, 14:9, 11; Ps. 18:6, 141:7; *Shi’ol*—1 Kings 2:6; Job 17:16.

Sheol akin to a netherworld: One scholar says that within the Bible itself Sheol goes through three incarnations: first as an amoral and eternal place for those who die; then as a place specifically for the wicked; and finally as some sort of intermediate place between the world and a postmortem existence, accommodating those who are righteous or those

who are wicked. Two other related ideas also found in the Bible are the resurrection of the dead and the end of time. See Simcha Paull Raphael, *Jewish Views of the Afterlife* (Northdale, NJ: Jason Aronson, 1994), 41–64, 74–75, 158–160; also David Charles Kraemer, *The Meanings of Death in Judaism* (London: Routledge, 2000).

**Aside from sacred yet noncanonical texts** For example, the books of Enoch, 4 Ezra, and 1 Maccabees (Raphael, *Jewish Views*, 77–115). For particular passages, see, e.g., 1 Enoch 84–94, 104–106, 112–113; 2 Enoch 94–97, 106–107; 3 Enoch 97–99, 107–108; 4 Ezra 99–102, 105, 111, 114; and 2 Macc. 110–111.

**Some of these Mishnaic and Talmudic discussions** On *olam haba* as what will happen in this world in its next phase, see Raphael, *Jewish Views*, 121–162.

*Olam haba* and *yimei hamashiah* as synonyms: There is a debate among scholars as to whether the rabbinic authors used these terms synonymously; see, e.g., Landman (ed.), *Messianism*, xxxiii.

*Gehenna* and *gehennum*: Raphael, *Jewish Views*, 140–149. *Gan Eden*: Raphael, *Jewish Views*, 149–156.

**From the Talmudic era** On changing meanings of the terms *olam haba*, *yimei hamashiah*, *gehenna*, *gehennum*, and *Gan Eden*, see Raphael, *Jewish Views*, 163–402.

Influence of non-Jewish communities on the Jewish idea of the messiah: See, e.g., Lloyd, R. Applegate, “Zoroastrianism and Its Probable Influence on Judaism and Christianity,” *Journal of Religion and Psychical Research* 23, no. 4 (October 2000): 184–196; James Barr, “The Question of Religious Influence: The Case of Zoroastrianism, Judaism, and Christianity,” *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 53, no. 2 (June 1985): 201–235.

**Today, the majority . . . of Jews** According to a 2008 study, only 39 percent of American Jews believe in an afterlife, in contrast to 74 percent of Americans generally, 62 percent of Buddhists, 61 percent of Hindus, and 48 percent of the unaffiliated (Pew Research Center, “U.S. Religious Landscape Survey—Religious Affiliation: Diverse and Dynamic,” February 2008, [www.pewforum.org/files/2013/05/report-religious-landscape-study-full.pdf](http://www.pewforum.org/files/2013/05/report-religious-landscape-study-full.pdf)). Gallup polls conducted in 1952 and 1965 showed even lower numbers among American Jews, 35 percent and 17 percent, respectively (George Gallup, *Adventures in Immortality* [New York: McGraw-Hill, 1981]), 212, cited in Raphael, *Jewish Views*, 29).

Jewish Israelis’ belief in an afterlife: A 2012 study showed that 56 percent of Israeli Jews believe in an afterlife; see Kobi Nahshoni, “Poll: 80% of Israeli Jews Believe in God,” January 28, 2012, [www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4181776,00.html](http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4181776,00.html). See also Arian and Keissar-Sugarmen, “Portrait of Israeli Jews,” 17.

**In the medieval period** Scholar Moshe Idel (*Messianic Mystics*, 265–269) argues that because Jewish mystical thought relies on “sophisticated” and complex doctrines that are most often rooted in sacred texts, messiahs who integrated mystical thought into their ideology were “accessible only to a very small elite.”

According to Gershom Scholem, twelfth-, thirteenth-, and fourteenth-century Kabbalists (see chapter 6) were not focused on the “end of days,” but rather on the “primal days of Creation” (Scholem, “Messianic Idea in Kabbalism,” 38–39). It was not until the sixteenth century, following the expulsion of Jews from the Iberian Peninsula, that Kabbalists began centering their mystical thought on a future messianic age (ibid., 41–42).

**One of the earliest medieval mystics** Abraham Abulafia offered several new ideas about the messiah, including a few based in a numerical system of interpretation called Gematria. According to this technique, each letter of the Hebrew alphabet is assigned a number (akin to A=1, B=2, etc.); passages from the Bible are then analyzed using this frame of reference. For instance, according to Jewish tradition, the seventh day of creation, *Shabbat*, symbolizes the time when the world will be redeemed. Accordingly, the sixth day, *yom hashishi* in Hebrew, is the period of time immediately preceding the redemption. Abulafia pointed out that the Gematria for *yom hashishi* is 671; so, too, is the Gematria for *yeshu hanotzri*, Hebrew for Jesus of Nazareth. For more on Abulafia, see Abraham Berger, “The Messianic Self-Consciousness of Abraham Abulafia: A Tentative Evaluation,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 250–255; Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 58–100; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 94–96; Sherwin, “‘Who Do You Say that I Am?’” 263). See also Moshe Idel, *The Mystical Experience in Abraham Abulafia* (New York: State University of New York Press, 1988).

**In contrast, the sixteenth-century mystic** On the Lurianic notion of individuals being able to hasten the coming of the messiah, see Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 128; Gershom Scholem, “Abraham Cardosos,” *Judaica* 1, 120, cited in David Biale, “Gershom Scholem on Jewish Messianism,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 530–531; Scholem, “Redemption through Sin,” in *Messianic Idea in Judaism*, 87. Luria was not the first scholar to bring this idea to the fore. Among others, Maimonides, some four centuries earlier, also wrote about the role that everyday individuals can play in hastening the coming of the messiah; see Schweid, “Jewish Messianism,” 62–64.

For some, a core point of contention is whether the messiah will bring in the messianic age and subsequently give the masses instructions, or whether the masses themselves will activate the coming of the messiah. A number of rabbis have maintained the latter belief, some of whom tied it together with their understanding of Zionism and the need for Jews to “return” to the Land of Israel in order to hasten the messiah’s coming. Among other eighteenth-, nineteenth-, and twentieth-century figures who promoted this point of view were Rabbis Yehuda Alkalai, Hirsch Kalischer, and Abraham Isaac Kook. See, e.g., Raymond Goldwater, *Pioneers of Religious Zionism: Rabbis Alkalai, Kalischer, Mohliver, Kook, and Maimon* (New York: Urim Publications, 2009); Moshe Idel, “Messianic Scholars: On Early Israeli Scholarship, Politics, and Messianism,” *Modern Judaism: A Journal of Jewish Ideas and Experience* 32, no. 1 (2012), 22–53; idem, *Messi-*

*anic Mystics*, 324–326; Jacob Katz, “Israel and the Messiah,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 475–491; Menachem Kellner, “Messianic Postures in Israel Today,” ibid., 504–518; Shalom Ratzabi, “Religious Thinkers on the Secular State,” *Israel Studies* 13, no. 3 (Fall 2008): 114–136; Dov Schwartz, *Religious Zionism: History and Ideology* (Boston: Academic Studies Press, 2009), 27–33.

Haim Vital as Luria’s potential successor: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 125–147.

**According to the renowned twentieth-century scholar** On the spread of messianic thought outside the Land of Israel, see Scholem, *Sabbatai Sevi*, in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*. For arguments challenging Scholem’s thesis, see Matt Goldish, *The Sabbatean Prophets* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2004). It is interesting to note that Scholem was among the first scholars to apply a psychiatric or mental health lens to the study of historical messiahs, speculating, in the case of Tzvi, that he suffered from bipolar disorder, as evidenced by his extreme manic and depressive shifts in behavior; see Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 152.

Spanish Inquisition as a precursor to the messianic age: Lawrence Fine, “Kabbalistic Texts,” in *Back to the Sources: Reading the Classic Jewish Texts*, ed. Barry W. Holtz (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2006), 342.

**In seventeenth-century Smyrna** Scholem notes that if Tzvi didn’t suffer from bipolar disorder and had not, by chance, met Rabbi Nathan of Gaza (John the Baptist to Tzvi’s Jesus), it is unlikely Tzvi’s messianic fervor would ever have reached the masses. See Gershom Scholem, *Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism* (New York: Schocken Books, 1974), 287–324. For more on Nathan of Gaza’s adherence to Lurianic mysticism, see Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 3–6.

Rejections of Tzvi: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 149–165. Interestingly, Tzvi’s devotees referred to themselves as the believers, *ma’aminim*, and to their opponents as the deniers, *kofrim*; see Gershom Scholem, “The Crypto-Jewish Sect of the Dönme (Sabbatians) in Turkey,” in *Messianic Idea in Judaism*, 147.

Spread of Tzvi’s devotees: According to Gershom Scholem, Sabbatai Tzvi didn’t have a single devotee until Nathan of Gaza, after which point his movement grew exponentially (Scholem, “Crisis of Tradition in Jewish Messianism,” 60; idem, “Crypto-Jewish Sect,” 144). Some argue that although Tzvi “appealed broadly to Sephardim, Ashkenazim and Christians, he had special appeal for *conversos*” (Jews living in the Iberian Peninsula during the fourteenth century and onward who pretended to be Catholic while practicing Jewish rituals in secret), especially because some of his ideas were rooted in antinomianism (i.e., “redemption through sin”). See Laura Arnold Leibman, *Messianism, Secrecy, and Mysticism: A New Interpretation of Early American Jewish Life* (Portland, OR: Vallentine Mitchell, 2012), 11; also Scholem, *Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism*, 303.

**Most Jewish authorities** On “redemption through sin,” see Shaul Magid, *Hasidism on the Margin: Reconciliation, Anti-*



*nomianism, and Messianism in Izbica/Radzin Hasidism* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2004), 201–203, 205–248, 340n.31, 350n.5, 351n.10, 356n.45; Gershom Scholem, “Redemption through Sin,” 78–142; idem, *Sabbatai Sevi*. Some say that this is the main aspect of Tzvi’s ideology that distinguishes it from Christianity. In the words of R.J. Zwi Werblowsky: “One of the main differences between the Christian and Sabbatian theologies is the nature of the messianic paradox. In the case of Jesus of Nazareth it takes on a form that might be called metaphysical. Jesus accepts the disgrace of death for the sake of redemption. For Sabbatianism the paradox is of a more moral kind. Sabbetai accepts worse than death, namely the disgrace of sin, and of the world sin at that, apostasy” (Werblowsky, “Messianism in Jewish History,” in Saperstein [ed.], *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 50).

**In 1666, however** Some contend that from the time he publicly converted to Islam through his death, Tzvi practiced both Islam and Judaism; e.g., Scholem, “Crisis of Tradition in Jewish Messianism,” 63.

New postconversion Sabbatian subject: Scholem, *Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism*, 287–324.

Dönme: Muge Akgun, “Historian Writes about the Sabbateans,” *Turkish Daily News*, March 8, 2008, [www.hurriyetdailynews.com/historian-writes-about-sabbateans.aspx?pageID=438&n=historian-writes-about-sabbateans-2008-03-06](http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/historian-writes-about-sabbateans.aspx?pageID=438&n=historian-writes-about-sabbateans-2008-03-06); Marc David Baer, *The Dönme: Jewish Converts, Muslim Revolutionaries, and Secular Turks* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2009); Rachel Elior, ed., *The Sabbatian Movement and its Aftermath: Messianism, Sabbatianism and Frankism* (Jerusalem: Institute of Jewish Studies, 2001); Scholem, “Crisis of Tradition in Jewish Messianism,” 63–67; idem, “Crypto-Jewish Sect,” 142–166; idem, “Redemption through Sin,” 81, 114–115; idem, “A Sabbatian Will from New York,” in *Messianic Idea in Judaism*, 167–175; Cengiz Sisman, “Dönme,” in *The Oxford Encyclopedia of the Islamic World*, vol. 2, ed. John L. Esposito (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009); idem, “The History of Naming the Ottoman/Turkish Sabbatians,” in *Studies on Istanbul and Beyond*, ed. Robert G. Ousterhout (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007), 37–51.

**The eighteenth-century figure Jacob Frank** Jacob Frank was not the first messianic figure to claim to be the reincarnation of Sabbatai Tzvi; see, e.g., Rabow, *50 Jewish Messiahs*, 116–119.

Frank and *tikkun olam*: Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 167–197; Rabow, *50 Jewish Messiahs*, 123–133; Scholem, “Redemption through Sin,” 126–141. For other connections between the Sabbatian and Frankian movements, see Scholem, “Crypto-Jewish Sect,” 160–161; see also chapter 6.

“Zoharites”: Arthur Green, “Introduction,” in Daniel C. Matt, trans. and comm., *The Zohar*, Pritzker ed., vol. 1 (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2004), lxxviii; see also chapter 6.

**Beginning in the eighteenth century** Twentieth-century scholars Gershom Scholem and Martin Buber argued as to whether Hasidism was a reaction to Sabbatianism, especially

in its attempt to neutralize messianic elements from the earlier movement. See, e.g., Moshe Idel, *Hasidism: Between Ecstasy and Magic* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995), 3–4, 16, 53, 253; idem, “The Tsadik and His Soul’s Sparks: From Kabbalah to Hasidism,” *Jewish Quarterly Review* 103, no. 2 (Spring 2013): 196–240; Liebes, *Studies in Jewish Myth*, 115–150; Scholem, *Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism*, 327–328, 338–329; idem, “Martin Buber’s Interpretation of Hasidism,” in *Messianic Idea in Judaism*, 228–250; idem, “The Neutralization of the Messianic Element in Early Hasidism,” *ibid.*, 176–202.

As one scholar explains, “Scholem’s argument is that although early Hasidim continued to say the usual prayers and repeat the usual formulas, their focus turned inward. Instead of redemption *from* exile, the goal became redemption *in* exile, by which they meant the sanctification of the individual soul culminating in *devekut* or union (adhesion), with God. This at least was within the human capability; although they did not deny that redemption could occur on a grand scale, events of this kind are in the hands of God” (Kenneth Seeskin, *Jewish Messianic Thoughts in an Age of Despair* [New York: Cambridge University Press, 2012], 52, referring to Scholem, *Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism*, 195).

Other scholars maintain that Hasidism lessened the focus on a single messiah but did not neutralize the idea altogether (e.g., Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 199–201; Raphael Mahler, “Hasidism and the Jewish Enlightenment,” in *Essential Papers on Hasidism: Origins to Present*, ed. Gershon David Hundert [New York: New York University Press, 1991], 416–417; Joseph G. Weiss, “Contemplative Mysticism and ‘Faith’ in Hasidic Piety,” *Journal of Jewish Studies* 4, no. 1 [1953]: 21) or that the founders were “very cautious” about incorporating some Sabbatian ideas while distancing themselves from others (Magid, *Hasidism on the Margin*, 201–203). Moshe Idel notes that Sabbatian themes are clearly present in Hasidism and may even have been influential in the development of certain strands of mystical thought; however, he concludes that “as a system [the Sabbatian] influence [on Hasidism] was minimal” (Idel, *Hasidism*, 53).

In contrast to these positions, Isaiah Tishby says that it is possible that the founders of Hasidism were themselves from the Sabbatian movement (Isaiah Tishby, “Between Sabbateanism and Hasidism: The Sabbateanism of the Kabbalist R. Ya’aqov Lifshitz of Miedzyrec,” in *Paths of Faith and Heresy*, ed. Isaiah Tishby [Ramat Gan, 1964], 204–226 [Hebrew], cited in Idel, *Hasidism*, 4, 253; Tishby, “The Messianic Idea and Messianic Trends in the Growth of Hasidism,” *Zion* 32 [1967]: 1–45 [Hebrew]).

**Messianism aside** Before Hasidism, Luria and his followers also utilized the idea of the *tzadik* in their teachings, though they differed in their understanding of the role this individual had; see Jonathan Garb, “The Cult of the Saints in Lurianic Kabbalah,” *Jewish Quarterly Review* 98, no. 2 (Spring 2008): 207–208, 226–228.

**The veneration of Hasidic rabbis** On saints in non-Jewish traditions, see Garb, “Cult of Saints.”

Simultaneous *tzadikim* among Hasidic sects: Some assert that Hasidism also recentralized the idea that every individual has an important role to play in hastening the messianic age (Biale, “Gershom Scholem on Jewish Messianism,” 541). Ironically, while promoting the idea that no single person is the embodiment of God vis-à-vis his own potential messiahness, given there have been many *tzadikim* alive at the same time, this movement has also reinforced the notion that only certain people (i.e., the *tzadikim* themselves) have the potential to be the messiah. In Moshe Idel’s own words, “Originally, this Hasidic school sought to moderate acute messianism. . . . Ironically, this once nonmessianic Hasidic approach bears witness to a clear revival of the mythical element of messianism. Thus even within a specific intellectual system, there can be oscillations between different writings and various definitions of messianism, which fluctuate according to historical or personal circumstance, causing the rise of the importance of a notion that earlier had been rejected or marginalized” (Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 278).

Multiple simultaneous *tzadikim* and Zions: Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 235–247; see also chapter 3.

**One may hold that the messianic idea** On the marginality of the messianic idea vis-à-vis core Jewish texts, see Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 262–265.

Word-count wise, the messianic idea is not central to the Bible, Mishnah, or Talmud: Saperstein, “Introduction,” in idem (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 17–18.

Messianic idea as having central significance for Jewish communities: The nineteenth-century German Jewish philosopher Hermann Cohen is credited with saying that messianism is the core of Judaism, even more important than monotheism; see Caitlin Yoshiko Kandil, “Jewish Word: Messiah—A Word Fit for a King,” *Moment Magazine* (March/April 2012), 21; see also Rory Schacter, “Hermann Cohen’s Secular Messianism and Liberal Cosmopolitanism,” Jerusalem Center for Public Affairs, April 24, 2008, <http://jcpa.org/article/hermann-cohens-secular-messianism-and-liberal-cosmopolitanism>.

It should also be noted that many synagogues, as well as other material forms of culture, especially those found on Caribbean islands, in Western Europe, and in the United States from the seventeenth century to today, are intentionally designed to reflect the Temple. In the words of one scholar, “to call upon the Temple of Jerusalem is to engage in messianic longing,” whether in the form of a messiah figure or a messianic age (Leibman, *Messianism, Secrecy, and Mysticism*, 59).

**This is evident, for starters** For calculations regarding when the messiah is supposed to appear, see Cohen, “Messianic Postures”; Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 158–161; Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*; Rabow, *50 Jewish Messiahs*; Joseph Sarachek, *The Doctrine of the Messiah in Medieval Jewish Literature* (New York: Hermon Press, 1968). For an analysis of twentieth-century calculations—and recalculations (i.e., when the messiah doesn’t come at the expected time, people often reexamine their calculations; such situations may either give devotees’

belief in the coming of the messiah new energy or discourage them altogether), see Motti Inbari, “Messianic Movements and Failed Prophecies in Israel: Five Case Studies,” *Nova Religio: The Journal of Alternative and Emergent Religions* 13, no. 4 (2010): 43–60.

Messiah in the *Amidah* prayer: BT Meg. 17b.

**A fourth indicator** On messianism in communism, nationalism, and socialism, see Rory Schacter, “Hermann Cohen’s Secular Messianism”; Schweid, “Jewish Messianism,” 65–70. For a brief analysis of the two primary types of messianism outlined by Gershom Scholem, the “restorative and utopian-catastrophic” (522), see Biale, “Gershom Scholem on Jewish Messianism,” 521–550.

**Fifth, many Jews** On the “miracle” of Israel’s military victory in June 1967, see Ehud Sprinzak, *The Ascendancy of Israel’s Right* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991); Chaim I. Waxman, “The Fourth Generation Grows Up: The Contemporary American Jewish Community,” *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 454 (1981): 70–85. See also chapter 10.

“Secular” belief in the “ingathering of the exiles”: Ben Zion Bokser, ed. and trans., *Abraham Isaac Kook: The Lights of Penitence, the Moral Principles, Lights of Holiness, Essays, Letters, and Poems* (New York: Paulist Press, 1978); Goldwater, *Pioneers of Religious Zionism*; Idel, “Messianic Scholars”; Inbari, “Messianic Movements,” 54–57; Katz, “Israel and the Messiah”; Kellner, “Messianic Postures”; Ratzabi, “Religious Thinkers”; Schwartz, *Religious Zionism*; Uriel Tal, “Foundations of a Political Messianic Trend in Israel,” in Saperstein (ed.), *Essential Papers in Messianic Movements*, 492–503.

Shoah as symbol of the “end of days”: In scholar David Halperin’s words, “We think of apocalyptic Judaism as having fallen into disuse, but I think it is at the center of modern Judaism. Our catastrophe was the Holocaust, and God’s Kingdom is the State of Israel” (quoted in Berman et al., “What Does the Concept of Messiah Mean Today?,” 31).

**To put it simply, many Jews today** According to a 2012 study, 51 percent of Israeli Jews believe in the coming of the messiah; see Arian and Keissar-Sugarmen, “Portrait of Israeli Jews,” 15, 49–51, 97; Nahshoni, “Poll: 80% of Israeli Jews”). We don’t currently have these data for American Jews.

**As for belief in a messianic age** Bokser, *Abraham Isaac Kook*; Goldwater, *Pioneers of Religious Zionism*; Katz, “Israel and the Messiah”; Schwartz, *Religious Zionism*.

On Reform Judaism and the messianic age, see Joseph Heinemann, *Prayer in the Talmud: Forms and Patterns*, trans. Richard S. Sarason (New York: Walter de Gruyter, 1977); Lawrence A. Hoffman, *The Canonization of the Synagogue Service* (South Bend, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1979); Neusner, *Messiah in Context*, 234–238.

**These doctrines were reiterated** “We are called to help bring near the messianic age . . .”: “A Statement of Principles for Reform Judaism,” adopted at the 1999 Pittsburgh Convention of the Central Conference of American Rabbis, <http://>

ccarnet.org/rabbis-speak/platforms/statement-principles-reform-judaism.

**Behind the conjecture** A “light unto the nations” in Hebrew is *or la-goyim*. See Raphael Jospe, “The Concept of the Chosen People,” *Judaism* 43, no. 2 (Spring 1994): 127–148; also chapter 2.

Jewish allegiances to the State of Israel: Steven M. Cohen and Ari Y. Kelman, “Beyond Distancing: Young Adult American Jews and Their Alienation from Israel,” Andrea and Charles Bronfman Philanthropies, New York, 2007, [www.acbp.net/pdf/pdfs-research-and-publications/Beyond\\_Distancing.pdf](http://www.acbp.net/pdf/pdfs-research-and-publications/Beyond_Distancing.pdf).

**In regard to “service”** On “service” as *tikkun olam*, see Jill Jacobs, *There Shall Be No Needy: Pursuing Social Justice through Jewish Law and Tradition* (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 2009), 24–28, 37–40, 128–129; Jane Kanarek, “What Does Tikkun Olam Actually Mean?,” in *Righteous Indignation: A Jewish Call for Justice*, ed. Or N. Rose, Jo Ellen Green Kaiser, and Margue Klein (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 2008), 15–22; see also chapter 6.

Well-known Jewish American activist Ruth Messinger explains this idea as follows: “The notion of a messiah is that in a time of troubles—which is what we have now—we are called on to do much more, in partnership with each other and with a world of force, to make things better. It won’t happen because someone drops out of the sky” (quoted in Berman et al., “What Does the Concept of Messiah Mean Today?,” 31).

Framing the issue theologically, Rabbi David Wolpe says, “Today the Messiah must represent an ideal of peace whose fulfillment lies in our own hands. The age of magic formulas or mitzvot flipping the eschatological switch is past. The nobility in the messianic vision is to live so that when the Messiah comes, we will no longer need him. That may prove beyond our powers, in which case, quite literally, God help us” (ibid., 35).

Performance of Jewish identities through “service”: For example, BTW Consulting, Inc., “Jewish Service Learning: What Is and What Could Be,” May 2008, <http://btw.informingchange.com/uploads/2009/11/Jewish-Service-Learning-What-Is-and-What-Could-Be.pdf>; Fern Chertok, Joshua Tobias, Shirah Rosin, Matthew Boxer, and Jim Gerstein, “Volunteering + Values: A Repair the World Report on Jewish Young Adults,” Repair the World, 2011, available at [www.brandeis.edu/cmjs/pdfs/VolunteeringValuesReport.Final.pdf](http://www.brandeis.edu/cmjs/pdfs/VolunteeringValuesReport.Final.pdf); Jonathan Krasner, “The Place of Tikkun Olam in American Jewish Life,” Jerusalem Center for Public Affairs, November 1, 2014, <http://jcpa.org/article/place-tikkun-olam-american-jewish-lifer>; Mordecai Walfish, “Jewish Service-Learning: History and Landscape,” *Journal of Jewish Communal Service* 87, nos. 1/2 (Winter/Spring 2012): 18–30, available at <http://jpro.org/pdf-files/past-web/18.pdf>.

Striving to make the world a better place as a core Jewish value: For an example of a conventional Jewish American leader’s ideas on this, see Irving Greenberg, “Personal Service: A Central Jewish Norm for Our Time,” *Contact* 4, no.

1 (Autumn 2001): 3–4. There are a number of other articles echoing this same idea. I realize that for some it is inaccurate to intermix the notions of “Israel advocacy” and service, let alone service, social justice, social action, and civil rights. However, I maintain that the intention of those Jews who engage in these issues is integrally related to their working toward a messianic age, implicitly or otherwise.

**According to scholar Kenneth Seeskin** Seeskin is quoted in Berman et al., “What Does the Concept of Messiah Mean Today?,” 31.

Leibowitz quote: Yeshayahu Leibowitz, “*Lishmah* and not *Lishmah*,” in *Faith, History, and Values* (Jerusalem: Academon, 1982), 25–45 [Hebrew], quoted in Yeshayahu Leibowitz: *Judaism, Human Values, and the Jewish State*, ed. Eliezer Goldman (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1992), 72.

**Some speculate that one reason** This chapter does not explore deeper patterns found from the first century CE forward in the literature produced by messianic figures. What is much more important for our purposes is that various Jewish communities believed that each one of these figures was the messiah. For more on the notion of charisma, see Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 93–104, 110–123.

Wilson quote: Bryan R. Wilson, *The Noble Savages: The Primitive Origins of Charisma and Its Contemporary Survival* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1975), 7, quoted in Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 78.

**As with the case of Tzvi** For an interesting thesis regarding three main stages in the development of the messianic idea, from the time of the Bible through the Talmudic era, see Shemaryahu Talmon, “The Concepts of Māšīah and Messianism in Early Judaism,” in Charlesworth (ed.), *The Messiah*, 80–115, esp. 80–83.

Green quote: Green, “Introduction: Messiah in Judaism,” in Neusner et al. (eds.), *Judaisms and Their Messiahs*, 4.

**Within the Jewish community** On the agenda being “complete change,” see Lenowitz, *Jewish Messiahs*, 263. Lenowitz goes on to agree, more or less, with Gershom Scholem, saying that the messianic age will come in a time of “desperation.” In contrast, elsewhere Scholem writes that the “end of days” is not an either/or situation; it is going to be a time of great destruction. In his own words, “Jewish Messianism is in its origins and by its nature—this cannot be sufficiently emphasized—a theory of catastrophe” (Scholem, “Toward an Understanding of the Messianic Idea in Judaism,” 7).

Amos Oz quote: Quoted in Berman et al., “What Does the Concept of Messiah Mean Today?,” 31. Yeshayahu Leibowitz similarly said: “The Messiah is essentially he who always *will come*, he is the eternal future” (Leibowitz, “*Lishmah* and Not-*Lishmah*”).

## Chapter 5. Laws

**“Well,” he softly responded** With the words “lucky for you . . .” the rabbi was making a derogatory comment about the Reform movement, insofar as part of their doctrine is



that halakhah, though observed by some Reform Jews, is not obligatory; Orthodoxy maintains that it is (see chapter 8).

**He went on to explain** Aaron Joshua Tapper, “The ‘Cult’ of Aish Hatorah: *Ba’alei Teshuva* and the New Religious Movement Phenomenon,” *Jewish Journal of Sociology* 44, nos. 1–2 (2002): 24n.55 and 25n.57. As discussed in chapter 6, according to some rabbinic leaders, such as Isaac Luria and Shneur Zalman, Jews’ souls are intrinsically more Godly than those of non-Jews. See Jody Myers, “Kabbalah for the Gentiles: Diverse Souls and Universalism in Contemporary Kabbalah,” in *Kabbalah and Contemporary Spiritual Revival: Historical, Sociological and Cultural Perspectives*, ed. Boaz Huss (Beer-Sheva, Isr.: Ben-Gurion University of the Negev Press, 2011), 181–212.

**The next day I visited the home of my own rabbi** On the United States naturalization process, see United States Citizenship and Immigration Services, “USCIS Policy Manual English and Civics Testing Guidance,” part e, ch. 1, sect. a, [www.uscis.gov/policymanual/HTML/PolicyManual-Volumer12-PartE-Chapter1.html#S-A](http://www.uscis.gov/policymanual/HTML/PolicyManual-Volumer12-PartE-Chapter1.html#S-A).

**As discussed in previous chapters** On the Talmud’s relevance vis-à-vis the Torah, see, e.g., Judith Hauptman, *Rereading the Rabbis: A Woman’s Voice* (Boulder, CO: Westview Press, 1998), 1; Talya Fishman, *Becoming the People of the Talmud: Oral Torah as Written Tradition in Medieval Jewish Cultures* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2011). See also fig. 2.4.

When legal jurists decide how to interpret halakhah today: For contemporary responses to the importance of studying Talmud, see Paul Socken, ed., *Why Study Talmud in the Twenty-First Century? The Relevance of the Ancient Jewish Text to Our World* (New York: Lexington Books, 2009).

**The Talmud is a compilation of texts** Some claim that the first-century CE sect called the Pharisees, discussed further in chapter 8, “transformed” themselves into the rabbis following the destruction of the First Temple, despite the fact that neither the rabbis of the Mishnah nor those of the Talmud claim to be the descendants of the Pharisees. See Shaye J. D. Cohen, *From the Maccabees to the Mishnah* (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1989), 226–227.

**The oldest parts of a page of Talmud** The root letters of the Aramaic word *Gemara*, g-m-r, are equivalent to the root letters of the Hebrew word *Talmud*, l-m-d, both of which mean teaching. In fact, what is called Gemara today was originally called Talmud. See “Gemara: The Essence of Talmud,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/gemara-the-essence-of-the-talmud](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/gemara-the-essence-of-the-talmud); Michael Katz and Gershon Schwartz, *Swimming in the Sea of Talmud* (New York: Jewish Publication Society, 1997), 12.

For more on normative understandings of the Mishnah, see H. L. Strack and Günter Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud and Midrash*, trans. Markus Bockmuehl (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 1996), 108–148.

For more on recent reexaminations of the Mishnah, specifically as something other than a legal text, see Christine

Hayes, “What is (the) Mishnah? Concluding Observations,” *Association of Jewish Studies Review* 32, no. 2 (November 2008): 291–297; Ishay Rosen-Zvi, “Orality, Narrative, Rhetoric: New Directions in Mishnah Research,” *Association of Jewish Studies Review* 32, no. 2 (November 2008): 235–249.

#### **The Mishnah also exists independent of the Talmud**

Some compare the Mishnah to Roman legal texts from the first, second, and sixth centuries CE. See, e.g., Boaz Cohen, *Jewish and Roman Law: A Comparative Study*, vol. 1 (New York: Shulsinger Bros., Inc., 1966); S. Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 219, 229–230.

Hebrew and Aramaic: Historically, there have been numerous dialects of these two languages; see Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud*, 101–107.

**There are actually two sets of Talmud** As for who edited—or redacted—either the Jerusalem or the Babylonian Talmud, we don’t know, nor do we know if Judah the Prince (see below), commonly credited with compiling the Mishnah, actually did so. Some say that the version of the Babylonian Talmud that we have today was originally edited and compiled in its entirety in a specific time period. Others hold that the process took place in incremental stages over the course of centuries; see Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud*, 194–197, 214–215. For more on the Jerusalem Talmud and Babylonian Talmud, see *ibid.*, 164–189 and 190–224, respectively.

Characteristics of the Babylonian and Jerusalem Talmuds: Katz and Schwartz, *Swimming in the Sea*, 9–31; Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud*, 180–185.

**Interaction between Palestine-based rabbis** On the destruction of the Temple in the Talmuds, see Berachyahu Lifshitz, “The Age of the Talmud,” in *An Introduction to the History and Sources of Jewish Law*, ed. Neil S. Hecht, Bernard S. Jackson, Stephen M. Passamaneck, Daniela Piattelli, and Alfredo Mordechai Rabello (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), 169–195.

Babylonian Talmud in dialogue with the Jerusalem Talmud: Daniel Boyarin, *Border Lines: The Partition of Judaeo-Christianity* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004), 151; Jacob Neusner, *Judaism in Society: The Evidence of the Yerushalmi—Toward the Natural History of a Religion* (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1991).

Relationship between the Talmuds and their editor(s): Judith Hauptman, “Feminist Perspectives on Rabbinic Texts,” in *Feminist Perspectives on Jewish Studies*, ed. Lynn Davidman and Shelly Tenenbaum (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1994), 40.

Ilan quote: Tal Ilan, “Introduction,” in *A Feminist Commentary on the Babylonian Talmud*, ed. Tal Ilan, Tamara Or, Dorothea M. Salzer, Christiane Steuer, and Irina Wandrey (Tübingen, Ger.: Mohr Siebeck, 2007), 15. In making this statement Ilan means to say that because we know there have been different versions of the sets of Talmuds, and we do not know definitively who edited either set of Talmuds or when they were first codified, we cannot say with any historical cer-

tainty that the versions studied today are the versions as they were originally written.

**During the proto-Jewish era** The use of the terms *rabbis* and *rabbinic period* in this book refers to texts produced during the Second Temple period (c. sixth century BCE through first century CE) through the eighth century, the last century usually included in the concretizing of the Babylonian Talmud.

**Biblical authorities:** According to a literal reading of the Bible, there were no female kings and only one queen, Atalya (2 Kings 11; 2 Chron. 22–23); no female priests; one female judge, Deborah (Judg. 4); and five female prophets: Deborah, Hulda (2 Kings 22; 2 Chron. 34), Miriam (Mic. 6, though this is debatable), Noadiah (Neh. 6), and Isaiah’s unnamed wife, whom he considered a prophet (Isa. 8). The only modification made to the Bible by the Talmudic rabbis in this respect relates to female prophets; they cite seven rather than five: aside from Deborah, Hulda, and Miriam (on the previous list) they also add Abigail, Esther, Hannah, and Sarah (BT Meg. 14a). According to Gen. Rab. (67.9 and 72.6), Sarah, Rebecca, Rachel, and Leah were all prophets. As for rabbis, the first female rabbi in history wasn’t ordained until the twentieth century (see below; also chapter 8), at least in terms of having this explicit title.

**In the first century** On priests’ attempts to hold on to their power, see Oded Irshai, “Confronting a Christian Empire: Jewish Culture in the World of Byzantium,” in *Cultures of the Jews: Mediterranean Origins*, vol. 1, ed. David Biale (New York: Schocken Books, 2002), 181–221; Katz and Schwartz, *Swimming in the Sea*, 15.

**Tana’im and Amora’im:** Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 214–231; Robert Goldenberg, “Talmud,” in *Back to the Sources: Reading the Classic Jewish Texts*, ed. Barry W. Holtz (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1984), 138.

**Some say that the rabbinic collective** On the development of the rabbinic collective, see Gabriele Boccaccini, *Roots of Rabbinic Judaism: An Intellectual History, from Ezekiel to Daniel* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2002), xiii–xvii, 1–8; Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 128–131; Katz and Schwartz, *Swimming in the Sea*, 13; Jacob Neusner, *The Four Stages of Rabbinic Judaism* (London: Routledge, 1999); Peretz Segal, “Jewish Law during the Tannaitic Period,” in Hecht et al. (eds.), *Introduction to the History and Sources of Jewish Law*, 101–140; Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud*, 5–14, 222–224. For a discussion of the historical dating of Talmudic rabbis, see *ibid.*, 56–100.

**The title rabbi has a much different meaning** On rabbis as blacksmiths and brewers, see Katz and Schwartz, *Swimming in the Sea*, 15.

**Rabbis’ disapproval of synagogues:** Irshai, “Confronting a Christian Empire,” 181–221; Jacob Neusner, *Talmudic Judaism in Sasanian Babylonia: Essays and Studies* (Leiden, Neth.: E.J. Brill, 1976), 87–89; Seth Schwartz, *Imperialism and Jewish Society: 200 B.C.E. to 640 C.E.* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2001), 124–126.

**If you want to become a rabbi today** Some date the practice of rabbinic ordination back to Moses, who passed on the mantle of chief authority to Joshua. Although rabbis from the Mishnah and Talmud contend that their authority could be traced directly to Moses in an unbroken line, this is highly debatable. We also know that there were periods of time, such as during the medieval era, when the chain of authority was stopped. In sixteenth-century Safed, for example, rabbinic ordination reemerged as a formalized process, having theretofore ceased. See Lawrence Fine, *Physician of the Soul, Healer of the Cosmos: Isaac Luria and His Kabbalistic Fellowship* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2003), 51–53; Segal, “Jewish Law,” 124–127; Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud*, 13–14. Some sources note that during the era of Judah the Prince, he had to approve all ordinations before they became official; e.g., Segal, “Jewish Law,” 134–135; JT San. 15:1, 19a.

**Modern institutionalization of rabbinic schools:** In the United States, the Reform movement did not begin ordaining women as rabbis until 1972 (Sally Priesand), with the Reconstructionist movement following in 1974 (Sandy Eisenberg Sasso), and the Conservative movement in 1985 (Amy Eilberg). The first female Orthodox rabbi—or, depending on one’s interpretation, the closest thing to it—was ordained with the title Maharat in 2009 (Sara Hurwitz), a moniker changed to Rabba in 2010 (fig. 8.5 and special topic 8.4).

**As scholar Jacob Neusner writes** Neusner says that only once in its sixty-three books does the Mishnah state that it is the written form of the Oral Torah given to Moses on Mount Sinai. Other laws written by Mishnaic authorities seem to have been followed by Jews during this same time, though they were excluded from the Mishnah. See Jacob Neusner, *Midrash in Context: Exegesis in Formative Judaism* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1983), 6–8; Segal, “Jewish Law,” 120–121; Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud*, 149–163, 177–178, 198–199.

**Judah the Prince as editor of the Mishnah:** Saul Lieberman (*Hellenism in Jewish Palestine* [New York: Jewish Theological Seminary of America, 1950], 90–99), among others, contends that Judah the Prince edited various versions of the Mishnah.

**An earlier Jewish tradition held** Scholars contend that during this era halakhic laws had already been written down—i.e., not all had remained oral traditions exclusively. See, e.g., Lieberman, *Hellenism in Jewish Palestine*, 84.

**Writing down the Oral Torah in order to preserve it:** Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud*, 31–44.

**Neusner quote:** Jacob Neusner, “Mishnah and Messiah,” in *Judaisms and Their Messiahs at the Turn of the Christian Era*, ed. Jacob Neusner, William Scott Green, and Ernest S. Frerichs (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1987), 268.

**The Talmud, which builds upon the Mishnah** Neusner (*Midrash in Context*, 57) argues that the main reason for the short segments of interpretation is that the Mishnah was a memorized, oral tradition, and it is too difficult to comment on large paragraphs of memorized text (Neusner, *Midrash in Context*, 57). All in all, the Talmud provides commentary on

thirty-seven out of sixty-three sections of the Mishnah (Ilan, “Introduction,” 14).

Mishnah’s extrapolation of verses from the Torah: Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 430.

**To complicate matters** On Tosefta and Mishnah, see Lieberman, *Hellenism in Jewish Palestine*, 83–99; Neusner, *Midrash in Context*, 53–69.

There were only versions: For example, according to Saul Lieberman, Rabbi Akiba’s disciples organized different versions of the Mishnah, but Judah the Prince probably edited only one of them. Many of these other texts—such as those Judah the Prince did not include in his final and authoritative edition—eventually were referred to as *beraitot*. Some made it into the Tosefta, others into the Talmud, and some have been lost to history. After Judah the Prince’s death, additional alterations were made to the Mishnah (Lieberman, *Hellenism in Jewish Palestine*, 90–99).

Mishnah written in relation to the Tosefta: Ilan, “Introduction,” 16–17.

Tosefta written in response to the Mishnah: Judith Hauptman, *Rereading the Mishnah: A New Approach to Ancient Jewish Texts* (Tübingen, Ger.: Mohr Siebeck, 2005). This assertion is one of the main arguments of this book, see, e.g., 15–16, 255–264.

**Both Mishnaic and Talmudic texts** Some define *agaddah* as any non-halakhic discussion in the Talmud. However, this is tenuous, as many halakhot are intermixed with *agaddot* such that they cannot justly be separated from one another.

*Midrash halakhah*: Goldenberg, “Talmud,” 138; Segal, “Jewish Law,” 121–124; Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud*, 247–275.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 5.1** M. Ber. 1:1. My translation is based on Philip Blackman, ed. and trans., *Mishnayoth*, vol. 1: *Order Zeraim*, 2nd ed. (Gateshead, Eng.: Judaica Press, 1983), 33.

**One can learn a number of things** According to Lieberman (*Hellenism in Jewish Palestine*, 84), Mishnah can also connote the entire body of early Oral Torah, including those passages that did not make it into the set of books referred to as the Mishnah.

Assumed familiarity with particular Mishnaic terms: Goldenberg, “Talmud,” 132–134.

**Shma** The three passages from the Torah that together make up the Shma, along with an additional sentence written by the rabbis, are from Deut. 6:4–9, Deut. 11:13–21, and Num. 15:37–41. One of the verses references saying a prayer when one wakes up and when one goes to sleep (or that is how the rabbis understand it), hence the discussion about how one defines night.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 5.2** M. Naz. 2:7. My translation is based on Philip Blackman, ed. and trans., *Mishnayoth*, vol. 3: *Order Nashim*, 2nd ed. (Gateshead, Eng.: Judaica Press, 1983), 288–289. I thank Elliot Kukla for introducing me to this text.

**Nazir** Num. 6:1–21. See also sections of the Mishnah and Talmud that present other laws connected to a Nazir, such as BT Naz. 1a–3b.

**Tumtum** “Not clearly meeting conventional, binary-based norms” in terms of how a given society defines a human as solely male or female based on what they consider to be “normal” genitalia. Some define *tumtum* as a subcategory of intersex. The term *tumtum* appears 17 times in the Mishnah, 23 times in the *Tosefta*, 119 times in the Babylonian Talmud, 22 times in the Jerusalem Talmud, and hundreds of times in midrashic (see later in chapter) and halakhic texts. For example, according to the Talmud the biblical Abraham and Sarah were *tumtumtim* before transitioning to male and female, respectively (BT Yev. 64a). See Elliot Kukla, “A Created Being of Its Own: Toward a Jewish Liberation Theology for Men, Women, and Everyone Else,” 2006, 5, 8, [www.transtorah.org/PDFs/How\\_I\\_Met\\_the\\_Tumtum.pdf](http://www.transtorah.org/PDFs/How_I_Met_the_Tumtum.pdf). See also, e.g., Intersex Society of North America, “What Is Intersex?,” [www.isna.org/faq/what\\_is\\_intersex](http://www.isna.org/faq/what_is_intersex).

As it says in another mishnah: See M. Bikk. 4:5. My translation is based on Blackman (ed.), *Mishnayoth: Order Zeraim*, 485–486.

Other halakhically gendered and sexed categories: Aside from *tumtum*, *androgynous* (see below), *zachar* (male), and *nekevah* (female), the Mishnah discusses two other possible genders and/or sexes, a *saris* (born male but later develops female traits) and an *aylonit* (born female but later develops male traits).

**Androgynous** As it says in another mishnah: See M. Bikk. 4:1, 5. My translation is based on Blackman (ed.), *Mishnayoth, Order Zeraim*, 486. The term *androgynous* appears 21 times in the Mishnah, 19 times in the *Tosefta*, 109 times in the Babylonian Talmud, and countless times in midrashic (see later in chapter) and halakhic texts. For example, according to one midrash the Torah’s Adam was an androgynous (Gen. Rab. 8). See Kukla, “A Created Being of Its Own,” 5, 8. See also idem, “‘Created by the Hand of Heaven’: Sex, Love, and the Androgynous,” in *The Passionate Torah: Sex and Judaism*, ed. Danya Ruttenberg (New York: New York University Press, 2009), 193–202.

**Both of these mishnayot present** Some Jews maintain that a portion of Talmudic *agaddic* stories actually happened, including some in ultra-Orthodox communities. As believers might argue, there is no way to know for sure. However, most scholars doubt the historical veracity of such passages. See, e.g., Boyarin, *Border Lines*, 151–201; Charlotte Fonrobert, “When the Rabbi Weeps: On Reading Gender in Talmudic Agadda,” *NASHIM: A Journal of Women’s Studies and Gender Issues* 4 (2008): 56–83; Goldenberg, “Talmud,” 157–158.

**We also know that only certain topics** Neusner quote: Jacob Neusner, *Method and Meaning in Ancient Judaism* (Millsboro, MA: Scholars Press, 1979), 97, in Hauptman, “Feminist Perspectives,” 44 (and see 44–50 for a critique of Neusner’s approach). See also Jacob Neusner, *A History of the Mishnaic Law of Women*, pts. 1–5 (Leiden, Neth.: E.J. Brill, 1980).

Scholar Judith Wegner argues that in Mishnaic texts women are regarded as either humans or “chattel,” a form of property aside from real estate. See Judith Romney Wegner,



*Chattel or Person? The Status of Women in the Mishnah* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1988).

Differences between biblical and Mishnaic legal codes: Ilan, "Introduction," 11.

**The Talmud focuses** Hillel quote: BT Shab. 31a.

**But the Talmud can also be studied** For example, another binary that the Talmudic rabbis use to categorize halakhot is as tasks relevant to Jews vs. non-Jews. For more on this particular binary, see David Ellenson, *After Emancipation: Jewish Responses to Modernity* (Cincinnati: Hebrew Union College Press, 2004); Robert Goldenberg, *The Nations That Know Thee Not: Ancient Jewish Attitudes to Other Religions* (New York: New York University Press, 1998); David Novak, *The Image of the Non-Jew in Judaism: An Historical and Constructive Study of the Noahide Laws* (New York: Edwin Mellon Press, 1983); Sacha Stern, *Jewish Identity in Early Rabbinic Writings* (New York: E.J. Brill, 1994).

**The following story** This paraphrase is based on Robert E. Fine, "Two Men and a Chimney," in *Three Times CHAI: 54 Rabbis Tell Their Favorite Stories*, ed. Laney Katz Becker (New York: Behrman House, Inc., 2007), 37–38.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 5.3** My translation of Mishnah Sanhedrin 4:5 is based on Philip Blackman, ed. and trans., *Mishnayoth*, vol. 4: *Order Nezikin*, 2nd ed. (Gateshead, Eng.: Judaica Press, 1983), 254–255. This chapter of Mishnah deals with laws pertaining to capital crimes and the witnesses who testify in these cases. The rabbis refer to a specific verse from Genesis, when Cain murders Abel, to explain the supreme value of a human life.

Babylonian Talmud Sanhedrin 37b–38a: My translation is based on Adin Steinsaltz, ed. and trans., *The Talmud: Tractate Sanhedrin*, vol. 17, pt. 3 (New York: Random House, 1998), 73–78.

**In this mishnah, the rabbis** What the rabbis did is not only fascinating but also illustrates a great deal about how they approached the Torah. In English, we don't have a plural for *blood*. Like the word *fish*, *blood* can have a singular or plural meaning. Such as, "I see a drop of blood on the table" or "I see drops of blood on the table." In both cases the noun *blood* is written the same way; the only way to make it a plural is to add an *s* to the word *drop*. The Hebrew for blood is דם, pronounced *dam* (with the *a* sounding like the *a* in *want*). As in many languages, pronouns in Hebrew are combined with nouns (or verbs), such that whereas in English we would say, "your blood," with two words, in Hebrew we would say "דמך," which combines the two words into one (your + blood). Similarly, in Hebrew "your brother's blood" would be דם של אחיך or דם אחיך (אחיך is a contraction for שלך). But if you wanted to say "your brother's bloods," it would be דמים של אחיך or דמי אחיך. Because the verse in the Torah has an extra letter (the last letter of the first word, the letter yud or י), the verse technically should be translated as *bloods* and not *blood* (or whatever the plural of *blood* is for a given language).

**In this effort, the rabbis explain** Some versions of this mishnah are much more particular than universal, plac-

ing the words *from Israel* after the word *soul*, as in "a single human was created to teach that if one destroys a single soul from Israel, Scripture charges him as if he had destroyed an entire world, and whoever saves a single soul from Israel, Scripture charges him as if he had saved an entire world." Many English translations, and even Hebrew versions, of this text note that the original manuscripts left out the word *Israel*. According to Benedict Roth, the first manuscript that added the word *Israel* was published in twelfth-century Florence, Italy. One of the earliest mentions of a manuscript that includes "from Israel" is found in Maimonides's eleventh-century text the *Mishneh Torah* (see below), where he says that the version he was using was five hundred years old (Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud*, 209–210).

**Another interesting thing about the Talmud** Conversation between American presidents: Katz and Schwartz, *Swimming in the Sea*, 26.

Talmudic rabbis from multiple eras: There were roughly five generations of rabbis in the Jerusalem Talmud and seven in the Babylonian Talmud (see Lifshitz, "Age of Talmud," 181–184).

**Another way to understand law** Sukkot: Lev. 23:33–44. Note that there is an entire tractate of Talmud, called *Sukkah*, that focuses on the laws around this holiday, in addition to other topics (BT Sukkah).

**After learning that none of the students** Defining a Christmas tree: David Green, Jewish Community Center of San Francisco, October 4, 2012. Green said he learned this analogy from one of his teachers, Rabbi Daniel Landes.

**In my university classes** "Bind them as a sign on your hand": Exod. 13:9, 16; Deut. 6:8, 11:18. Though these four verses are not identical, according to the rabbis all four refer to the same ritual object called *tefillin*.

Why this ritual object: Part of the reason I use this particular ritual object is because of how foreign it looks to those unfamiliar with it. Take the following recent event: In 2010, a young man on a domestic airplane in the United States put on tefillin in order to complete his morning prayers. The black boxes on his arm and head were so strange to other passengers that the plane was grounded: people thought he was a potential "terrorist" and that his tefillin were potential weapons. See Dave Warner and Larry McShane, "Jewish Teen's Tefillin Sets off Bomb Scare That Diverts US Airways Flight from LaGuardia Airport," *New York Daily News*, January 21, 2010, [www.nydailynews.com/news/national/jewish-teen-tefillin-sets-bomb-scare-diverts-airways-flight-laguardia-airport-article-1.183107](http://www.nydailynews.com/news/national/jewish-teen-tefillin-sets-bomb-scare-diverts-airways-flight-laguardia-airport-article-1.183107).

**For our purposes, it is most critical** Blu Greenberg, *On Women and Judaism: A View from Tradition* (New York: Jewish Publication Society of America, 1998), 44–47.

Roth quote: Joel Roth, *The Halakhic Process: A Systemic Process* (New York: Jewish Theological Seminary of America, 1986), 81–113, quoted in Rachel Adler, *Engendering Judaism: An Inclusive Theology and Ethics* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1998), xiv–xv, 33.

**The rabbis were clearly aware** On the factuality of the Talmudic rabbinic court, see Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 107–108; Katz and Schwartz, *Swimming in the Sea*, 13. Some sources say that there were two smaller courts of twenty-three individuals (M. San. 1:2–6; BT San. 88b).

**SPECIAL TOPIC 5.4** This is a summary of BT Baba Metzia 59b.

**Their logic is often understood as follows** Million-plus community: Num. 11: 16–17. For a story found elsewhere in the Talmud with a similar lesson: BT RH 24b–25a.

Halakhic transmission across generations: For example, see the beginning of M. Avot.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 5.5** This is a summary of BT Menahot 29b.

**To sum up the relationship** Consider the following Mishnah, which says the law discussed herein originated on Mount Sinai and was transmitted in an unbroken chain since: “It once happened that Rabbi Simon of Mizpah sowed and came before Rabban Gamliel, and [together] they went up to the seat of the great Sanhedrin and enquired. Nahum the Scribe said, ‘I received it from Rabbi Mey’asha who received it from his father who received it from the ‘Pairs’ who received it from the Prophets that the halachah of Moses as handed down from Sinai is . . .” (M. Pe’ah, 2:6; my translation is based on Blackman [ed.], *Mishnayoth: Order Zeraim*, 89–90).

Alexander quote: Elizabeth Shanks Alexander, “The Orality of Rabbinic Writing,” in *The Cambridge Companion to the Talmud and Rabbinic Literature*, ed. Charlotte Elisheva Fonrobert and Martin S. Jaffee (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2007), 42. For texts that support this statement, see, e.g., BT Ber. 5a, Er. 54b; JT Pe’ah ii, 17a, Shek. 6:1, 49d.

**Around the same time** Although Midrash is thought to have come about as a genre during the rabbinic era, the oldest examples of Midrash are contained in the Bible itself. For example, some argue that 1 and 2 Chronicles are midrashim on 1 and 2 Samuel and Kings. Some scholars also see noncanonical texts, such as Jubilees, in this way. See, e.g., Michael Fishbane, *Biblical Interpretation in Ancient Israel* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1985); Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud*, 235–236.

Kugel quote: James Kugel, “Two Introductions to Midrash,” *Prooftexts: A Journal of Jewish Literary History* 3, no. 2 (May 1983): 131–157. See also Barry W. Holtz, “Midrash,” in Holtz (ed.), *Back to the Sources*, 187. Kugel notes that the idea of Midrash can be traced to noncanonical texts from the first few centuries BCE, such as the Apocrypha.

Perhaps one of the most interesting, and for some heretical, investigations into early Midrash is John Shelby Spong’s book *Liberating the Gospels: Reading the Gospels with Jewish Eyes* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1997), which contends that one way to understanding the Christian Bible books of Matthew, Mark, Luke, and John is as midrashim about Jesus rather than as historical recordings.

**Also focusing on biblical verses** On Torah verses relating to verses from the Prophets or Writings, see Cohen, *Macca-*

*bees to the Mishnah*, 204–209; Strack and Stemberger, *Introduction to the Talmud*, 178–179, 199–200, 233–359.

**By way of example** One could argue that many translations of the Torah (and Bible) incorporate midrashim.

Gen. 4:8 can be translated as two separate sentences, the first of which would be a fragment, as in “Cain said to his brother,” and the second of which would be a full sentence, “When they were in the field Cain rose up against his brother Abel and killed him.” A third possible translation, from the Harper Collins Study Bible (see special topic 2.3), is arguably closer to the ancient Septuagint, or Greek, Syriac, and Latin translations, as well as that of the Samaritans, all of which render the sentence as “Cain said to his brother Abel, ‘Let’s go out to the field, etc.’” (Nahum M. Sarna, ed. and trans., *The JPS Torah Commentary: Genesis* [New York: Jewish Publication Society, 1989], 33).

**SPECIAL TOPIC 5.6** Gen. Rab. 22:7. My translation is based on H. Freedman, ed. and trans., *Genesis: Midrash Rabbah*, vol. 1, pt. 1 (New York: Soncino Press, 1983), 187.

**Some ancient midrashim** On the Bible’s textual unity, see Kugel, “Two Introductions to Midrash,” 133–134.

Stories about biblical or Talmudic characters: Holtz, “Midrash,” 187–188.

Midrashim in the *Haggadah*: Holtz, “Midrash,” 201–203. Chapter 1 discusses the Passover Seder and the *Haggadah*.

**Initially, midrashim were narrative only** On midrashim in paintings and poetry, see Holtz, “Midrash,” 177–211.

**An artist can also create** My translation of Exodus 19:16 is based on Nahum M. Sarna, ed. and trans., *The JPS Torah Commentary: Exodus* (New York: The Jewish Publication Society, 1991), 106.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 5.7** Merle Feld, “Sinai,” in idem, *A Spiritual Life: Exploring the Heart and Jewish Tradition* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2007), 246–247.

**But because the Torah text is male-centric** Although the psbat (simplistic literal interpretation) of the Torah reveals minor insight into female characters such as Miriam, Moses and Aaron’s sister, unlike Feld’s midrash such passages offer very little understanding of their femaleness. For other midrashic writings expressing female voices, see, e.g., Anita Diamant, *The Red Tent* (New York: St. Martin’s Press, 1997); Alicia Suskin Ostriker, *The Nakedness of the Fathers: Biblical Visions and Revisions* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1994); Eleanor Wilner, *Sarah’s Choice* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990); Jane Sprague Zones, ed., *Taking the Fruit: Modern Women’s Tales of the Bible* (San Diego: Women’s Institute for Continuing Jewish Education, 1989).

Exod. 19:15: There are, of course, multiple ways to read this text, patriarchally or otherwise; e.g., Tikva Frymer-Kensky, “The Bible and Women’s Studies,” in *Feminist Perspectives on Jewish Studies*, 25–26. See also Judith Plaskow, “Women and Revelation,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/women-and-revelation](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/women-and-revelation), extracted from *The Torah: A Women’s Commentary*, ed. Tamara Cohn Eskenazi and Andrea L. Weiss (New York: URJ Press and Women of Reform Judaism, 2008).

**In special topic 5.8** This is certainly not to say that marginalized communities, whether so relegated based on sexual orientation, gender, sex, or something else entirely, are literally “voiceless.” Rather, dominant structures, and the people who uphold them, commonly play a core role in silencing oppressed groups, which often makes it seem as if said groups don’t have the power to represent their own subordinated positions. (This is to say nothing about it is not uncommon for people from said communities to be punished, physically or otherwise, if they “use their voice.”)

**SPECIAL TOPIC 5.8** Andrew Ramer, “The Seeker,” in idem, *Queering the Text: Biblical, Medieval, and Modern Jewish Stories* (Maple Shade, NJ: White Crane Books, 2010), 7–8.

**Midrashim such as special topics 5.7 and 5.8** For an interesting critique of the use of the term *marginality* when referring to subordinated groups such as females within the Jewish community—given that use of this term can be understood to reinforce a group’s marginality—see Beth S. Wenger, “Notes from the Second Generation,” in *Judaism since Gender*, ed. Miriam Peskowitz and Laura Levitt (New York: Routledge, 1997), 113–119.

**For millennia, Jewish practice** On one’s ability to make a judgment regardless of one’s core social identities, consider the July 13, 2009, questioning of then United States Supreme Court nominee Sonya Sotomayor during her Senate Judiciary Committee hearing, when she was asked, multiple times, about this issue, especially as related to gender (“Transcript of the Sotomayor Confirmation Hearings,” [http://epic.org/privacy/sotomayor/sotomoyor\\_transcript.pdf](http://epic.org/privacy/sotomayor/sotomoyor_transcript.pdf)).

**After watching the video** Christopher Chabris and Daniel Simons, *The Invisible Gorilla: How Our Intuitions Deceive Us* (New York: Broadway Paperbacks, 2009), 1–6. See also Daniel J. Simons and Christopher Chabris, “Gorillas in Our Midst: Sustained Inattentional Blindness for Dynamic Events,” *Perception* 28 (1999): 1059–1074. The video is available at [www.invisiblegorilla.com](http://www.invisiblegorilla.com).

**Chabris and Simons refer to this phenomenon** The term “inattentional blindness” was originally coined by two other social psychologists, Arien Mack and Irvin Rock (cited in Chabris and Simons, *Invisible Gorilla*, 238n.9).

Chabris and Simons quote: Chabris and Simons, *Invisible Gorilla*, 6–7.

**To take this one step further** In *The Invisible Gorilla*, Chabris and Simons discuss countless other experiments that illustrate the principle of structural blindness or violence, including related phenomena such as “inattentional deafness” and false memories. For more on structural violence, see Kenneth A. Parsons, “Structural Violence and Power,” *Peace Review: A Journal of Social Justice* 19, no. 2 (2007): 173–181; Vern N. Redekop, *From Violence to Blessing: How an Understanding of Deep-Rooted Conflict Can Open Paths to Reconciliation* (Ottawa: Novalis, 2002), 111–121.

Connection between social identities and interpretation: Aaron J. Hahn Tapper, “A Pedagogy of Social Justice Education: Social Identity Theory, Intersectionality, and Empower-

ment Education,” *Conflict Resolution Quarterly* 30, no. 4 (Summer 2013): 411–445.

Ilan quote: Tal Ilan, *Jewish Women in Greco-Roman Palestine* (Tübingen, Ger.: J. C. B. Mohr, 1995), 1.

**The following passage** Cynthia Ozick, “Notes Toward Finding the Right Question,” in *On Being a Jewish Feminist: A Reader*, ed. Susannah Heschel (New York: Schocken, 1983), 137–138. Elsewhere in this essay, Ozick refers to this phenomenon as “masculine universalism.”

**What may have been a slip of the tongue** In fact, passages in the Jerusalem Talmud say that the “words of the Torah should be burned rather than be entrusted to women” and that “women’s wisdom is only in the spindle” (JT Sotah 3:4, 19a); cited in Rachel Keren, “Torah Study,” Jewish Women’s Archive, from *Jewish Women: A Comprehensive Historical Encyclopedia*, March 20, 2009, <http://jwa.org/encyclopedia/article/torah-study>. Similar passages can be found in the Babylonian Talmud. That said, a number of contemporary halakhic arbiters have permitted women’s Torah study, sometimes within precise parameters.

“Though a woman is like a pot of filth”: BT Shab. 152a. For two books that focus on the alleged second-class status of women, who are often perceived only as temptresses, in the Mishnah and Talmud, see Neusner, *Method and Meaning*; and Wegner, *Chattel or Person?*

“Women are a separate people”: BT Shab. 62a. Some interpret “separate” to mean “independent.”

Generalizations are never made about men: Dvora Weisberg, “Insiders or Outsiders: Women and Rabbinic Literature,” *Judaism* 52, nos. 207–208 (Summer-Fall 2003): 215n.15, also 203–215.

Rachel Adler quote: Adler, *Engendering Judaism*, 28.

Halakhically controlled by men: Wegner, *Chattel or Person?*

**Acknowledgment that there is** Of course, for many male and female Jews, male hegemony within the Jewish tradition is not “invisible.” See, e.g., Aviva Cantor, *Jewish Women/Jewish Men: The Legacy of Patriarchy in Jewish Life* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1995).

Lack of major structural gender equality: This obviously depends entirely on whether or not one focuses more on the progress still to be made as opposed to the progress that has already been made. For more on the latter position from those within the American Reform movement, see, e.g., Jacqueline Koch Ellenson, “From the Personal to the Communal: How Women Have Changed the Rabbinate,” in *New Jewish Feminism: Probing the Past, Forging the Future*, ed. Elyse Goldstein (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 2009), 125–132; Barbara Ostfeld, “The Ascent of a Female Cantor: Shira Hamaalot,” *ibid.*, 33–143.

Lerner quote: Anne Lapidus Lerner, “Pacing Change: The Impact of Feminism on Conservative Synagogues,” in Goldstein (ed.), *New Jewish Feminism*, 185.

“Theology” meaning male theology: Donna Berman, “Major Trends in Jewish Feminist Theology: The Works of Rachel Adler, Judith Plaskow, and Rebecca Alpert,” in Goldstein (ed.), *New Jewish Feminism*, 12–13. Note that because the



constructs of gender and sex are so intertwined, and because this book's primary focus is not this important intersection, I have decided not to engage this specific issue in depth. Of course, this is not to imply that this distinction is not important.

**Let me be clear here** Adler, *Engendering Judaism*, xiv.

**Many of those defending halakhah** Time-bound mitzvot: BT Kid. 29a; "Gender Theory and Gendered Realities: An Exchange between Tamar Ross and Judith Plaskow," *NASHIM: A Journal of Jewish Women's Studies and Gender Issues* 13 (2007): 207–251.

For more on mitzvot, see chapter 2.

Obligation of women to uphold halakhah: According to the Mishnah, this statement holds true except for three specific time-bound mitzvot, all of which deal with halakhot pertaining to family life (at least in the eyes of the rabbis): laws dealing with menstruation (*niddah*), burning one-tenth of the dough when making *challah*, and lighting candles to begin Shabbat (M. Kid. 1:7).

**In other words, someone looking** Rachel Adler, "The Jew Who Wasn't There: *Halakhah* and the Jewish Woman," in Heschel (ed.), *On Being a Jewish Feminist*, 13; originally published in *Response* 7, no. 22 (Summer 1973): 77–82.

For Orthodox responses to feminist critiques of halakhah, see, e.g., Saul Berman, "The Status of Women in Halakhic Judaism," *Tradition* 14, no. 2 (Fall 1973): 5–28; Moshe Meiselman, *Jewish Woman in Jewish Law* (New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1978); Tamar Ross, *Expanding the Palace of Torah: Orthodoxy and Feminism* (Waltham, MA: Brandeis University Press, 2004).

**There have been a number of stages** See, e.g., Adler, "The Jew Who Wasn't There," 13; Rachel Biale, *Women and Jewish Law: Their Essential Texts, Their History, and Their Relevance for Today* (New York: Schocken Books, 1995); Greenberg, *On Women and Judaism*; Heschel (ed.), *On Being a Jewish Feminist*; Elizabeth Koltun, ed., *The Jewish Woman: New Perspectives* (New York: Schocken Books, 1976); Deborah E. Lipstadt, "Women and Power in the Federation," in Heschel (ed.), *On Being a Jewish Feminist*, 152–166; Wegner, *Chattel or Person?*

This is not to say, of course, that most feminists maintain that there have been enough major changes in these areas since that time. For example, though Reform, Reconstructionist, and Conservative rabbinical schools have been ordaining women for decades, major gender discrepancies still exist in terms of professional advancement and salary; see, e.g., Steven Cohen and Judith Schor, "Gender Variation in the Careers of Conservative Rabbis: A Survey of Rabbis Ordained Since 1985," report sponsored by the Rabbinical Assembly, New York, July 14, 2004, available at [www.rabbinicalassembly.org/sites/default/files/public/social\\_action/gender/gender-study.pdf](http://www.rabbinicalassembly.org/sites/default/files/public/social_action/gender/gender-study.pdf). At a minimum, these data are supported by lists of the largest salaries in the American Jewish institutional world presented each year by *The Jewish Forward*, which, to date, have always reflected gender inequality.

**Simply put, whether one focuses** Another predominant halakhic focus is related to whether or not one performs an action in a private or public domain.

Male, female, or another category: See Notes, chapter 4, "tumtum" and "androgynous."

Halakhic challenges related to divorce and adultery: See, e.g., Biale, *Women and Jewish Law*, 70–120; Blu Greenberg, "Women Today—An Orthodox View," in *Frontiers of Jewish Thought*, ed. Steven T. Katz (Washington, DC: B'nai B'rith Books, 1992), 73–102, where she touches on halakhic issues related to male-centric language, witnesses, family law, life-cycle rituals, and more; Hauptman, *Rereading the Rabbinis*, where she looks at many of these same issues; Sarra Lev, "Sotah," in Ruttenberg (ed.), *Passionate Torah*, 7–23, where she examines the disproportionate time the Mishnaic rabbis dedicated to the Torah-based ritual of Sotah, which focuses primarily on a woman who has been suspected of adultery (there is no equivalent ritual if a man is suspected of adultery).

**A second approach that has emerged** As Tal Ilan notes: "The entire corpus [of rabbinic stories in which women play roles that are not prototypically feminine] could easily be bound in a very thin booklet. . . . We have learned that women were present in the house of study, petitioned the judicial system, practiced medicine, engaged in charity and even paid the ransom of captives when they could afford it" (Ilan, *Mine and Yours Are Hers: Retrieving Women's History from Rabbinic Literature* [New York: Brill, 1997], 277).

Important examples: Judith R. Baskin, ed., *Jewish Women in Historical Perspective* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1991); Bernadette J. Brooten, *Women Leaders in the Ancient Synagogue* (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1982); Nathaniel Deutsch, *The Maiden of Ludmir: A Jewish Holy Woman and Her World* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003); Peter J. Haas, ed., *Recovering the Role of Women: Power and Authority in Rabbinic Jewish Society* (Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1992); Heschel (ed.), *On Being a Jewish Feminist*, xii–xiii; Ilan, *Jewish Women in Greco-Roman Palestine*, 32–33; Lawrence Kushner, *God Was in This Place and I, I Did Not Know* (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 1994), 57–80; Sallie Overby Langford, "On Being a Religious Woman: Women Proselytes in the Greco-Roman World," in Haas (ed.), *Recovering the Role of Women*, 61–83; Marvin Lowenthal, trans., *The Memoirs of Gluckel of Hameln* (New York: Schocken Books, 1977); Ada Rappaport-Alpert, "On Women and Hasidism: S. A. Horodecky and the Maid of Ludmir Tradition," in *Jewish History: Essays in Honor of Chimen Abramsky*, ed. A. Rappaport-Alpert and S. J. Zipperstein (London: P. Halban, 1988); Yona Sabar, ed. and trans., *The Folk Literature of the Kurdistan Jews: An Anthology* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1982), chap. 15; Sondra Henry and Emily Taitz, *Written Out of History: Our Jewish Foremothers* (Fresh Meadows, NY: Biblio Press, 1983); Chava Weissler, trans., "Glückel of Hameln: From Her Memoirs" and "Four Tkhines," in *Four Centuries of Jewish Women's Spirituality*, ed. Ellen M. Umansky and Dianne Ashton (Waltham, MA: Brandeis University Press, 2009), 71–75 and 75–80,

respectively; idem, *Voices of the Matriarchs: Listening to the Prayers of Early Modern Jewish Women* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1999); idem, "Woman as High Priest: A Kabbalistic Prayer in Yiddish for Lighting Sabbath Candles," in *Essential Papers on Kabbalah*, ed. Lawrence Fine (New York: New York University Press, 1995), 526–527.

**Scholar Judith Plaskow says of such research** Judith Plaskow, *Standing Again at Sinai: Judaism from a Feminist Perspective* (New York: Harper & Row, 1990), 51.

**Some scholars have taken a third approach** Hauptman, *Rereading the Rabbinis*, 4. Another scholar, Shulamit Valler, points to overall halakhic differences in regard to women in the Jerusalem Talmud as opposed to the Babylonian Talmud; see Valler, *Massekhet Sukkah: Text, Translation, and Commentary* (Tübingen, Ger.: Mohr Siebeck, 2009).

"Contextualized feminism": Hauptman, *Rereading the Rabbinis*, 11.

Hauptman's work as "apologetic": See, e.g., Ilan, *Jewish Women in Greco-Roman Palestine*, 5n.11.

**In the final analysis** Judith R. Baskin, "Rabbinic Judaism and the Creation of Woman," in Heschel (ed.), *On Being a Jewish Feminist*, 130n.8.

Citing Neusner, Ross S. Kramer notes that rabbinic sources may refract the social realities of a handful of Jewish communities at best, and at worst only the utopian visions of a relative few Jewish men. The portrait of Jewish women that emerges from these writings, he argues, may then be largely discounted in favor of the more persuasive evidence of epigraphical, archeological, and nonrabbinic writings for Jewish communities both in the Diaspora and in the Land of Israel. See Ross S. Kramer, *Her Share of Blessings: Women's Religions among the Pagans, Jews, and Christians in the Greco-Roman World* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992), 93, cited in Ilan, *Mine and Yours Are Hers*, 25. See also Ilan, *Jewish Women in Greco-Roman Palestine*; and idem, *Integrating Women into Second Temple History* (Tübingen, Ger.: J. C. B Mohr, 1999).

**"Radical" Jewish Feminism** These perspectives are "radical" relative to heteronormative and androcentric norms.

**Critics of attempts to recalibrate halakhah** On equality meaning women should get to do what men do, see Heschel (ed.), *On Being a Jewish Feminist*, xvi.

Greenberg quote: Greenberg, *On Women and Judaism*, 39, quoted in "Gender Theory and Gendered Realities," 214.

The term *peripheral Jews* is found in Adler, "The Jew Who Wasn't There," 13–14; the expression *honorary men* is found throughout Adler's book *Engendering Judaism*. She also calls children and slaves "peripheral Jews," but notes that if a child or slave is male, he can grow up and be freed (or leave this category through other means), whereas women cannot. See, e.g., Catherine Hezser, "Passover and Social Equality: Women, Slaves, and Minors in *Bavli Pesahim*," in Ilan et al. (eds.), *A Feminist Commentary*, 91–107.

**In contrast, a more critical approach** One can't change a centuries-old system quickly: Miriam Peskowitz, "Engender-

ing Jewish Religious History," in Peskowitz and Levitt (eds.), *Judaism Since Gender*, 20, 35n.11.

**Such voices have asserted** Simone de Beauvoir, *The Second Sex* (New York: Bantam Books, 1961). See also Plaskow, *Standing Again at Sinai*, 2–3.

**Along similar lines** Judith Plaskow, "The Right Question Is Theological," in Plaskow with Donna Berman, *The Coming of Lilith: Essays on Feminism, Judaism, and Sexual Ethics, 1972–2003* (Boston: Beacon Press, 2005), 56–59.

Plaskow's reflections on "radical feminism" are discussed in "Gender Theory and Gendered Realities," 207–251.

Waves of Jewish feminism: For an exploration of dominant understandings of the history of the American feminist movement at larger, see Sarah M. Evans, *Tidal Wave: How Women Changed America at Century's End* (New York: Free Press, 2003). The Jewish American feminist movement mirrored the American feminist movement; in turn, it was mirrored by trends within Jewish Studies scholarship. See Rela Geffen Monson, "Women Today—A Non-Orthodox View," in Katz (ed.), *Frontiers of Jewish Thought*, 103–118; Susannah Heschel, "Feminism," *ibid.*, 61–71; Rose Rosenzweig, "Post-Triumphalism and the New *Haskalah*," in Goldstein (ed.), *New Jewish Feminism*, 397–399.

**In the words of Adler** Adler, *Engendering Judaism*, xiv–xv.

Critique of Adler: Interestingly, Plaskow (*Standing Again at Sinai*, 62–65) charges Adler and others with, at times, focusing on the trees at the expense of the forest.

As Robert Cover explains, laws are always designed within a "universe of meanings, values, and rules . . . a world to inhabit and not a data set" one can master; see Robert Cover, "The Supreme Court 1986 Term—Foreword: Nomos and Narrative," *Harvard Law Review* 97, no. 4 (1983): 4–68, quoted in Adler, *Engendering Judaism*, 33.

**Since Jewish history** The idea that Jewish history doesn't reflect women's realities is discussed in Plaskow, "The Right Question Is Theological," 230. For Cohen's view, see Shaye J. D. Cohen, "Are Women in the Covenant?," in Ilan et al. (eds.), *A Feminist Commentary*, 25–42.

**The latest wave in Jewish feminist thought** See, e.g., Notes, chapter 4, "*tumtum*" and "androgynous." See also special topic 5.2.

For recent scholarship in Jewish feminist and queer thought, see, e.g., Noach Dzmura, ed., *Balancing on the Mechitza: Transgender in Jewish Community* (Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic Books, 2010); Judith Plaskow, "Calling All Theologians," in Goldstein (ed.), *New Jewish Feminism*, 9. See also special topic 0.2.

**The word *halakhah* literally means** "These and these . . .": BT Er. 13b. Before and after this statement, the Talmud clearly says that although the *halakhah* should follow the School of Hillel, it is also permissible to follow the law according to the School of Shammai (BT Er. 6b–14a). As for different schools of thought aside from the few mentioned in the Talmud, it isn't clear how many there were (Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 120–123).

Historical trend of restricting halakhic opinions: According to Shaye Cohen, with the post-Temple era came a new ability to “agree to disagree”; indeed, most of the Talmud offers disparate opinions on a range of topics, as opposed to a list of unanimous agreements. See Shaye J. D. Cohen, “The Significance of Yavneh: Pharisees, Rabbis, and the End of Sectarianism,” in *Origins of Judaism: The Pharisees and Other Sects*, vol. 2, pt. 1, ed. Jacob Neusner (New York: Garland Publishing, 1990).

According to Daniel Boyarin, for centuries, even after the attempted consolidation of Christian doctrine at the Council of Nicea in the fourth century CE, although some Christian Jews rejected Jewish law altogether, many Christian Jews and non-Christian Jews did not, but instead maintained a wide range of halakhic practices. Boyarin claims that there was no single list of observances that either of these two subcommunities practiced, nor, for that matter, should we depict Jews at this time as having been members of clearly identifiable subcommunities. See Daniel Boyarin, *The Jewish Gospels: The Story of the Jewish Christ* (New York: New Press, 2012).

**From approximately the tenth century CE onward** At a minimum this reflects general halakhic approaches among those in Europe, the Middle East, and North Africa.

#### **One reason for the narrowing of halakhic opinion**

Another reason for the narrowing of halakhic opinion may have been the spread of printed texts. In *Becoming the People of the Talmud*, Talya Fishman notes that it was during this period that the Talmud became better known as a written text—in actual book form—as opposed to an oral tradition. Some say that the concretization of the Babylonian Talmud into book form led directly to the spread of new legal codes such as the *Mishneh Torah*. See also Barry Scott Wimpfheimer, *Narrating the Law: A Poetics of Talmudic Legal Stories* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2011).

**Jewish authorities beyond the Land of Israel** This isn’t to say that prior to this point Jews living in North Africa didn’t already follow the halakhic decisions of their local rabbinic authority. Rather, there is little evidence that major individual rabbinic authorities predated the seventh or eighth centuries.

Collections of halakhot and teshuvot: Some contend that these collections were largely extensions of conversations that began in the Talmud. See, e.g., Gideon Libson, “The Age of the Geonim,” in Hecht et al. (eds.), *Introduction to the History and Sources of Jewish Law*, 204–214.

**By the eleventh century** On Maimonides, see, e.g., Joel Kraemer, *Maimonides: The Life and World of One of Civilization’s Greatest Minds* (New York: Doubleday, 2009); Sarah Stroumsa, *Maimonides in His World: A Portrait of a Mediterranean Thinker* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2009).

**Although, as scholar Stephen Passamanek states** Stephen M. Passamanek, “Toward Sunrise in the East 1300–1565,” in Hecht et al. (eds.), *Introduction to the History and Sources of Jewish Law*, 337.

“Outside of this work there is no need”: Moses Maimonides, *A Maimonides Reader*, Isadore Twersky, ed. and trans. (Springfield, NJ: Behrman House, Inc., 1972), 426. See also Rachel Furst, “The Mishneh Torah,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-mishneh-torah](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-mishneh-torah); Eliav Shochetman, “Jewish Law in Spain before 1300,” in Hecht et al. (eds.), *Introduction to the History and Sources of Jewish Law*, 271–298.

**During Maimonides’s lifetime** The importance of the *Mishneh Torah* is discussed in Haig Bosmajian, *Burning Books* (Jefferson, NC: McFarland & Co., 2006), 45–47; Arthur Green, “Introduction,” in Daniel C. Matt, trans. and comm., *The Zohar*, Pritzker ed., vol. 1 (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2004), xl. Maimonides considered this book to be his *magnum opus* (Furst, “The Mishneh Torah”).

According to Daniel Boyarin, “It would be no exaggeration to say that Maimonides occupies a place in a specific Jewish literary history and theory analogous to that of Aristotle in the discourse of European literature” (Daniel Boyarin, *Intertextuality and the Reading of Midrash* [Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1994], 1).

**It is important to briefly mention** On halakhic practices linked to geographic regions during this era, see Libson, “Age of the Geonim,” 197–250.

**Likewise, many of the Ashkenazi Jewish authorities** On Rabbi Gershom’s ruling, see Avraham Grossman, “Ashkenazim to 1300,” in Hecht et al. (eds.), *Introduction to the History and Sources of Jewish Law*, 317–319. Note that in a book by Grossman published a few years later, he writes that it is possible that the halakhic ruling that Rabbi Gershom ben Judah is said to have given may not have been his but may have been attributed to him retroactively some time after he died; idem, *Pious and Rebellious: Jewish Women in Medieval Europe* (Waltham, MA: Brandeis University Press, 2004), 70–78).

**A third situation** Karaite population: See Notes, chapter 11, “In existence for centuries.”

**In the mid–sixteenth century** Passamanek, “Toward Sunrise,” 337–346.

**The significance of the shift** Rabbi Hama and Hanina Ben-Menachem quotes: BT Sheb. 48a, in Hanina Ben-Menachem, “The Judicial Process and the Nature of Jewish Law,” in Hecht et al. (eds.), *Introduction to the History and Sources of Jewish Law*, 427.

The idea that contemporary halakhic opinions are much less multiplicitous than those found in the Talmud is more relevant to the Babylonian Talmud than to the Jerusalem Talmud, perhaps because there were more Jewish subgroups that agreed with the Jewish High Court decisions in Babylonia than there were in Palestine. In the latter situation, some of the sects asserted that the court had no legal authority. See Ben-Menachem, “Judicial Process,” 428–429.

**Halakhah focuses almost exclusively** Regarding Christianity’s greater focus on faith over religious practice, see Adam B. Cohen, Joel I. Siegel, and Paul Rozin, “Faith versus Practice: Different Bases for Religiosity Judgments by Jews



and Protestants,” *European Journal of Psychiatry* 33 (2003): 287–295.

Jewish belief systems: Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 219–221; “What Do American Jews Believe? A Symposium,” *Commentary*, August 1996, 18–96.

Mishnah and Talmud mention different Jewish beliefs: The belief in a single God (monotheism) is not part of this short list because whereas there is a mitzvah to believe in one God (and if one believes in more than one God, polytheism, one is breaking a biblical directive), there is no mitzvah about the divinity of the Torah, resurrection of the dead, the messiah, or the world-to-come.

**At the same time** Male God vs. Female God: Jill Hammer, “To Her We Shall Return: Jews Turning to the Goddess, the Goddess Turning to Jews,” in Goldstein (ed.), *New Jewish Feminism*, 22–34.

**Meta-halakhah** I am not using the prefix *meta-* as a pejorative. However, in terms of a strict definition of halakhah that approaches this legal system from within the legal system itself, including its legal rules, “meta-halakhic” practices are not halakhic. See also chapter 8.

“The nineteenth-century emergence”: Despite clear halakhic precedents, nineteenth-century ritual changes caused an uproar among those more resistant to change. Yet these initial adjustments weren’t necessarily new within the context of halakhah. Some of the first proposals were actually based in the Mishnah, such as the recitation of prayers in a local vernacular rather than Hebrew, and the playing of instruments in synagogue during Shabbat (see chapter 8).

This was a time when Jews in Europe and the United States—possibly more than anywhere else—made major changes regarding halakhic practice in an effort to assimilate into the larger non-Jewish milieu. See Laura Arnold Leibman, *Messianism, Secrecy, and Mysticism: A New Interpretation of Early American Jewish Life* (Portland, OR: Vallentine Mitchell, 2012), 181–210.

**Yet for customary practices** Custom and law: The relationship between custom and law is also known in Hebrew as *minhag yisrael k’halakhah* (lit., the customs of Israel are akin to halakhah). See also Segal, “Jewish Law,” 111. In fact, in the Talmud it even says: “Every halakhah that is unclear in the *Beit Din* [Jewish court] and you do not know its nature, go and see how the community conducts itself and conduct yourself accordingly” (BT Ber. 45a; JT Pe’ah 7:5, in Ronald H. Isaacs, *Every Person’s Guide to Jewish Law* [Northvale, NJ: Jason Aronson, 2000], 77).

Eating legumes on Passover: The origins of this ban, which is nonexistent in virtually all non-Ashkenazi communities, are unknown. Some Ashkenazi halakhic authorities have even ruled that Ashkenazi Jews should refrain from following such customs, calling this practice “foolish.” See David Golinkin, “Eating Kitniyot (Legumes) on Pesach,” *Va’ad Halakhah*, OH 453.1, 1988 [www.responsafortoday.com/engsums/3\\_4.htm](http://www.responsafortoday.com/engsums/3_4.htm).

Cigarette smoking and halakhah: See, e.g., Moshe Feinstein, *Igrot Moshe: Yoreh De’ah*, HB, 49 (1984); “The Prohi-

bition of Smoking in Halacha,” *Va’ad Halacha*, Rabbinical Council of America (June 30, 2006), 1–11. This decision was partially based on a passage from the Babylonian Talmud that says a halakhah cannot be made for people unless most of them will follow it (BT Bab. Bat. 60b).

**Put differently, customs are linked** Community norms and laws: JT Yev. 12:1, in Isaacs, *Every Person’s Guide*, 78.

In other words, meta-halakhic practices are not halakhic from a traditional, non-Reconstructionist perspective. Chapter 8 has a longer discussion of the Reconstructionist movement and its approach to halakhah.

For an innovative understanding of the application of halakhah in the twenty-first century, including such practices as kashrut, something that can be construed as another usage of the term meta-halakhah, see Zalman Schachter-Shalomi, *Integral Halakhah: Transcending and Including* (Victoria, BC: Trafford Publishing, 2007).

**From a traditional halakhic** For those who eat out: One could make a halakhic case that if eating at a regular McDonald’s (not the kosher ones in the State of Israel and Argentina), it would be permissible to eat cold salad with plastic utensils. (Why plastic utensils? Because the laws of kashrut include specifics regarding whether or not the utensils you are eating with, or plate you are eating on, have been used previously with nonkosher products.)

**In other words, from a meta-halakhic perspective** Such meta-halakhic self-imposed rituals regarding kashrut exist in connection to halakhic laws across the board. For example, one Jewish family I know has two sets of dishes specifically for Passover, one for dairy products and a second for meat products. In preparation for the holiday, the family’s matriarch ensures there is no leavened bread, which is prohibited on Pesah, in the house. However, during the first night of Passover, she serves ham—a nonkosher food by any interpretation—albeit on plates specifically set aside for this holiday (Ryan Bauer, conversation with author, Santa Rosa, CA, July 23, 2013).

**From a meta-halakhic point of view** Meta-halakhah and kashrut: This might be analogous to someone who identifies as a vegetarian and eats chicken or fish. Some vegetarians would no doubt balk at such a definition of a vegetarian; others might accept that there is an unwritten hierarchy within the world of vegetarians, that it is a spectrum rather than a binary of vegetarian/nonvegetarian. (I would submit that in the American Northeast there are plenty of people identifying as vegetarian who eat chicken or fish, whereas in California this phenomenon is much less common.)

**Another good example of meta-halakhic practices** Ari Goldman, “Celebrating Shabbat in Many Ways,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/celebrating-shabbat-in-many-ways](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/celebrating-shabbat-in-many-ways), originally published in Ari L. Goldman, *Being Jewish: The Spiritual and Cultural Practice of Judaism Today* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2007).

**The conversion question** On increased rates of Jews marrying non-Jews, see Calvin Goldscheider, “Are American Jews

Vanishing Again?" *Contexts* 2, no. 1 (February 2003): 18–24; Kobu Nahshoni, "Intermarriage Rates Among Diaspora Jews at All-Time High," [www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-3984935,00.html](http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-3984935,00.html); Jeffrey S. Passel, Wendy Wang, and Paul Taylor, "Marrying Out: One-in-Seven New U.S. Marriages Is Interracial or Interethnic," Pew Research Center, June 15, 2010, [www.pewsocialtrends.org/files/2010/10/755-marrying-out.pdf](http://www.pewsocialtrends.org/files/2010/10/755-marrying-out.pdf); Shulamit Reinharz and Sergio DellaPergola, eds., *Jewish Intermarriage around the World* (New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 2009). See also chapters 2, 3, 8, and 11.

**Yet some maintain** No single transdenominational edict offering a definitive explanation of Jewishness: This is to say that although there may be specific guidelines that all of the groups agree on, there are also many others that they vehemently disagree about.

## Chapter 6. Mysticism

**Jewish mystical thought and practice** Lawrence Fine, "Kabbalistic Texts," in *Back to the Sources: Reading the Classic Jewish Texts*, ed. Barry W. Holtz (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2006), 306–307.

**Between what I had been told** Approximately 20 percent of all Jewish saints in Morocco are also venerated by Muslims. See Issachar Ben-Ami, *Saint Veneration among the Jews of Morocco* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1998), 131; Harvey E. Goldberg, "The *Zohar* in Southern Morocco: A Study in the Ethnography of Texts," *History of Religions* 29, no. 3 (Feb. 1990): 233–258.

**Later we also learned** Because most Moroccan Jews emigrated to Israel in the 1950s and 1960s, most of today's Jewish pilgrims to Morocco arrive from Israel. In 1973, a replica of the David U-Moshe tomb and synagogue was built in the Galilean town of Safed (in Israel). Nearly a decade earlier, in the southern Israeli town of Ashkelon, another Moroccan Jewish Israeli built a synagogue in homage to David U-Moshe, though not a replica of the pilgrimage site. See Linda Kay Davidson and David Martin Gitlitz, eds., *Pilgrimage: From the Ganges to Graceland—An Encyclopedia*, vol. 1 (Santa Barbara, CA: ABC-CLIO, 2002), 145–147.

**Hillula:** David U-Moshe is one of twelve Moroccan Jewish saints whose graves are visited for *hillulot* (sing. *hillula*), ten of whom came to Morocco from the Land of Israel (Ben-Ami, *Saint Veneration*, 42, 93–104). The *hillula* is similar to a Moroccan Muslim ritual referred to as a *muṣem*, although the two differ in that the latter practice is more jovial and sometimes involves horse racing and the shooting of guns (Goldberg, "The *Zohar*," 241n.31).

**One reason people visit** Shmuel Zanwill Kahana, *Legends of Zion*, ed. Leo Gartenberg, trans. S. M. Lehrman (Jerusalem: Research Center of Kabbalah, 1986), 29, cited in Gil Daryn, "Moroccan Hassidism: The Chavreu Habakuk Community and Its Veneration of Saints," *Ethnology* 37, no. 4 (Autumn

1998): 352. Such visits are also mentioned in the Talmud (BT Baba Metzia 85b, Sotah 34b, Taanit 16a).

**Many Jews refer to these deceased saints** On Rabbis Yaakov Abihatsira, Moshe Haliwa, and Raphael Anqawa, as well as saints in familial dynasties, see Ben-Ami, *Saint Veneration*, 13, 23–40; Janice K. Rosen, "Trance Parties and Tomb Picnics: Moroccan Saint Veneration among Muslims and Jews," *Dialogue and Alliance* 14, no. 1 (Spring/Summer 2000): 19–40.

On revelatory dreams, see, e.g., Yoram Bilu, "Dreams and the Wishes of the Saint," in *Judaism Viewed from Within and Without*, ed. Harvey E. Goldberg (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1987), 285–313; Yoram Bilu and Henry Abramovitch, "In Search of the Saggi: Visitationary Dreams among Moroccan Jews in Israel," *Psychiatry* 48, no. 1 (1985): 83–92.

**There are differences** One basic difference between Moroccan Muslims and Jews is that Muslims are rarely familiar with the *Zohar* (Goldberg, "The *Zohar*," 252), along with the Torah, the central text for Jewish mystics, discussed later in this chapter. Another difference is that Moroccan Muslims more commonly visit living saints, whereas Moroccan Jews usually visit graves of those already dead. Two contemporary exceptions in the Moroccan Jewish community in Israel include veneration of Rabbi Israel Abu-Hatseira (now deceased, but venerated for decades when alive) and his son, Rabbi Baruch Abu-Hatseira, better known as the Baba Sali and Baba Baruch, respectively. Interestingly, Ashkenazi Jews in Israel also commonly made pilgrimages to the homes of these two rabbis, though like Moroccan Muslims, many Ashkenazi Jews visit living saints more often than dead ones (Ben-Ami, *Saint Veneration*, 147–170; Daryn, "Moroccan Hassidism," 354).

Noah's Ark, the prophet Daniel, and three of King Solomon's sons buried in Morocco: Ben-Ami, *Saint Veneration*, 13, 23–48, 131–170.

**Although Jewish mystics also lived elsewhere** Ben-Ami, *Saint Veneration*, 41. Eighty-four of these saints came to Morocco from the Land of Israel.

**Like fellow mystics** On the connection between mystics in the Atlas mountains of Morocco and the Safed region in the Land of Israel, see Lawrence Fine, *Physician of the Soul, Healer of the Cosmos: Isaac Luria and His Kabbalistic Fellowship* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2003), 118–120.

**In Morocco and elsewhere** See, e.g., Jonathan Garb, "The Cult of the Saints in Lurianic Kabbalah," *Jewish Quarterly Review* 98, no. 2 (Spring 2008): 203–229. This phenomenon is akin to pilgrimages made to the alleged tombs of ancient biblical figures, such as Abraham, Sarah, Isaac, Rebecca, Jacob, Leah, Rachel, and Esau (all mentioned in the book of Genesis); Isaiah, Zekharia, Habbakuk (Iran, Israel), and Ezekiel (Iraq) (all mentioned in the Prophets); and Esther and Mordechai (Iran) (found in the Writings). (Unless specified otherwise, these shrines are all located in Israel and the occupied West Bank—the latter area also commonly called Palestine.)

**One way to understand mysticism** For more on some of mysticisms' characteristics, see Fine, "Kabbalistic Texts."

**What Is Jewish Mysticism?** Some scholars gravitate away from using the term *mysticism* generally, let alone *Jewish mysticism* specifically. See, e.g., Joseph Dan, *The Heart and the Fountain: An Anthology of Jewish Mystical Experiences* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002), 1–9; Peter Schäfer, *The Origins of Jewish Mysticism* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2011), 1–33.

**Despite the use of the word God** For a detailed explanation of the hermeneutics of Jewish mysticisms, see Moshe Idel, *Absorbing Perfections: Kabbalah and Interpretation* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2002).

**Some scholars are quick to point out** Arthur Green, *A Guide to the Zohar* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2004), 7; Gershom Scholem, *Major Trends in Jewish Mysticism* (New York: Schocken, 1974), 4.

In this chapter the terms *Jewish mysticism* and *Jewish mysticisms* are used interchangeably.

**Important distinctions can be made** Characteristics specific to Jewish mysticism are discussed in Green, *Guide to the Zohar*, 122–125; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 15–17.

**The first Jewish mystical text** Daniel C. Matt, *The Essential Kabbalah* (San Francisco: Harper Collins, 1983), 134–146.

Experiencing God "face to face": Jacob—Gen. 32:31; Moses—Exod. 33:11, Deut. 34:10. Though many understand these biblical figures to have been mystics, Scholem (*Major Trends*, 6) says that it would be "absurd" to consider Moses in this way.

"Saw the sounds of thunder and lightening": Exod. 20:14.

**Jewish mysticism is built upon the Bible** Historically and literarily: Aryeh Kaplan, *Meditation and the Bible* (Northvale, NJ: Jason Aronson, Inc., 1995).

Scholem quote: Scholem, *Major Trends*, 9.

Medieval period of Jewish mysticism: Another way to understand medieval forms of Jewish mysticism is as mystical Midrash; see Arthur Green, "Introduction," in Daniel C. Matt, trans. and comm., *The Zohar*, Pritzker ed., vol. 1 (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2004), lxi–lxii. For more on Midrash, see chapter 5.

**One of the earliest genres** Moshe Idel quote: *Midrash Mishlei* 10 and *Merkavah Shlemah* 4b, in Moshe Idel, "Merkavah Mysticism in Rabbinic Literature," [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/merkavah-mysticism-in-rabbinic-literature](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/merkavah-mysticism-in-rabbinic-literature).

Ascendance of souls: See, e.g., Joseph Dan, "The Religious Experience of the *Merkavah*," in *Jewish Spirituality: From the Bible to the Middle Ages*, vol. 1, ed. Arthur Green (New York: Crossroad, 1986), 289–307; Louis Jacobs, *Jewish Mystical Testimonies* (New York: Schocken Books, 1978), 26–34.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 6.1** TANAKH: A New Translation of the Holy Scriptures according to the Traditional Hebrew Text (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 1985), 893–894.

**Scholars debate whether** Some of these ancient texts are

called the *Hekhalot* (Palaces or Realms of God) Books; some use this term interchangeably with *Merkavah* literature, and some contend the latter is just a name for the fragments of texts that make up the former. See Green, "Introduction"; Kenneth Hanson, *Kabbalah: Three Thousand Years of Mystic Tradition* (San Francisco: Council Oak Books, 1998); Scholem, *Major Trends*.

**According to scholar Rachel Elio** Rachel Elio, *The Three Temples: On the Emergence of Jewish Mysticism* (Oxford: Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2004).

Peter Schäfer reference: Schäfer, *Origins of Jewish Mysticism*, 1–33.

Scholem's speculation that *Merkavah* literature appeared alongside the Palestinian Talmud: For example, BT Ber. 7a, Hag. 11b–16a, Hul. 91b, Meg. 24b, Shab. 80b; JT Hag. 2:1 (77b). In fact, Scholem says both sets of texts were probably written by Palestinian Jews, many of whom were influenced by ideas originally emerging out of the Greek-Egyptian community. Others challenge whether the authors of the *Merkavah* and Talmudic traditions were familiar with one another at all; see, e.g., Ra'anana Boustan, "Rabbinization and the Making of Early Jewish Mysticism," *Jewish Quarterly Review* 101, no. 4 (Fall 2011): 482–501.

Scholem argument that we don't know: Gershom Scholem, *Jewish Gnosticism, Merkavah Mysticism, and Talmudic Tradition* (New York: Jewish Theological Seminary of America, 1965); idem, *Major Trends*, 40–79.

**By the tenth century** On Scholem's reversal of his previous position, see Gershom Scholem, *Origins of the Kabbalah*, ed. R. J. Zwi Werblowsky and trans. Allan Arkush (New York: Jewish Publication Society, 1987), 7–12.

Medieval mystical texts built upon previous ones: For example, Jacobs, *Jewish Mystical Testimonies*, 48–55.

**In twelfth- and thirteenth-century Germany** On the Holy Roman Empire, see "Holy Roman Empire," *Columbia Encyclopedia*, 6th ed. (2014); and "Holy Roman Empire," [www.encyclopedia.com/topic/Holy\\_Roman\\_Empire.aspx#2](http://www.encyclopedia.com/topic/Holy_Roman_Empire.aspx#2).

German Jewish mystical thought: Green, "Introduction," xxxvii–xxxviii; Hanson, *Kabbalah*, 28–49; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 80–118; idem, *On the Kabbalah*, 54, 158–204.

**These German Jewish mystics** We have written correspondences between thirteenth-century German Jewish mystics and Spanish Jewish mystics, providing evidence that these two groups were in dialogue with one another. See Scholem, *Major Trends*, 40–18; idem, *Origins of the Kabbalah*, 18–24, 215–216, 367.

Influence of non-Jewish communities on German and Spanish Jewish mystical schools: From the eighth through fifteenth centuries, parts of the Iberian Peninsula (today's Spain, Portugal, and Gibraltar) were under the rule of Muslims. From roughly the tenth through fifteenth centuries, Christian rulers worked to regain control over the Peninsula, which they had previously controlled. During this entire time, Jews lived as a minority (under both non-Jewish groups), living through both massacres and periods of peace.



There is a range of opinion regarding Jewish life in this time and place, including, e.g., Maria Rosa Menocal, *The Ornament of the World: How Muslims, Jews, and Christians Created a Culture of Tolerance in Medieval Spain* (New York: Back Bay Books, 2003).

Jewish mystical thought in the sixteenth through nineteenth centuries also influenced by non-Jews: Scholem, *Major Trends*, 40–118; idem, *Origins of the Kabbalah*, 18–24, 215–216, 367.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 6.2** “A poetic demonstration of the truth and superiority of the Jewish faith”: Joseph J. Blau, “Evil in Popular Medieval Judaism,” *Union Seminary Quarterly Review* 37, nos. 1–2 (Fall–Winter 1981–82): 115–124.

Understood that being more forthright could lead to a violent backlash: Green, “Introduction,” lviii–lx.

Openly refer to their reverence and study of Sufi practices: Joseph Dan, *Jewish Mysticism and Jewish Ethics*, 2nd ed. (Northvale, NJ: J. Aronson, 1977), 115–31. See also Elisha Russ-Fishbane, *Judaism, Sufism, and the Pietists of Medieval Egypt: A Study of Abraham Maimonides and His Times* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2015).

Abraham Ibn Ezra and the astrological system he used: Bernard R. Goldstein, “Astronomy and Astrology in the Works of Abraham Ibn Ezra,” *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* 6 (1996): 9–21; Harris Lenowitz, *The Jewish Messiahs: From the Galilee to Crown Heights* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998), 94; David Shulman, “Is There an Indian Connection to *Sefer Yesirah*?” *Aleph* 2 (2002): 191–199; Braj M. Sinha, “Divine Anthropos and Cosmic Tree: Hindu and Jewish Mysticism in Comparative Perspective,” in *Indo-Judaic Studies in the Twenty-first Century: A View from the Margin*, ed. Nathan Katz, Ranabir Chakravarti, Braj M. Sinha, and Shalva Weil (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), 93–112. See also chapter 7 for more on interactions between Hindus and Jews in India.

Moses De León and *Sefer Mishkan ha-Edut*: Elliot R. Wolfson, *A Dream Interpreted within a Dream: Oneiropoiesis and the Prism of Imagination* (New York: Zone Books, 2011), 256–257. I thank Jeremy Brown for this reference.

**Many date the genesis of Kabbalah** Gershom Scholem localizes medieval Jewish mysticism in twelfth-century France and in a similar school that emerged shortly thereafter in Spain. It was out of this latter school that most developments in Jewish mystical thought emerged during the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. See Scholem, *Major Trends*, 20–21; idem, *Origins of the Kabbalah*, 12–18. Some attribute the coining of the term *Kabbalah* to the twelfth-century mystic Isaac the Blind; see David A. Cooper, *God Is a Verb: Kabbalah and the Practice of Mystical Judaism* (New York: Riverhead Books, 1997), 37, citing *Encyclopedia Judaica* 10:494.

Another important Jewish mystical movement reflecting the overarching umbrella term *Jewish mysticism* in contrast to the narrower term *Kabbalah* is found in thirteenth-century pietism. See, e.g., Russ-Fishbane, *Judaism, Sufism, and the Pietists of Medieval Egypt*.

My use of the term *Kabbalah*: For example, Fine, “Kabbalistic Texts,” 308; Scholem, *Origins of the Kabbalah*, 37–39. Else-

where, however, Scholem notes that the term *kabbalah* refers to the larger genre of Jewish mysticism (*Major Trends*, 18–22).

**Scholars underscore** On the connections between *Sefer Ha-Bahir* and Gnosticism, see Joseph Dan, “Sefer Ha-Bahir: The Book of Brilliance,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/sefer-ha-bahir-the-book-of-brilliance](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/sefer-ha-bahir-the-book-of-brilliance); Fine, “Kabbalistic Texts,” 308–309; Moshe Idel, *Kabbalah: New Perspectives* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1988); Scholem, *Major Trends*; idem, *Origins of the Kabbalah*, 49–198.

**According to Arthur Green** Green, “Introduction,” xlv.

**Although the Book of Illumination** The *Book of Formation* or *Sefer Yetzirah*, which some date to the Talmudic era, is also a foundational medieval mystical text. There is evidence that the ninth-century Babylonian Jewish leader Saadia Gaon wrote a commentary it, thus dating it to this era, if not earlier. A number of other commentaries on the *Book of Formation* appeared during the medieval period as well. For more on Saadia Gaon’s commentary, as well as mention of a few others, see, e.g., Green, “Introduction,” xxxvii; Aryeh Kaplan, *Sefer Yetzirah: The Book of Creation in Theory and Practice* (San Francisco: Weiser Books, 1997); Matt, *Essential Kabbalah*, 102–108; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 75–79; idem, *Origins of the Kabbalah*, 24–35, 97–98, 228. Scholem argues that the *Book of Formation* and the *Book of Illumination* were influential in the development of the idea of the *Golem* in Prague some three to four centuries later; see Green, “Introduction,” xxxvii–xxxviii; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 80–118; idem, *On the Kabbalah*, 54, 158–204).

Importance of the *Zohar*: Green, *Guide to the Zohar*; Isaiah Tishby, *Wisdom of the Zohar*, trans. David Goldstein (London: Littman Library, 1989).

*Zohar* on a par with Bible and Talmud: Scholem, *Major Trends*, 156. At one time, Jews in southern Morocco welcomed a new set of *Zohar* books into their community by means of a ritual, just as they did (and many Jews worldwide continue to do) when welcoming a new Torah scroll. The analogy one scholar makes is that the *Zohar* is to the Torah as a saint is to God (Goldberg, “The *Zohar*,” 249–252).

Aside from the Bible, more commentaries on the *Zohar* than any other text: Matt (trans.), *The Zohar*, xv.

**Sometimes called** On the *Zohar* as a “mystical novel,” see Green, “Introduction,” lxv–lxix.

**Aside from marginal naysayers** For decades after Scholem weighed in positively on the question of whether the *Zohar* was written by one author, scholars basically agreed with him that that was the case—the most notable exception being nineteenth-century scholar Heinrich Graetz, who considered the entire work to be based in superstition. More recent scholarship, however, posits that although De León wrote large sections of the *Zohar*, he did not write the entire text. Scholars continue to debate this question of authorship; see, e.g., Green, *Guide to the Zohar*, 162–168; idem, “Introduction,” lvi–lvii.

Dating the *Zohar* to thirteenth-century Spain: Green, *Guide to the Zohar*, 169–173.

**Another reason for dating the Zohar** Like other medieval texts, the *Zohar* reflects an editorial process that is internal to the text itself, with many of the earliest *Zohar* manuscripts including overt revisions and reformulations. See Fine, “Kabbalistic Texts,” 309–313; Matt (trans.), *The Zohar*, xvi; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 156–204. Scholem (ibid., 164–165) adds that the *Zohar*’s author was familiar with the Babylonian Talmud but not the Jerusalem.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 6.3** *Zohar* 1:54a–1:54b, in Matt (trans.), *The Zohar*, 302–306.

The world’s first humans committed a terrible sin: Gen. 2:16–17.

Eventually, Cain murdered his younger brother, Abel: As explained in chapter 2, elsewhere the *Zohar* explains that Eve copulated with the serpent, another reason his evil slime made its way into her and, eventually, her firstborn. See *Zohar* 2:167b–2:168a, in Matt (trans.), *The Zohar*, 472–473. This tradition is also based in a passage from BT Shab. 146a.

**Daniel Matt’s translation and commentary** Matt (trans.), *The Zohar*, 302n.1464.

**Lawrence Fine argues that what distinguishes** Green, “Introduction,” lxiv.

**A core idea in both the Zohar** The *Book of Formation* discusses the sefirot in a completely different manner than later mystical texts, referring to it instead in relation to primordial numbers, specifically those written by the Greeks (i.e., Pythagoreanism and Neopythagoreanism). Beginning with the *Book of Illumination*, the sefirot begin to describe God. I thank Lawrence Fine for pointing this out to me.

Sefirot: Although the *Book of Illumination* explains this notion in great detail, during the medieval period the sefirot received many different explanations in Kabbalistic literature, some of which cite Talmudic passages to prove a given interpretation’s ancient origins. See Green, “Introduction,” xlv; Matt, *Essential Kabbalah*, 1–11, 74–88. Over time, these multiple traditions developed into a single, unified, cogent system (ibid., 5).

Scholem (*Major Trends*, 197, 213) notes that the author of the *Zohar* was averse to using the term *sefirot*. This may have been partly due to the writer’s hesitation to speak casually about esoteric doctrines. Instead of using the term *sefirot*, one finds the *Zohar* using the language of *deveikut*, the mystical idea of becoming closer to or joining with God, a term that first appears in the Torah in a description of Adam “cleaving” to his wife as they “become one flesh” (Gen. 2:24). Nonetheless, it is clear that the *Zohar* often speaks of the sefirot, even when not using the term itself. See Green, “Introduction,” lxix–lxx; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 123; idem, *Origins of the Kabbalah*, 299–309.

**These ten spheres** The ninth-century Babylonian Jewish sage Saadia Gaon also wrote about the infinite nature of God; see Scholem, *Origins of the Kabbalah*, 266–267.

*Ayin* or *Ein*: Scholem, *Origins of the Kabbalah*, 357.

**Some mystics use the idea** Daniel C. Matt, “Ayin: The Concept of Nothingness in Jewish Mysticism,” in *Essential*

*Papers on Kabbalah*, ed. Lawrence Fine (New York: New York University Press, 1995), 67–108.

David ben Abraham ha-Lavan quote: Matt, “Ayin,” 67–68.

Distinction between *Ayin* and *Ein Sof*: Some scholars (and mystics) conflate elements of the *Ayin* and *Ein Sof*, whereas others are firm in disaggregating them, even while connecting them with one another in terms of their respective meanings.

**Attributing nothingness to the world** Gershom Scholem, *Kabbalah* (New York: Dorset Press, 1974), 94.

**As for the other spheres** Fine, “Kabbalistic Texts,” 318–325; Green, “Introduction,” xlv–liii; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 205–243.

Lowest sefirah, *Malkhut*: To complicate matters, some Kabbalists identify this sefirah with the active intellect. As one scholar of mysticism, Jeremy Brown, recently explained, “It’s tricky because intellect [in this context] does not mean the same thing as cerebral experience” (email to author, August 24, 2015). In short, Jewish mystical experiences can coexist with, and even emerge from, one’s intellectual experiences.

**Clearly there are paradoxes** Fine, “Kabbalistic Texts,” 318–325.

**Perhaps unsurprisingly** *Ruah*, and *neshamah*: Gen. 2:7, 6:3.

*Nefesh*: Lev. 17:11. According to the Talmud, humans are part animal and part angel; their physical body is animalistic, whereas their soul is angelic. See Aryeh Kaplan, *Jewish Meditation* (New York: Schocken Books, 1985), 134.

Various translations for these three terms: See, e.g., Harold Fisch, ed., *The Holy Scriptures* (Jerusalem: Koren Publishers Jerusalem, 1992), 2, 6, 138; Everett Fox, trans., *The Schocken Bible: Volume I, The Five Books of Moses* (New York: Schocken Books, 1995), 19, 33, 592; Baruch A. Levine, trans., *The JPS Torah Commentary: Leviticus*, ed. Nahum M. Sarna (New York: Jewish Publication Society, 1989), 115; Wayne E. Meeks, ed., *The HarperCollins Study Bible, New Revised Standard Version* (New York: HarperCollins, 1993), 8, 12, 179; Nahum M. Sarna, trans., *The JPS Torah Commentary: Genesis*, ed. Nahum M. Sarna (New York: Jewish Publication Society, 1989), 17, 46; Nosson Scherman, ed., *The Chumash*, Stone ed., Artscroll Series (New York: Mesorah Publications, 1993), 10–11, 26–27, 646–647; Isaiah Tishby, “The Doctrine of Man in the *Zohar*,” in Fine (ed.), *Essential Papers*, 109–153.

Interchangeability of these terms in the Prophets and Writings: For example, Eccles. 12:7, where the word *nefesh* is used to mean a human soul.

Elior reference: “Body and Soul,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/practices/Ethics/Our\\_Bodies/Themes\\_and\\_Theology/Body\\_and\\_Soul.shtml](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/practices/Ethics/Our_Bodies/Themes_and_Theology/Body_and_Soul.shtml); idem, “Jewish Spirituality and the Soul,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-spirituality-and-the-soul](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-spirituality-and-the-soul).

**During the medieval era** For additional soul references, see Elior, “Jewish Spirituality.”

**The Zohar picks up on the Talmudic tradition** On the hierarchical arrangement of these terms, see Dan Cohn-

Sherbock, *Jewish Mysticism: An Anthology* (Oxford: Oneworld, 1995), 29–30.

Evolution and progression of the soul: Cohn-Sherbock, *Jewish Mysticism*, 30; Cooper, *God Is a Verb*, 265–271.

Postmortem nature of the soul: Allan Arkush, “Immortality: Belief in a Bodiless Existence,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/immortality-belief-in-a-bodiless-existence](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/immortality-belief-in-a-bodiless-existence); Scholem, “Gilgul,” *Encyclopedia Judaica* (2008), available at [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/judaica/ejud\\_0002\\_0007\\_o\\_07314.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/judaica/ejud_0002_0007_o_07314.html).

**Historically, Kabbalists have often been described** On mysticism and Jewish philosophy and mysticism as integrative and not oppositional, see, e.g., David R. Blumenthal, *Understanding Jewish Mysticism, A Source Reader*, vol. 2: *The Philosophic-Mystical Tradition and the Hasidic Tradition* (New York: Ktav, 1982). Diana Lobel, *Between Mysticism and Philosophy: Sufi Language of Religious Experience in Judah Ha-Levi’s Kuzari* (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 2000); Georges Vajda, “Un chapitre de l’histoire de conflit entre la Kabbale et la philosophie: La Polemique anti-intellectualiste de Joseph b. Shalom Ashkenazi,” *Archives d’Histoire Doctrinale et Littéraire du Moyen Age* 31 (1956): 45–127 [French]. I thank Elisha Russ-Fishbane for these references.

Sefirot as polytheism: Fine, “Kabbalistic Texts,” 324–325.

Kabbalists’ reactions to philosophers: Green, *Guide to the Zohar*, 21; idem, “Introduction,” xli.

**Other points of discord** Many Kabbalists actually agreed with Maimonides that anthropomorphic understandings of God were overly simplistic. At the same time, many felt that human beings could affect God, the latter premise which Maimonides felt brought God too close to humans in terms of descriptives (Green, “Introduction,” xl–xli).

**Yet as we have seen** Jewish philosophy and mysticism not oppositional: Scholem, *Major Trends*, 119–155.

**Maimonides, for one, believed** Moses Maimonides, *The Guide for the Perplexed*, 1:58–59, in Matt, “Ayin,” 73.

**Although they didn’t feel** *The Guide for the Perplexed* as an entryway into Jewish mysticism: Scholem, *Origins of the Kabbalah*, 408–413. Some Kabbalists, such as Abraham Abulafia (discussed earlier in this chapter as well as in chapter 4), even wrote commentaries on Maimonides’s *Guide*; see Jacobs, *Jewish Mystical Testimonies*, 5, 35–47, 56–72.

**Some reputable halakhic authorities** Some maintain that Ramban ensured that Kabbalistic teachings remained cryptic, however, which lends credence to the theory that he was not in favor of popularizing mystical ideas. See, e.g., Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 100–101; Jacobs, *Jewish Mystical Testimonies*, 73–79; Scholem, *Origins of the Kabbalah*, 384–401.

Joseph Karo and Jewish mysticism: Jacobs, *Jewish Mystical Testimonies*, 98–122.

**Following the expulsion** Safed is not mentioned in the Bible and is only mentioned in passing in the Talmud. Aside from its status—including nearby locations, such as Mount Meron—as the alleged resting place for a number of Talmudic rabbis, including Shimon Bar Yochai, this town did not

become a center of Jewish life until the sixteenth century, even though there is a record of Jews there dating back to the thirteenth century. By the fourteenth century, Safed’s reputation among Jewish mystics had begun to spread, increasing exponentially in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries, in particular in the decades immediately following the Spanish Inquisition. See Fine, “Kabbalistic Texts,” 344–346; idem, *Physician of the Soul*, 41–47, 65–74.

Another reason why Jews, especially rabbinic figures, moved to the Land of Israel (where Safed is) at this time was that Palestine-based rabbis had a superior reputation relative to rabbis living elsewhere; see Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 78–80. Today, more than 150,000 devotees visit Bar Yochai’s grave annually on Lag B’Omer, a holiday that lands thirty-three days after the second night of Passover (Goldberg, “The Zohar,” 246).

Safed mystical thought based on previous Jewish mystical texts: *Zohar*, vol. 1, 119a; vol. 2, 7b, 9a, 120a, cited in Moshe Idel, *Messianic Mystics* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1998), 157.

**During this era Jewish mysticism was popularized** One can also point to ideas found in the *Zohar* for the popularization of Jewish mysticism, such as the notion of placing positive value on poverty, a state in which many if not most Jews found themselves at the time. See, e.g., Scholem, *Major Trends*, 234–235. As to why this trend didn’t take hold until the sixteenth century, scholars have offered various theories. One suggests that it was because the *Zohar*, written largely in Aramaic, a language not understood by the masses, did not start to be translated into Hebrew until then. Green, “Introduction,” lxxiv–lxxxi; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 233.

**But halakhah ensured that mystical ascetics** These practices were starkly different from those ascetic rituals performed by German Jewish mystics during the twelfth and thirteenth centuries; see Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 180–186.

**One of the most important figures** On Luria’s early years, see Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 32–34. As for other famous mystics from the sixteenth century, Rabbi Judah Loew ben Bezalel, who lived in Prague, is one of the more renowned. He is said to have used mystical incantations to give life to an inanimate piece of clay called the Golem. Some say this is the foundational story for Mary Shelley’s novel *Frankenstein* (e.g., Hanson, *Kabbalah*, 162–170).

Luria stepped into a leadership vacuum: Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 353–354.

**Although Luria was only in Safed** According to Vital’s writings, a number of Jewish women in Damascus experienced auditory revelations; Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 80–82, 120–122.

**For Luria, the most important mystical text** On humans helping God connect with Godself, see Fine, “Kabbalistic Texts,” 327–336. Note that I am using the term *Godself* rather than *Himself* or *Herself*.

Responsibility to heal the world: Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 12–15, 134–143.



The spread of Lurianic mysticism: It is likely that Lurianic mysticism spread through one of his disciples, if not a fellow mystic, since even before he died his teachings had made their way to places such as Italy. According to Scholem (*Major Trends*, 244–286), not Luria or Vital but a man named Israel Sarug was the missionary par excellence for this thread of mystical thought. This theory has since been dismissed; see Cohn-Sherbok, *Jewish Mysticism*, 32–37; Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 1–6, 361n.1. In fact, there is no evidence that Luria, Vital, or any other specific individual disseminated Lurianic Kabbalah. See, e.g., Green, *Guide to the Zohar*, 178–187; Jacobs, *Jewish Mystical Testimonies*, 123–135.

**In fact, one of the reasons** Strict observance of the mitzvot: For example, Luria is said to have studied a set number of verses from the Torah each day of the week. See Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 187–219, 259–260.

**Luria also added a new and influential** On Luria's new and influential idea, see Green, *Guide to the Zohar*, 101–108; Matt, *Essential Kabbalah*, 90–99.

*Tzimtzum*: Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 126–149, 187–258; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 244–286; *Zohar* 1:156a–b.

**This leads to a complementary Lurianic idea** On “Breaking the Vessels” and *tikkun olam* (also known as *tikkun ha-olam*), see Lawrence Fine, “Tikkun in Lurianic Kabbalah,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/tikkun-in-lurianic-kabbalah](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/tikkun-in-lurianic-kabbalah); Jane Kanarek, “What Does Tikkun Olam Actually Mean?” in *Righteous Indignation: A Jewish Call for Justice*, ed. Or N. Rose, Jo Ellen Green Kaiser, and Margue Klein (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 2008), 15–22; Howard Schwartz, “How the Ari Created a Myth and Transformed the World,” *Tikkun* (March 28, 2011), [www.tikkun.org/nextgen/how-the-ari-created-a-myth-and-transformed-judaism](http://www.tikkun.org/nextgen/how-the-ari-created-a-myth-and-transformed-judaism). The Hebrew root for the word *tikkun* also means “establish, institute, mend, restore, correct, perfect, prepare, arrange, array, and adorn” (Matt [trans.], *The Zohar*, xxi).

While Luria did not invent the idea of *tikkun olam*—indeed, it predated his era by centuries, going back at least as far as the Mishnah—he developed a new and distinct understanding of this concept.

God's need for humans: Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 134–141; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 244–286.

**Another act of major importance** Some say that in the idea of ascending the sefirot through prayer, Luria was speaking only of esoteric forms of mystical prayer, thereby limiting the practice to elites.

As for the issue of one's intention during prayer, for this Luria drew upon a number of sources, including the eleventh-century Spanish text *Guide to Duties of the Heart*, written by Bahya Ibn Pakuda, which in turn drew a great deal from Islamic philosophy and the work of the renowned ninth-century Babylonian rabbi Saadia Gaon. See Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 220–302.

**Luria and his disciples** On the “Seven Mitzvot of the Sons of Noah,” see Michael Kress, “The Modern Noahide Movement,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-modern](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-modern)

-noahide-movement; Jeffrey Spitzer, “The Noahide Laws,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-noahide-laws](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-noahide-laws).

Hell: Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 94–95, 192–193, 259–299, 305–314, 321–326, 333–339; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 244–286.

**In many ways, the Safed mystics** On connections between messianism, Safed mysticism, and the Spanish and Portuguese Inquisitions, see Fine, “Kabbalistic Texts,” 342; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 244–286.

**Jewish mystics in the sixteenth century** On Lurianic mysticism and non-Jews, see Garb, “The Cult of the Saints,” 218–219; Idel, *Messianic Mystics*, 154–182; Jody Myers, “Kabbalah for the Gentiles: Diverse Souls and Universalism in Contemporary Kabbalah,” in *Kabbalah and Contemporary Spiritual Revival: Historical, Sociological and Cultural Perspectives*, ed. Boaz Huss (Beer-Sheva, Isr.: Ben-Gurion University of the Negev Press, 2011), 181–212.

**As mentioned in chapter 4** On Hasidism and mysticism, see Cohn-Sherbok, *Jewish Mysticism*, 40–42; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 325–350; Herbert Weiner, *9½ Mystics: The Kabbala Today* (New York: Touchstone, 1992), 121–153.

Sabbatai Tzvi: See chapter 4.

Hasidism as anti-Sabbatian: Some argue that the Hasidic movement was able to attain an incredibly quick mass appeal because it began in the region of Ukraine, where previously Tzvi had a major following. Some even allege that the link between Hasidism and Tzvi is much stronger than merely having a geographical connection, arguing that the founder of Hasidism, Israel ben Eliezer, or the Baal Shem Tov, studied with a devoted rabbi of Tzvi's. See, e.g., Scholem, *Major Trends*, 330–333; Isaiah Tishby, “Between Sabbateanism and Hasidism: The Sabbateanism of the Kabbalist R. Ya'aqov Kopel Lifshitz of Miedzyrec,” in *Paths of Faith and Heresy* (Ramat Gan: n.p., 1964), 204–226 [Hebrew], cited in Moshe Idel, *Hasidism: Between Ecstasy and Magic* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995), 4. Idel contends that Hasidism's appeal was more likely due to its integration of a number of normative Jewish strands than a connection to Tzvi (*ibid.*, 18–20).

**Saint veneration** Garb, “The Cult of the Saints.” Scholem (*Major Trends*, 333–338) says the Hasidic notion of a tzadik is akin to a “non-messianic messiah.”

**Accessibility** In contrast, roughly during the same eighteenth-century period in which Hasidism emerged, a Yemenite Jewish mystic moved to Jerusalem and helped launch a new school of mystical thought (that is still in existence). Despite his becoming one of the most famous mystics of his day, his school has only been accessible to an elite few. See Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 6; Jacobs, *Jewish Mystical Testimonies*, 156–169; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 328–330.

Although much of early Hasidism was accessible to the masses specifically living in eighteenth-century Russia, one obscure Hasidic group moved to Ottoman-controlled Palestine in 1877 and thus did not help spread the Baal Shem Tov's teachings to the Ukrainian, Russian, and Polish masses (Scholem, *Major Trends*, 330).

**Experiencing God trumps textual learning** On communion with God, see Gershom Scholem, *On the Kabbalah and its Symbolism*, trans. Ralph Manheim (New York: Schocken Books, 1965), 25.

**Popularizing movement-based prayer** This included new approaches to practices referred to as *deveikut* (see Notes, chapter 6, “A Core idea in both the *Zohar*”). Idel, *Hasidism*, 45–102; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 334–336.

**This said, Scholem writes** On the ways Hasidism added mystical ideas to the tradition, see Moshe Idel, “The *Tsadiq* and His Soul’s Sparks: From Kabbalah to Hasidism,” *Jewish Quarterly Review* 103, no. 2 (Spring 2013): 196–240; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 340–341.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 6.4** Yosef Marcus, “The Harder They Come . . . (from the Teachings of Rabbi Schneur Zalman of Liadi)” (2003), adapted from Zalman, *Maamarei Admor Hazaken Haketzarim*, 47, available at [www.kabbalaonline.org/kabbalah/article\\_cdo/aid/379436/jewish/The-Harder-They-Come.htm](http://www.kabbalaonline.org/kabbalah/article_cdo/aid/379436/jewish/The-Harder-They-Come.htm).

This teaching builds on Lurianic thought regarding lineages of transmigrated souls, such as one connecting Adam to Abel and another connecting Adam to Cain, at least as understood by Luria’s disciple, Hayim Vital. See Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 333–339.

The text continues:

Now Cain is [akin to] the realm the *sefira* of *gevura*. His name is numerically equivalent to the Hebrew word for “rock.” . . . There are many souls from the realm of Cain, which are much loftier than those of Abel. When they fall, their drive for evil is far greater. . . . *Shaar Hagilgulim* lists various ancient souls including the sages of the Mishna and the Talmud and designates them as stemming either from Cain or Abel. There are in fact signs by which to recognize the roots of souls. It is written in *Shaar Hakavanot* [The Gate of Medications: a book relayed to Hayim Vital by his teacher, Luria], one who is wrapped in a *tallit* [prayer shawl] from right to left and left to right is from the realm of Abel. And one whose nature and custom is to fold the two sides of his *tallit* on his two shoulders is from the realm of Cain. (It was the Baal Shem Tov’s custom to fold his *tallit* on his shoulder, and perhaps he was from the realm of Cain.)

“Including how the founder of Hasidism wore his prayer shawl”: According to scholar Rachel Elior, Lurianic understandings of mysticism can be found in virtually every Hasidic discussion of God. See Rachel Elior, “Lurianic Kabbalah, Sabbateanism, and Hasidism: Historical Sequence, Spiritual Affinity, and Differences in Identity” [Hebrew], *MY* 12 (1997): 379–397, cited in Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 5–6.

**The Hasidic movement, of course** On *Mitnagdim*, *Maskilim*, and *Hasidim*, see Scholem, *Major Trends*, 325–350.

Mysticism beyond the Hasidic community: Green, “Introduction,” lxxix; Jacobs, *Jewish Mystical Testimonies*, 170–175.

**Israel ben Eliezer, also called the Baal Shem Tov** Louis Jacobs, “The Baal Shem Tov,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-baal-shem-tov/2/#](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-baal-shem-tov/2/#).

**SPECIAL TOPIC 6.5** Daryn, “Moroccan Hassidism,” 351–372.

**Aside from the Baal Shem Tov** For more on Rabbi Nahman of Bratslav, see Sharon Flatto, “Hasidism and Mitnaggedim: Not a World Apart,” *Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy* 12, no. 2 (August 2003): 99–121; Arthur Green, *Tormented Master: The Life and Spiritual Quest of Rabbi Nahman of Bratslav* (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 2004); Louis Jacobs, “Nahman of Bratslav,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/nahman-of-bratslav](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/nahman-of-bratslav); and Weiner, *9½ Mystics*, 197–226.

**For many Jews, mystics or otherwise** On what medieval Jewish philosophers considered heretical, see Fine, “Kabbalistic Texts,” 327–336.

**As for the act of prayer itself** On meditative prayer, see Green, *Guide to the Zohar*, 134–144; Kaplan, *Jewish Meditation*.

**For the most part, Jewish mystics** There were other forms of meditative prayer as well. For instance, in the sixteenth century, Safed mystics commonly practiced a ritual called *gerushin*, in which one focused on a single verse of a sacred text and either repeated it over and over again or wrote it down on parchment and stared at it (i.e., visual contemplation). In Hinduism and Buddhism, this might be referred to as a mantra, and in psychotherapeutic milieus as Standardized Clinical Meditation.

**But nowhere is there any discussion** On mitzvot, reward, and punishment, see, e.g., Deut. 11:13–21, which is also the second paragraph of an important Jewish prayer called the *Shema* (see special topic 5.1).

**During the rabbinic period** On *yetzer hara* and performing mitzvot, see Vanessa Avery, “The Jewish Vaccine against Mimetic Desire: A Girardian Exploration of a Sabbath Ritual,” *Contagion: Journal of Violence, Mimesis, and Culture* 19, no. 2 (2012): 29–33.

**Other texts from the rabbinic period** Reward, punishment, good, and evil are mentioned explicitly in BT Ber. 4a, Eruv. 19a, Hag. 16a, San 107b, Sotah 47a, Yoma 69b; and Gen. Rab. 9:7. See also Cooper, *God Is a Verb*, 244–250; Ishay Rosen-Zvi, “Refuting the *Yetzer*: The Evil Inclination and the Limits of Rabbinic Discourse,” *Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy* 17, no. 2 (2009): 117–141; Jeffrey Spitzer, “The Birth of the Good Inclination,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-birth-of-the-good-inclination](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-birth-of-the-good-inclination). This is to say nothing about notions such as the “evil eye,” which, though linked to larger questions like what is evil and where did it come from, is quite different (see Brigitte Kern-Ulmer, “The Power of the Evil Eye and the Good Eye in Midrashic Literature,” *Judaism* 40 [June 1, 1991]: 344–353).

**For some Kabbalists, what seems to be evil** Other Jewish understandings of good and evil are explored in Cohn-Sherbok, *Jewish Mysticism*, 26–28; Joseph Dan, “Samuel, Lilith, and the Concept of Evil in Early Kabbalah,” in Fine (ed.), *Essential Papers*, 154–178; Green, *Guide to the Zohar*, 116–121; idem, “Introduction,” xlii–xliii.

**As for how to deal with evil** On performing mitzvot and

transforming evil into good, see Daniel C. Matt, “The Mystic and the *Mizwot*,” in Green (ed.), *Jewish Spirituality*, 1:367–404.

**Zohar and presenting contradictory ideas about evil:** A number of scholars see the varied edicts regarding how to deal with evil as incompatible; e.g., Joseph J. Blau, “Evil in Popular Medieval Judaism,” *Union Seminary Quarterly Review* 37, nos. 1–2 (Fall–Winter 1981–82): 115–124; Cohn-Sherbok, *Jewish Mysticism*, 26–28; Cooper, *God Is a Verb*, 59–61, 151–161; Green, *Guide to the Zohar*, 126–133; Aryeh Kaplan, *Sefer Yitzerah* (York Beach, ME: Samuel Weiser, 1990), 167–190; Moses Ben Maimon, *Guide of the Perplexed*, trans. Shlomo Pines (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1963), 3:22; Scholem, *Mystical Trends*, 235–239; Elliot R. Wolfson, “Light through Darkness: The Ideal of Human Perfection in the *Zohar*,” *Harvard Theological Review* 81, no. 1 (1988): 73–95.

**Luria took considerations of evil** On Hasidic texts continuing Lurianic ideas, see Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 150–186.

Hell, Satan, demons, and angels: Contrary to what many Jews contend anecdotally, such ideas are not solely Christian, but are present in both Judaism and Christianity (as well as many other religions). A number of rabbinic and medieval texts touch on these ideas in greater detail, many of which predate Christianity altogether. See, e.g., Dan Cohn-Sherbok, “The Jewish Doctrine of Hell,” *Religion* 8, no. 2 (1978), 196–209; Cooper, *God Is a Verb*, 134–150, 290–297; Isaiah Gafni, “Babylonian Rabbinic Culture,” in *Cultures of the Jews: Mediterranean Origins*, vol. 1, ed. David Biale (New York: Schocken Books, 2002), 244–252; James A. Montgomery, “The Holy City and Gehenna,” *Journal of Biblical Literature* 27, no. 1 (1908): 24–47; Or N. Rose, “Heaven and Hell in Jewish Tradition,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/heaven-and-hell-in-jewish-tradition](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/heaven-and-hell-in-jewish-tradition). For an interesting piece on “Jewish Exorcism,” see J. H. Chajes, “Jewish Exorcism: Early Modern Traditions and Transformations,” in *Judaism in Practice: From the Middle Ages through the Early Modern Period*, ed. Lawrence Fine (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2001), 386–398.

**Jewish mysticism, according to Scholem** Scholem, *Major Trends*, 37–39.

**Among these may be** Chava Weissler, “Woman as High Priest: A Kabbalistic Prayer in Yiddish for Lighting Sabbath Candles,” in Fine (ed.), *Essential Papers*, 525–546.

**As for feminine representations** God, Moses, and sexual intercourse: *Zohar* 1:21b–22a.

The phallic nature of *Yisod*: As seen in fig. 6.3, *Yisod* is situated just above *Malkhut*, the sefirah directly connecting God to the earthly realm. This means that the other eight sefirot, God’s “body,” rest upon *Yisod*; it is their foundation. All earthly souls emerge from *Yisod* but are then birthed into the world through *Malkhut*, *Yisod*’s feminine counterpart. See, e.g., Daniel C. Matt, *God and the Big Bang: Discovering Harmony between Science and Spirituality* (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 1996); and Gershom Scholem, *On the Mystical Shape of the Godhead: Basic Concepts in the Kabbalah* (New York: Schocken Books, 1991).

**Perhaps the most important of the female sefirot** Such

ideas are found in important Kabbalistic texts such as *Iggeret Hakodesh* (written c. twelfth or thirteenth century) as well as the *Zohar*. See Rachel Biale, *Women and Jewish Law: Their Essential Texts, Their History, and Their Relevance for Today* (New York: Schocken Books, 1995), 140–145; Green, “Introduction,” xliii–liii; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 219, 235.

**Green suggests that this idea** Green, *Guide to the Zohar*, 94–98.

**Daniel Matt notes** Matt, *God and the Big Bang*, 52–53.

**Although not claiming that pre-Hebrew** Matt, *God and the Big Bang*, 52–53.

**Jewish mystical ideas** On the rebuilding of London based on the sefirot, see Laura Arnold Leibman, *Messianism, Secrecy, and Mysticism: A New Interpretation of Early American Jewish Life* (Portland, OR: Vallentine Mitchell, 2012), 60–61.

Kabbalah Centre: Some new religious movements of the 1960s and 1970s, like the European New Age movement, which eventually made its way to the United States, drew foundational ideas from Jewish mysticism, among other places. See, e.g., Catherine L. Albanese, *A Republic of Mind and Spirit: A Cultural History of American Metaphysical Religion* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2007); Boaz Huss, Marco Pasi, and Kocku von Stuckrad, eds., *Kabbalah and Modernity: Interpretations, Transformations, Adaptations* (Boston: Brill Academic Publishers, 2010). See also chapter 11.

**This process may have begun** R. J. Z. Werblowsky, *Joseph Karo, Lawyer and Mystic* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1962), 62, quoted in Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 76. Fine quote, *ibid*.

**The mainstream idea of tikkun olam** On social justice activism, see chapter 4.

According to scholar Jonathan Krasner, it wasn’t until the 1970s and 1980s that the centuries-old idea of tikkun olam began to take on contemporary meanings associated with social justice activism for both humanistic and Jewish-specific causes. Jonathan Krasner, “The Place of Tikkun Olam in American Jewish Life,” Jerusalem Center for Public Affairs, November 1, 2014, <http://jcpa.org/article/place-tikkun-olam-american-jewish-lifer>.

Mysticism and mainstream rituals: Schwartz, “How the Ari Created a Myth.” See also discussion in chapter 4 about the link between tikkun olam and the messianic age.

**In addition, many prayers** On mainstream prayers and mysticism, see Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 5–6, 248–258; Scholem, *Major Trends*, 285–286; Adin Steinsaltz, “Afterword,” in Weiner, *9½ Mystics*, 386.

**Perhaps the most important addition** On Shabbat and Jewish mysticism, see Fine, *Physician of the Soul*, 5–6, 248–258; Elliot K. Ginsburg, “Kabbalistic Rituals of Shabbat Preparation,” in Fine (ed.), *Essential Papers*, 400–437.

**The imprint that Jewish mysticism has left** Steinsaltz, “Afterword,” 386. Note that Steinsaltz is using the term “Kabbala” here to mean Jewish mysticism at large.



## Chapter 7. Cultures

**Like many other Americans** When asked about their religious affiliation, my maternal grandparents' usual response was that, to some degree, they identified with the United Church of Canada (at the time, similar to American Presbyterianism). But if anything, this was merely a remnant of their time in Winnipeg, where they both grew up, as well as a scripted response intended to put the questions on this topic to bed.

**Many American Jews today** See, e.g., Pew Research Center, "A Portrait of Jewish Americans: Findings from a Pew Research Center Survey of U.S. Jews," October 1, 2013, available at [www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey](http://www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey); Regina Kakhnovets, "An Investigation of Jewish Ethnic Identity and Identification and their Psychological Correlates for American Jews," Ph.D. diss., Ohio State University, 2006, available at [http://etd.ohiolink.edu/ap/10?107406665591557::NO:10:P10\\_ETD\\_SUBID:64660](http://etd.ohiolink.edu/ap/10?107406665591557::NO:10:P10_ETD_SUBID:64660). See also sources cited in the notes to this book's introduction, specifically those related to classification categories in general and which, if any, classification categories Jews should be placed in.

"Hanukkah bush": Pew Research Center, "Portrait of Jewish Americans," 80; "Ask the Expert—Hanukkah Bush," [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/ask-the-expert-hanukkah-bush](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/ask-the-expert-hanukkah-bush); Michael Doyle, "There's No Such Thing as a Hanukkah Bush," December 21, 2011, [www.jewcy.com/religion-and-beliefs/theres-no-such-thing-as-a-hanukkah-bush](http://www.jewcy.com/religion-and-beliefs/theres-no-such-thing-as-a-hanukkah-bush). On those who engage in this practice and identify as Messianic Jews, see chapter 11.

**Today, many Jews in the United States and Israel** On Jews who don't identify as religiously Jewish, but as Jewish nonetheless, see Pew Research Center, "Portrait of Jewish Americans."

**This chapter addresses two large questions** Another related question, recently addressed by scholar Shaul Magid, is whether American Jews in particular are in a new "post-ethnic" phase of identity formation (citing a term coined by American historian David Hollinger and first applied to the American milieu in general). See Shaul Magid, "Be the Jew You Make: Jews, Judaism, and Jewishness in Post-Ethnic America," *Shm'a: A Journal of Jewish Responsibility*, March 2011, [www.shma.com/2011/03/be-the-jew-you-make-jews-judaism-and-jewishness-in-post-ethnic-america](http://www.shma.com/2011/03/be-the-jew-you-make-jews-judaism-and-jewishness-in-post-ethnic-america). See also Shaul Magid, *American Post-Judaism: Identity and Renewal in a Postethnic Society* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2013).

**With this in mind, this chapter begins** On the number of Jews living in Muslim-majority societies between the twelfth and nineteenth centuries, see Susan L. Douglass, *The Rise and Spread of Islam, 622–1500* (Detroit: Gale Group, 2001); John L. Esposito, *The Oxford History of Islam* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999); Reuven Firestone, "Jewish Culture in the Formative Period of Islam," in *Cultures of the Jews*, vol. 1: *Medi-*

*terranean Origins*, ed. David Biale (New York: Schocken Books, 2002), 267–302; Everett Jenkins, Jr., *The Muslim Diaspora: A Comprehensive Reference to the Spread of Islam in Asia, Africa, Europe, and the Americas* (Jefferson, NC: McFarland, 1999); Hugh Kennedy, *The Great Arab Conquests: How the Spread of Islam Changed the World We Live In* (Philadelphia: Da Capo, 2007); Jonathan Lyons, *The House of Wisdom: How the Arabs Transformed Western Civilization* (New York: Bloomsbury Press, 2009); Shelomo Morag, Issachar Ben-Ami, and Norman A. Stillman, eds., *Studies in Judaism and Islam (Presented to Shelomo Dov Goitein)* (Jerusalem: Magnus Press, 1981).

**Please note that the attention** One of the "Invisible Gorillas" (see chapter 5) in this chapter—addressed in particular instances rather than generally—is the fact that both gender and sexuality are central to the formation of all cultures discussed herein.

In the Jewish community, male hegemony goes back to the Bible (at least according to the text's *pshat*). As for heteronormativity, this term means something very different with regard to biblical times, when polygyny was permitted and polyandry prohibited, than it does in a present-day context. To further explore what this idea means today we would have to localize it to a particular time and place.

**Before continuing, we need to consider** David Biale, "Preface: Toward a Cultural History of the Jews," in Biale (ed.), *Cultures of the Jews*, 1:xv.

**For Jews, there is not** "Inseparable from [those] of their Canaanite . . .": Biale, "Preface," xviii–xxi.

**First, as scholar Melanie Kaye/Kantrowitz argues** Melanie Kaye/Kantrowitz, *The Colors of Jews: Racial Politics and Radical Diasporism* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2007), 12–13, 30–31; Pew Forum on Religion and Public Life, "U.S. Religious Landscape Survey: Religious Affiliation—Diverse and Dynamic," February 2008, available at [www.pewforum.org/files/2013/05/report-religious-landscape-study-full.pdf](http://www.pewforum.org/files/2013/05/report-religious-landscape-study-full.pdf).

Subordinated groups and the influence of dominants: Barbara Jean Fields, "Slavery, Race, and Ideology in the United States of America," *New Left Review* 181 (1990): 95–118. As for why non-Christian Americans, like Jews, also approach Jewish identity as if it were a religious category, this reflects how dominants shape even the ideas that subordinated groups have about themselves. See Kaye/Kantrowitz, *Colors of Jews*, 12–13, 30–31; Pew Forum, "U.S. Religious Landscape Survey."

**Second, because Christianity** Paul Tillich also briefly explores this phenomenon in Germany and Russia; see Paul Tillich, *Theology of Culture*, ed. Robert C. Kimball (New York: Oxford University Press, 1959).

Christian presidents of the United States: Some scholars contend that Thomas Jefferson is best described as a theist or deist, rather than a Christian. See "Jefferson's Religious Beliefs," *Thomas Jefferson Encyclopedia*, Robert H. Smith International Center for Jefferson Studies, [www.monticello.org/site/research-and-collections/jeffersons-religious-beliefs](http://www.monticello.org/site/research-and-collections/jeffersons-religious-beliefs).

**It is not simply happenstance** On the significance of

dominant social identities, see Beverly Daniel Tatum, "The Complexity of Identity: Who am I?," in *Readings for Diversity and Social Justice*, 3rd ed., ed. Maurianne Adams, Warren J. Blumenfeld, Carmelita Castaneda, Heather W. Hackman, Madeline L. Peters, and Ximena Zuniga (New York: Routledge, 2013), 6–9.

American presidents and Christmas trees: This custom started in the nineteenth century. See "A Christmas Reversal," *New York Times*, December 25, 1994, [www.nytimes.com/1994/12/25/opinion/a-christmas-reversal.html](http://www.nytimes.com/1994/12/25/opinion/a-christmas-reversal.html).

Tillich quote: Tillich, *Theology of Culture*, 51, 53–67.

**For most of their history** On the idea of a cross-cultural spectrum, see Clifford Geertz, *Life Among the Anthros and Other Essays*, ed. Fred Inglis (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2012).

**This isolationist approach** This isolationism does not include two distinct ultra-Orthodox groups, Chabad and Aish Hatorah, whose primary purpose is to missionize non-Orthodox Jews and bring them into the ultra-Orthodox fold. See, e.g., Aaron Joshua Tapper, "The 'Cult' of Aish Hatorah: *Ba'alei Teshuva* and the New Religious Movement Phenomenon," *Jewish Journal of Sociology* 44, nos. 1–2 (2002): 5–29.

Difficulty of twenty-first-century isolationist groups not interacting with outsiders: Sima Zalberg Block, "Shouldering the Burden of Redemption: How the 'Fashion' of Wearing Capes Developed in Ultra-Orthodox Society," *NASHIM: A Journal of Jewish Women's Studies and Gender Issues* 22 (Fall 2011): 32–55; Heidi Campbell, "Religion and the Internet in the Israeli Orthodox Context," *Israel Affairs* 17, no. 3 (July 2011): 364–383; Yoel Finkelman, "Nostalgia, Inspiration, Ambivalence: Eastern Europe, Immigration, and the Construction of Collective Memory in Contemporary American Haredi Historiography," *Jewish History* 23, no. 1 (March 2009): 57–82; Emmanuel Sivan, "Enclave Culture," in *The Fundamentalism Project*, vol. 5: *Fundamentalisms Comprehended*, ed. Martin E. Marty and Scott R. Appleby (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995), 11–69.

**Of course, particular rituals** The application of the term *cross-fertilization* to this particular phenomenon was introduced to me by photographer Frédéric Brenner in a conversation in the summer of 2005. (See chapter 1.)

Overlap of specific rituals as assimilationist or isolationist: For example, J. W. Berry, "Acculturation: Living Successfully in Two Cultures," *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 29 (2005): 697–712; Colleen Ward, "Probing Identity, Integration, and Adaptation: Big Questions, Little Answers," *International Journal of Intercultural Relations* 37, no. 4 (July 2013): 391–404.

**Before continuing, we need to consider** Max Weinreich, "The Reality of Jewishness versus the Ghetto Myth: The Sociolinguistic Roots of Yiddish," in *Never Say Die! A Thousand Years of Yiddish in Jewish Life and Letters*, ed. Joshua A. Fishman (New York: Mouton Publishers, 1981), 110.

**Second, framing cultural practices** On the Star of David, see Gershom Scholem, "The Star of David: History of a Sym-

bol," in Scholem, *The Messianic Idea in Judaism and Other Essays on Jewish Spirituality* (New York: Schocken Books, 1995), 257–281.

Swastika: Horst Heidtmann, "Swastika," in *Encyclopedia of the Third Reich*, ed. Christian Zenter and Friedemann Bedürftig (New York: Macmillan, 1991), 937–939; Steven Heller, *The Swastika: Symbol Beyond Redemption?* (New York: Allworth Press, 2000); Malcolm Quinn, *The Swastika: Constructing the Symbol* (London: Routledge, 1994); "History of the Swastika," United States Holocaust Memorial Museum [www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007453](http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007453).

On how a single symbol can have multiple meanings: See Karen B. Stern, "Limitations of 'Jewish' as a Label in Roman North Africa," *Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic, and Roman Period* 39 (2008): 307–336.

**As the biblical prophets foretold** In the third book of the Torah, God tells Moses that the Israelites will be scattered all over the world (Lev. 26:33), an idea echoed by two of the biblical prophets, Isaiah and Ezekiel, who both use the phrase "to the four corners of the earth" (Isa. 11:12, Ezek. 7:2).

World population of Jews: On the number of countries in the world, see, e.g., [www.state.gov/s/inr/rls/4250.htm](http://www.state.gov/s/inr/rls/4250.htm) and [www.un.org/en/members](http://www.un.org/en/members). On the number of Jews in each country, see [http://bechollashon.org/img/charts/World\\_Pop\\_or.pdf](http://bechollashon.org/img/charts/World_Pop_or.pdf); <http://bechollashon.org/population/today.php>; [http://bechollashon.org/population/world\\_map.php](http://bechollashon.org/population/world_map.php).

"Jews are like everyone else, only more so": This quote has been attributed to the likes of Isaiah Berlin, Sigmund Freud, Heinrich Heine, Mark Twain, and Chaim Weitzman, among others. See, e.g., Elliot E. Cohen, ed., *Commentary on the American Scene: Portraits of Jewish Life in America* (New York: Aldred A. Knopf, 1953), xxii.

**In most twenty-first-century societies** Shaye J. D. Cohen, "'Anti-Semitism' in Antiquity: The Problem of Definition," in *History and Hate: The Dimensions of Anti-Semitism*, ed. David Berger (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 1986), 43–47, quoted in John J. Collins, *Jewish Cult and Hellenistic Culture: Essays on the Jewish Encounter with Hellenism and Roman Rule* (Boston: Brill, 2005), 16.

**A new chapter of intercultural integration** On Greco-Romans and Judeans, see Shaye J. D. Cohen, "Epigraphical Rabbis," *Jewish Quarterly Review* 72, no. 1 (1981): 1–17.

Greek coins and symbols: John Wilson Betlyon, "The Provincial Government or Persian Period Judea and the Yehud Coins," *Journal of Biblical Literature* 105, no. 4 (1986): 633–642.

**Some Judeans, referred to as Hellenists** On Hellenists identifying as Greek culturally but not ethnically or tribally, see Michael Edward Stone, *Scriptures, Sects, and Visions* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1980), 3.

Erich Gruen reference: Gruen adds that at the same time they were synthesizing Jewish and Greek culture, among Jews living in the Land of Israel there was also a "strong strain in Jewish literature [that] emphasized the differences in culture and behavior between the two peoples, categorizing the Greeks as aliens, inferiors, even savage antagonists

and barbarians" (Erich Gruen, "Jewish Perspectives on Greek Culture and Ethnicity," in *Hellenism in the Land of Israel*, ed. John J. Collins and G. E. Sterling [Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2001], 82, quoted in Collins, *Jewish Cult*, 5, 45–83).

Philo reference: Collins, *Jewish Cult*, 25.

**A number of examples reflect** Although the Torah may have been solidified by this time, it is unlikely that the Bible was; see James C. Vanderkam, *An Introduction to Early Judaism* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2001), 213–217. For more on the distinction between the Torah and Bible, see chapter 2. As to when the Torah was translated into Greek, see special topic 2.1.

Performing Jewish rituals in Greek: As Cohen remarks, "All the Jews of antiquity were 'hellenized' in some way" (Shaye J. D. Cohen, *From the Maccabees to the Mishnah* [Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1987], 40–41). As for the oft-cited prohibition that Jewish leaders imposed on the study of Greek texts, which is refuted by such scholars as Saul Lieberman, perhaps this directive emerged to support the historical construction of the Hasmonean attempt to keep the Jewish community "pure." See Saul Lieberman, *Hellenism in Jewish Palestine* (New York: Jewish Theological Seminary of America, 1950), 100–114. That said, prohibitions against idolatry, particularly forms that flourished in the Greek Jewish community, can be found in numerous places from this era; see, e.g., *ibid.*, 115–138.

Parallels between Jewish texts and Greek texts from this era: In addition, multiple textual dramas written by Jews from this period integrate Greek literary styles with biblical narratives, focusing on stories involving Joseph, Moses, and Kings David and Solomon, among others. Because they often address seeming ambiguities in the Bible, these texts can also be described as among the earliest forms of Midrash (see chapter 5). See Erich S. Gruen, "Hellenistic Judaism," in Biale (ed.), *Cultures of the Jews*, 1:77–132; *idem*, *Heritage and Hellenism: The Reinvention of Jewish Tradition* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998); *idem*, "Jewish Perspectives".

**Some Judean Hellenists** Judean Hasmoneans, also called Maccabees, regained control over the Temple in Jerusalem in 164 BCE from the Selucid Greeks. They created a small Maccabean state within the Selucid territory, but in 63 BCE the Romans conquered Judea, thus defeating them. See Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 14–15; see also chapter 8.

Intra-Judean violence: Some scholars cite this intra-Judean tension as the true impetus for the major revolt that eventually took place against the Greeks, rather than the oppression of Greek rule itself. See Stone, *Scriptures, Sects, and Visions*, 27–30; Vanderkam, *Introduction to Early Judaism*, 11–24.

Influence of Greeks on Jews, including Hasmoneans: Steven Fine, ed., *The Temple of Jerusalem: From Moses to the Messiah* (Boston: Brill, 2011).

**Perhaps to the Hasmoneans' chagrin** According to scholar Richard Kalmin, in contrast to the Babylonian rabbis, some Palestinian rabbis were comfortable with idolatry. One possible reason is that in Persia, unlike in Judah, idol worship

was uncommon, which allowed Babylonian rabbis to rail against such practices. (Others dispute this argument.) Kalmin also notes that Babylonian rabbis were somewhat indifferent toward the larger Jewish community, perhaps a reflection of how Persian non-Jewish authorities dealt with the masses. (Alternatively, perhaps this behavior had to do with Babylonian rabbis not having as much authority over their Jewish community as is commonly assumed.) Some of these rabbis openly embraced aspects of the larger non-Jewish Persian culture. For example, at least one third-century CE Babylonian rabbi was criticized by his colleagues for "putting on Persian airs." See Richard Kalmin, *Jewish Babylonia Between Persia and the Roman Empire* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006), 3–18.

Non-Jewish integration of Jewish practices: Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 55.

**Of course, it is difficult to distinguish** On the designation "Judean" rather than "Jewish," see Steve Mason, "Jews, Judaeans, Judaizing, Judaism: Problems of Categorization in Ancient History," *Journal for the Study of Judaism in the Persian, Hellenistic, and Roman Period* 38 (2007): 457–512.

**Unlike Babylonian- and Persian-based rabbis** Kalmin, *Jewish Babylonia*, 3–18.

**For centuries prior to their decimation** For a detailed list of Romanote Jewish American customs, including ones no longer practiced, see Richard Glaser, "The Greek Jews in Baltimore," *Jewish Social Studies* 38, nos. 3–4 (Summer/Fall 1976): 321–336.

**From at least the sixteenth century** On sixteenth-century Greek Jews, especially in Salonika, see Mark A. Epstein, *The Ottoman Jewish Communities and Their Role in the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries* (Freiburg, Ger.: Schwarz, 1980); Mark Mazower, *Salonika, City of Ghosts: Christians, Muslims, and Jews, 1430–1950* (London: Harper Collins, 2004); Anthony Molho, "The Jewish Community in Salonika: The End of a Long History," *Diaspora: A Journal of Transnational Studies* 1, no. 1 (Spring 1991): 100–122.

**As for Jews in Salonika today?** On Salonika Jews and World War II, see K. E. Fleming, "The Stereotyped 'Greek Jew' from Auschwitz-Birkenau to Israeli Popular Culture," *Journal of Modern Greek Studies* 25, no. 1 (2007): 17–40.

**Even before the Land of Israel** One could call the community at this time "Babylonian Judeans," perhaps a more accurate term for these proto-Jews in this specific time and place. Some argue that the Jews who remained in Judah called themselves the "Children of Israel," whereas those who were exiled went by "Judean" or "Israelite."

**The primary contemporary group** For centuries, the largest Jewish Syrian communities were in the country's most populated cities, Damascus and Aleppo, though smaller communities existed as far east as Qamishle, today on the border with Turkey. The contemporary Syrian Jewish community is primarily composed of three groups: those who claim a Syrian lineage going back to the days of the Babylonian Empire; those whose ancestors arrived during the fifteenth through



seventeenth centuries as a result of the Spanish and Portuguese Inquisitions (also known as Sephardi Jews); and those who identify as Kurds. As with Egyptian Jewry, there are also those who trace their families back to Jews who arrived in Syria from Italy or other European countries via trade opportunities.

**Origins of Syrian Jewish community:** Some Syrian Jews date their community back even further, to the era of King David. As for the Kurds, there is viable evidence from the biblical era that they arrived in Kurdistan during the Assyrian Exile in the eighth century BCE. According to a dominant oral tradition, they are one of the so-called Lost Tribes of Israel that was exiled during this time.

During the twentieth century most Syrian Jews immigrated to Israel and the United States (specifically New York City), where approximately 80,000 and 75,000, respectively, lived as of 2010. Others made it to European countries (especially England), as well as South America (Argentina, Brazil, and Chile) and Central America (Mexico and Panama). Of course, some Syrian Jews began immigrating to these places earlier than the last century, such as those who moved to Ottoman-controlled Palestine in the nineteenth century. Given the violence in Syria since 2011, it is likely that the number of Jews left in Syria is today less than fifty.

Like Iraqi Jews and others immigrating to Israel and the United States from Middle Eastern countries during the twentieth century, most Syrian Jews identified with a particular urban center, such as Damascus (*Shammi*) or Aleppo (*Halabi*). In Syrian-only contexts many still claim such connections, but when interacting with non-Syrians, especially in the United States, members of this Jewish community typically identify as Syrian more generally. An exception is Syrian Jews who relocated to Israel and Mexico in the 1950s and 1960s and have largely maintained the nuances of their families' geographic roots.

Some Jews immigrating to Israel from countries outside Syria, such as Turkey, also have identified as Halabi, which at this point is much more of a subcultural signifier than anything else. In Mexico City, Syrian Jews still identify as Shammi, Halabi, or Sephardi. Outside Israel, where it is not uncommon for Syrian Jews to marry non-Syrian Jews, Syrian Jews marry "in" more so than other Jewish subcommunities. To this day there are a number of prayer melodies particular to the Syrian Jewish community, many of which reflect dominant Arabic musical trends from when the community lived in Syria.

See Alan Appelbaum, "The Rabbis and Palmyra: A Case Study on (Mis-)Reading Rabbis for Historical Purposes," *Jewish Quarterly Review* 101, no. 4 (Fall 2011): 527–544; Evelyn Dean-Olmsted, "Shamis, Halebis and Shajatos: Labels and the Dynamics of Syrian Jewishness in Mexico City," *Language and Communication* 31 (2011): 130–140; Herbert C. Dobrinsky, *A Treasury of Sephardic Laws and Customs: The Ritual Practices of Syrian, Moroccan, Judeo-Spanish and Spanish and Portuguese Jews of North America* (New York: Yeshiva University Press, 1988); Yaron Harel, "The First Jews from Aleppo in Manches-

ter: New Documentary Evidence," *AJS Review* 23, no. 2 (1998): 191–202; Mark L. Kligman, *Maqam and Liturgy: Ritual, Music, and Aesthetics of Syrian Jews in Brooklyn* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2009); Walter P. Zenner, "The Ethnography of Diaspora: Studying Syrian Jewry," 1997 Sklare Memorial Lecture, Association for the Social Scientific Study of Jewry, *Contemporary Jewry* 19, no. 1 (January 1998): 151–174; idem, *A Global Community: The Jews from Aleppo, Syria* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2000); idem, *Syrian Jewish Identification in Israel* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1965); Yael Zerubavel and Dianne Esses, "Reconstructions of the Past: Syrian Jewish Women and the Maintenance of Tradition," *Journal of American Folklore* 100, no. 398 (Oct.–Dec. 1987): 528–539.

**Despite this variety** On Iraqi Jews as Arab Jews, see Yehouda Shenhav and Hannah Hever, "'Arab Jews' after Structuralism: Zionist Discourse and the (De)Formation of an Ethnic Identity," *Social Identities* 18, no. 1 (January 2012): 101–118. See also chapters 1 and 10.

**One member of the larger Arab Jewish community** Albert Memmi, *Jews and Arabs*, trans. Eleanor Levieux (Chicago: J. Philip O'Hara, 1975), 29, quoted in Shenhav and Hever, "'Arab Jews,'" 103. While Memmi might describe his identity differently today, this does not change how he understood his identity at this earlier stage of his life.

Sami Michael quote: From Reuven Snir, *Arabness, Jewishness, Zionism: A Struggle of Identities in the Literature of Iraqi Jews* (Jerusalem: Ben Zvi Institute, 2005), 46, quoted in Shenhav and Hever, "'Arab Jews,'" 104.

**Prior to immigrating to Israel** On Abdallah Somekh, see "Baghdad, Iraq," *Encyclopedia Judaica* (2008) available at [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/judaica/lejuda\\_0002\\_0003\\_o\\_01872.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/judaica/lejuda_0002_0003_o_01872.html).

Salah and Daud Al-Kweiti: Gilli Gaon, *Iraq N-Roll* (2011) [film]; "From Baghdad to Tel Aviv and Back: An Israeli Star Digs into His Grandfather's Music," *Vox Tablet*, March 11, 2014, <http://tabletmag.com/podcasts/165416/song-writer-dudu-tassa>.

**The food of Iraqi Jews** Rivka Goldman, *Mama Nazima's Jewish-Iraqi Cuisine* (New York: Hippocrene Books, 2006), 7–14.

**In Iraq, they also adopted non-Jewish norms** Shaul Sehayik, "Changes in the Status of Urban Jewish Women in Iraq at the End of the Nineteenth Century" (1988) [Hebrew], in Naomi Gale, "Iraqi Jewish Women," *Jewish Women's Archive*, <http://jwa.org/encyclopedia/article/iraqi-jewish-women>.

**During the 1940s** As of February 2003, it was estimated that out of a worldwide population of 250,000 Iraqi Jews, fewer than one hundred were still living in Iraq. Over the last century most have migrated to Israel, while about 45,000 live in London, England, and 10,000 in Los Angeles. See Rachel Pomerance, "Iraq Home to Glorious Jewish Past but Lonely and Fragile Present," *Jewish Telegraphic Agency*, February 10, 2003, [www.jta.org/2003/02/10/archive/crisis-in-iraq-iraq](http://www.jta.org/2003/02/10/archive/crisis-in-iraq-iraq)

-home-to-glorious-jewish-past-but-to-a-lonely-and-fragile-present. Given the violence in Iraq since 2002, it is likely that this number has shrunk even more.

Operation Ezra and Nehemiah: See “Immigration to Israel: Operation Ezra and Nehemiah—The Airlift of Iraqi Jews (1951–1952),” [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsourc/Immigration/ezra.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsourc/Immigration/ezra.html).

Fewer than 10: David Van Biema, “The Last Jews of Baghdad,” *Time*, July 27, 2007, <http://content.time.com/time/world/article/0,8599,1647740,00.html>.

**Ironically, the process of assimilating** The final Middle Eastern area where Jews lived prior to 1948 who could be added to this group are, of course, those Jews who were present in Ottoman-controlled and British-occupied Palestine. See chapter 10.

Population of Middle Eastern Jews not living in Israel: See, e.g., Norman A. Stillman, *The Jews of Arab Lands: A History and Source Book* (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America Press, 1979); idem, *The Jews of Arab Lands in Modern Times* (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America Press, 1991).

Population of Middle Eastern Jews today: See Notes, chapter 7, “Whether going back millennia.”

**The roles of women also changed** See, e.g., Sammy Smooha, *Israel: Pluralism and Conflict* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978), 183–233.

**Another difference is** Samir Naqqash is quoted in Reuven Snir, “‘Arabs of the Mosaic Faith’: Chronicle of a Cultural Extinction Foretold,” *Die Welt des Islams* 46, no. 1 (2006): 43.

**Another reason for negative feelings** On Iraqi Jewish immigration to Israel, see Haya Gavish, *Unwitting Zionists: The Jewish Community of Zakho in Iraqi Kurdistan* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 2010).

For more on these bombings, see Ian Black and Benny Morris, *Israel's Secret Wars: A History of Israel's Intelligence Services* (New York: Grove Press, 1992); Moshe Gat, *The Jewish Exodus from Iraq, 1948–1951* (Portland, OR: Frank Cass & Co., 1997); Naeim Giladi, *Ben Gurion's Scandals: How the Haganah and the Mossad Eliminated Jews* (Occidental, CA: Dandelion Enterprises, 2006); Devorah Hachohen, *Immigrants in Turmoil: Mass Immigration to Israel and Its Repercussions in the 1950s and After*, trans. Gila Brand (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2003); Esther Meir-Glitzenstein, “Iraqi Jews in Israel: From ‘Refugees’ to ‘Zionists’ and Back Again,” in *Population Resettlement in International Conflicts: A Comparative Study*, ed. Ariel M. Kacowicz and Pawel Lutomski (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2007), 115–134; Tom Segev, “Now It Can Be Told,” *Haaretz*, April 6, 2006, [www.haaretz.com/now-it-can-be-told-1.184724](http://www.haaretz.com/now-it-can-be-told-1.184724); idem, *1949: The First Israelis*, trans. Arlen N. Weinstein (New York: Owl Books, 1998).

Other reasons for dissatisfaction with their new home are touched on in chapters 1, 9, and 10.

**Kurdistan today encompasses** On Seharane, see Lazar Berman, “Cultural Pride, and Unlikely Guests, at Kurdish Jewish Festival,” *Times of Israel*, September 30, 2013, [www.timesofisrael.com/pride-and-unlikely-guests-at-kurdish-jewish-festival](http://www.timesofisrael.com/pride-and-unlikely-guests-at-kurdish-jewish-festival);

[www.timesofisrael.com/pride-and-unlikely-guests-at-kurdish-jewish-festival](http://www.timesofisrael.com/pride-and-unlikely-guests-at-kurdish-jewish-festival); Jewish Agency for Israel, “The Seharane,” [www.jewishagency.org/holidays-and-memorial-days/content/23863](http://www.jewishagency.org/holidays-and-memorial-days/content/23863).

**Although there have been Kurdish Jews** On Kurdish Jews in Israel, see, e.g., Berman, “Cultural Pride”; Jerusalem Center for Jewish-Christian Relations, “Kurdish Jewish Community,” [www.jcjr.org/kurdish-jewish-community](http://www.jcjr.org/kurdish-jewish-community); Lokman I. Meho, “The Kurds and Kurdistan: A General Background,” in *Kurdish Culture and Society: An Annotated Bibliography*, comp. Lokman I. Meho and Kelly Maglaughlin (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 2001), 3–25; Yona Sabar, “Jews of Kurdistan,” in *Encyclopedia of World Cultures*, vol. 9: *Africa and the Middle East*, ed. John Middleton and Amal Rassam (Boston: G. K. Hall, 1995), 144–147.

**In general, Kurdish Jews** On Seharane, see Berman, “Cultural Pride”; Jewish Agency for Israel, “The Seharane.” See also Erich Brauer, *The Jews of Kurdistan: An Ethnological Study*, ed. Raphael Patai (Detroit: Wayne University Press, 1993); Naomi Gale, “Kurdish Women,” *Jewish Women's Archive*, <http://jwa.org/encyclopedia/article/kurdish-women>; Mehrdad R. Izady, *A Concise Handbook: The Kurds* (Cambridge, MA: Taylor & Francis, 1992); Mordechai Yona, *Kurdish Jewish Encyclopedia*, vols. 1 and 2 (Miami: University of Miami Press, 2003).

Returning to Kurdistan: See, e.g., Ivan Watson, “Iraq’s Kurdish Jews Cautiously Return to Homeland,” National Public Radio, December 8, 2007, available at [www.institutkurde.org/en/info/iraq-s-kurdish-jews-cautiously-return-to-homeland-1197280259.html](http://www.institutkurde.org/en/info/iraq-s-kurdish-jews-cautiously-return-to-homeland-1197280259.html).

**Instances of this cultural synthesis** For more on Persian Jews, see Agence France-Presse, “Iran Young, Urbanized, and Educated: Census,” *The National*, July 29, 2012, [www.thenational.ae/news/world/middle-east/iran-is-young-urbanised-and-educated-census](http://www.thenational.ae/news/world/middle-east/iran-is-young-urbanised-and-educated-census); Arlene Dallal, “Negotiated Allegiances: Contemporary Iranian Jewish Identities,” *Comparative Studies of South Asia, Africa, and the Middle East* 20, no. 2 (2010): 272–296; Yaakov Elman, “Acculturation to Elite Persian Norms and Modes of Thought in the Babylonian Jewish Community of Late Antiquity,” in *Netivot LeDavid: Jubilee Volume for David Weiss Halivni*, ed. Yaakov Elman, Ephraim Halivni, and Zvi Steinfeld (Jerusalem: Orhot Press, 2004), 31–56; idem, “Middle Persian Culture and Babylonian Sages: Accommodation and Resistance in the Shaping of Rabbinic Legal Tradition,” in *The Cambridge Companion to the Talmud and Rabbinic Literature*, ed. Charlotte E. Fonrobert and Martin S. Jaffee (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007); Isaiah Gafni, “Babylonian Rabbinic Culture,” in Biale (ed.), *Cultures of the Jews*, 1:223–265; Mark W. Hamilton, “Who Was the Jew? Jewish Ethnicity during the Achaemenid Period,” *Restoration Quarterly* 37, no. 5 (1995): 102–117; Eric M. Meyers, “Jewish Culture in Greco-Roman Palestine,” in Biale (ed.), *Cultures of the Jews*, 1:135–179; Haggai Ram, “Caught Between Orientalism and Aryanism, Exile and Homeland: The Jews of Iran in Zionist/Israeli Imagination,” *HAGAR Studies in Culture, Polity, and Identities* 8, no. 1 (2008): 83–108; Shai

Secunda, "Reading the Bavli in Iran," *Jewish Quarterly Review* 100, no. 2 (Spring 2010): 310–342; Shaul Shaked, "Iranian Influence on Judaism: First Century B.C.E. to Second Century C.E.," in *The Cambridge History of Judaism: Introduction to the Persian Period*, vol. 1, ed. W.D. Davies and Louis Finkelstein (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984); Saba Soomekh, *From the Shahs to Los Angeles: Three Generations of Iranian Jewish Women between Religion and Culture* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2012); Nurit Yaffe, "Population," *StatistiLite* 15 (State of Israel Central Bureau of Statistics, 2000), available at [www.middle-east-info.org/league/israel/israelpopulation.pdf](http://www.middle-east-info.org/league/israel/israelpopulation.pdf).

Jews (or Judeans) becoming Persian Jews: Interestingly, the main evidence we have of the sixth-century BCE Jewish community living under Persians—specifically after those in the Babylonian Jewish community decided to return to Judah (once given permission)—is anti-assimilationist and not integrationist. In fact, aside from the Torah's directives against marrying into particular non-Hebrew and non-Israelite groups, the first evidence of a prohibition against proto-Jews marrying outside their community is in the biblical books of Ezra and Nehemiah, which describe events alleged to have taken place during the fifth century BCE (but only among those living in Judah).

Ezra and Nehemiah were concerned about Judean cultural purity. For example, Ezra firmly opposed intermarriage. Indeed, his first action upon returning to Judah was the dramatic step of engaging in mourning rituals (i.e., tearing his clothes and wearing a sackcloth) because some of the Judeans who stayed had intermarried. He called for the expulsion of all non-Jewish wives and their children. Though one of the biblical directives prohibited intermarrying with specific communities, it did not say that the punishment was exile. (Based on this decree, some scholars have theorized that Ezra is responsible for the shift in Jewish identity from patrilineal to matrilineal descent.)

Because of such severe edicts, some speculate that one of the major issues for Babylonian and Persian Jews was assimilation, not integration. In the words of scholar Philip Esler, "Ezra's attitude reflects a concern that a symbolical boundary between Israel and other ethnic groups had been breached in a manner which threatened his people's very identity" (Philip F. Esler, "Ezra-Nehemiah as a Narrative of [Re-Invented] Israelite Identity," *Biblical Interpretation* 11, nos. 3–4 [2003]: 421).

Others argue that Ezra and Nehemiah made these firm demands under pressure from the Persian Empire, which wanted there to be clear demarcations in the Land of Israel between Judeans and non-Judeans. (It is also worth noting that given the Babylonian Exile and, for some, the return to Judah, the expulsion of non-Judean wives along with their children was yet another exile, this time imposed from within.) According to the Bible, Ezra also reestablished what he considered to be authentic Judean cultural practices, some of which were actually more rigorous than those outlined in the Torah, such as practices of public Torah readings and

strict observance of the Sabbath. He also declared that the Temple needed to be rebuilt. See Esler, "Ezra-Nehemiah," 413–426.

Scroll of Esther and the Bible: It was also during the sixth through fourth centuries BCE that the Bible began to be edited, including some of the books compiled in the Prophets and Writings (chapter 2). Many of these texts echo themes of sadness, longing, and hopelessness. Some of the prophets, such as Jeremiah, are particularly critical of Jerusalemite prophets, which might reflect another intra-Judean struggle over authority and power.

Esther's potential Judean, and not Persian, origins: Elsie R. Stern, "Esther and the Politics of Diaspora," *Jewish Quarterly Review* 100, no. 1 (Winter 2010): 25–53.

**While it is difficult to pinpoint** For more on Zoroastrian influences on Persian Jewry, see James Barr, "The Question of Religious Influence: The Case of Zoroastrianism, Judaism, and Christianity," *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 53, no. 2 (1985): 201–235; Elman, "Acculturation"; Saba Soomekh, "Iranian Jewish Women: Domesticating Religion and Appropriating Zoroastrian Religion in Ritual Life," *Nashim: A Journal of Jewish Women's Studies and Gender Issues* 18 (October 1, 2009): 13–38.

**An annual holiday than often overlaps** Saba Soomekh, email with author, September 13, 2013; Soomekh, *From the Shahs to Los Angeles*, 40.

**According to scholar Saba Soomekh** Saba Soomekh, email with author, September 13, 2013.

King Cyrus's treatment of Jews: See Notes, chapter 3, "A little less than fifty years after."

**As for esphand** Soomekh, email with author, September 13, 2013

**The largest waves of Persian Jews** On Persian Jewish population and identity, see Agence France-Presse, "Iran Young"; Yaakov Lappin, "Why Are People Going to Iran?," *Jerusalem Post*, February 12, 2010, [www.jpost.com/Iranian-Threat/News/Why-are-people-going-to-Iran](http://www.jpost.com/Iranian-Threat/News/Why-are-people-going-to-Iran); Soomekh, *From the Shahs to Los Angeles*; "Statistical Abstract of Israel: Immigrants, by Period of Immigration, Country of Birth and Last Country of Residence," *CBS. Statistical Abstract of Israel* 4, no. 4 (2010): 233–234, available at [www1.cbs.gov.il/reader/shnaton/templ\\_shnaton\\_e.html?num\\_tab=sto4\\_04&CYear=2010](http://www1.cbs.gov.il/reader/shnaton/templ_shnaton_e.html?num_tab=sto4_04&CYear=2010); Yaffe, "Population." Given that in 1979 only 10,000 to 15,000 Iranian Jews immigrated to Israel, whereas 35,000 to 40,000 moved to the United States, the population figure of 250,000 doesn't seem to be accurate; see Ram, "Caught between Orientalism."

**As with all communities, there continue** On intra-Jewish Persian distinctions, see Dallal, "Negotiated Allegiances," 272–296; Houman M. Sarshar, ed., *Jewish Communities of Iran, Entries on Judeo-Persian Communities Published by the Encyclopedia Iranica* (New York: Encyclopedia Iranica Foundation, 2011), 155–156, 187–241.

**A number of today's Jewish communities** It is not



uncommon to see other groups of Jews, such as those from Kurdistan, also referred to as “Mountain Jews.”

**Afghani Jews, Bukharan Jews, and Kazakhstani Jews:** Alanna E. Cooper, *Bukharan Jews and the Dynamics of Global Judaism* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2012); Morag et al. (eds.), *Studies in Judaism and Islam*.

**Other Jewish communities:** Morag et al. (eds.), *Studies in Judaism and Islam*; Yosef Tobi, “Challenges to Tradition: Jewish Cultures in Yemen, Iraq, Iran, Afghanistan, and Bukhara,” in *Cultures of the Jews*, vol. 3: *Modern Encounters*, ed. David Biale (New York: Schocken Books, 2002), 211–252.

**Islam first emerged** On Jews in eighth-century Arabia, see Firestone, “Jewish Culture”; Charles Cutler Torrey, *The Jewish Foundation of Islam* (New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1967).

**Within a few generations** Douglass, *Rise and Spread of Islam*; Esposito, *Oxford History of Islam*; Firestone, “Jewish Culture”; Jenkins, *Muslim Diaspora*; Kennedy, *Great Arab Conquests*; Lyons, *House of Wisdom*; Morag et al. (eds.), *Studies in Judaism and Islam*.

**For example, they had to pay** On *dhimmi*, see Mark R. Cohen, *Under Crescent and Cross: The Jews in the Middle Ages* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1994); S. D. Goiten, *Jews and Arabs: A Concise History of their Social and Cultural Relations* (Mineola, NY: Dover, 2005); Gianstefano C. Martin, *The Dhimmi Narrative: A Comparison between the Historical and the Actual in the Context of Christian-Muslim Relations in Modern Egypt* (Amazon Digital Services, Inc., 2012); Stillman, *Jews of Arab Lands*; idem, *Jews of Arab Lands in Modern Times*; Bat Ye’or, *The Dhimmi: Jews and Christians under Islam*, trans. David Maisel, Paul Fenton, and David Littman (Teaneck, NJ: Farleigh Dickinson University Press, 1985).

**But as with most generalizations** Scholar Bat Ye’or argues that there was one primary difference between the contexts of living under Christians versus living under Muslims: “During the first two centuries of the [Muslim Arab] conquest—and certainly at the outset—the Arabs were themselves a minority. In order to impose their laws, their language, and their foreign culture on ancient civilizations [outside Arabia], they had to proceed with caution. . . . The *dhimma* prepared the way for Arab colonization in the political, economic, religious, and cultural sectors. The divine rights of conquest transformed the foreign lands into ‘Arab territories,’ while Arabization reinforced the military conquests” (Ye’or, *Dhimmi*, 67–68).

**Some Yemenite Jews** Origins of Yemenite Jewish community: According to documents from the Cairo Genizah [a *genizah* is a bin or room where Jews store sacred texts and objects rather than throw them out], among other places, Jews may have been in Yemen since the sixth century BCE. There is also evidence that in the period 517–525 CE Yemenite Jews had their own kingdom under the authority of the last of the Himyar kings, Yusuf Dhu Nawas. Other sources suggest that a Jewish presence in this area goes back as far as King David. Though researchers often cite all of these traditional

narratives, scholar Reuben Aharoni maintains that the “earliest credible historical evidence” of their presence in Yemen is found in a passage from one of the books of Josephus, written during the first century CE. See Reuben Aharoni, *Yemenite Jewry: Origins, Culture, and Literature* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1986), 20–37, 42–48; Nathan Katz, Ranabir Chakravarti, Braj M. Sinha, and Shalva Weil, eds., *Indo-Judaic Studies in the Twenty-First Century: A View from the Margin* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007), 53.

**Halakhic basis for eating locusts:** Though generally permitted, and explicitly referred to in the Torah (Lev. 11:21–22), some halakhic authorities prohibit the eating of locusts. See Jack Abramowitz, “Knee-High to a Grasshopper: The Obligation to Examine Locusts for Signs of Being Kosher,” *Orthodox Union*, [www.ou.org/torah/mitzvot/taryag/mitzvah158/#.Us8d%20zfQouZ5gf](http://www.ou.org/torah/mitzvot/taryag/mitzvah158/#.Us8d%20zfQouZ5gf).

**One of the worst periods** On the seventeenth-century exile, see Reuben Aharoni, *The Jews of the British Crown Colony of Aden* (New York: E.J. Brill, 1994); idem, *Yemenite Jewry*; Stillman, *Jews of Arab Lands*, 233–258; idem, *Jews of Arab Lands in Modern Times*, 156–158, 225–226, 236–239, 294–299, 517–522.

**Second, prior to the mid-twentieth century** Quote about Yemenite Jewish heterogeneity: Aharoni, *Yemenite Jewry*, 15–16.

**As for their lives outside of Yemen** On Yemenite Jews in Ottoman-controlled and British-occupied Palestine, see Yoav Peled, “Inter-Jewish Challenges to Israeli Identity,” *Palestine-Israel Journal* 8, no. 4 (2001) and 9, no. 1 (2002): 15; see also 12–23.

**During the 1950s** For the reasons Yemenite Jews immigrated to Ottoman-controlled Palestine in 1882, see Reeva Spector Simon, Michael Menachem Laskier, and Sara Reguer, eds., *The Jews of the Middle East and North Africa in Modern Times* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003), 406, in P. Ram, *Life in Yemen: Yemen History and Culture* (AnVi Open-Source Knowledge Trust, 2015), 393.

**By 1940 the community** Yemenite Jewish population figures are from Associated Press, “Israel: 17 Yemeni Jews Find Shelter,” *New York Times*, August 15, 2013, [www.nytimes.com/2013/08/16/world/middleeast/israel-17-yemeni-jews-find-shelter.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2013/08/16/world/middleeast/israel-17-yemeni-jews-find-shelter.html); Jewish Telegraphic Agency, “Yemeni Jews Secretly Airlifted to Israel,” August 14, 2013, [www.jta.org/2013/08/14/news-opinion/israel-middle-east/17-yemeni-jews-airlifted-to-israel-in-covert-operation](http://www.jta.org/2013/08/14/news-opinion/israel-middle-east/17-yemeni-jews-airlifted-to-israel-in-covert-operation); Gershon Shafir, *Land, Labor, and the Origins of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict, 1882–1914* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996), 91–122; Gabriella Tzvia Weiniger, “17 Yemenite Jews Brought to Israel in Covert Operation,” *Jerusalem Post*, August 14, 2013, [www.jpost.com/Jewish-World/Jewish-News/Operation-Magic-Carpet-Part-II-Yemenite-Jews-arrive-in-Israel-323083](http://www.jpost.com/Jewish-World/Jewish-News/Operation-Magic-Carpet-Part-II-Yemenite-Jews-arrive-in-Israel-323083); Yaffe, “Population.”

**According to this claim** On the taking away of possessions, see Shoshana Madmoni-Gerber, *Israeli Media and the*

*Framing of Internal Conflict: The Yemenite Babies Affair* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 37.

Transit camps and abuse: Ruth Blau, *Les gardiens de la cité: Histoire d'une guerre sainte* (Paris: Flammarion, 1978), 271, quoted in Yakov M. Rabkin, *A Threat from Within: A Century of Jewish Opposition to Zionism*, trans. Fred A. Reed (Winnipeg: Fernwood Publishing, 2006), 43 (see also 43–45); Zvi Zamaret, *The Melting Pot in Israel: The Commission of Inquiry Concerning Education in the Immigrant Camps during the Early Years of the State* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2002). See also chapter 10.

“Yemenite Babies Affair”: Joel Greenberg, “The Babies from Yemen: An Enduring Mystery,” *New York Times*, September 2, 1997, [www.nytimes.com/1997/09/02/world/the-babies-from-yemen-an-enduring-mystery.html](http://www.nytimes.com/1997/09/02/world/the-babies-from-yemen-an-enduring-mystery.html); Claris Harbon, “Revealing the Past—Breaking with Silence: The Yemenite Babies Affair and the Israeli Media (Review Article),” *Holy Land Studies* 10, no. 2 (2011): 229–248; Sarah Helm, “Yemeni Jews Describe Their Holocaust,” *The Independent*, April 17, 1994, [www.independent.co.uk/news/world/yemeni-jews-describe-their-holocaust-sarah-helm-in-yehud-reports-on-claims-that-israelis-stole-4500-children-from-immigrants-1370515.html](http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/yemeni-jews-describe-their-holocaust-sarah-helm-in-yehud-reports-on-claims-that-israelis-stole-4500-children-from-immigrants-1370515.html); Meira Weiss, “The Children of Yemen: Bodies, Medicalization, and Nation-Building,” *Medical Anthropology Quarterly* 15, no. 2 (2001): 206–221; idem, *The Chosen Body: The Politics of the Body in Israeli Society* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2004), 62–63; idem, “The Immigrating Body and the Body Politic: The ‘Yemenite Children Affair’ and Body Commodification in Israel,” in *Commodifying Bodies*, ed. Nancy Scheper-Hughes and Loïc Wacquant (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2002), 93–110; “Yemenite Children Affair: Families of the Kidnapped Speak Out,” trans. Maayan Goldman, *+972 Magazine*, January 17, 2015, <http://972mag.com/yemenite-children-affair-families-of-the-kidnapped-speak-out/101166/>.

**Since that time** On Yemenite babies being handed over to Ashkenazi families, see Madmoni-Gerber, *Israeli Media*, 1–2.

Experiments conducted on Yemenite babies: Weiss, “Immigrating Body,” 100.

State-appointed commissions: Critics of these inquiries, such as scholar Shoshana Madmoni-Gerber, argue that the first two had “no subpoena power and no intention to investigate,” and all three “were exceptional only in how slowly they worked and how little new information they could discover” (Madmoni-Gerber, “The Yemenite Babies Affair: What if This Was Your Child?,” *+972 Magazine*, July 12, 2013, [http://972mag.com/the-yemenite-baby-affair-what-if-this-was-your-child/75672/#\\_edn1](http://972mag.com/the-yemenite-baby-affair-what-if-this-was-your-child/75672/#_edn1)).

Marginalization of this episode in teaching Jewish history: Madmoni-Gerber, *Israeli Media*, 125.

**Although some date this community** For more on Egyptian Jews, see Michèle Baussant, “Heritage and Memory: The Example of the Egyptian Jewish Association,” *International Social Science Journal* 63, nos. 203–204 (March–June 2011): 45–56; Joel Beinin, *Dispersion of Egyptian Jewry: Culture, Politics, and the Formation of a Modern Diaspora* (Berkeley: University

of California Press, 1998); Emily Benichou Gottreich, “Historicizing the Concept of Arab Jews in the *Maghreb*,” *Jewish Quarterly Review* 9, no. 4 (Fall 2008): 433–451; Jacob M. Landau, *Jews in Nineteenth-Century Egypt* (New York: New York University Press, 1969); Lital Levy, “Historicizing the Concept of Arab Jews in the *Mashriq*,” *Jewish Quarterly Review* 98, no. 4 (Fall 2008): 452–469; Snir, “‘Arabs of the Mosaic Faith,’” 51; idem, “Jewishness, Arabness, and Egyptianness: The Participation of Egyptian Jews in Arabic Press and Journalism during the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries,” *Australian Journal of Jewish Studies* 20 (2006): 199–238.

**Within these groups** Snir, “Jewishness, Arabness, and Egyptianness,” 203–206.

**As in Iraq, Jews played** Yaqub Sanu and Esther Lazari-Moyal: See Snir, “Jewishness, Arabness, and Egyptianness,” 215–216. Born in Beirut, Lazari-Moyal spent the first twenty-five years of her life in Lebanon. Thus, some Lebanese Jews also claim her as “one of their own.”

**All of these differences** Beinin, *Dispersion of Egyptian Jewry*; Gottreich, “Historicizing the Concept”; Landau, *Jews in Nineteenth-Century Egypt*; Levy, “Historicizing the Concept of Arab Jews”; Snir, “Arabs of the Mosaic”; idem, “Jewishness, Arabness, and Egyptianness.”

**There were two major migration waves** Beinin, *Dispersion of Egyptian Jewry*; Gottreich, “Historicizing the Concept”; Landau, *Jews in Nineteenth-Century Egypt*; Levy, “Historicizing the Concept of Arab Jews”; Snir, “Arabs of the Mosaic”; idem, “Jewishness, Arabness and Egyptianness.”

**The Roman Empire** On the illegality of studying Mishnah, see Oded Irshai, “Confronting a Christian Empire: Jewish Culture in the World of Byzantium,” in Biale (ed.), *Cultures of the Jews*, 1:181–221; Kalmin, *Jewish Babylonia*.

**Contemporary Jews and non-Jews** For more on Ethiopian Jews, see Michael Corinaldi, *Jewish Identity: The Case of Ethiopian Jewry* (Jerusalem: Magnus Press, 1998); Tudor Parfitt and Emanuela Trevisan Semi, eds., *The Jews of Ethiopia: The Birth of an Elite* (New York: Routledge, 2005); Hagar Salamon, “Blackness in Transition: Decoding Racial Constructs through Stories of Ethiopian Jews,” *Journal of Folklore Research* 40, no. 1 (2003): 3–32; idem, *The Hyena People: Ethiopian Jews in Christian Ethiopia* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1999); idem, “Religious Interplay on an African Stage: Ethiopian Jews in Christian Europe,” in Biale (ed.), *Cultures of the Jews*, 3:255–286.

**Most maintain that Ethiopian Jews** Ruling as to Ethiopian Jewishness by Israeli rabbinic leaders: Anamaria-Helvia Roman, “The Story behind the Secret Operations Regarding Ethiopian Jews,” *Scientific Journal of Humanistic Studies* 3, no. 4 (March 2011): 164–167; Hagar Salamon, “Ethiopian Jewry and New Self-Concepts,” in *The Life of Judaism*, ed. Harvey E. Goldberg (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001), 227–240; idem, “Religious Interplay on an African Stage,” 278. For more on Ashkenazi hegemony, see chapters 1 and 10.

**In 1984, following reports** For more on Ethiopian Jews

being airlifted to the State of Israel between 1984 and 1991, see Mitchell G. Bard, *From Tragedy to Triumph: The Politics behind the Rescue of Ethiopian Jewry* (Westport, CT: Praeger, 2002); Mitchell Bard and Howard Lenhoff, "Ethiopian Jewry: American's Role in the Rescue of Ethiopia Jewry," *The Humanist*, Nov.–Dec. 1987, available at [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/Judaism/ejus.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/Judaism/ejus.html); Corinaldi, *Jewish Identity*; Roman, "Story behind the Secret Operations."

Ethiopian Jewish population: "The Ethiopian Community in Israel," *Central Bureau of Statistics*, State of Israel, November 12, 2012, [www.cbs.gov.il/reader/newhodaot/hodaa\\_template\\_eng.html?hodaa=201211307](http://www.cbs.gov.il/reader/newhodaot/hodaa_template_eng.html?hodaa=201211307).

**Most research attempting** Demarcations between Ethiopian Jews and Ethiopian Christians: Salamon, "Religious Interplay."

Prohibitions of Ethiopian Jews owning land in Ethiopia: Countless countries have historical instances of denying minorities the right to own property, including the United States. Though de jure things have changed in America, in practice they have not. See, e.g., Margalynne Armstrong, "African Americans and Property Ownership: Creating Our Own Meanings, Redefining Our Relationships," *Berkeley Journal of African-American Law and Policy* 1, no. 1 (1994); Society of American Law Teachers and Golden Gate University School of Law, eds., *Vulnerable Populations and Transformative Law Teaching: A Critical Reader* (Durham, NC: Carolina Academic Press, 2011).

**Although Ethiopian Jews had other laws separating them** On the notion that Ethiopian Jews did not look different from their non-Jewish neighbors, see Steven Kaplan, "Can the Ethiopian Change His Skin? The Beta Israel (Ethiopian Jews) and Racial Discourse," *African Affairs* 98 (1999): 544–547.

**In Ethiopia, these people were accepted** After much protest, the requirement that Ethiopian Jews go through a ritual conversion upon reaching Israel was altered somewhat to apply only to those Ethiopians trying to get married. See Salamon, "Ethiopian Jewry," 232–233.

**Some Ethiopian Jews immigrating to Israel** For more on this virtually unknown phenomenon, see Salamon, "Blackness in Transition"; idem, *The Hyena People*; idem, "Reflections of Ethiopian Cultural Patterns on the 'Beta Israel' Absorption in Israel: The 'Barya' Case," in *Between Africa and Zion: Proceedings of the First Conference on Ethiopian Jewry*, ed. Steven Kaplan, Tudor Parfitt, and Emanuela Trevisan Semi (Jerusalem: Ben-Zvi, 1995), 126–132; idem, "Slavery among the Beta Israel in Ethiopia: Religious Dimensions of Intergroup Perceptions," *Slavery and Abolition* 15, no. 1 (1994): 72–88.

**In Israel, Ethiopian Jews of all stripes** "Reddish-brown" rather than black skin: Haim Rosen, "Working as a Government Anthropologist among Ethiopian Jews in Israel," *Israel Social Science Research* 10, no. 2 (1995): 59–61, in Steve Kaplan and Hagar Salamon, "Ethiopian Immigrants in Israel: Experience and Prospects," *Institute for Jewish Policy Research Report*

1 (1998): 20; Salamon, "Reflections of Ethiopian Cultural Patterns," in Kaplan et al. (eds.), *Between Africa and Zion*, 126–130.

**Conversion aside, two infamous examples** For background on these two incidents, as well as other instances of like-minded structural racism against Ethiopian Israeli Jews, see Uri Ben-Eliezer, "Multi-cultural Society and Everyday Cultural Racism: Second Generation of Ethiopian Jews in Israel's 'Crisis of Modernization,'" *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 31, no. 5 (July 2008): 935–961; Hanan Chehata, "Israel: Promised Land for Jews . . . as Long as They're Not Black?," *Race Class* 53, no. 4 (2012): 67–77; Nicole Fox, "Exodus of the Ethiopian Jews: The Historical Movement and Development of Racial Constructs in Israel," in *The Dispersion of African and African Culture throughout the World*, ed. Lois Merriweather Moore (Lewiston, NY: Edwin Mellen Press, 2007), 45–62; Jewish Telegraphic Agency, "Ethiopian Israelis Demonstrate against Discrimination," *Jewish Journal*, January 11, 2012, [www.jewishjournal.com/israel/article/ethiopian\\_israelis\\_demonstrate\\_against\\_discrimination\\_20120111](http://www.jewishjournal.com/israel/article/ethiopian_israelis_demonstrate_against_discrimination_20120111); Kaplan, "Can the Ethiopian Change His Skin?," 535–550; Talila Nesher, "Israel Admits Ethiopian Women Were Given Birth Control Shots," *Haaretz*, January 27, 2013, [www.haaretz.com/news/national/israel-admits-ethiopian-women-were-given-birth-control-shots.premium-1.496519](http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/israel-admits-ethiopian-women-were-given-birth-control-shots.premium-1.496519); Salamon, "Blackness in Transition"; Serge Schmemmann, "Ethiopian in Israeli Riot over Dumping of Donated Blood," *New York Times*, January 29, 1996, [www.nytimes.com/1996/01/29/world/ethiopian-in-israeli-riot-over-dumping-of-donated-blood.html](http://www.nytimes.com/1996/01/29/world/ethiopian-in-israeli-riot-over-dumping-of-donated-blood.html).

**A subset of Ethiopian Jews** This group is usually referred to as the "Falash(a) Mura." (In fact, some call all Ethiopian Jews "Falash[a].") Because this has become a pejorative term, I refer to them as the "Feres Mura," the term most of them prefer. See, e.g., Don Seeman, *One People, One Blood: Ethiopian Jews and the Return to Judaism* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2009); Michal Shmulovich, "The Last of the Falash Mura?," *Times of Israel*, August 26, 2013, [www.timesofisrael.com/the-last-of-the-falash-mura](http://www.timesofisrael.com/the-last-of-the-falash-mura).

Waves of Ethiopian Jews immigrating to Israel in 2013: Associated Press, "Israel: Effort to Move Ethiopians Wraps Up with Final Large Airlift," *New York Times*, August 28, 2013, [www.nytimes.com/2013/08/29/world/middleeast/israel-effort-to-move-ethiopians-wraps-up-with-final-large-airlift.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2013/08/29/world/middleeast/israel-effort-to-move-ethiopians-wraps-up-with-final-large-airlift.html); Miriam Berger, "The Last Jews of Ethiopia: As the Final Beta Israel Make Aliyah, a Community Vanishes," *Jewish Daily Forward*, August 9, 2013, 17; Avi Hoffman, "Pandor in Gandar," *Jerusalem Report*, January 14, 2013, 30–35; Jewish Telegraphic Agency, "Final Airlifts of Ethiopian Immigrants Arrive in Israel," August 28, 2013, [www.jta.org/2013/08/28/news-opinion/israel-middle-east/final-airlifts-of-ethiopian-immigrants-arrive-in-israel](http://www.jta.org/2013/08/28/news-opinion/israel-middle-east/final-airlifts-of-ethiopian-immigrants-arrive-in-israel); Salamon, "Religious Interplay"; Shmulovich, "Last of the Falash Mura?"

November 2015 proposal for an additional 9,000-plus Ethiopians to receive Israeli citizenship: "According to the proposal, only those who intend to convert in Israel, who left their villages before January 1, 2013 and who have been



waiting in Addis Ababa or Gondar since then will be eligible to come to Israel.” Similar to the 2010 government decision to bring a group of Ethiopians to Israel, this proposal also says that this will be the final group of Ethiopians “brought to Israel for conversion on the claim of belonging to the Falashmura community” (Ilan Lior, “Israel Set to Greenlight Final Aliyah of Ethiopia’s Falashmura Community,” *Ha’aretz*, November 14, 2015, [www.haaretz.com/israel-news/premium-1.685833](http://www.haaretz.com/israel-news/premium-1.685833)).

**As for Sigd, this is an annual Ethiopian holiday** Shai Afsai, “The Sigd Festival Comes Home to Jerusalem,” *Jerusalem Post*, December 12, 2012, [www.jpost.com/Opinion/Op-Ed-Contributors/The-Sigd-Festival-comes-home-to-Jerusalem](http://www.jpost.com/Opinion/Op-Ed-Contributors/The-Sigd-Festival-comes-home-to-Jerusalem); Ron Atar, “The Function of Muscial Instruments in the Liturgy of the Ethiopian Jews,” in Parfitt and Semi (eds.), *Jews of Ethiopia*, 155–172; Shoshana Ben-Dor, “The Sigd of Beta Israel: Testimony to a Community In Transition,” in *Ethiopian Jews and Israel*, ed. Michael Ashkenazi and Alex Weingrod (Oxford: Transaction Publishers, 1987); Abebe Zegeye, “The Religious Experience of Ethiopian Jews in Israel,” *Religion and Theology* 14 (2007): 347–394.

**A final point worth mentioning** On marriage between Ethiopian Jews and non-Ethiopian Jews, see Ofri Ilani, “Survey: 90% of Ethiopian Israelis Resist Interracial Marriage,” *Haaretz*, November 16, 2009, [www.haaretz.com/print-edition/news/survey-90-of-ethiopian-israelis-resist-interracial-marriage-1.4115](http://www.haaretz.com/print-edition/news/survey-90-of-ethiopian-israelis-resist-interracial-marriage-1.4115).

**As mentioned in chapter 1** Regarding those converts who returned to Judaism a few decades later, see also Notes, chapter 1, “During the Spanish and Portuguese Inquisitions.”

**Most of their descendants** Jonathan Ray, “New Approaches to the Jewish Diaspora: The Sephardim as a Sub-Ethnic Group,” *Jewish Social Studies: History, Culture, Society* 15, no. 1 (Fall 2008): 17. See also chapter 1.

**Ray argues that the label** On “Sephardi Jews” in fifteenth-century Iberian Peninsula, see Ray, “New Approaches,” 17–22. See also Bernard Dov Cooperman, “Ethnicity and Institution Building among Jews in Early Modern Rome,” *AJS Review* 30 (2006): 119–245; idem, “Portuguese Conversos in Ancona: Jewish Political Activity in Early Modern Italy,” in *In Iberia and Beyond: Hispanic Jews Between Cultures*, ed., idem (Newark, NJ: University of Delaware Press, 1998), 297–352; Bernard Lewis, *Notes and Documents from the Turkish Archives* (Jerusalem: Israel Oriental Society, 1952), 25–28; Benjamin Ravid, “A Tale of Three Cities and Their ‘Raison d’etat,’” *Mediterranean Historical Review* 6 (1991): 138–62; Jonathan Ray, *The Sephardic Frontier: The Reconquista and the Jewish Community in Medieval Iberia* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 2006), 131–144; Minna Rozen, “Collective Memories and Group Boundaries: The Judeo-Spanish Diaspora Between the Lands of Christendom and the World of Islam,” *Michael* 14 (1997): 35–52.

**Everywhere, these Jews** On Sephardi Jews in the Ottoman Empire, see Haim Beinart, ed., *The Sephardi Legacy*, vols. 1 and 2 (Jerusalem: Magnus Press, 1992); Aviva Ben-

Ur, *Sephardic Jews in America: A Diasporic History* (New York: New York University Press, 2009); Nabil Boudra and Joseph Krause, eds., *North African Mosaic: A Cultural Reappraisal of Ethnic and Religious Minorities* (Newcastle, Eng.: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2007); H. Z. Hirschberg, *A History of the Jews in North Africa*, vol. 1: *From Antiquity to the Sixteenth century* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1974); idem, *A History of the Jews in North Africa*, vol. 2: *From the Ottoman Conquests to the Present Time*, ed. Eliezer Bashan and Robert Attal (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1981); Yosef Kaplan, “Bom Judesmo: The Western Sephardic Diaspora,” in *Cultures of the Jews*, vol. 2: *Diversities of Diaspora*, ed. David Biale (New York: Schocken Books, 2002), 337–367; Benzion Netanyahu, *The Marranos of Spain: From the Late 14th to the Early 16th Century*, 3rd ed. (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1999).

**Netanyahu also suggests** Netanyahu divides Conversos into two groups: those who maintained Jewish practices in private but not public (whom he calls Crypto-Jews) and those who were of Jewish descent but eventually had stopped practicing Jewish ritual entirety (whom he calls Marranos). See Netanyahu, *Marranos of Spain*; idem, *The Origins of the Inquisition in Fifteenth Century Spain* (New York: Random House, Inc., 1995); idem, *Toward the Inquisition: Essays on Jewish and Converso History in Late Medieval Spain* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1997). See also Ray, “New Approaches,” 19–20.

**Another lesser-known group of Jews** Also worth mentioning is the Bnai Menashe community, whom some consider a Jewish “Lost Tribe” while others don’t even consider them to be Jews. See fig. 7.9a.

Indian Jews: Wendy Ellman, “Menashe’s Children Come Home,” *Hadassah Magazine*, October 1999; Shirley Berry Isenberg, “The Bene Israel Villagers of Kolaba District: Generations, Culture Change, Changing Identities,” in *Studies of Indian Jewish Identity*, ed. Nathan Katz (New Delhi: Manohar, 1985), 85–116; Katz et al. (eds.), *Indo-Judaic Studies*; Katz, *Who Are the Jews of India?* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000); Nathan Katz, email to author, February 19, 2015; Yosef Levanon, *The Jewish Travelers in the Twelfth Century* (Lanham, MD: University Press of America, 1980); Karen Primack, ed., *Jews in Places You Never Thought Of* (Jersey City, NJ: KTAV Publishing House, 1998); Maina Chawla Singh, *Being Indian, Being Israeli: Migration, Ethnicity, and Gender in the Jewish Homeland* (New Delhi: Manohar Publishers, 2010).

**Over time, Cochini Jews** For more on Cochini Jews, see Katz, *Who Are the Jews of India?*, 41–81.

Origins of Cochini Jewish community: In addition, there are documents from the ninth to eleventh centuries that confirm interaction between Middle Eastern Jews and Indian Jews. See Katz et al. (eds.), *Indo-Judaic Studies*; Brian Weinstein, “The Pepper Traders of the Malabar Coast: The Rahabis,” *Journal of Indo-Judaic Studies* 5, no. 5 (2002): 40–54.

**As far back as at least the sixteenth century** Some say the problems between these white and black Jews pre-dated the fifteenth century and that the influx of Sephardi Jews

only exacerbated things. Others say that white Jews were the Sephardi Jews and that it was only in the fifteenth century when these problems began.

Some say there was a third subgroup, the *Meshurarim*, those descended from freed slaves; others say these black Jews and *Meshurarim* are one and the same. See Barbara C. Johnson, "Cochin Jews and Kaifeng Jews: Reflections on Caste, Surname, 'Community,' and Conversion," in *The Jews of China: Historical and Comparative Perspectives*, vol. 1, ed. Jonathan Goldstein (Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, 1999), 104–119; Tudor Parfitt, "Genetics and Jewish History in India: The Bene Israel and the Black Jews of Cochin," *Journal of Indo-Judaic Studies* 6 (2003): 7–18.

**Regarding particular Cochini rituals** Katz, *Who Are the Jews of India?*, 41–81.

**Cochini Jews are also known** Katz, *Who Are the Jews of India?*, 41–81.

**According to one tradition** On the origins of Bnai Israel Jews, see Katz, *Who Are the Jews of India?*, 101–120.

**Some scholars note important distinctions** See Paul Dharamraj and Ofira Reuben, "Our Big-Fat Indian Jewish Weddings," *Times of Israel*, May 8, 2013, [www.timesofisrael.com/our-big-fat-indian-jewish-weddings](http://www.timesofisrael.com/our-big-fat-indian-jewish-weddings); Ben G. Frank, "India's Living Presence of Jewish Pride and Honor," *Jerusalem Post*, July 20, 2013, [www.jpost.com/Travel/Around-Israel/Indias-living-evidence-of-Jewish-pride-and-honor-320484](http://www.jpost.com/Travel/Around-Israel/Indias-living-evidence-of-Jewish-pride-and-honor-320484); Robert Hirschfield, "Jews of Two Worlds: Indians in Israel," *Khabar Magazine*, January 2013, [www.khabar.com/magazine/cover-story/jews\\_of\\_two\\_worlds\\_indians\\_in\\_israel](http://www.khabar.com/magazine/cover-story/jews_of_two_worlds_indians_in_israel); Eetta Prince-Gibson, "'Lost' Indian Jews Come Home," *Tablet Magazine*, December 27, 2012, [www.tabletmag.com/jewish-news-and-politics/120195/lost-indian-jews-come-home](http://www.tabletmag.com/jewish-news-and-politics/120195/lost-indian-jews-come-home); Myer Samra, "The Benei Mesashe: Choosing Judaism in North East India," *Journal of Indo-Judaic Studies* 12 (2012): 45–56; Shalva Weil, "The Bene Israel Indian Jewish Family in Transnational Context," *Journal of Comparative Family Studies* 43, no. 1 (2012): 71–80.

**One of the largest communities of Bnai Israel Jews** See Dharamraj and Reuben, "Our Big-Fat Indian Jewish Weddings"; Frank, "India's Living Presence"; Hirschfield, "Jews of Two Worlds"; Prince-Gibson, "'Lost' Indian Jews Come Home"; Samra, "The Benei Mesashe"; Weil, "The Bene Israel Indian Jewish Family."

**At the beginning of the twentieth century** For more on Jews in Pakistan, see Yoel Moses Reuben, *The Jews of Pakistan: A Forgotten Heritage* (Mumbai: Bene Israel Heritage Museum and Genealogical Research Centre, 2010), 7–8, 73, 163, 206–207.

**Perhaps most noteworthy in terms of ritual** Katz, *Who Are the Jews of India?*, 101–120.

**The Jew who started what became known** According to one source, in 1947, at the time of the Indian Partition, there were 145 Jews still living in what became East Pakistan and later Bangladesh; see Shalva Weil, "The Unknown Jews of

Bangladesh: Fragments of an Elusive Community," *Asian Jewish Life: A Journal of Spirit, Society, and Culture* 10 (Sept. 2012): 16–18, available at <http://asianjewishlife.org/images/issues/Issue10-Sept2012/PDFs/AJL-issue10-complete.pdf>.

**The Baghdadi Jews were unusual** For more on Baghdadi Jews, see Joan G. Roland, *Jews in British India: Identity in a Colonial Era* (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 1989).

**Many scholars agree** On antisemitism in India, see Katz, *Who Are the Jews of India?*, 128–159.

**Most Cochini and Bnai Israel Indian Jews** For more on the population of Indian Jewish subcommunities today, see Ellman, "Menashe's Children Come Home"; Katz et al. (eds.), *Indo-Judaic Studies*; Katz, *Who Are the Jews of India?*; Primack (ed.), *Jews in Places*; Singh, *Being Indian, Being Israeli*. For more on Jews in Israel marrying individuals the government considers to be non-Jewish, see chapters 10 and 11.

**As is the case with other** On Chinese Jews, see Matthew Fishbane, "China's Ancient Jewish Enclave," *New York Times*, March 30, 2010, [www.nytimes.com/2010/04/04/travel/04journeys.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/04/travel/04journeys.html); Goldstein (ed.), *Jews of China*; idem, ed., *The Jews of China: A Sourcebook and Resource Guide*, vol. 2 (Armonk, NY: M. E. Sharpe, 1999); Xu Xin, *The Jews of Kaifeng, China: History, Culture, and Religion* (Jersey City, NJ: Ktav Publishing House, Inc., 2003).

Origins of Chinese Jewish community: Irene Eber, "Overland and by Sea: Eight Centuries of the Jewish Presence in China," *Chinese Journal of International Law* 4, no. 1 (2005): 235–236; Menashe Har-El, "Jews and the Great Silk Road," *Ariel: A Review of Arts and Letters in Israel (Jerusalem)* 84 (1991): 16–17, cited in Xin, *Jews of Kaifeng*, 8–9.

**Many contend that the founders** On their being of Babylonian or Persian descent, see Martin Gilbert, *Atlas of Jewish History* (New York: Dorset Press, 1984), 22; Har-El, "Jews and the Great Silk Road"; Donald Leslie, "The Jewish-Iranian Community of Kaifeng," in Sarshar (ed.), *Jewish Communities of Iran*, 147–148.

**Whether living under** For example, when the Yellow River flooded during the fifteenth century, Kaifeng's synagogue was destroyed along with most other city buildings. Interestingly, they seem to have been given special permission to rebuild, and they also received new Torah scrolls from two Chinese Jewish communities to Kaifeng's southeast, Ningbo and Yangzhou. See Donald D. Leslie, *The Chinese-Hebrew Memorial Book of the Jewish Community of Kaifeng* (Belconnen, ACT, Australia: Canberra College of Advanced Education, 1984), xxxv, cited in Xin, *Jews of Kaifeng*, 34.

**With the abandonment of the Silk Road** On Kaifeng's gradual isolation, see Xin, *Jews of Kaifeng*, 47–66.

Population of Kaifeng Jews: Xin, *Jews of Kaifeng*, 72–73.

**Like other groups of Jews** On the integration of Confucian thought, see Andrew H. Plaks, "The Confucianization of the Kaifeng Jews: Interpretations of the Kaifeng Stelae Inscriptions," in Goldstein (ed.), *Jews of China*, 1:36–49. As the

local Chinese language had no name to represent a monotheistic God, an idea central to Jewish thought, the author of this inscription instead used words such as *Tian* (Heaven), *Dao* (the Way), and *Tiandao* (the Way of Heaven). Similarly, the inscription links the Torah's first human, Adam, with Pangu, a giant who, according to local Chinese narratives, was the first human; and the timeline of figures in the Torah, such as Abraham and Moses, are explained in relation to the Chinese calendar rather than the ancient Jewish calendar. See Jonathan N. Lipman, "Living Judaism in Confucian Culture: Being Jewish and Chinese," in *Judaism in Practice: From the Middle Ages through the Early Modern Period*, ed. Lawrence Fine (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2001), 265–277.

Iber reference: Irene Eber, "Kaifeng Jews: The Sinification of Identity," in Goldstein (ed.), *Jews of China*, 1:22–35.

**These Chinese Jews had other** Maror substitution: Donald D. Leslie, *The Survival of Chinese Jews: The Jewish Community of Kaifeng* (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1975), 87, in Xin, *Jews of Kaifeng*, 99.

Marking graves: Xin, *Jews of Kaifeng*, 103.

Scroll of Esther: Cecil Roth, in William Charles White, *Chinese Jews: A Compilation of Matters Relating to the Jews of K'aifêng Fu* (New York: Paragon Book Gallery/University of Toronto Press, 1966), 3–15.

**Jews also lived in other Chinese cities** See, e.g., Boris Bresler, "Harbin's Jewish Community, 1898–1958: Politics, Prosperity, and Adversity," in Goldstein (ed.), *Jews of China*, 1:200–215; Joan G. Roland, "Baghdadi Jews in India and China in the Nineteenth Century: A Comparison of Economic Roles," *ibid.*, 141–156; Zvia Shickman-Bowman, "The Construction of the Chinese Eastern Railway and the Origin of the Harbin Jewish Community, 1898–1931," *ibid.*, 187–199.

**Finally, Jews have lived in Hong Kong** On Jews in Shanghai, Japan, and Hong Kong, see Chiara Betta, "Silas Aaron Hardoon and Cross-Cultural Adaptation in Shanghai," in Goldstein (ed.), *Jews of China*, 1:216–229; Dennis A. Leventhal, "Environmental Interactions of the Jews of Hong Kong," *ibid.*, 171–186.

**Whether going back millennia** Muslim-majority areas—Algerian Jews: As recently as the mid-1980s, there were a few Jews still living in Ghardaia, Algeria, one of the so-called five cities of the Sahara. There was even a synagogue there at this time, though it was unused. One dominant communal tradition is that they arrived in this region following the destruction of the Second Temple. According to French records, 500 or so members of the community, also called the M'zab Jews, immigrated to Israel after 1948, with another 1,200 leaving during the Algerian-French War, some of whom also relocated to France. See Hirschberg, *History of the Jews in North Africa*, vol. 1 and 2:1–79; Ronald L. Nagel, "Jews of the Sahara," *Einstein Journal of Biology and Medicine* 21 (2004): 25–32; Stillman, *Jews of Arab Lands*; *idem*; *Jews of Arab Lands in Modern Times*.

Lebanese Jews: About 20,000 Lebanese Jews immigrated

to Israel in the years immediately after 1948. See Nada Abdel Samad, *The Jews of Lebanon: Loyalty to Who?* (BBC, 2010) [film, Arabic]; *idem*, *Wadi Abu Jamil: Qisas 'an Yahud Lubnan* (Beirut: Dar A-Nahar, 2009) [film, Arabic]; Kirsten Schulze, *The Jews of Lebanon: Between Coexistence and Conflict* (Eastbourne, Eng.: Sussex Academic Press, 2009). See also Hirschberg, *History of the Jews*, vol. 1; Stillman, *Jews of Arab Lands*; *idem*; *Jews of Arab Lands in Modern Times*.

Libyan Jews: About 35,000 Libyan Jews immigrated to Israel in the years immediately after 1948. See Harvey E. Goldberg, *Jewish Life in Muslim Libya: Rivals and Relatives* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1990); Hirschberg, *A History of the Jews in North Africa*, 2:147–187; James Kirchick, "Right of Return," *Tablet*, September 2, 2011, [www.tabletmag.com/jewish-news-and-politics/76721/right-of-return](http://www.tabletmag.com/jewish-news-and-politics/76721/right-of-return); Maurice M. Roumani, *The Jews of Libya: Coexistence, Persecution, Resettlement* (Portland, OR: Sussex Academic Press, 2008); Vivienne Roumani-Denn, *The Last Jews of Libya* (LionTree Productions, 2007) [film]. See also Hirschberg, *History of the Jews*, vol. 1; Stillman, *Jews of Arab Lands*; *idem*; *Jews of Arab Lands in Modern Times*.

Tunisian Jews: Jews currently residing on the island of Djerba, Tunisia, approximately 1,200 in number, maintain that they have been there for more than two millennia. Between 1948 and 1967 about 85,000 Tunisian Jews immigrated to France and Israel, with another 15,000 to 20,000 leaving over the following four decades. See Hirschberg, *History of the Jews in North Africa*, vol. 1 and 2:80–146; Edward Karabenick, "Djerba: A Case Study in the Geography of Isolation," *Journal of Geography* 70 (January 1971): 52–55; Stern, "Limitations of 'Jewish,'" 315; Stillman, *Jews of Arab Lands*; *idem*, *Jews of Arab Lands in Modern Times*; Nomi Stone, "Al-Bilad Al-Haqaniya? Otherness and Homeland in the Case of Djerban Jewry," *Journal of Modern Jewish Studies* 6, no. 3 (November 2007): 257–272.

Christian majority areas—Australian Jews: See Suzanne D. Rutland, *Edge of the Diaspora: Two Centuries of Jews in Australia* (New York: Holmes and Meir, 2001); *idem*, *The Jews of Australia* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2006); Suzanne D. Rutland, Leon Mann, and Margaret Price, eds., *Jews of the Outback: The Centenary of the Broken Hill Synagogue, 1910–2010* (Ormond, Vic.: Hybrid Publishers, 2010).

Mexican Jews: See Adina Cimmet, *Ashkenazi Jews in Mexico: Ideologies in the Structuring of a Community* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1997); Paulette Schuster Kershenovich, *The Syrian Jewish Community in Mexico City in a Comparative Context: Between a Rock and a Hard Place* (Saarbrücken, Ger.: Lambert Academic Publishing, 2012); Seymour B. Lieberman, *The Jews in New Spain: Faith, Flame, and the Inquisition* (Coral Gables, FL: University of Miami Press, 1970).

Jews in the Philippines: See, e.g., [www.jewishphilippines.net](http://www.jewishphilippines.net).

South African Jews: See Louis Herrman, *A History of the Jews in South Africa, from the Earliest Times to 1895* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1975); Mendel Kaplan and Marian Robertson, eds., *Founders and Followers: Johannesburg Jewry*,



1887–1915 (Cape Town: Vlaeberg, 1991); Gideon Shimoni, *Community and Conscience: The Jews in Apartheid South Africa* (Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 2003); idem, *Jews and Zionism: The South African Experience, 1910–1967* (Cape Town: Oxford University Press, 1980).

Jews in South Korea: Since at least the mid-twentieth-century there has been a Jewish presence in South Korea (American-Israeli Cooperative Enterprise, “South Korea,” [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsources/vjw/south\\_korea.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsources/vjw/south_korea.html)).

**Does this mean that there is no** Biale, “Preface,” xxii.

**We can certainly say** On Satmar Jews and the 2013 New York City mayoral election, see Joseph Berger, “Out of Enclaves, a Pressure to Accommodate Traditions,” *New York Times*, August 21, 2013, available at [www.nytimes.com/2013/08/22/nyregion/hasidic-jews-turn-up-pressure-on-city-to-accommodate-their-traditions.html?\\_r=0](http://www.nytimes.com/2013/08/22/nyregion/hasidic-jews-turn-up-pressure-on-city-to-accommodate-their-traditions.html?_r=0); Jesse McKinley, “Road Trip to the Catskills to Reach Orthodox Jewish Voters,” *New York Times*, July 19, 2013, available at [www.nytimes.com/2013/07/20/nyregion/road-trip-to-the-catskills-to-reach-orthodox-jewish-voters.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2013/07/20/nyregion/road-trip-to-the-catskills-to-reach-orthodox-jewish-voters.html).

**To take this conversation** Frédéric Brenner, conversation with author, summer 2005; Frédéric Brenner, email to author, September 28, 2013.

Sartre quote: Jean-Paul Sartre, *Anti-Semite and Jew: An Exploration of the Etiology of Hate* (New York: Schocken Books, 1995), 67.

## Chapter 8. Movements

**In college, I spent much more time** Attending a “Jewish parochial school and religious summer camp made me somewhat unusual statistically”: Jack Wertheimer, “Jewish Education in the United States: Recent Trends and Issues,” in *American Jewish Year Book* 99, ed. David Singer (New York: American Jewish Committee, 1999), 3–118.

**Today, heteronormative American Jews** Steven M. Cohen and Ari Y. Kelman, “Uncoupled: How Our Singles Are Reshaping Jewish Engagement,” *Jewish Identity Project of Reboot* (2008), 11, available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=323](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=323).

**In October 2013** Pew Research Center, “A Portrait of Jewish Americans: Findings from a Pew Research Center Survey of U.S. Jews,” October 1, 2013, available at [www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey](http://www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey).

**Most definitions of “religion”** Dalai Lama quote: In other words, the Dalai Lama was orienting toward the term *atheism* as nontheism, not believing in a theistic God or higher power. See Ninian Smart, *Dimensions of the Sacred: An Anatomy of the World’s Beliefs* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996), 27.

**If we take God out of the equation** Clifford Geertz, *The Interpretation of Cultures* (New York: Basic Books, 1973), 119–120.

**Scholar Ninian Smart** Smart, *Dimensions of the Sacred*.

**Jewish identities also have different meanings** On the term *secular*, see Talal Asad, *Formations of the Secular: Christianity, Islam, Modernity* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2003); also introduction and chapter 10.

2009 poll of Jewish Israelis: Asher Arian, Ayala Keissar-Sugarman, Dror Walter, Dahlia Scheindlin, Shaul Slepak, Tamar Hermann, and Raphael Ventura, “A Portrait of Israeli Jews: Beliefs, Observance, and Values of Israeli Jews, 2009,” Guttman Center for Surveys of the Israel Democracy Institute (Jerusalem: Israel Democracy Institute and AVI CHAI-Israel, 2012), 30–49, available at <http://avichai.org/wp-content/uploads/2012/01/A-Portrait-of-Israeli-Jews.pdf>. The study was not released publicly until 2012.

**Although nearly half of Jewish Israelis** Arian et al., “Portrait of Israeli Jews.”

**The same poll found** Arian et al., “Portrait of Israeli Jews”; Pew Research Center, “Portrait of Jewish Americans,” 8–13. In a different poll of Jewish Israelis, 30 percent (31 percent of whom identified as secular, 43 percent as orthodox or religious, and only 20 percent as ultra-Orthodox) were in favor of building a Temple on the Temple Mount. Muslims call this same site *al-Haram al-Sharif* (the Noble Sanctuary), and consider it to be one of the most sacred sites in Islam; rebuilding a temple there would certainly cause major problems both locally and globally. See Nir Hasson, “One Third of Israeli Jews Want Temple Rebuilt in Jerusalem, Poll Finds,” *Haaretz*, July 12, 2013, [www.haaretz.com/news/national/premium-1.535336](http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/premium-1.535336).

**Scholars of modern Jewish groups** The debate over whether to call the particular communities explored in this chapter sects, movements, or something else altogether is an important scholarly endeavor worthy of consideration. However, this question is secondary to this book. Shaye Cohen, for example, contends that “a ‘sect’ is an organized group which separates itself from the community and asserts that it alone has religious truth.” He then goes on to describe other characteristics of sects in great detail. See Shaye J. D. Cohen, “The Significance of Yavneh: Pharisees, Rabbis, and the End of Sectarianism,” in *Origins of Judaism: The Pharisees and Other Sects*, vol. 2, pt. 1, ed. Jacob Neusner (New York: Garland, 1990), 103.

**According to dominant Jewish narratives today** Persia was conquered by Alexander the Great in roughly 334 or 333 BCE. Following his death, his empire was divided up between his generals, which led to thirty years of infighting. By 300 BCE, Judea was controlled by the Macedonian Ptolemies of Egypt (commonly called “the Greeks”). In approximately 200 BCE, Judea was conquered by another Macedonian (or “Greek”) kingdom, the Syrian Selucids, who were eventually challenged by the Judean Hasmoneans (also called Maccabees), who in turn regained control over the Temple in Jerusalem in 164 BCE. The Hasmoneans created a small Maccabean state within the Selucid territory, but in 63 BCE the Romans conquered Judea and the Maccabees. See Shaye J. D. Cohen, *From*

*the Maccabees to the Mishnah* (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1987), 14–15; see also chapter 3.

**Not only is there reason to doubt** On customs connected to Hanukkah, see Clemens Leonhard, “‘Herod’s Days’ and the Development of Jewish and Christian Festivals,” in *Jewish Identity and Politics between the Maccabees and Bar Kokhba*, ed. Benedikt Eckhardt (Boston: Brill, 2012), 189–208.

Reasons for the rebellion against the Greeks: Louis H. Feldman, “Hanukkah Reconsidered,” *American Mizrahi Woman* 54, no. 3 (December 1981): 6–7; Mitchell First, “What Motivated Antiochus to Issue His Decrees against the Jews?”

*akirah: The Flatbush Journal of Jewish Law and Thought* 16 (Winter 2013): 193–211.

**Most relevant for us, the core** Others point to the second century BCE, prior to the Hasmonean revolt against the Greeks, as the period when the Samaritan community emerged. See, e.g., Robert T. Anderson and Terry Giles, *The Keepers: An Introduction to the History and Culture of the Samaritans* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2002), 10. See also chapter 11.

Books of Maccabees: John H. Hayes and J. Maxwell Miller, eds., *Israelite and Judean History* (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1971), 562–66. According to the *Jewish Encyclopedia* (1906), there are four books with the name *Book of Maccabees* (I, II, III, and IV Maccabees), only the first of which “can be regarded as a reliable historical source.” See Crawford Howell Toy, George A. Barton, Joseph Jacobs, and Israel Abrahams, “Books of Maccabees,” [www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/10237-maccabees-books-of](http://www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/10237-maccabees-books-of).

Books of Maccabees translated into Greek: Michael Edward Stone, *Scriptures, Sects, and Visions* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1980), 50–56.

**But lest we think that clear lines** According to Shaye J. D. Cohen (*The Beginnings of Jewishness: Boundaries, Varieties, Uncertainties* [Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1999], 110–139), the Idumeans were given the choice of expulsion or joining the Judeans.

Book of Judith: Cohen, *Beginnings of Jewishness*, 129–130.

Ambiguous lines separating Idumeans, Judeans, and Greeks: Benedikt Eckhardt, “Introduction,” in Eckhardt (ed.), *Jewish Identity and Politics*, 8.

**A few centuries later** For the population of Jews in Palestine at this time, see Megan Broshi, “The Role of the Temple in the Herodian Economy,” *Journal of Jewish Studies* 38, no. 1 (Spring 1987): 35; James Carroll, *Constantine’s Sword: The Church and the Jews* (New York: Houghton Mifflin, 2001), 79; Paula Fredriksen, *Jesus of Nazareth King of the Jews: A Jewish Life and the Emergence of Christianity* (New York: Knopf, 1999), 64; E. P. Sanders, *Judaism: Practice and Belief, 63 B.C.E.–66 C.E.* (Philadelphia: Trinity Press International, 1992), 127.

Common descriptions of these first-century CE Palestine-based Jewish communities: James C. Vanderkam, *An Introduction to Early Judaism* (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2001), 10–54, 165–193.

**These communities have been the subject** The facts

about these Jewish subgroups are much less concrete than what is described here. See, e.g., Gregory Knight, “The Pharisees and the Sadducees: Rethinking Their Respective Outlooks on Jewish Law,” *Brigham Young University Law Review* 3 (1993): 925–948. Scholar E. P. Sanders (*Judaism*) contends that despite the heterogeneity of the Jewish community during this period, there were dominant, or “common,” Jewish practices; see Shaye J. D. Cohen, “Common Judaism in Greek and Latin Authors,” in *Redefining First-Century Jewish and Christian Identities*, ed. Fabian E. Udoh (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 2008), 69–87. Others, however, disagree, pointing to different practices among Jewish subgroups, such as those relating to fast days. See, e.g., Cohen, “Significance of Yavneh,” 101–127; Hayes and Miller, *Israelite and Judean History*, 549–550.

Part of the ambiguity is due to the sheer breadth and depth of scholarship on this topic. As one scholar notes, the literature on these groups alone could fill up an entire library (Solomon Zeitlin, “The Pharisees and the Gospels,” in Neusner [ed.], *Origins of Judaism*, vol. 2, pt. 2, 485).

Ambiguity of intra-Jewish schisms: Daniel Boyarin, *A Radical Jew: Paul and the Politics of Identity* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1994), 14; Wayne A. Meeks, *The First Urban Christians: The Social World of the Apostle Paul* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1983), 33. See also Daniel Boyarin, *Border Lines: The Partition of Judaeo-Christianity* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2006); idem, *The Jewish Gospels: The Story of the Jewish Christ* (New York: New Press, 2012).

Some families had been part of this heterogeneous Jewish community for only a few centuries, following forced conversions at the hands of the Hasmoneans during the second century BCE. By some accounts, these groups were not nearly as “Judaized” as those who had been Jewish (or Judean) prior to this time (Neusner [ed.], *Origins of Judaism*, vol. 2, pt. 1, viii–xii).

**The facts about any of these groups** On the Pharisees, see Cohen, “Significance of Yavneh,” 101–127; idem, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 156–157.

**Shaye Cohen argues** Subdivisions among Pharisees: II *Avot de Rabbi Natan* 37, ed. Solomon Schechter (New York: Feldheim, 1945), 109, in Saul Lieberman, “The Discipline in the So-called Dead Sea Manual of Discipline,” in Neusner (ed.), *Origins of Judaism*, vol. 2, pt. 2, 138.

Pharisee Jews who killed non-Pharisee Jews: Cohen, *Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 145.

Pharisees as revolutionaries: Ellis Rivkin, “Pharisaism and the Crisis of the Individual in the Greco-Roman World,” in Neusner (ed.), *Origins of Judaism*, vol. 2, pt. 2, 219–245.

Pharisees supporting the status quo of Roman rule: Cecil Roth, “The Pharisees in the Jewish Revolution of 66–73,” *ibid.*, 255–272.

**We aren’t even positive** On the origins of the name Pharisee, see Samuel S. Cohon, “Pharisaism: A Definition,” in Neusner (ed.), *Origins of Judaism*, vol. 2, pt. 1, 135–144; Ralph

Marcus, "The Pharisees in the Light of Modern Scholarship," *ibid.*, 385–396.

Being named oppositionally (i.e., in terms of what group you are not): Zeitlin, "Pharisees and the Gospels," 488.

Pharisee identities in relation to Sadducee identities: Jacob Z. Lauterbach, "The Sadducees and the Pharisees," in Neusner (ed.), *Origins of Judaism*, vol. 2, pt. 2, 34–56; Zeitlin, "Pharisees and the Gospels," 485–488.

Pharisees in opposition to being *am ha-aretz*: Rivkin, "Pharisaism."

**Then there are the Zealots** Zealots as Sicarii: According to Shaye Cohen (*Maccabees to the Mishnah*, 164–166), the Sicarii and the Zealots were two different groups.

Pharisees as similar to Zealots: Cecil Roth, "The Religious Nature of the Zealots," in Neusner (ed.), *Origins of Judaism*, vol. 2, pt. 2, 273–279.

Groups of Jews, such as the Zealots, that killed other Jews: Cecil Roth, "The Zealots in the War of 66–73," in Neusner (ed.), *Origins of Judaism*, vol. 2, pt. 1, 494–517.

**All of these changes** Changes during the Jewish Enlightenment: Todd M. Endelman, *Broadening Jewish History: Toward a Social History of Ordinary Jews* (Portland, OR: Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2011).

**SPECIAL TOPIC 8.1** "At first glance, middle-class Jews in Berlin": Endelman, *Broadening Jewish History*, 33–35, 43; see also 45, 66, 72, 76, and 296.

Sephardi English Jews "immersed in the social and cultural life": Todd M. Endelman, "The Englishness of Jewish Modernity in England," in *Toward Modernity: The European Jewish Model*, ed. Jacob Katz (New York: Transaction, 1987), 227.

**France, the Netherlands, Belgium, and Greece** For the quote attributed to a French Jew, see Eli Barnavi, "Jewish Emancipation in Western Europe," [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-emancipation-in-western-europe](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-emancipation-in-western-europe). See also chapter 3.

**Jews began to proudly profess** On the modern emergence of the academic study of Judaism, see Jacob Neusner, "Studies in Judaism: Modes and Contexts," *Journal of the American Academy of Religion* 37, no. 2 (June 1969): 136–137.

**In the German Jewish community** Naftali Herz Wessely, one of Mendelssohn's colleagues, echoed these ideas when writing about the differences between the laws of humans and the laws of God. See Joshua Barzilay Folman, "Wessely, Naphtali Herz," *Encyclopedia Judaica* (2008), available at [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/judaica/jejud\\_0002\\_0021\\_o\\_20854.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/judaica/jejud_0002_0021_o_20854.html).

**FIGURE 8.2** As explained by the Magnes Collection of Jewish Art and Life, where the painting is housed, "The scene refers to two foundational moments in the history of German-Jewish cultural interaction. The actual meetings between Mendelssohn and Lavater, which took place in 1763–1764, were followed by the failed attempt on the part of the theologian to convince Mendelssohn to embrace Christianity. The well-known friendship between Mendelssohn and

Lessing, one of the high points of the *haskalah*, or 'Jewish Enlightenment,' came to be considered a paradigm of the possibility of a harmonious cohabitation between Germans and Jews" ("Painting [75.18]: Lavater and Lessing Visit Moses Mendelssohn, by Moritz Daniel Oppenheim (1856)," Magnes Collection of Jewish Art and Life, [www.flickr.com/photos/magnesmuseum/4402841084/](http://www.flickr.com/photos/magnesmuseum/4402841084/)).

**In the mid-nineteenth century** The Gordon statement is sometimes quoted as "Be a Jew in your tent and a man in the street"; see Louis Jacobs, "Haskalah," [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/haskalah/](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/haskalah/); Allan Nadler, "Whatever Happened to Moses Mendelssohn?," December 6, 2010, [www.jewishideasdaily.com/772/features/whatever-happened-to-moses-mendelssohn](http://www.jewishideasdaily.com/772/features/whatever-happened-to-moses-mendelssohn).

Heine quote: Heinrich Heine, *Almansor: A Tragedy* (1823), cited in "Frequently Asked Questions," United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, [www.ushmm.org/research/ask-a-research-question/frequently-asked-questions](http://www.ushmm.org/research/ask-a-research-question/frequently-asked-questions).

Mendelssohn's children and their Jewish identities: Some even say that Joseph, one of Mendelssohn's two children who remained Jewish, was only "nominally" Jewish, while Recha, the other, never married and thus could not instill a Jewish identity in her progeny. See David Sorkin, "The Mendelssohn Myth and Its Method," *New German Critique* 77 (Spring/Summer 1999): 8–10.

German Jews receiving full legal equality: Matt Plen, "Moses Mendelssohn," [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/moses-mendelssohn](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/moses-mendelssohn).

**The early reformers were laypeople** On the origins of the modern Reform movement, see, e.g., Union for Reform Judaism, "Reform Judaism," [www.urj.org/who-we-are/history](http://www.urj.org/who-we-are/history). According to another source, in 1810 Jacobson founded the first Reform synagogue as "part of the boys' school in See-son, Westphalia, [where he conducted] the first confirmation service that same year" (Dana Evan Kaplan, *The New Reform Judaism: Challenges and Reflections* [Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2013], 323).

**To explain why these challenges** On Eliezer Lieberman, see Kaplan, *New Reform Judaism*, 99–100.

**There was a range of opinions** In 1840 England, for example, one synagogue declared their allegiance to the Bible while condemning the Talmud as a document written by humans, not unlike the radical idea the Karaites brought to the fore in ninth-century Iraq (see chapter 11).

**Meanwhile, new camps within the movement** The extent to which Geiger and Holdheim differed is a matter of opinion. In regard to the *mitzvah* (biblical directive) of ritual circumcision, in 1845 Geiger said: "The fact remains that it is a barbaric, gory rite which fills the infant's father with fear and subjects the new mother to harmful emotional strain." Regarding the laws of *kashrut*, he said: "It is precisely these dietary laws that are so void of rationale and . . . such a hindrance to the development of social relationships" (Max Wiener, ed., *Abraham Geiger and Liberal Judaism: The Challenge of the Nineteenth Century* [Cincinnati: Hebrew Union



College Press, 1981], 113–115, quoted in Neil Gillman, *Conservative Judaism: The New Century* [New York: Behrman House, 1993], 16–17).

Holdheim's suggestion to move Shabbat to Saturday/Sunday: Kaplan, *New Reform Judaism*, 323–331; Kerry M. Olitsky, "The Sunday-Sabbath Movement in American Reform Judaism: Strategy or Evolution?," *American Jewish Archives* 34 (1982): 75–88; Union for Reform Judaism, "Reform Judaism."

**Jews began coming to America** "Congregational History," Congregation Shearith Israel, <http://shearithisrael.org/content/congregational-history>.

**Estimates of the Jewish population** Sidney Goldstein, in "Jews in the United States: Perspectives from Demography," *American Jewish Year Book*, ed. Milton Himmelfarb and David Singer (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 1981), 9.

Technically, Jews were not arriving from Russia, per se, but the Russian Empire.

**In 1824, a few members** On the first American Reform synagogue, see David Ellenson, "American Jewish Denominationalism: Yesterday, Today, Tomorrow," *The Reconstructionist* 71, no. 2 (Spring 2007): 5–15; Kaplan, *New Reform Judaism*, 323–325.

**Wise did not initially intend to start a new movement** For more on Wise and his changes to ritual practices, see Ellenson, "American Jewish Denominationalism"; Kaplan, *New Reform Judaism*, 323–325.

**By 1873, Wise had founded** On the founding of the first Reform institutions in the United States, see Ellenson, "American Jewish Denominationalism"; Kaplan, *New Reform Judaism*, 323–325.

**While Wise was successfully driving** On Einhorn, see Lou H. Silberman, "The Union Prayer Book: A Study in Liturgical Developments," in *Retrospect and Prospect: Essays in Commemoration of the Seventy-Fifth Anniversary of the Founding of the Central Conference of American Rabbis, 1889–1964*, ed. Bertram W. Korn (New York: CCAR, 1965), 46–61.

**Even more important, although Einhorn** "One of the most notable ideas articulated": In 1897, prior to the first Zionist National Congress in Europe, the CCAR passed a resolution rejecting Zionism; see Kaplan, *New Reform Judaism*, 323–325.

"The Pittsburgh Platform," November 19, 1885, available at <http://ccarnet.org/rabbis-speak/platforms/declaration-principles>.

Sussman quote: Lance J. Sussman, "The Myth of the Trefa Banquet: American Culinary Culture and the Radicalization of Food Policy in American Reform Judaism," *American Jewish Archives Journal* 57, nos. 1–2 (2005): 45.

**In 1977, the movement called for an end** See "Judaism and Sexual Orientation," The Jeff Herman Virtual Resource Center, Hebrew Union College-Jewish Institute of Religion, [http://elearning.huc.edu/jhvc/qa\\_res\\_cat\\_list.php?question=1](http://elearning.huc.edu/jhvc/qa_res_cat_list.php?question=1).

Denise Eger: Jewish Telegraphic Agency, "Reform Rabbis

Install First Openly Gay President, Denise Eger," March 16, 2015, [www.jta.org/2015/03/16/news-opinion/united-states/reform-rabbis-install-first-openly-gay-president-denise-eger](http://www.jta.org/2015/03/16/news-opinion/united-states/reform-rabbis-install-first-openly-gay-president-denise-eger).

**Arguably, however, this movement's most controversial decision** Central Conference of American Rabbis (CCAR), Contemporary American Reform Responsa, "38. Patrilineal and Matrilineal Descent," October 1983, <http://ccarnet.org/responsa/carr-61-68>.

Although the Reconstructionist movement began accepting patrilineal descent as far back as 1968, throughout the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, more Jews have affiliated with Reform Judaism than Reconstructionist Judaism (see later in chapter).

**In 1851, Rabbi Samson Raphael Hirsch** On Hirsch, see Louis Jacobs, "Samson Raphael Hirsch: The Father of Neo-Orthodoxy," [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/samson-raphael-hirsch-the-father-of-neo-orthodoxy](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/samson-raphael-hirsch-the-father-of-neo-orthodoxy).

Modern Orthodoxy (or Neo-Orthodoxy): Also referred to as "Enlightened Orthodoxy"; see Nathan Glazer, *American Judaism* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1972), 58.

**Hirsch and his ideological colleagues** On contemporary ultra-Orthodox Jews, see Arthur Green, "How Hasidism Went Astray," *Jewish Daily Forward*, June 23, 2010, available at <http://forward.com/opinion/128935/how-hasidism-went-astray/#ixzz2h4Kl9dYy>.

Differences among Orthodox groups: For an introductory look at some of the challenges of Modern Orthodoxy, see Noah Feldman, "Orthodox Paradox," *New York Times Magazine*, June 22, 2007, [www.nytimes.com/2007/07/22/magazine/22yeshiva-t.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2007/07/22/magazine/22yeshiva-t.html).

**The American Jewish Orthodox community** On the emergence of Orthodoxy in the United States, see Jeffrey S. Gurock, "Resisters and Accommodators: Varieties of Orthodox Rabbis in America, 1886–1983," *American Jewish Archives* 35, no. 2 (November 1983): 105.

**With the growth of Reform Judaism** On the history of Orthodoxy in the United States, see Neil Gillman, *Conservative Judaism*, 32–40.

**By the turn of the twentieth century** Scholar Moshe D. Sherman adds, "Sephardic, German, Lithuanian, Polish, Hungarian, and Galician congregations were only some of the distinct [Orthodox] communities represented in New York, Philadelphia, Baltimore, and other cities throughout the United States. They also differed in such matters as the modernization of synagogue services" (Sherman, "Orthodox Judaism in America," [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/a-short-history-of-orthodox-judaism-in-america](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/a-short-history-of-orthodox-judaism-in-america)).

**Other important Orthodox institutions** The Rabbi Isaac Elchanan Theological Seminary (RIETS) was the first American seminary focused on advanced Talmud study. Founded in 1896, it eventually became part of Yeshiva University. Stern College, a female-only counterpart to Yeshiva College, was launched in 1945.

**In looking at Orthodoxy** Since the eighteenth century,

members of the Hasidic movement have prayed according to *Nusah Sfar*, a distinctive liturgy derived from, but not identical to, that of Sephardic Jews.

**Tension between Orthodox submovements:** For example, while the *Agudat ha-Rabbanim* and RCA struggled over who was more legitimate, the Hasidic rabbis created yet another organization, *Agudas ha-Admorim*, in 1924, claiming that only they had the authority to speak on behalf of Orthodox Jews. See Ira Robinson, “The First Hasidic Rabbis in North America,” *American Jewish Archives* 44 (1992): 501–515.

**One thing that continues to distinguish** On differences between Orthodox submovements, see Sharon Flatto, “*Hasidism and Mitnaggedim*: Not a World Apart,” *Journal of Jewish Thought and Philosophy* 12, no. 2 (August 2003): 99–121; Arthur Green, “Introduction,” in Daniel C. Matt, trans. and comm., *The Zohar*, Pritzker ed., vol. 1 (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2004), lxxix. See also chapter 6.

**Some argue that today’s Hasidic Jews** Within the subgroup of ultra-Orthodox Jews there are two distinct communities, Chabad and Aish Hatorah, whose primary purpose is to missionize non-Orthodox Jews in order to bring them into the ultra-Orthodox fold. Because of such practices, it is inaccurate to consider them as self-isolated as all other ultra-Orthodox subgroups. See, e.g., Aaron Joshua Tapper, “The ‘Cult’ of Aish Hatorah: *Ba’alei Teshuva* and the New Religious Movement Phenomenon,” *Jewish Journal of Sociology* 44, nos. 1–2 (2002): 5–29.

“Hasidic” vs. “Haredi” vs. “ultra-Orthodox”: Green, “How Hasidism Went Astray.”

**From the 1840s onward** The origins of Conservative Judaism are discussed in Gillman, *Conservative Judaism*; idem, “Judaism’s Fragile Center: JTS and the Conservative Movement,” *Christianity and Crisis*, June 10, 1991, 198–202; Louis Jacobs, “Rabbi Zechariah Frankel,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/rabbi-zechariah-frankel](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/rabbi-zechariah-frankel); Sherman, “Orthodox Judaism in America.”

**Some cite a mid-nineteenth-century rabbi** On Zechariah Frankel and the origins of Conservative Judaism, see Gillman, *Conservative Judaism*, 22.

**Less than ten years later** See Gillman, *Conservative Judaism*, 22.

**Like Reform Judaism** The term *treif* refers to the biblical prohibition (Exod. 22:30) against eating food that was torn by wild animals; see “Treyf: a Yiddish Word Meaning Non-Kosher,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/treyf](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/treyf).

Degrees of kashrut: See the section “*Meta-Halakhah* and *Kashrut*” in chapter 5.

*Treifa* banquet and the emergence of Conservative Judaism: According to scholar Lance Sussman (“Myth of the Trefa Banquet,” 44), “The controversy following the Trefa Banquet, its denominational consequences, and the deepening problems in the U.S. kosher food industry in the 1880s probably neither slowed nor accelerated the pace of radicalization within the Reform movement.” Cincinnati Reform Jewish norms aside, prior to the 1880s many Reform synagogues

did keep the halakhic laws of kashrut, such as Baltimore’s Har Sinai (est. 1842) and New York’s Emanu-El (est. 1843). As historian Leon Jick notes, “Even radical congregations . . . ‘remained substantially traditional in their ritual practice. Men and women were seated separately, heads were covered, and the Sabbath and dietary laws were strictly observed’” (Jick, “The Reform Synagogue,” in *The American Synagogue: A Sanctuary Transformed*, ed. Jack Wertheimer [Hanover, NH: University Press of New England, 1987], 86). Indeed, when the UAHC met in New York City in 1879 for a different banquet, the food was kosher (Sussman, “Myth of the Trefa Banquet”).

**SPECIAL TOPIC 8.2** Sussman, “Myth of the Trefa Banquet.”

**Although JTS would become the central institution** On the founding of the Jewish Theological Seminary in New York City, see Gillman, *Conservative Judaism*, 30–40.

**By 1900, out of the eleven synagogues** The distinctions between Reform and non-Reform practices are discussed in Glazer, *American Judaism*, 58.

**That same year, one of the most respected** Michael R. Cohen, *The Birth of Conservative Judaism: Solomon Schechter’s Disciples and the Creation of an American Religious Movement* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2012).

Solomon Schechter, founder of JTS: Gillman, *Conservative Judaism*, 32–40.

It wasn’t until 1913: According to this argument, JTS was still Orthodox as of 1902, pre-schism. Then Schechter took over. Only after this point did this community begin to develop its own distinct institutions, such as the United Synagogue of America, which was an alternative to the UAHC and OU.

**Others say that the line** On both the split in the late 1940s and the required course about Conservatism Judaism, see Cohen, *The Birth of Conservative Judaism*; Gillman, *Conservative Judaism*. See Notes, chapter 8, “Rabbi Mordecai Kaplan,” regarding the perception of Mordecai Kaplan’s rabbinic bonafides by his employers at Kehillath Jeshurun, an Orthodox synagogue in New York City where he worked early on in his career.

See also *Emet ve’Emunah: Statement of Principles of Conservative Judaism* (New York: Jewish Theological Seminary, Rabbinical Assembly, and United Synagogue of America, 1988).

**In 1900, the JTS community** On the early years of JTS as Modern Orthodox, see Glazer, *American Judaism*, 58.

Gurock quote: Jeffrey S. Gurock, *American Jewish Orthodoxy in Historical Perspective* (Hoboken, NJ: KTAV Publishing, 1996), 36–37.

**Explaining why people were drawn** Gurock quote: Gurock, *American Jewish Orthodoxy*, 36–37.

Regarding the “‘churchlike’ religious radicalism of Reform,” consider the following anecdote: In 1910, the well-known Reform rabbi Judah Magnes shared a story with his congregants at New York City’s Temple Emanu-El about a non-Jew who visited the synagogue on a Sunday thinking it was a church; it was not until the service was well under way

that he realized he was not in a Christian house of worship (Judah L. Magnes, “Reformed Judaism—Plans for Reconstruction,” sermon of April 24, 1910, cited in Glazer, *American Judaism*, 46).

**SPECIAL TOPIC 8.3** Some say a synagogue in Charleston, South Carolina: Karla Goldman, “When the Women Came to Shul,” in *Judaism since Gender*, ed. Miriam Peskowitz and Laura Levitt (New York: Routledge, 1997), 58.

One community was even taken to court: *Katz v. Singerman*, 241 Louisiana 154 (1961), in Jonathan D. Sarna, “The Debate over Mixed Seating in the American Synagogue,” in Wertheimer (ed.), *The American Synagogue*, 380.

Mid-twentieth century: Louis Bernstein, *Challenge and Mission: The Emergence of the English Speaking Orthodox Rabbinate* (New York: Shengold, 1982), 20–21, 36, 46–49, 138–141, in “The Debate,” 380; *Katz v. Singerman*, 241 Louisiana 154 (1961), in Sarna, “The Debate,” 380; “Opinion in Kahila Kodesh Adath Israel Congregation Matter” (Cincinnati, 1954, mimeographed), 42, in Sarna “The Debate,” 380.

General reference for special topic 8.3: Sarna, “The Debate,” 363–394.

**Scholar Jack Wertheimer** Wertheimer continues: “They sought a refined synagogue service, sermons in the vernacular, mixed seating of men and women, and a shift from an adult-centered religion to a child-centered one. Reform temples would not do; they were often socially exclusive enclaves, and their services were too church-like to appeal to the children of East European immigrants. Instead, this generation overwhelmingly opted for the Conservative synagogue. . . . Conservative Judaism arose as a modernizing movement in defiance of Orthodoxy, and its religious conservatism was more nostalgic than ideological in nature” (Jack Wertheimer, “The Perplexities of Conservative Judaism,” *Commentary* 124, no. 2 [September 2007]: 38–44).

**Since its inception** On the size of the movement, see Steven Bayme, “American Jewry’s Future as Seen Fifty Years Ago and Now,” *Changing Jewish Communities* 49, no. 15 (September 2009), available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=4590](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=4590); Gillman, *Conservative Judaism*, 64–65; Sidney Goldstein and Alice Goldstein, “Conservative Jewry in the United States: Evolution through Denominational Switching,” *Jewish Population Studies* 29 (1997): 295–316.

**Largely in response to the changing social norms** Prior to 1984, as a graduate student, Eilberg had taken a number of courses at JTS and elsewhere that applied toward her rabbinic degree (i.e., she didn’t complete the rabbinical program in one year). As JTS was considering this decision for a number of years, Eilberg had optimistically anticipated their eventual admittance of women, and thus had taken courses ahead of time accordingly. See Lila Corwin Ber- man, “Amy Eilberg,” Jewish Women’s Archive, <http://jwa.org/encyclopedia/article/eilberg-amy>.

**In 2007, JTS began accepting** For various positions on homosexuality at different Conservative-affiliated rabbinical schools, see “Judaism and Sexual Orientation.”

Rabbinic Assembly position: Jewish Telegraphic Agency, “Conservative Rabbis Approve Same-Sex Marriage,” June 26, 2012, available at [www.jpost.com/Jewish-World/Jewish-News/Conservative-rabbis-approve-same-sex-marriage](http://www.jpost.com/Jewish-World/Jewish-News/Conservative-rabbis-approve-same-sex-marriage).

**Rabbi Mordecai Kaplan** On Mordecai Kaplan’s early career, see American-Israeli Cooperative Enterprise, “Rabbi Mordecai Kaplan,” [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/biography/kaplan.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/biography/kaplan.html).

Second rabbinic ordination: According to scholar Pamela S. Nadell, while serving the community of Kehillath Jesu- hurun Kaplan’s official titled was “minister,” not “rabbi,” “reflecting that [the Jewish Theological] Seminary did not confer *semichah*, the classical formula for rabbinic ordina- tion. Subsequently, while on his honeymoon in 1908, he received *semichah* from Rabbi Isaac Jacob Reines of Lida, Russia, the founding head of the Zionist religious Mizrachi movement” (idem, *Conservative Judaism in America: A Bio- graphical Dictionary and Sourcebook* [New York: Greenwood Press, 1988], 147). See also “Mordecai M. Kaplan (1881–1983), Lecture Notes,” Library, Jewish Theological Seminary, [www.jtsa.edu/The\\_Library/Collections/Archives/The\\_Ratner\\_Center/Finding\\_Aids\\_to\\_papers\\_of\\_Conservative\\_Rabbis\\_and\\_Synagogues/Kaplan\\_Mordecai\\_M.xml](http://www.jtsa.edu/The_Library/Collections/Archives/The_Ratner_Center/Finding_Aids_to_papers_of_Conservative_Rabbis_and_Synagogues/Kaplan_Mordecai_M.xml).

Society of the Advancement of Judaism: “History of the SAJ,” [www.thesaj.org/history-of-the-saj](http://www.thesaj.org/history-of-the-saj). Other sources say that Judah Magnes was the founder and first leader of SAJ; see, e.g., Arthur Hertzberg, ed., *The Zionist Idea: A Historical Analysis and Reader* (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 1997), 442—although in the same text it also says that Kaplan was SAJ’s founder (ibid., 535).

**In 1934 he published *Judaism as a Civilization*** Kaplan is quoted in Mel Scult, *The Radical American Judaism of Morde- cai M. Kaplan* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2014), 219–220. See also Mordecai M. Kaplan, *Judaism as a Civiliza- tion: Toward a Reconstruction of American-Jewish Life* (Phila- delphia: Jewish Publication Society, 2010).

**Perhaps most challenging** Kaplan, *Judaism as a Civiliza- tion*, 316.

**As for Judaism, Kaplan posited** Kaplan’s thought: Dan Cohn-Sherbok, *Fifty Key Thinkers* (New York: Routledge, 1997), 74–77; Mordecai M. Kaplan, *The Meaning of God in Mod- ern Jewish Religion* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1995); “Rabbi Mordecai Kaplan”; Robert Seltzer, “Morde- cai Kaplan: Founder of Reconstructionist Judaism,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/mordecai-kaplan-founder-of-reconstructionist-judaism](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/mordecai-kaplan-founder-of-reconstructionist-judaism).

**For some in the JTS establishment** On Kaplan’s daugh- ter’s Bat Mitzvah and pre-twentieth-century Italian Bnot Mitzvah, see “Judith Kaplan Celebrates First American Bat Mitzvah Ceremony,” March 18, 1922, *Jewish Women’s Archive*, <http://jwa.org/thisweek/mar/18/1922/judith-kaplan>; Zachary Silver, “The Excommunication of Mordecai Kaplan,” *Ameri- can Jewish Archives Journal* 62, no. 1 (2010): 21–48; Francesco Spagnolo, “Music and Synagogue Life,” in *Italia*, ed. Roni Weinstein (Jerusalem: Ben Tzvi Institute, 2013), 143–150;



idem, email to author, September 23, 2013. I thank Andrew Ramer for introducing me to Spagnolo's research on this issue.

**It wasn't this particular act** “First American Bat Mitzvah”; Silver, “Excommunication of Mordecai Kaplan.”

First effort at changing traditional liturgy: Silver, “Excommunication of Mordecai Kaplan,” 22.

Publicly burned his *Sabbath Prayer Book*: As scholar Zachary Silver notes, “On a basic level, a *siddur* differs from a *haggadah* because Sabbath *siddurim* are used weekly, whereas *haggadot* are used a maximum of twice yearly. Additionally, a *siddur* is a way for people to connect to the divine, whereas the *haggadah* facilitates Jews recalling a collective history. Both of these facts indicate that Kaplan's choice to publish the *haggadah* before the *siddur* served as a test to see how the Jewish world would respond to his liturgical works” (Silver, “Excommunication of Mordecai Kaplan,” 41n.9).

**The Reconstructionist Rabbinical College** On Kaplan's opposition to starting a new denomination, see Ellenson, “American Jewish Denominationalism,” 12.

**Ordained at Hebrew Union College** There are interesting parallels between Wine and Humanistic Judaism emerging out of the Reform movement, on the one hand, and Kaplan and Reconstructionist Judaism emerging out of Conservatism, on the other.

**Like other branches** Quote: Society for Humanistic Judaism, “13 Tough Questions,” [www.shj.org/humanistic-judaism/13-tough-questions](http://www.shj.org/humanistic-judaism/13-tough-questions). For more on the history of Humanistic Judaism, see Associated Press, “Sherwin Wine: Founded Humanistic Judaism's First Congregation,” *Washington Post*, July 24, 2007, [www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2007/07/22/AR2007072201381.html](http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2007/07/22/AR2007072201381.html).

**Their understanding of Judaism** Quote: Society for Humanistic Judaism, “13 Tough Questions.”

**As for whether they consider** Quote: Society for Humanistic Judaism, “13 Tough Questions.”

**Since 2000, this denomination** History of Humanistic Judaism: Associated Press, “Sherwin Wine”; Society for Humanistic Judaism, “13 Tough Questions.”

**Of all American Jewish movements** On the difficulty of categorizing Renewal Judaism, see Shaul Magid, “Jewish Renewal Movement,” in *Encyclopedia of Religion*, 2nd ed., vol. 7, ed. Lindsay Jones (Farmington Hills, MI.: Macmillan Reference USA, 2005), 4868–4874. For an analysis of Renewal Judaism as a particular manifestation of Jewish identities within the American context, as well as a deeper examination of the thought of Rabbi Zalman Schachter-Shalomi, see Shaul Magid, *American Post-Judaism: Identity and Renewal in a Postethnic Society* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2013). See also Michael Lerner, *Jewish Renewal: A Path to Healing and Transformation* (New York: Harper Perennial, 1995); Arthur Green, *Seek My Face, Speak My Name: A Contemporary Jewish Theology* (Northvale, NJ: Jason Aronson, 1992); idem, *Hyeh: A Kabbala for Tomorrow* (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights

Publishing, 2003); Zalman Schachter-Shalomi, *Fragments of a Future Scroll: Hasidism for the Aquarian Age* (Germantown, PA: Leaves of Grass Press, 1975); idem, *Wrapped in a Holy Flame: Teachings and Tales of the Hasidic Masters* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2003); Arthur I. Waskow, *Godwrestling* (New York: Schocken Books, 1978); idem, *Godwrestling, Round 2: Ancient Wisdom, Future Paths* (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 1998).

Quote: Marcia Prager, “What Is Jewish Renewal?,” <http://aleph.org/what-is-jewish-renewal-o>.

**FIGURE 8.6** Description of Romemu: “What Is Romemu?,” <http://romemu.org/what-is-romemu>.

Romemu and Jewish Renewal: “Jewish Renewal Defined,” <http://romemu.org/mission>.

**Drawing substantially on the ideas** On the founder of Renewal Judaism, see Ellen Singer, ed., *Paradigm Shift: From the Jewish Renewal Teachings of Reb Zalman Schachter-Shalomi* (New York: Rowman and Littlefield, 2005).

On not being “halakhic or anti-halakhic, but rather neo-halakhic,” see Marcia Prager, “Jewish Renewal,” <http://marcia.prager.com/jewish-renewal>.

Reb Zalman's early years: Reb Zalman and Reb Shlomo were sent out by the sixth Lubavitcher Rebbe, Joseph Schneerson, not the seventh, Menachem Mendel Schneerson, who is discussed in chapter 4.

Rabbi Shlomo Carlebach: Yaakov Ariel, “Hasidism in the Age of Aquarius: The House of Love and Prayer in San Francisco, 1967–1977,” *Religion and American Culture* 13, no. 2 (Summer 2003): 139–165.

Early years of Rabbis Schachter-Shalomi and Carlebach: Magid, “Jewish Renewal Movement.”

**Jewish Renewal's proper beginning** The B'nai Or Religious Fellowship changed its name to the P'nai Or (Faces of Light) Religious Fellowship in 1985. In 1993 it merged with another Jewish Renewal organization, the Shalom Center, which had been run by Rabbi Arthur Waskow, to form ALEPH. The Shalom Center again became an independent organization in 2005. See “About ALEPH,” <http://aleph.org/about-aleph>.

**From the outset, Renewal has self-identified** Other characteristics of Renewal Judaism: Debra Nussbaum Cohen, “Jewish Renewal,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-renewal/](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-renewal/); <http://aleph.org/>; [www.jewishrenewalct.org/renewal.html](http://www.jewishrenewalct.org/renewal.html).

**The denominational descriptions in this chapter** This is to say nothing of the fact that many non-Ashkenazi traditions have become integrated into Ashkenazi American ritual practices. See, e.g., Joseph A. Levine, ed., “Non-Ashkenazi Traditions,” *Journal of Synagogue Music* 38 (Fall 2013): 1–270, for essays on the influence of non-Ashkenazi music on Ashkenazi synagogue liturgy.

**One example is the Persian Jewish community** For more on Los Angeles-based Persian Jewish synagogues, see [www.nessah.org/about-nessah.shtml](http://www.nessah.org/about-nessah.shtml) and <http://sinaitemple.org>. Approximately half Ashkenazi Jews and half Persian Jews:

According to a synagogue administrator (email to author, October 21, 2015), Sinai Temple does not keep records regarding members' Jewish subidentities (e.g., Ashkenazi, Persian, etc.), nor do they track the number of attendees who are also dues-paying members of the synagogue. Thus this estimate is based on anecdotal evidence provided by a scholar of the Persian Jewish community who has also been a member of Sinai for more than three decades (Saba Soomekh, email to author, October 21, 2015). More to the point, even historically Ashkenazi-identified synagogues are not necessarily homogeneously Ashkenazi any more, such as Sinai Temple.

**Nevertheless, synagogue affiliation** As early as 1916 only 56 percent of American synagogues had a rabbi because there was a lack of institutional finances; see A. W. Rosenthal, "Cultural Changes in American Jewish Life in the Twentieth Century," *Proceedings of the National Conference of Jewish Social Service*, June 1930, 7. In a survey of first-generation Jewish Americans (the children of immigrants) conducted in 1935 in New York City, 72 percent of fifteen- to twenty-five-year-old men and 78 percent of fifteen- to twenty-five-year-old women said they had not attended synagogue even once the previous year (Glazer, *American Judaism*, 85).

**By the late 1950s** Quote: Lawrence Hoffman, "From Common Cold to Uncommon Healing," *CCAR Journal* 41 (Spring 1994): 10, quoted in Jack Wertheimer, "The American Synagogue: Recent Issues and Trends," *American Jewish Year Book*, ed. Lawrence Grossman and David Singer (New York: American Jewish Committee, 2005), 7.

Synagogue affiliation in early twenty-first century: Wertheimer, "The American Synagogue: Recent Issues and Trends," 7–19. See also Pew Research Center, "Portrait of Jewish Americans," 15.

Some, of course, choose not to become members of a synagogue largely because of the costs involved.

**Some attribute changes** Steven M. Cohen and Arnold M. Eisen, *The Jew Within: Self, Family, and Community in the United States* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2000). Other criteria that sociologists commonly cite to illustrate a commitment to Jewish identities are matriculation in Jewish parochial schools and summer overnight camps (see chapter 12). However, the proportion of American Jews either attending full-time Jewish parochial schools or summer overnight camp has never exceeded 10 percent; by some accounts, during the 1990s it was less than 5 percent (Wertheimer, "Jewish Education in the United States," 3–115).

Scholars Ari Y. Kelman and Tobin Belzer argue that younger Jews aren't overly focused on their individual selves. Rather, their Jewish identities are quite "social," interconnected with other Jews of their generation, an identity that might best be explained not as the "Sovereign Self" but the "Social Self" (Ari Y. Kelman, "Traditional Jews: 'Nones' on Religion," and Tobin Belzer, "Under Construction: The Social Life of Jewish Identity," Papers presented as part of the "Interrogating Identity: New Approaches to the Study of Jewish Adults" panel, Annual Conference of the Association for Jewish Studies, Boston, December 14, 2015).

**SPECIAL TOPIC 8.4 Institutions: Renewal:** Regarding the ALEPH rabbinical program, see Jewish Telegraphic Agency, "Renewal Wants to Keep Same Spirit While Standardizing Rabbis' Training," January 16, 2007, [www.jta.org/2007/01/16/archive/renewal-wants-to-keep-same-spirit-while-standardizing-rabbis-training](http://www.jta.org/2007/01/16/archive/renewal-wants-to-keep-same-spirit-while-standardizing-rabbis-training). Regarding Ohalah, see Sholom Groesberg, *Jewish Renewal: A Journey, The Movement's History, Ideology, and Future* (New York: iUniverse, 2009), 69. See also Cohen, "Jewish Renewal."

What percentage of American Jews affiliate with you? Jonathan Ament, "National Jewish Population Survey, 2000–01: American Jewish Religious Denominations," United Jewish Communities, New York, February 2005; Hasia Diner, *Jews of the United States, 1654–2000* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), 122; Goldstein and Goldstein, "Conservative Jewry," 295–316; Abraham J. Karp, "A Century of Conservative Judaism in the United States," *American Jewish Year Book* (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 1986), 3–61; Barry A. Kosmin, Sidney Goldstein, Joseph Waksberg, Nava Lerer, Ariela Keysar, and Jeffrey Scheckner, *Highlights of the CJF 1990 National Jewish Population Survey* (New York: Council of Jewish Federations, 1991); Bernard Lazewitz, J. Alan Winter, Arnold Dashefsky, and Ephraim Tabory, "A Study of Jewish Denominational Preferences: Summary Findings," *American Jewish Year Book* (New York: American Jewish Committee, 1997), 115–137; Pew Research Center, "Portrait of Jewish Americans."

What is your definition of a Jew? Reform: CCAR, "38. Patrilineal and Matrilineal Descent." Reconstructionist: Based on conversations the author had with both pulpit rabbis and RRC administrators and rabbis. According to the following article, however, the Reconstructionist movement has a required conversion process: Lena Romanoff, "Cross-Denominational Differences Regarding Conversion," *Your People, My People: Finding Acceptance and Fulfillment as a Jew by Choice*, available at [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/cross-denominational-differences-regarding-conversion/#](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/cross-denominational-differences-regarding-conversion/#). Humanistic: "Becoming a Humanistic Jew," Society for Humanistic Judaism, [www.shj.org/humanistic-jewish-life/life-cycles/becoming-a-humanistic-jew](http://www.shj.org/humanistic-jewish-life/life-cycles/becoming-a-humanistic-jew); "Society for Humanistic Supports IFSHJ Statement: Who Is a Jew?," Society for Humanistic Judaism, [www.shj.org/humanistic-jewish-life/issues-and-resolutions/who-is](http://www.shj.org/humanistic-jewish-life/issues-and-resolutions/who-is). Renewal: see, e.g., how one Renewal synagogue in Berkeley, CA, Beyt Tikun, responds to the notion of conversion, in "Conversion," [www.beyttikun.org/article.php/conversation](http://www.beyttikun.org/article.php/conversation).

What is the Torah's authority? Reform: "What Is Reform Judaism?," Union for Reform Judaism, [www.urj.org/what-we-believe/what-reform-judaism](http://www.urj.org/what-we-believe/what-reform-judaism). Conservative: *Emet ve'Emunah*, 19. Reconstructionist: "FAQs on Reconstructionist Approaches to Jewish Ideas and Practices," Jewish Reconstructionist Communities, <http://jewishrecon.org/resource/faqs-reconstructionist-approaches-jewish-ideas-and-practices>. Humanistic: Society for Humanistic Judaism, "What Is Humanistic Judaism?," [www.shj.org/humanistic-judaism/what-is-humanistic-judaism](http://www.shj.org/humanistic-judaism/what-is-humanistic-judaism). Renewal: "Whether considered

the literal Word of God or the words of God-inspired human beings, The Torah's words possess unsurpassed authority" (Groesberg, *Jewish Renewal*, 77; see also 77–79).

What should a Jew's relationship to halakhah be? Reform: Mark Washofsky, "Reform Judaism and Halakhah," [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/reform-judaism-halakhah](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/reform-judaism-halakhah). Reconstructionist: "FAQs on Reconstructionist Approaches." Humanistic: "Society for Humanistic Mission Statement," [www.shj.org/humanistic-jewish-life/issues-and-resolutions/core-principles](http://www.shj.org/humanistic-jewish-life/issues-and-resolutions/core-principles). Renewal: ALEPH, "What Is Jewish Renewal?," <http://aleph.org/what-is-jewish-renewal>; Marcia Prager, "KOL ALEPH: The Voice of ALEPH: Alliance for Jewish Renewal," <http://kolaleph.org/about/what-is-jewish-renewal/>.

What is your position on women becoming rabbis? Orthodox: Ben Harris, "For Graduates of Avi Weiss' Academy, Ordination Comes with Controversy," *Jewish Telegraphic Agency*, June 18, 2013, [www.jta.org/2013/06/18/life-religion/for-graduates-of-avi-weiss-academy-ordination-comes-with-controversy](http://www.jta.org/2013/06/18/life-religion/for-graduates-of-avi-weiss-academy-ordination-comes-with-controversy); Batya Ungar-Sargon, "Orthodox Yeshiva Set to Ordain Three Women. Just Don't Call Them 'Rabbi,'" *Tablet Magazine*, June 10, 2013, [www.tabletmag.com/jewish-life-and-religion/134369/orthodox-women-ordained](http://www.tabletmag.com/jewish-life-and-religion/134369/orthodox-women-ordained). Reform: "What Is Reform Judaism?" Renewal: Prager, "KOL ALEPH."

What is your position on queer-identified Jews becoming rabbis? Regarding term *queer*, see special topic 0.2. Reform: "Judaism and Sexual Orientation"; "What Is Reform Judaism?" Conservative: "Judaism and Sexual Orientation"; Jewish Telegraphic Agency, "Conservative Rabbis Approve Same-Sex Marriage." Reconstructionist: "FAQs on Reconstructionist Approaches." Humanistic: "Society for Humanistic Judaism Supports Rights of Same-Sex Couples," [www.shj.org/humanistic-jewish-life/issues-and-resolutions/marriage-equality](http://www.shj.org/humanistic-jewish-life/issues-and-resolutions/marriage-equality).

What is your position on Jews marrying non-Jews? Reform: "A Statement of Principles for Reform Judaism," Central Conference of American Rabbis, May 1999, <http://ccarnet.org/rabbis-speak/platforms/statement-principles-reform-judaism>. See also Central Conference of American Rabbis, Contemporary American Reform Responsa, "149. Rabbi Officiating at a Mixed Marriage," 1982, <http://ccarnet.org/response/arr-467-470>. Humanistic: Society for Humanistic Judaism, "13 Tough Questions."

**In addition to those Jewish Americans** Steven M. Cohen, "Non-denominational and Post-denominational: Two Tendencies in American Jewry," *Contact* 7, no. 4 (Summer 2005): 7–8; Pew Research Center, "Portrait of Jewish Americans," 7, 10.

**The 2013 Pew study** Pew Research Center, "Portrait of Jewish Americans," 7–16.

Patterns of thought and behavior in larger non-Jewish communities: See, e.g., Arnold M. Eisen, "The Rhetoric of Chosenness and the Fabrication of American Jewish Identity," in *American Pluralism and the Jewish Community*, ed. Seymour Martin Lipset (New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 1990), 53–69.

**Clearly, categorizing twenty-first-century Jews** Quip regarding JTS: Gillman, *Conservative Judaism*, 119.

**For Orthodox Jews immigrating** Diner, *Jews of the United States*, 131–132 (quote and 1913 study).

**Chapter 12 will touch on** Nondenominationalism and transdenominationalism: There are at least three rabbinical schools in the United States that do not affiliate with a denomination: the Academy for Jewish Religion in New York, founded in 1956 (<http://ajrsem.org/about/>); the Academy for Jewish Religion in California, founded in 2000 (<http://ajrca.edu/history/>); and the Hebrew College Rabbinical School, founded in 2003 and located just outside Boston ([www.hebrewcollege.edu/history](http://www.hebrewcollege.edu/history)). In the literature of these three schools one finds terms such as *pluralistic*, *non-denominational*, *post-denominational*, *trans-denominational*, and *unaffiliated*. Each school has its own requirements regarding who is eligible to apply.

## Chapter 9. Genocides

**That said, I cannot overstate** The centrality of the Shoah is often inversely related to the age of a given Jew, it being much more significant to an average Jew in her eighties and much less so to one in her twenties. This is touched on further in chapters 10 and 12.

**The term genocide** Dan Stone, "Raphael Lemkin on the Holocaust," *Journal of Genocide Research* 7, no. 4 (2005): 539–550. Lemkin began his professional research on genocide in 1933, prior to World War II. But the first time he used the word in print was in 1944, in one of his most famous books, *Axis Rule in Occupied Europe: Analysis, Proposals for Redress* (Washington, DC: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, 1944).

**Largely thanks to Lemkin's tireless efforts** Office of the UN Special Adviser on the Prevention of Genocide, "Analysis Framework," [www.un.org/en/preventgenocide/adviser/pdf/osapg\\_analysis\\_framework.pdf](http://www.un.org/en/preventgenocide/adviser/pdf/osapg_analysis_framework.pdf).

**The genocide of Jews during World War II** Two websites offering excellent online educational resources on the Shoah are the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum (USHMM; [www.ushmm.org](http://www.ushmm.org)) and Yad Vashem: The Holocaust Martyrs' and Heroes' Remembrance Authority ([www.yadvashem.org](http://www.yadvashem.org)).

**Term Holocaust:** Some don't use the term *Holocaust* because of its theological insinuation (i.e., those who were exterminated in World War II were a sacrifice to God—based on the word's Greek etymology). Others avoid the word *Shoah* because it refers only to the Jewish genocide of WWII and does not include the other communities the Nazis targeted and murdered. See, e.g., Bob Brecher, "Holocaust," in *The International Encyclopedia of Ethics*, ed. Hugh LaFollette (New York: Blackwell, 2013), 2431–2434; "History and Meaning of the Word 'Holocaust': Are We Still Comfortable with This Term?," *Huffington Post*, January 27, 2012, [www.huffpost.com](http://www.huffpost.com)



.huffingtonpost.com/2012/01/27/the-word-holocaust-history-and-meaning\_n\_1229043; *Oxford Dictionaries*, “holocaust,” [www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/holocaust](http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/holocaust); Yad Vashem: The Holocaust Martyrs’ and Heroes’ Remembrance Authority, “The Holocaust: Definition and Preliminary Discussion,” [www.yadvashem.org/yv/en/holocaust/resource\\_center/the\\_holocaust.asp](http://www.yadvashem.org/yv/en/holocaust/resource_center/the_holocaust.asp).

**Under the leadership of Adolf Hitler** During World War II, one-quarter of all European Roma were murdered, approximately 220,000 individuals. See USHMM, “Genocide of European Roma (Gypsies), 1939–1945,” [www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10005219](http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10005219).

Disabled or non-abled bodied: Between 1939 and 1945 approximately 200,000 disabled or non-abled bodied people were exterminated by the Nazis. See USHMM, “The Murder of the Handicapped,” [www.ushmm.org/outreach/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007683](http://www.ushmm.org/outreach/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007683).

Jehovah’s Witnesses: If members of the Jehovah’s Witnesses renounced their community’s beliefs, their lives would have theoretically been spared, as opposed to other targeted groups that were not given such a choice. Approximately 1,500 Jehovah’s Witnesses were killed during the war. See USHMM, “Jehovah’s Witnesses,” [www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10005394](http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10005394).

Homosexuals: “Between 1933 and 1945, an estimated 100,000 men were arrested for homosexuality, and of these, approximately 50,000 were sentenced for the crime. Most of these men spent time in regular prisons. An estimated 5,000–15,000 were sent to concentration camps where an unknown number of them perished” (USHMM, “United States Holocaust Memorial Museum Opens Exhibition on the Nazi Persecution of Homosexuals,” [www.ushmm.org/information/press/press-releases/united-states-holocaust-memorial-museum-opens-exhibition-on-the-nazi-persec](http://www.ushmm.org/information/press/press-releases/united-states-holocaust-memorial-museum-opens-exhibition-on-the-nazi-persec)).

Roughly fifty million: Adam Jones, “The Jewish Holocaust,” in *Genocide: A Comprehensive Introduction*, 2nd ed. (New York: Routledge, 2011), 233–282.

Two of every three Jews in Europe and one of every three Jews in the world: Michael Berenbaum and Fred Skolnik, eds., “Population,” *Encyclopedia Judaica* (Detroit, MI: Macmillan Reference USA, 2007), 397–398; USHMM, “Jewish Life in Europe Before the Holocaust,” [www.ushmm.org/outreach/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007689](http://www.ushmm.org/outreach/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007689); idem, “Victims of the Nazi Era: Nazi Racial Ideology,” [www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007457](http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007457).

**Adolf Hitler and the Nazi party** An excellent resource on the situation in Germany during the sixty years preceding the Shoah is Ian Kershaw, *Hitler, 1889–1936: Hubris* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1999). See also Richard S. Levy, “Antisemitism,” in *The Oxford Handbook of Holocaust Studies*, ed. Peter Hayes and John K. Roth (Oxford Handbooks Online, 2011).

**Within a few years, Germany’s legal definitions** On racially based laws in Germany and the United States, see Judy Scales-Trent, “Racial Purity Laws in the United States and Nazi Germany: The Targeting Process,” *Human Rights Quarterly* 23, no. 2 (May 2001): 259–307.

Richard Miller quote: In Bill Ezzell, “Laws of Racial Identification and Racial Purity in Nazi Germany and the United States: Did Jim Crow Write the Laws That Spawned the Holocaust?,” *Southern University Law Review* 30, no. 1 (Fall 2002): 6–7.

**Initially, the Nazis defined two types of Jews** According to Peter Black, senior historian at USHMM: “In areas where the Nuremberg Laws applied (Greater Germany, Holland) and generally in Western Europe, where the Germans more or less respected indigenous legal definitions of what constituted a ‘Jew,’ those with a single Jewish grandparent were not subject to deportations or killing. In occupied Eastern Europe (not the territory of Germany’s Axis partners), such distinctions did not exist in practice” (email to author, November 1, 2013).

**Jews were gradually prohibited** “Certificate of racial composition”: Black, email to author; Ezzell, “Laws of Racial Identification”; Deborah E. Lipstadt, “The Holocaust Is Humanity’s Greatest Failure,” *Guardian*, September 8, 2009, [www.theguardian.com/world/2009/sep/09/holocaust-analysis-deborah-lipstadt-germany](http://www.theguardian.com/world/2009/sep/09/holocaust-analysis-deborah-lipstadt-germany); Scales-Trent, “Racial Purity Laws.”

Racially based definitions in the United States: Similar to this stage in Germany’s history, the United States had anti-miscegenation laws—those prohibiting people from particular racial classification groups from having sexual intercourse with one another—for most of its history. Up until 1967, sixteen states still declared it illegal for “different races” to have sexual relations (Scales-Trent, “Racial Purity Laws”).

**Laws against sexual relations** Scholars maintain that in nineteenth- and twentieth-century Australia, one of the ways the colonialist government attempted to control, and arguably exterminate, those indigenous to continental Australia—Aboriginals and Torres Strait Islanders—was to “breed out their color.” In other words, at times they encouraged sexual relations between whites and Aboriginals because each successive generation had lighter skin. See, e.g., Russell McGregor, “‘Breed Out the Colour,’ or the Importance of Being White,” *Australian Historical Studies* 33, no. 120 (October 2002): 286–302; Peter Read, *The Stolen Generations: The Removal of Aboriginal People in NSW 1883 to 1969* (Sydney: NSW Ministry of Aboriginal Affairs, 1981), 5–8.

**However, as scholar George Mosse points out** George Mosse, *Toward a Final Solution: A History of European Racism* (New York: Fertig, 1985), 92–99, cited in Melanie Kaye/Kantrowitz, *The Colors of Jews: Racial Politics and Radical Diasporism* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2007), 15–16.

**Germans who fit the legal category** Nazi definitions of Jews: USHMM, “The Nuremberg Race Laws,” [www.ushmm.org/outreach/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007695](http://www.ushmm.org/outreach/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007695).

**FIGURE 9.2** See also USHMM, “Classification System in Nazi Concentration Camps,” [www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10005378](http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10005378).

**Another example** Yom Hashoah is the colloquial name for this solemn day; formally, it is called *Yom haZikaron laS-*

*hoah ve'laGevurah* (lit., the Day of Remembrance for the Shoah and Heroism).

It is relevant to note that (a) the principal of the school involved, the Kedma School, was Sami Shalom Chetrit, a scholar mentioned in chapters 1 and 10, and later in this chapter, and (b) the seventh candle, though representing genocides carried out against non-Jewish communities, was lit by a Shoah survivor. See Avner Ben-Amos and Ilana Bet-el, "Commemoration and National Identity: Memorial Ceremonies in Israeli Schools," in *Homelands and Diasporas: Holy Lands and Other Places*, ed. Andrew Levy and Alex Weinrood (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2004), 169–199; Sami Shalom Chetrit, "The Jewish Holocaust and the Universal Lesson" [Hebrew], in Yochai Oppenheimer, "The Holocaust: A Mizrahi Perspective," trans. Batya Stein, *Hebrew Studies* 51 (2010): 305; Shoshana Madmoni-Gerber, Review of *Intra-Jewish Conflict in Israel: White Jews, Black Jews*, by Sami Shalom-Chetrit, *Holy Land Studies* 9, no. 1 (May 2010): 121–123. For an analysis of the development of such commemoration ceremonies in Israel, see Doron Bar, "Holocaust Commemoration in Israel during the 1950s: The Holocaust Cellar on Mount Zion," *Jewish Social Studies: History, Culture, and Society* 12, no. 1 (Fall 2005): 16–38.

**This incident raised** On comparing two different things, see, e.g., Jonathan Z. Smith, *Imagining Religion: From Babylon to Jonestown* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982), xiii, 19–35.

**As for those who argued** Jewish genocide and Native American genocide: Steven T. Katz, "The 'Unique' Intentionality of the Holocaust," *Modern Judaism* 1, no. 2 (September 1981): 168–170. In his book *The Holocaust in Historical Context*, vol. 1: *The Holocaust and Mass Death before the Modern Age* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994), Katz, a notable scholar of Holocaust Studies who was chosen to become the first president of the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, lays out a rigorous definition for genocide, which includes the specific intention to eradicate a group from the face of the planet. In that sense, he says, the Shoah is the only true genocide ever to have taken place. Along the way he rebuts Raphael Lemkin's definition of genocide, which includes comparisons to other massacres. As for Katz's intentions for making this argument, he says: "My purpose is to make a fundamental methodological observation about how much of the variegated history of persecution is now being rewritten" (19). In short, he holds that the Shoah is unique (25).

African slave trade: Jeffrey Herf, "Comparative Perspectives on Anti-Semitism, Radical Anti-Semitism in the Holocaust, and American White Racism," *Journal of Genocide Research* 9, no. 4 (December 2007): 575–600.

Speed of Rwandan genocide: Jones, "The Jewish Holocaust," 254.

**Such lines of reasoning** Yehuda Bauer, "On the Holocaust and Other Genocides," Joseph and Rebecca Meyerhoff Annual Lecture, Center for Advanced Holocaust Studies,

October 5, 2006, 9–10, available at [www.ushmm.org/m/pdfs/20070215-bauer.pdf](http://www.ushmm.org/m/pdfs/20070215-bauer.pdf).

**A few years ago, Bauer** Bauer, "On the Holocaust and Other Genocides," 9–15. Bauer suggests replacing *unique* with *unprecedented*, but this linguistic substitution does not necessarily help deexceptionalize the Shoah. On the contrary, this argument seems to put Bauer in agreement with Katz (*Holocaust in Historical Context*, 131) as to the exceptional historical properties of the Shoah. Perhaps the main distinction is that whereas Katz is concerned with whether this event should be seen as "outside of history," Bauer focuses on the Shoah as a new form of genocide, one that may be replicated in the future.

**The United States Holocaust Memorial Museum** USHMM, "Guidelines for Teaching about the Holocaust," [www.ushmm.org/educators/teaching-about-the-holocaust/general-teaching-guidelines#define](http://www.ushmm.org/educators/teaching-about-the-holocaust/general-teaching-guidelines#define).

**If the Shoah is considered historically "unique"** On comparative oppression, see Henry L. Feingold, "How Unique Is the Holocaust?," *Genocide: Chap. 10, Implications*, pt. 1, Museum of Tolerance Online Multimedia Learning Center, <http://motlc.wiesenthal.com/site/pp.asp?c=gvKVLcMVluG&b=394855>.

**Yet comparing genocides** David Biale, Review of Steven Katz's *The Holocaust in Historical Context*, Vol. 1, *Tikkun* 10, no. 1 (January/February 1995): 79.

**The issue of the uniqueness** When teaching a course based on the content of this book, my students are given an assignment to interview someone who identifies as a Jew, no matter what age, and ask what role the Shoah plays in the individual's Jewish identity. Every semester, almost all those interviewed, even if they have no familial connection to the Holocaust, say that this event is notably influential in how they view the world.

Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs, "The Declaration of the Establishment of the State of Israel," May 14, 1948, [www.mfa.gov.il/MFA/ForeignPolicy/Peace/Guide/Pages/Declaration%20of%20Establishment%20of%20State%20of%20Israel.aspx](http://www.mfa.gov.il/MFA/ForeignPolicy/Peace/Guide/Pages/Declaration%20of%20Establishment%20of%20State%20of%20Israel.aspx).

It is unclear whether the members of the United Nations took the Shoah into account when deliberating the establishment of a new Jewish-majority country (i.e., Israel). It is not uncommon, especially in discussions regarding the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, to hear people say there is no hard evidence to make this case. There are even those, scholars and others, who argue that the Shoah and the establishment of the Jewish State are linked only because of their proximity in time; e.g., Evyatar Friesel, "On the Myth of the Connection between the Holocaust and the Creation of Israel," *Israel Affairs* 14, no. 3 (July 2008): 446–466. Based on the literal text of the Declaration of the Establishment of the State of Israel, however, it is abundantly clear that for Jewish Israelis the two events cannot be separated.

**FIGURE 9.3B** Stand with Us: Alexandra Lapkin, "War Stories from the Israeli Front Line," *Jewish Advocate*, April

16, 2015, available at [www.standwithus.com/news/article.asp?id=3888](http://www.standwithus.com/news/article.asp?id=3888).

**Since roughly half of Israeli Jews** “The Jewish genocide primarily affected Ashkenazi Jews”: A small number of non-Ashkenazi Jews—in Iraq, Greece, and North Africa—were murdered during World War II as a direct result of Nazi actions. For example, in Iraq, where there was a pro-Nazi regime, Jews were targeted in several unofficial riots; in Greece, Sephardi Jews were murdered in Nazi death camps; and in Algeria, Libya, Morocco, and Tunisia, parts of which were Nazi-controlled areas, Jews were sent to European death camps. See Hanna Yablonka, “Oriental Jewry and the Holocaust: A Tri-Generational Perspective,” *Israel Studies* 14, no. 1 (2008): 96, cited in Oppenheimer, “Holocaust,” 306nn.3–5; also *ibid.*, 325). This said, the Shoah primarily affected Ashkenazi Jews in terms of direct deaths.

Yochai Oppenheimer reference: Natasha Goldman, “Israeli Holocaust Memorial Strategies at Yad Vashem: From Silence to Recognition,” *Art Journal* 65, no. 2 (Summer 2006): 102–111. Also Oppenheimer, “Holocaust,” 303–328.

**Other non-Ashkenazi Jewish Israelis** In 2013, the Knesset endorsed a proposal to mark November 30 as a national day to commemorate the some 800,000 Jews who arrived in Israel in the 1950s, many of whom were forced to leave Muslim-majority countries following the establishment of the Jewish State; this has yet to become law. See “Knesset Committee Designates a Memorial Day for Jewish Refugees of Arab States,” July 15, 2013, [www.jns.org/news-briefs/2013/7/15/knesset-committee-designates-a-memorial-day-for-jewish-refugees-of-arab-states#.VkiIQqaT5NF=](http://www.jns.org/news-briefs/2013/7/15/knesset-committee-designates-a-memorial-day-for-jewish-refugees-of-arab-states#.VkiIQqaT5NF=); Shimon Ohayon, “Mizrahi Jews Deserve Memorial Day Too,” May 10, 2013, [www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4436289,00.html](http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4436289,00.html); Oppenheimer, “Holocaust,” 306n.5).

**This was not always the case** Adolf Eichmann was a high-ranking member of the German Nazi party and played a central role in the World War II genocide of Jews. In 1960, the Israeli government sent intelligence operatives to Argentina, where Eichmann had gone into hiding after the war, to kidnap him and bring him to the State of Israel to stand trial for war crimes. In 1962, Eichmann was found guilty and sentenced to death, the only time in Israeli history that a criminal court instituted the death penalty. The trial received a great deal of media coverage; reporters had access to the entire trial via closed-circuit television. It is also said to have led to a shift in dominant Jewish Israeli narratives, especially in terms of the treatment of Shoah survivors. Many Jews felt more compassion for those who survived the war after hearing testimony after testimony regarding what the survivors went through. See USHMM, “Adolf Eichmann,” [www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007412](http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007412); “Eichmann Trial,” . . . =10005179.

Holocaust education: Zehavit Gross, “Holocaust Education in Jewish Schools in Israel: Goals, Dilemmas, Challenges,” *Prospects* 40, no. 1 (March 2010): 93–113, esp. 94–96; Zehavit Gross and E. Doyle Stevick, eds., *As the Witnesses Fall Silent: 21st-Century Holocaust Education in Curriculum, Policy,*

*and Practice* (New York: Springer International, 2015); Baruch Kimmerling, *Immigrants, Settlers, Natives: The Israeli State and Society between Cultural Pluralism and Cultural Wars* (Tel Aviv: Am Oved, 2004) [Hebrew]; Dalia Ofer, “We Israelis Remember, but How? The Memory of the Holocaust and the Israeli Experience,” *Israel Studies* 18, no. 2 (Summer 2013): 80; Dan A. Porat, “From the Scandal to the Holocaust in Israeli Education,” *Journal of Contemporary History* 39 (2004): 619–636; Anita Shapira, *New Jews, Old Jews* (Tel Aviv: Am Oved, 1997) [Hebrew].

Beginning Holocaust education in kindergarten: Stephanie Butnick, “Israel to Teach about Holocaust in Kindergarten,” *Tablet Magazine*, April 24, 2010, [www.tabletmag.com/scroll/170448/israel-to-teach-about-holocaust-in-kindergarten](http://www.tabletmag.com/scroll/170448/israel-to-teach-about-holocaust-in-kindergarten); Lidar Grávė-Lazi, “New Holocaust Education Program in Israel to Start in Kindergarten,” *Jerusalem Post*, April 24, 2014, [www.jpost.com/National-News/New-Holocaust-education-program-in-Israel-to-start-in-kindergarten-350335](http://www.jpost.com/National-News/New-Holocaust-education-program-in-Israel-to-start-in-kindergarten-350335); Yarden Skop, “Israel Unveils New Holocaust Studies Program Starting in Kindergarten,” *Haaretz*, April 24, 2014, [www.haaretz.com/news/national/premium-1.587252](http://www.haaretz.com/news/national/premium-1.587252).

**A second argument** Final Solution: Gross, “Holocaust Education”; Lipstadt, “Holocaust”; Porat, “From the Scandal.”

**In a related argument** Itzhak Ben-Zvi stated: “Israel’s victory [in 1948] was followed by an armistice; those who had intended following in the footsteps of their Nazi masters had no time to carry out their nefarious designs, and the Jews in Moslem lands had a respite” (Itzhak Ben-Zvi, *The Exiled and the Redeemed* [Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 1957], 8, quoted in Sammy Smooha, *Israel: Pluralism and Conflict* [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978], 372).

**A fifth explanation** On Ashkenazi shaping of the master Zionist narrative, see Rusi Jaspal and Maya A. Yampolsky, “Social Representations of the Holocaust and Jewish Israeli Identity Construction: Insights from Identity Process Theory,” *Social Identities* 17, no. 2 (March 2011): 201–224; Ofer, “We Israelis Remember,” 70–85; Sammy Smooha, “Ashkenazi Hegemony,” *New Outlook* 24, no. 6 (July–August 1981): 17–21; Hanna Yablonka, “Oriental Jewry and the Holocaust: A Tri-Generational Perspective,” *Israel Studies* 14, no. 1 (Spring 2009): 94–122.

**The denial of the Jewish genocide** IGSA quote: Adam Jones, “International Genocide Scholars Association Officially Recognizes Assyrian, Greek Genocides,” December 15, 2007, [www.aina.org/news/20071215131949.htm](http://www.aina.org/news/20071215131949.htm).

**Raphael Lemkin also raised** Lemkin is quoted in John Docker, *Raphael Lemkin’s History of Genocide and Colonialism* (Washington, DC: United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, 2004), 3, cited in Stone, “Raphael Lemkin,” 549n.9.

Nazi intentions beyond physical genocide of Jews: Some maintain that the Nazis had plans to establish a so-called Museum of an Extinct Race, focusing on the soon-to-be extinct Jewish race. There is little evidence to support this



claim, however. See, e.g., Leo Pavlát, “The Jewish Museum in Prague during the Second World War,” *European Judaism* 41, no. 1 (Spring 2008): 124–130.

**The term cultural genocide** Frank Lightvoet, “Purple Boots, Silver Stars . . . and White Parents,” *New York Times*, October 13, 2013, [www.nytimes.com/2013/10/14/opinion/purple-boots-silver-stars-and-white-parents.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2013/10/14/opinion/purple-boots-silver-stars-and-white-parents.html).

**Jews such as those affiliated** Aish Hatorah quote: Yonason Rosenblum, “The Spiritual Holocaust,” *Kiruv*, Aish Hatorah International, [www.kiruv.com/articles/457/the-spiritual-holocaust](http://www.kiruv.com/articles/457/the-spiritual-holocaust).

**Similarly, some in the ultra-Orthodox community** Inter-marriage as “spiritual genocide”: “Israeli Yated: Chelsea’s Marriage a ‘Spiritual Holocaust,’” August 4, 2010, <http://matzav.com/israeli-yated-chelseas-marriage-a-spiritual-holocaust>; Kobi Nahshoni, “‘Chelsea’s Marriage a Spiritual Shoah’: Haredi Newspaper Devotes Editorial to Chelsea Clinton’s Wedding, Slams Assimilation,” August 4, 2010, [www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-3929754,00.html](http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-3929754,00.html).

Norman Lamm quote: In Peter Novick, *The Holocaust in American Life* (New York: Mariner Books, 2000), 185.

**A second type of cultural genocide** Sami Shalom Chetrit, “Mizrahi Politics in Israel: Between Integration and Alternative,” *Journal of Palestine Studies* 29, no. 4 (Autumn 2000): 51–65.

**Shohat calls this trend** The full quote that includes the term *cultural massacre* is as follows: “In many respects, European Zionism has been an immense confidence trick played on Sephardim, a cultural massacre of immense proportions, an attempt, partially successful, to wipe out, in a generation or two, millennia of rooted Oriental civilization, unified even in its diversity” (Ella Shohat, “Sephardim in Israel: Zionism from the Standpoint of Its Jewish Victims,” *Social Text* 19/20 [Autumn 1988]: 32).

Ella Shohat quote: Shohat, “Sephardim in Israel,” 22–23. See also Shmuel Eisenstadt, Rivkah Bar Yosef, and Chaim Adler, eds., *Integration and Development in Israel* (Jerusalem: Israel Universities Press, 1970).

Inequity of partial inclusion in school curricula: Sammy Smooha, “Jewish Ethnicity in Israel: Symbolic or Real?,” in *Jews in Israel: Contemporary Social and Cultural Patterns*, ed. Uzi Rebhun and Chaim I. Waxman (Hanover, NH: Brandeis University Press, 2004), 47–80.

**While Chetrit, Shohat, and Smooha** On the use of the term *Holocaust* to refer to the marginalization of non-Ashkenazi Jews, see Oppenheimer, “Holocaust,” 303–328.

“The larger question of what it means to identify as a Jew”: In this case meaning whether identification as a Jew should include an identification with the Shoah.

**Although the term antisemitism wasn’t coined** The German Wilhelm Marr, who began using the term in a number of anti-Jewish campaigns during the mid-nineteenth century, is commonly credited with being a father of modern antisemitism; see USHMM, “Antisemitism,” [www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10005175](http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10005175). Some con-

nect the word *semitic* to the biblical Shem, one of Noah’s three sons, from whose lineage came Abraham and his two sons, Ishmael and Isaac. In terms of modern usages, the term *semitic* was used to buttress theories connecting races with particular languages, and arguing for the superiority of some of these groups, such as “Aryans” over others (Bernard E. Lewis, “Who Are the Semites?,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/who-are-the-semites/#](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/who-are-the-semites/#)). Although non-Jewish Arabs also technically fall into this category, the term *antisemitism* commonly refers almost exclusively to anti-Jewish acts of discrimination.

**The antisemitic events** As mentioned in chapter 7, it is not uncommon for scholars to compare the treatment of the Jewish minority living under Muslims to their treatment when living under Christians.

**Many antisemitism watchdog groups** These groups include, for example, the Anti-Defamation League, [www.adl.org](http://www.adl.org); Community Security Trust, [www.thecst.org.uk](http://www.thecst.org.uk); and Diaspora Communications and Countering Antisemitism of the World Zionist Organization, <http://izionist.org/eng>.

“Anti-Israelism” fueled by antisemitism: For example, multiple European demonstrations against the Israeli government’s military actions in Gaza in July and August 2014 included overt instances of antisemitism; see, e.g., Melissa Eddy, “Anti-Semitism Rises in Europe amid Israel-Gaza Conflict,” *New York Times*, August 1, 2014, [www.nytimes.com/2014/08/02/world/europe/anger-in-europe-over-the-israeli-gaza-conflict-reverberates-as-anti-semitism.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2014/08/02/world/europe/anger-in-europe-over-the-israeli-gaza-conflict-reverberates-as-anti-semitism.html).

Those critical of the policies of the State of Israel as “self-hating Jews”: There are some Jews whose understanding of antisemitism may best be understood through the metaphor “To a hammer, everything looks like a nail.” See, e.g., Haggai Ram, “Caught between Orientalism and Aryanism, Exile and Homeland: The Jews of Iran in Zionist/Israeli Imagination,” *HAGAR: Studies in Culture, Polity, and Identities* 8, no. 1 (2008): 98–99.

**Such strategies for combating** Ami Eden, “Playing the Holocaust Card,” *New York Times*, January 29, 2005, [www.nytimes.com/2005/01/29/opinion/29eden.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2005/01/29/opinion/29eden.html).

**Prejudice against a group** On the difference between contextualizing and justifying prejudice, see, e.g., Ervin Staub, *The Roots of Evil: The Origins of Genocide and Other Group Violence* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1992).

**The first of these claims** John Dominic Crossan, *Who Killed Jesus? Exposing the Roots of Anti-Semitism in the Gospel Story of the Death of Jesus* (New York: HarperOne, 1996); Adam Lee, “The Anti-Semitism of the New Testament,” July 20, 2009, [www.patheos.com/blogs/daylightatheism/2009/07/new-testament-anti-semitism](http://www.patheos.com/blogs/daylightatheism/2009/07/new-testament-anti-semitism).

For example, the following passages are found in the Gospels:

- “Therefore the Jews started persecuting Jesus . . . the Jews were seeking to kill him” (John 5:16–18).
- “After this Jesus went about in Galilee. He did not wish to go about Judea because the Jews were looking for an

opportunity to kill him. . . . Yet no one would speak openly about [Jesus] for fear of the Jews” (John 7:1, 13).

- “Jesus said to [the Jews], ‘If God were your Father, you would love me, for I came from God and now I am here. I did not come on my own, but he sent me. Why do you not understand what I say? It is because you cannot accept my word. You are from your father the devil, and you choose to do your father’s desires. He was a murderer from the beginning and does not stand in the truth, because there is no truth in him. When he lies, he speaks according to his own nature, for he is a liar and the father of lies’” (John 8:42–44).

Each one of these passages creates divisions between Jesus and “them,” the Jews. When the Gospel narratives reach the end of Jesus’s life, immediately before he is said to have been crucified, we find verses that seem to absolve the Romans of any wrongdoing, placing the responsibility instead fully onto the Jews. For example:

- “When the chief [Temple] priests and the police saw him, they shouted, ‘Crucify him! Crucify him!’ . . . Pilate tried to release him, but the Jews cried out, ‘If you release this man, you are no friend of the emperor’” (John 19:6, 12).
- “So when Pilate saw that he could do nothing, but rather that a riot was beginning, he took some water and washed his hands before the crowd, saying, ‘I am innocent of this man’s blood; see to it yourselves.’ Then the people as a whole answered, ‘His blood be on us and on our children!’ So he released Barabbos for them; and after flogging Jesus, he handed him over to be crucified” (Matt. 27:24–25).

A number of other passages from the Christian Bible echo similar sentiments (e.g., Acts 7:51–52, Titus 1:10–11, 1 Thessalonians 2:14–16, Revelation 3:9; see Lee, “Anti-Semitism”). The above passages are based on translations from Wayne E. Meeks, ed., *The HarperCollins Study Bible, New Revised Standard Version* (New York: HarperCollinsPublishers, 1993).

It wasn’t until the last half of the twentieth century, in 1965, that the Catholic Church officially changed its position on this matter. In the *Nostra Aetate* proclamation, the Church said that Jews were not responsible for the death of Jesus. Their official statement at the time was as follows:

True, the Jewish authorities and those who followed their lead pressed for the death of Christ; still, what happened in His passion cannot be charged against all the Jews, without distinction, then alive, nor against the Jews of today. Although the Church is the new people of God, the Jews should not be presented as rejected or accursed by God, as if this followed from the Holy Scriptures. All should see to it, then, that in catechetical work or in the preaching of the word of God they do not teach anything that does not conform to the truth of the Gospel and the spirit of Christ. (“Declaration on the Relation of the Church to Non-Christian Religions, *Nostra Aetate*, Proclaimed by His Holiness Pope Paul VI,” October 28, 1965, [www.vatican.va/archive/hist\\_councils/ii\\_vatican\\_council/documents/vat-ii\\_decl\\_19651028\\_nostra-aetate\\_en.html](http://www.vatican.va/archive/hist_councils/ii_vatican_council/documents/vat-ii_decl_19651028_nostra-aetate_en.html))

**Some link the so-called Blood Libel** Larry Domnitch, “Blood Libels: The Accusation That Blood Was Used to Make Wine or Matzah on Passover,” [www.myjewishlearning.com](http://www.myjewishlearning.com)

/holidays/Jewish\_Holidays/Passover/History/Medieval/Blood\_Libels.shtml.

**A second common antisemitic stereotype** Interestingly, both the Torah and the Talmud prohibit charging interest on lent money. See Louis Jacobs, “Usury and Moneylending in Judaism,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/usury-and-moneylending-in-judaism](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/usury-and-moneylending-in-judaism); Norman Roth, “Jewish Moneylending,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-moneylending](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jewish-moneylending).

**But Jews were not the only moneylenders** Quote: Roth, “Jewish Moneylending.”

**The stereotype of greedy Jews** Jewish representation in economic spheres: Michael Berkowitz, “The Madoff Paradox: American Jewish Sage, Savior, and Thief,” *Journal of American Studies* 46, no. 1 (2012): 189–202; Roth, “Jewish Moneylending.”

**A third common antisemitic stereotype** The basic idea of *Protocols of the Elders of Zion* predates the book’s publication. According to the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, a book published in 1864 by French political satirist Maurice Joly, *The Dialogue in Hell between Machiavelli and Montesquieu*, and another written in 1868 by Prussian writer Hermann Goedsche, called *Boarritz*, both contained ideas that were incorporated into the *Protocols*. See USHMM, “Protocols of the Elders of Zion,” [www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007058](http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007058); idem, “Protocols of the Elders of Zion: Timeline,” [www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007244](http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/article.php?ModuleId=10007244).

**The book appeared in Europe** On recent antisemitism related to the *Protocols*, see USHMM, “Protocols of the Elders of Zion.”

**Whether an act is considered** On professional sports teams’ names and Native Americans, see Ives Goddard, “‘I Am a Red Skin’: The Adoption of a Native-American Expression (1769–1826),” *European Review of Native American Studies* 19, no. 2 (2005): 1–20. See also National Congress of American Indians (NCAI), “NCAI Releases Report on History and Legacy of Washington’s Harmful ‘Indian’ Sports Mascot,” October 10, 2013, [www.fastcodesign.com/3019811/american-indians-counter-racist-iconography-with-racist-baseball-caps](http://www.fastcodesign.com/3019811/american-indians-counter-racist-iconography-with-racist-baseball-caps).

**During a recent round** On the NCAI poster, see Charles CurtisStanley, “Next Week in the NFL, the New York Jews vs the SF Chinamen,” October 11, 2013, [www.dailykos.com/story/2013/10/11/1246254/-Next-week-in-the-NFL-the-New-York-Jews-vs-the-SF-Chinamen](http://www.dailykos.com/story/2013/10/11/1246254/-Next-week-in-the-NFL-the-New-York-Jews-vs-the-SF-Chinamen); NCAI, “NCAI Releases Report”; Emma Roller, “Old Poster Goes Viral, Teaches Multiple Lessons,” October 10, 2013, [www.slate.com/blogs/browbeat/2013/10/10/new\\_york\\_jews\\_san\\_francisco\\_chinamen\\_cleveland\\_indians\\_ncai\\_poster\\_is\\_old.html](http://www.slate.com/blogs/browbeat/2013/10/10/new_york_jews_san_francisco_chinamen_cleveland_indians_ncai_poster_is_old.html).

**Perhaps Baron Cohen’s most famous scene** Those at the bar were in on the joke: Nathaniel Popper, “Comic Pushes Limits in Antisemitic Sing-along,” *Jewish Daily Forward*,

August 13, 2004, <http://forward.com/articles/5116/comic-pushes-limits-in-antisemitic-sing-along>.

**Are these scenes antisemitic?** Sacha Baron Cohen quote: In Neil Strauss, “Sacha Baron Cohen: The Man behind the Mustache,” *Rolling Stone*, November 15, 2006, [www.rollingstone.com/movies/news/the-man-behind-the-mustache-20061130](http://www.rollingstone.com/movies/news/the-man-behind-the-mustache-20061130).

**Deborah Lipstadt and other scholars** Deborah Lipstadt, “Borat,” December 18, 2006, <http://lipstadt.blogspot.com/2006/12/borat.html>.

ADL statement: “Statement of the Comedy of Sacha Baron Cohen, A.K.A. ‘Borat,’” Anti-Defamation League, September 28, 2006, [http://archive.adl.org/PresRele/Mise\\_00/4898\\_00.htm](http://archive.adl.org/PresRele/Mise_00/4898_00.htm).

**Some call figures such as Baron Cohen** For more on the charge that Theodor Herzl was antisemitic, see Jordie Gerson, “Self-Hating Jews? How Does One Qualify?,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/self-hating-jews](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/self-hating-jews). See also chapter 10.

Jacobson quote: Howard Jacobson, *Root Schmoots: Journeys among Jews* (Woodstock, NY: Overlook Press, 1993), 128.

**FIGURE 9.6** Translation of caption (right): Calvin College, “German Propaganda Archive, Caricatures from *Der Stürmer*: 1927–1932,” [www.calvin.edu/academic/cas/gpa/sturm28.htm](http://www.calvin.edu/academic/cas/gpa/sturm28.htm).

**Scholar Sander Gilman** Sander L. Gilman, *Jewish Self-Hatred: Anti-Semitism and the Language of Jews* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1986), 11.

**In dealing with antisemitism** In American police lingo, as represented on popular television programs such as *C.S.I.* and *Law & Order*, the “vic” (short for victim) is the nonspecific term used to describe a person who has been on the receiving end of a crime, whether dead or alive. Yet when police detectives speak with victims directly, the terms *survivor* and *victim* are often used interchangeably, despite their different meanings.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 9.1** Angus Stevenson, ed., *Oxford Dictionary of English*, 3rd ed. (Oxford University Press Online, 2010) (accessed October 26, 2013).

**Until a few years ago** In *We Remember with Reverence and Love: American Jews and the Myth of Silence after the Holocaust, 1945–1962* (New York: New York University Press, 2009), Hasia Diner argues that in the United States numerous memorials, programs, Shoah observances, and survivor gatherings were held as early as the 1950s. School curricula were developed and books about the Shoah were published. The Holocaust was already a central part of American and Jewish American discourse in the late 1940s and 1950s; the alleged silence is not factual. Others disagree, saying that although Diner’s proof of these events is indisputable, such occurrences were marginal to most Jewish American communities. In an article examining Diner’s book, scholar Jerome Chanes says that survivors were often treated with contempt by fellow Jewish Americans, including being shunned by synagogues; see Jerome A. Chanes, “Remembering (Not) Remember-

ing,” *Jewish Daily Forward*, August 26, 2009, <http://forward.com/articles/112892/remembering-not-remembering>.

**In Israel, survivors had a different experience** Immediately prior to the Shoah, many Hasidic rebbes fled, and some were charged with allowing their devotees to go to the Nazi death camps like “lambs to slaughter.” See, e.g., Yair Ettinger, “When the Shepherds Fled,” *Haaretz*, April 20, 2009, [www.haaretz.com/print-edition/features/when-the-shepherds-fled-1.274415](http://www.haaretz.com/print-edition/features/when-the-shepherds-fled-1.274415).

A 2006 survey of Jewish Israeli high school students revealed that most believed that Jews in the Shoah went “like sheep to slaughter.” See Dan Porat, “Varying Perceptions of the Holocaust: The Discourse of Holocaust and Revolt among Israeli Youth,” *Israel* 9 (2006): 175–201 [Hebrew], cited in Dalia Ofer, “Victims, Fighters, Survivors: Quietism and Activism in Israeli Historical Consciousness,” *Common Knowledge* 16, no. 3 (Fall 2010): 515.

**Israeli psychiatrist Hillel Klein** Hillel Klein, *Survival and Trials of Revival: Psychodynamic Studies of Holocaust Survivors and their Families in Israel and the Diaspora* (Boston: Academic Studies Press, 2012), 99–105. See also Ronald J. Berger, “To Be or Not to Be: The Holocaust and Jewish Identity in the Post-war Era,” *Humanity and Society* 31 (February 2007): 24–42; Rhona D. Seidelman, “Conflicts of Quarantine: The Case of Jewish Immigrants to the Jewish State,” *American Journal of Public Health* 102, no. 2 (February 2012): 243–252; Zahava Solomon, “From Denial to Recognition: Attitudes toward Holocaust Survivors from World War II to the Present,” *Journal of Traumatic Stress* 8, no. 2 (1995): 215–228.

**Many of these negative feelings** Eichmann: See Notes, chapter 9, “This was not always the case.”

**In Israel, the primary method** On Holocaust education, see Jaspal and Yampolsky, “Social Representations,” 203; more generally, 201–224.

**These trips have been criticized** On visiting Nazi death camps as a ritual, see Erik H. Cohen, *Research on Teaching the Holocaust in Israeli Public Schools* (Ramat-Gan: Bar-Ilan University, 2009); Gross, “Holocaust Education”; Gross and Stevick (eds.), *As the Witnesses Fall Silent*; Kobi Nahshoni, “Rabbi Avner: Visiting Nazi Death Camps Forbidden,” [www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-3675990,00.html](http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-3675990,00.html); Dalia Ofer, “The Past That Does Not Pass: Israelis and Holocaust Memory,” *Israel Studies* 14, no. 1 (Spring 2009): 1–35; idem, “Victims, Fighters, Survivors,” 493–517; Jeffrey S. Podoshen and James M. Hunt, “Equity Restoration, the Holocaust, and Tourism of Sacred Sites,” *Tourism Management* 32 (2011): 1332–1342.

Holocaust education as the Godhead of Israel’s civil religion: Some would put the Israeli Defense Forces (IDF) immediately next to the Holocaust as the Godhead of Israel’s civil religion. See chapter 10.

For more on the meaning of civil religion: See Robert N. Bellah, “Civil Religion in America,” *Daedalus: Journal of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences* 96, no. 1 (Winter 1967): 1–21.



2009 study: Gross, “Holocaust Education.” See also Zehavit Gross, “Between Involuntary and Voluntary Memories: A Case Study of Holocaust Education in Israel,” in Gross and Stevick (eds.), *As the Witnesses Fall Silent*, 114.

**Jews (and non-Jews) often say** On non-Jews using the phrase “never again,” see, e.g., Agence France-Presse, “Obama Vows ‘Never Again’ on Holocaust Memorial Day,” January 27, 2013, [www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4337656,00.html](http://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4337656,00.html).

To some degree, the particularist versus universalist dichotomy is seen among those who see the Shoah as a one-of-a-kind event versus those, such as Raphael Lemkin, who see commonalities between the Jewish genocide and other genocides, such as the Armenian genocide.

**Those who gravitate** The two ends of this spectrum (particularism vs. universalism) orient toward the genocides of World War II either as a calamity that targeted Jews only or as “a crime against humanity ‘on the body of the Jewish people’” (Hannah Arendt, *Eichmann on Trial: A Report on the Banality of Evil* [New York: Viking, 1964], 8). Of course, people can shift back and forth between the ends of this spectrum or, in some cases, hold both ends to be true simultaneously.

Niemöller quote: Martin Niemöller, in Franklin H. Littell’s foreword to *Exile in the Fatherland: Martin Niemöller’s Letters from Moabit Prison*, ed. Hubert G. Locke (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1986), viii.

**What individual Jews mean** Hannah Arendt, *Between Past and Future: Six Exercises in Political Thought* (New York: Viking, 1961).

**The question, however** The guard appears in Yoav Shamir’s 2009 film *Defamation: Anti-Semitism, the Movie*.

Pope quote: John Paul II, “We Remember: A Reflection on the Shoah,” 1998, [www.vatican.va/roman\\_curia/pontifical\\_councils/chrstuni/documents/rc\\_pc\\_chrstuni\\_doc\\_16031998\\_shoah\\_en.html](http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/pontifical_councils/chrstuni/documents/rc_pc_chrstuni_doc_16031998_shoah_en.html).

## Chapter 10. Powers

**I wouldn’t have thought** I am using stereotypical understandings of David and Goliath—with the former character embodying a feisty underdog who is out of his league when facing the latter, a massively brawny giant—rather than integrating some of the contrarian perspectives regarding these archetypes, such as those found in Malcolm Gladwell’s *David and Goliath: Underdogs, Misfits, and the Art of Battling Giants* (New York: Little, Brown, 2013).

**FIGURE 10.1** Based on “Percentage of Religious Adherents in the U.S.,” in Pew Forum on Religion and Public Life, “U.S. Religious Landscape Survey, Religious Affiliation: Diverse and Dynamic,” February 2008, 5, [www.pewforum.org/files/2013/05/report-religious-landscape-study-full.pdf](http://www.pewforum.org/files/2013/05/report-religious-landscape-study-full.pdf); Pew Research Center, “Muslim Americans: Middle Class and Mostly Mainstream,” May 22, 2007, [www.pewresearch.org/files/2007/05/muslim-americans.pdf](http://www.pewresearch.org/files/2007/05/muslim-americans.pdf).

**Twenty-first-century Jews are not powerless** First time in history: Even if one accepts the biblical story of King David as historically factual, David was the leader of a kingdom, not a country.

Fielder quote: Leslie Fielder, “Leopold and Loeb: A Perspective in Time” (1958), in *Collected Essays of Leslie Fielder*, vol. 1 (New York: Stein and Day, 1971), 444, quoted in Daniel Itzkovitz, “Secret Temples,” in *Jews and Other Differences: The New Jewish Cultural Studies*, ed. Jonathan Boyarin and Daniel Boyarin (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1997), 177.

“Israel and the United States contain approximately 80 percent of Jews worldwide”: This important statistic has been mentioned in previous chapters. Note that this chapter interweaves the Jewish community’s status in the United States and Israel as if it is part of a single, cohesive worldview. In terms of dominant Jewish narratives worldwide, I maintain that this is accurate. That said, of course the situation of Jews in the United States is different—in countless ways—from that of Jews in the State of Israel.

**These questions are rooted in** In terms of total world population, of course, .2 percent represents a modest number of Jews. In terms of social mobility and power, however, even though Jews have not had the same communal experiences in every country, in many industrialized countries Jewish power has reached historically unprecedented levels since the latter half of the twentieth century and into the early twenty-first century. See, e.g., Aaron J. Hahn Tapper, “The War of Words: Jews, Muslims, and the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict on American University Campuses,” in *Muslims and Jews in America: Commonalities, Contentions, and Complexities*, ed. Reza Aslan and Aaron J. Hahn Tapper (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011).

**WHAT IS POWER?** Parts of this section were taken from Aaron J. Tapper, “From Gaza to the Golan: Religious Nonviolence, Power, and the Politics of Interpretation,” Ph.D. diss., University of California, Santa Barbara, 2007.

**Many see power** On constructive and destructive power, see Carolyn Schrock-Shenk, ed., *Mediation and Facilitation Training Manual*, 4th ed. (Akron, PA: Mennonite Conciliation Service, 2000), 80.

Possessed, shared, and hoarded: Johan Galtung, cited in Kenneth A. Parsons, “Structural Violence and Power,” *Peace Review: A Journal of Social Justice* 19, no. 2 (2007): 177.

**One scholar who has explored** Michel Foucault, *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and other Writings, 1972–1977*, ed. Colin Gordon (New York: Pantheon Books, 1980).

**Generated within the domains** “Truth” and power: Michel Foucault, “Truth and Power,” in *The Foucault Reader*, ed. Paul Rabinow (New York: Pantheon Books, 1984), 72–73.

“Truth” and dominant narratives: Alison Leigh Brown, *On Foucault: A Critical Introduction* (Belmont, CA: Wadsworth, 2000), 30 and 31 (“no outside to power” quote).

Power and authority: Hannah Arendt, “Authority in the

Twentieth Century,” *Review of Politics* 18, no. 4 (October 1956): 406–416.

**When we say that during the twentieth and twenty-first centuries** Power vs. control: Consider, e.g., this definition of power: “The ability of a people to control its relations to other peoples as well as its own internal political, cultural, religious, economic, and social life” (David Biale, *Power and Powerlessness in Jewish History* [New York: Schocken Books, 1986], 7).

**Since World War II** On academia, government, the media, and pop culture, see Hahn Tapper, “War of Words,” 80, 92n.72.

Jewish Americans’ gradual upward social mobility: Most Jewish immigrants arriving in the first half of the twentieth century were not by any means wealthy. Some scholars attribute the rise in Jewish social mobility to shifts in professional trades, from mechanical to medical and legal occupations. See, e.g., Calvin Goldscheider, “Immigration and the Transformation of American Jews: Assimilation, Distinctiveness, and Community,” in *Immigration and Religion in America: Comparative and Historical Perspectives*, ed. Richard Alba, Albert J. Raboteau, and Josh DeWind (New York: New York University Press, 2009), 198–223; Simon Kuznets, “Economic Structure of U.S. Jewry: Recent Trends,” Institute of Contemporary Jewry, Hebrew University of Jerusalem (1972), 1–27, available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=4319](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=4319).

American higher education—students: Karen W. Arenson, “Princeton or Puzzle: Where Have All the Jewish Students Gone?,” *New York Times*, June 2, 1999, [www.nytimes.com/1999/06/02/nyregion/princeton-puzzle-where-have-jewish-students-gone.html](http://www.nytimes.com/1999/06/02/nyregion/princeton-puzzle-where-have-jewish-students-gone.html); Jerome Karabel, *The Chosen: The Hidden Story of Admission and Exclusion at Harvard, Yale, and Princeton* (New York: Houghton Mifflin, 2005).

In addition, according to a recent Pew study, Jewish Americans have a university graduation rate of 59 percent, in terms of minority “religious communities” second only to Hindu Americans (at 77 percent); see Uriel Heilman, “1 in 6 American Jews Are Converts—and 9 Other Findings in Pew Study,” Jewish Telegraphic Agency, May 12, 2015, [www.jta.org/2015/05/12/news-opinion/united-states/1-in-6-jews-are-new-to-the-faith-and-9-other-new-pew-findings](http://www.jta.org/2015/05/12/news-opinion/united-states/1-in-6-jews-are-new-to-the-faith-and-9-other-new-pew-findings).

American higher education—faculty: Neil Gross and Solon Simmons, “The Religiosity of American College and University Professors,” *Sociology of Religion* 70, no. 2 (2009): 118–119; Amy L. Sales and Leonard Saxe, “Particularism in the University: Realities and Opportunities for Jewish Life on Campus,” Avi Chai Foundation (New York, 2006), 29, <http://avichai.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/06/Jewish-Life-on-Campus.pdf>; Jack Schuster and Martin Finkelstein, *The American Faculty: The Restructuring of Academic Work and Careers* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2006); Stephen Steinberg, *The Academic Melting Pot: Catholics and Jews in American Higher Education* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1974); Gary A. Tobin and Aryeh K. Weinberg, “Profiles of the American University, Vol. II: Religious Beliefs and Behavior of Col-

lege Faculty,” Institute for Jewish and Community Research (San Francisco, 2007), [www.jewishresearch.org/PDFs2/FacultyReligion07.pdf](http://www.jewishresearch.org/PDFs2/FacultyReligion07.pdf).

**In terms of government representation in the United**

**States** Congress: American-Israeli Cooperative Enterprise, “Jewish Members of U.S. Congress: 112th Congress (2011–2013),” [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsources/US-Israel/jewcong112.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsources/US-Israel/jewcong112.html); Pew Research Center, “Faith on the Hill—The Religious Composition of the 112th Congress,” February 28, 2011, [www.pewforum.org/2011/01/05/faith-on-the-hill-the-religious-composition-of-the-112th-congress](http://www.pewforum.org/2011/01/05/faith-on-the-hill-the-religious-composition-of-the-112th-congress).

Supreme Court: Interestingly, Catholics are also disproportionately represented on the U.S. Supreme Court; see, e.g., Noah Feldman, “The Triumphant Decline of the WASP,” *New York Times*, June 27, 2010, [www.nytimes.com/2010/06/28/opinion/28feldman.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2010/06/28/opinion/28feldman.html). As of 2013, although 23 percent of Americans are Catholic, six out of nine Supreme Court justices identify with this community. See also Pew Forum on Religion and Public Life, “U.S. Religious Landscape Survey, Religious Affiliation.”

David Luchins quote: J.J. Goldberg, *Jewish Power: Inside the American Jewish Establishment* (Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley, 1996), 4.

This is to say nothing of Jewish activists, many of whom can be labeled “antigovernment” in terms of their political efforts, such as those involved in leftist circles of the 1960s and 1970s. As one scholar notes, “Altogether about 60 to 80 percent of student radicals were of Jewish origin in the sixties and an astounding 30 to 50 percent of the core organization, Students for a Democratic Society (SDS), were Jewish. The same overwhelming predominance was found in related organizations such as the Yippies and Berkeley’s Free Speech Movement, five of whose seven leaders were ‘of Jewish origin’” (Henry L. Feingold, *Jewish Power in America: Myth and Reality* [New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 2008], 125).

A final point worth mentioning is that Jews have historically voted in favor of liberal and progressive political issues more consistently than any other “ethno-religious group in America.” One way this manifests is in their long-term support for the Democratic party: since 1928, 75 percent of American Jews have voted for a Democratic presidential candidate, and in 2008, 78 percent of American Jews voted for President Obama, the “highest percentage of any ethnic or religious group aside from African Americans.” Despite minor increases in Jewish support for Republicans, American Jews continue to vote democratic consistently. See Sam Sokol, “Fewer American Jews Now Identify as Democrats, Poll Finds,” *Jerusalem Post*, January 8, 2015, [www.jpost.com/Diaspora/Fewer-American-Jews-now-identify-as-Democrats-poll-finds-387064](http://www.jpost.com/Diaspora/Fewer-American-Jews-now-identify-as-Democrats-poll-finds-387064); “Why Jews Are (Still) Liberals,” *Koret Perspectives*, Spring 2010, [http://koret.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/perspectives\\_spring\\_10.pdf](http://koret.org/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/perspectives_spring_10.pdf).

**In Hollywood** J.J. Goldberg, “3 Questions for the Oscars,” *Jewish Daily Forward*, February 25, 2013, <http://forward.com/opinion/171900/3-questions-for-the-oscars/#ixzz2jsvTtryD>.

Indeed, the disproportionate Jewish representation in the movie business is not a new phenomenon but has been the case for decades. See also Neil Gabler, *Empire of Their Own: How the Jews Invented Hollywood* (New York: Anchor, 1988); Jim Hoberman and Jeffrey Shandler, eds., *Entertaining America: Jews, Movies, and Broadcasting* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2003); Simcha Jacobovici, *Hollywood: An Empire of Their Own* (2005) [film]; Jeffrey Shandler, *Jews, God and Videotape: Religion and Media in America* (New York: New York University Press, 2009); Joel Stein, “Who Runs Hollywood? C’mon,” *Los Angeles Times*, December 19, 2008, <http://articles.latimes.com/2008/dec/19/opinion/oe-stein19>.

Wealth and Jews: “*Forbes* Ranking: The World’s Richest Jews,” cited in *Jerusalem Post*, April 17, 2013, [www.jpost.com/Business/Business-Features/Forbes-ranking-The-worlds-richest-Jews-310104](http://www.jpost.com/Business/Business-Features/Forbes-ranking-The-worlds-richest-Jews-310104); Goldberg, *Jewish Power*, 30; Luisa Kroll, “Inside the 2013 Billionaires List: Facts and Figures,” *Forbes*, March 4, 2013, [www.forbes.com/sites/luisakroll/2013/03/04/inside-the-2013-billionaires-list-facts-and-figures](http://www.forbes.com/sites/luisakroll/2013/03/04/inside-the-2013-billionaires-list-facts-and-figures).

**Yet contrary to the claims** 1990s poll: Goldberg, *Jewish Power*, 57.

ADL poll: Anti-Defamation League, “Press Release: ADL Poll of Over 100 Countries Finds More than One-Quarter of Those Surveyed Infected with Anti-Semitic Attitudes,” May 13, 2014, [www.adl.org/press-center/press-releases/anti-semitism-international/adl-global-100-poll.html](http://www.adl.org/press-center/press-releases/anti-semitism-international/adl-global-100-poll.html).

**Although many Americans are aware** See UJA–Federation of New York in consultation with the Metropolitan Council on Jewish Poverty, “Jewish Community Study of New York: 2011 Special Report on Poverty,” [www.ujafedny.org/get/762375](http://www.ujafedny.org/get/762375). According to one study, as of 2011 there were 333,000 Jews in metropolitan New York City who were poor, with an additional 174,000 living in “near poor” conditions. In addition, approximately 50,000 Jews live in poverty in the Los Angeles area; see Jewish Federation of Greater Los Angeles, November 20, 2014, [www.jewishla.org/blog/entry/our-ezra-network-is-helping-impooverished-jews-in-l.a.-and-so-can-you](http://www.jewishla.org/blog/entry/our-ezra-network-is-helping-impooverished-jews-in-l.a.-and-so-can-you).

**In a 1995 essay** Irving Greenberg, “The Ethics of Power,” in *Contemporary Jewish Ethics and Morality: A Reader*, ed. Elliot N. Dorff and Louis E. Newman (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995), 403.

“In their own land”: In stating that the land on which the State of Israel was established belongs to Jews—i.e., “exercising sovereignty in *their* own land” [italics are my own]—Greenberg reflects a dominant trend found within the Jewish community.

**Greenberg begins by acknowledging** Greenberg, “Ethics of Power,” 403–407. In 2000, Greenberg expanded on this 1995 essay, addressing, to some degree, the need for Jewish Israelis to be more aware of their power. Yet many of the conclusions in the 2000 piece are the same as in his 1995 article, such as that the Shoah was a “disaster that essentially was made possible by [the Jewish community’s] own powerlessness” and that Jews—specifically Jewish Israelis—often have “no choice” but to abuse their power. Echoing a dominant

narrative in the Jewish community, he also argues that the Israeli military’s occupation of the West Bank and Gaza is “moral” (Greenberg, “The Ethics of Jewish Power Today,” Speech delivered at the General Assembly of the United Jewish Communities, November 2000, 5–12, available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=2486](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=2486)).

Power’s potential to corrupt: This alludes to the oft-cited statement made by the nineteenth-century British historian Lord Acton, “Power tends to corrupt, and absolute power corrupts absolutely,” first found in a letter sent by Acton (John Emerich Edward Dalberg) to Archbishop Mandell Creighton, dated April 5, 1887 (“Acton-Creighton Correspondence [1887],” available at <http://oll.libertyfund.org/pages/acton-creighton-correspondence-1887?q=power+tends+to+corrupt#>).

For a critique of those, such as Greenberg, who approach Jews’ current situation—specifically issues related to the State of Israel—through the lens of the Shoah, see, e.g., Avraham Burg, *The Holocaust Is Over; We Must Rise from Its Ashes* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008); Idith Zertal, *Israel’s Holocaust and the Politics of Nationhood* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005).

**In contrast, scholar Carl Sheingold** “The most important general challenge confronting Jewish politics today,” Sheingold writes, “is that of taking responsibility for power. Conversely, Jews cannot and should not take pride in feeling or acting as if they are outsiders to power . . . when they are not” (Carl A. Sheingold, “Towards a Politics of Paradox: The Jewish Confrontation with Power,” in *American Pluralism and the Jewish Community*, ed. Seymour Martin Lipset [New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 1990], 129).

“Addressing the need for accountability”: Sheingold, “Towards a Politics,” 118, 126.

Asymmetrical power and destructive social relations: Schrock-Shenk, *Mediation*, 80–81.

**Both these viewpoints** Writer Ami Eden offers an idea similar to Sheingold’s; see Ami Eden, “Playing the Holocaust Card,” *New York Times*, January 29, 2005, [www.nytimes.com/2005/01/29/opinion/29eden.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2005/01/29/opinion/29eden.html).

**Of course, some Jews are not on this spectrum** Goldberg, *Jewish Power*, 5–6. As Goldberg’s book is from 1996, I emailed him in 2014 to see if he would still hold by this statement. He responded by saying, “I think [what I wrote in this quote is] a little less true than it was in 1996, but still represents the majority. . . . It’s noteworthy that public references to ‘the Jewish lobby’ are still widely regarded, by the major organizations and much of their constituency, as an anti-Semitic slur. . . . The division between Jews and gentiles that you quoted from my book is probably more intense than ever, though the number and proportion of Jews who see the reality of a Jewish lobby is probably larger than before (which is why I say it’s less true)” (J.J. Goldberg, email to author, August 22, 2014).

**The modern nation-state of Israel** For a range of primary documents related to Zionism, see Arthur Hertzberg, ed., *The*



*Zionist Idea: A Historical Analysis and Reader* (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society of America, 1997); Jehuda Reinharz and Anita Shapira, eds., *Essential Papers on Zionism* (New York: New York University Press, 1996); Michael Selzer, ed., *Zionism Reconsidered: The Rejection of Jewish Normalcy* (London: Macmillan, 1970).

**SPECIAL TOPIC 10.1** Countries that do not recognize the State of Israel: See, e.g., “H. Res. 1249,” United States House of Representatives, June 5, 2008, [www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/BILLS-110HRES1249IH/pdf/BILLS-110HRES1249IH.pdf](http://www.gpo.gov/fdsys/pkg/BILLS-110HRES1249IH/pdf/BILLS-110HRES1249IH.pdf).

Countries that have diplomatic relations with Israel: “Israel’s Diplomatic Missions Abroad: Status of Relations,” Israeli Ministry of Foreign Affairs, [www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/abouttheministry/pages/israel-s%20diplomatic%20missions%20abroad.aspx](http://www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/abouttheministry/pages/israel-s%20diplomatic%20missions%20abroad.aspx).

President George W. Bush and use of term *Palestine*: “Bush Calls for an End to ‘Occupation’ of Arab Lands,” January 10, 2008, [www.nbcnews.com/id/22587081/ns/politics-white\\_house/t/bush-calls-end-occupation-arab-lands/#.VVuhJqbfjNQ](http://www.nbcnews.com/id/22587081/ns/politics-white_house/t/bush-calls-end-occupation-arab-lands/#.VVuhJqbfjNQ).

Golan Heights and occupation: The Golan Heights was part of Syria prior to the June 1967 war; since then it has been occupied (special topic 10.2) by Israel. This contested region is primarily an issue between Israel and Syria as opposed to Israel and Palestine (or the Palestinian Authority). When people use either the term *State of Israel* or *Palestine*, they are sometimes implying an inclusion of the Golan Heights.

**A great deal has been written** On Middle Eastern conflicts linked to the State of Israel, such as the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, see Walter Laqueur and Barry Rubin, eds., *The Israel-Arab Reader: A Documentary History of the Middle East Conflict*, 7th ed., rev. and updated (New York: Penguin, 2008); Benny Morris, *Righteous Victims: A History of the Zionist-Arab Conflict, 1881–2001* (New York: Vintage Books, 2001); Robert I. Rotberg, ed., *Israeli and Palestinian Narratives of Conflict: History’s Double Helix* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2006); Mark Tessler, *A History of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict*, 2nd ed. (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2009).

This strife gets more attention than any other: See, e.g., Noah Bernstein, “A Media Eclipse: Israel-Palestine and the World’s Forgotten Conflicts,” *Open Democracy*, Open Security: Reconciliation and Conflict, March 18, 2010, [www.opendemocracy.net/opensecurity/noah-bernstein/media-eclipse-israel-palestine-and-worlds-forgotten-conflicts](http://www.opendemocracy.net/opensecurity/noah-bernstein/media-eclipse-israel-palestine-and-worlds-forgotten-conflicts).

**Theodor Herzl is commonly credited** Dreyfus was officially exonerated in 1906, largely thanks to help he received from the non-Jewish French novelist Émile Zola. See Murray Sachs, “Émile Zola’s Last Word: Vérité and the Dreyfus Affair,” *Romance Quarterly* 45, no. 4 (1998): 203–210; Maurice Samuels, “Zola’s Philosemitism: From l’Argent to Vérité,” *Romantic Review* 102, nos. 3–4 (May–November 2011): 503–519.

**But facts on the ground show** On the unexceptional nature of Jewish nationalism, see Gabriel Piterberg, *The Returns of Zionism: Myths, Politics, and Scholarship in Israel* (New York: Verso, 2008).

“Colonialist settler” discourse: Some academics call the Jewish nationalist movement a “colonial settler” project and use the word *colonialism* when referring to Zionism, partly because many early-twentieth-century Zionists used this precise term (to say nothing of the use of the term by virtually all British individuals involved in Jewish settlement of the land at this time). For example, one of the first Zionist organizations charged with settling Ottoman-controlled Palestine was the Jewish Colonization Association; during the first two Zionist Congress annual meetings, organization members established the Jewish Colonial Trust (sometimes called the Jewish Colonial Bank) to help in their pursuit to purchase land and support Jewish settlements in Palestine. Herzl and Ze’ev Jabotinsky also used the terms *colony* and *colonization* a number of times when referring to the Zionist project in the Land of Israel. See Israel Cohen, *Theodor Herzl: Founder of Political Zionism* (New York: Thomas Yoseloff, 1959), 69, 119, 134, 143, 165–181, 210–240, 271; Ze’ev Jabotinsky, “The Iron Wall (We and the Arabs),” *The Jewish Herald*, November 26, 1937, available at [www.danielpipes.org/3510/the-iron-wall-we-and-the-arabs](http://www.danielpipes.org/3510/the-iron-wall-we-and-the-arabs); Baruch Kimmerling, *Zionism and Territory: The Socio-Territorial Dimensions of Zionist Politics* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983); Gershon Shafir, *Land, Labor, and the Origins of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict, 1882–1914* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989); Geoffrey Wheatcroft, “Zionism’s Colonial Roots,” *National Interest* 125 (May–June 2013): 125–131.

As explained by scholar Zachary Lockman, “By 1900 there were twenty-two moshavot [rural settlements rooted in socialist ideals established during early proto-Zionist and Zionist immigrations] with a total population of about 5,000. Most of these settlements had come to be organized on the Algerian colonial model preferred by Baron Rothschild and his agents, with European Jewish farmers employing local Arab peasants to cultivate their vineyards, citrus groves, and fields. Zionist historiography has tended to focus on this segment of the growing Yishuv [body of Jewish residents in pre-Israel Palestine], seeing in these struggling farmers the forerunners of Zionism’s settlement and state building project” (Lockman, *Comrades and Enemies: Arab and Jewish Workers in Palestine, 1906–1948* [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996], 25–26).

It should be noted that Jewish Zionists settling Ottoman-controlled Palestine in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries embodied a different form of colonialism than did European countries colonizing Africa and other parts of the world during this same time, insofar as Jewish communal narratives have maintained a connection to the Land of Israel going back centuries.

**Nonetheless, curricula sanctioned** On Herzl’s notion of mass conversion to Christianity, see Henry J. Cohn, “Theodor Herzl’s Conversion to Zionism,” *Jewish Social Studies* 32, no. 2 (April 1970): 101–110; Ariel Feldestein, “Textbooks as Memory-Shapers: Structuring the Image of Theodor Herzl in Textbooks as Part of Israeli Collective Memory in the 1950s,” *Israel Affairs* 13, no. 1 (January 2007): 80–94; “Herzl Biog-

raphy,” Herzl Museum, Jerusalem, [www.herzl.org/english/Article.aspx?Item=492&Section=491](http://www.herzl.org/english/Article.aspx?Item=492&Section=491).

**Herzl didn't even hold that** On alternative sites for a Jewish State, see Gur Alroey, “‘Zionism without Zion’: Territorialist Ideology and the Zionist Movement, 1882–1958,” *Jewish Social Studies: History, Culture, Society* 18, no. 1 (Fall 2011): 1–32; Shlomo Avineri, “Theodor Herzl’s Diaries as Bildungsroman,” *Jewish Social Studies* 5, no. 3 (Spring/Summer 1999): 1–46; Michael Blakeny, “Proposals for a Jewish Colony in Australia, 1938–1948,” *Jewish Social Studies* 46, nos. 3–4 (Summer/Fall 1984): 277–292; Martin Buber, “The Pressing Demand of the Hour (On Leo Pinsker and Theodor Herzl),” in *On Zion: The History of an Idea*, trans. Stanley Goodman (London: Horowitz Publishing Co., 1973), 123–142; Fred Jerome, *Einstein on Israel and Zionism* (New York: St. Martin’s Press, 2009), 90–91; Walter Laqueur, *A History of Zionism: From the French Revolution to the Establishment of the State of Israel* (New York: Schocken Books, 1993), 129; Dan Leon, “The Jewish National Fund: How the Land Was ‘Redeemed,’” *Palestine-Israel Journal of Politics, Economics, and Culture* 12–13, no. 4/1 (December 1, 2005): 115–123; João Medina and Joel Barromi, “The Jewish Colonization Project in Angola,” *Studies in Zionism* 12, no. 1 (1991): 1–16; Yair Seltenreich and Yossi Katz, “Between the Galilee and Its Neighbouring Isle: Jules Rosenheck and the JCA Settlements in Cyprus, 1897–1928,” *Middle Eastern Studies* 45, no. 1 (2009): 87–109; Robert Weinberg, *Stalin’s Forgotten Zion: Birobidzhan and the Making of a Soviet Jewish Homeland: An Illustrated History, 1928–1996* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998); Robert G. Weisbord, “Israel Zangwill’s Jewish Territorial Organization and the East African Zion,” *Jewish Social Studies* 30, no. 2 (April 1, 1968): 89–108.

Other mainstream Zionist ideologues, such as Max Nordau, Leo Pinsker, and Israel Zangwill, similarly did not prioritize the establishment of a Jewish autonomous region in the Land of Israel. Nordau, who supported Herzl’s Uganda idea, was almost assassinated for taking this position.

**At the 1903 World Zionist Congress** The Jewish Territorial Organisation (abbreviated ITO based on its Yiddish name), established in 1905, was originally an offshoot of the Zionist Organization. Though the ITO waned in the 1920s and the JNF at this time was not nearly as important as it soon became, during the 1930s this same ideology—building a Jewish State outside the Land of Israel—gained momentum yet again, this time with either Australia or New Zealand as the potential sites. See “About JNF,” Jewish National Fund, [www.jnf.org/about-jnf](http://www.jnf.org/about-jnf); Alroey, “‘Zionism without Zion’”; Avineri, “Theodor Herzl”; Blakeny, “Proposals”; Buber, “Pressing Demand”; Theodor Herzl (miscellaneous papers), in Hertzberg (ed.), *Zionist Idea*, 204–230; Laqueur, *History of Zionism*; Leon, “Jewish National Fund”; Medina and Barromi, “Jewish Colonization Project”; Seltenreich and Katz, “Between the Galilee”; Axel Stähler, “Constructions of Jewish Identity and the Spectre of Colonialism: Of White Skin and Black Masks in Early Zionist Discourse,” *German Life and Letters* 66, no. 3 (July 2013): 254–276; Weisbord, “Israel Zangwill.”

**The fact that Israel** For the earliest known contemporary uses of the term *Palestinian*, see, e.g., Rashid Khalidi, *Palestinian Identity: The Construction of Modern National Consciousness* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1998).

**As for why the Zionist movement** Regarding antisemitic acts in Russia, often referred to as pogroms, see Jonathan Dekel-Chen, David Gaunt, Natan M. Meir, and Israel Bartal, eds., *Anti-Jewish Violence: Rethinking the Pogrom in East European History* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2011); John D. Klier and Shlomo Lambroza, eds., *Pogroms: Anti-Jewish Violence in Modern Russian History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004).

“A land without people for a people without a land”: This slogan was originally coined by the nineteenth-century British Christian Zionist Lord Shaftsbury and popularized by Zionist writer Israel Zangwill; see Morris, *Righteous Victims*, 42.

**When Herzl first began** For more on Jews moving to the Land of Israel under the Ottomans, see Lockman, *Comrades and Enemies*, 22–23.

**Reform Jews in Europe** “The Pittsburgh Platform,” November 19, 1885, <http://ccarnet.org/rabbis-speak/platforms/declaration-principles>.

**In 1889, a professor at Hebrew Union College** Two quotes and CCAR’s ban on supporting Zionism: Ben Halpern, “Zion in the Mind of American Jews,” in *The Future of the Jewish Community in America*, ed. David Sidorsky (New York: Basic Books, 1973), 31.

The Conservative movement had a similar position as the CCAR. For example, in 1948 the American Conservative movement’s most important institution, the Jewish Theological Seminary, banned the Israeli national anthem from being sung at their commencement ceremony. See Jack Wertheimer, *A People Divided: Judaism in Contemporary America* (New York: Basic Books, 1993), cited in Harriet Hartman and Moshe Hartman, “Denominational Differences in the Attachment to Israel of American Jews,” *Review of Religious Research* 41, no. 3 (March 1, 2000): 399.

Samson Raphael Hirsch: Allan C. Brownfield, “Zionism at 100: Remembering Its Often Prophetic Jewish Critics,” *Issues of the American Council for Judaism*, Summer 1997, 2, in Yakov M. Rabkin, *A Threat from Within: A Century of Jewish Opposition to Zionism*, trans. Fred A. Reed (Winnipeg: Fernwood Publishing, 2006), 19–20.

By 1937: “Columbus Platform,” 1937, <http://ccarnet.org/rabbis-speak/platforms/guiding-principles-reform-judaism>.

**In 1889, for example** Soloveitchik quote and on immigration to the United States rather than the Land of Israel, see Rabkin, *Threat from Within*, 9, 75–76.

Technically, Jews were not leaving Russia, per se, but the Russian Empire.

**Anti-Zionists were so opposed** Jewish Zionist collaboration with Nazis: Edwin Black, *The Transfer Agreement: The Dramatic Story of a Pact Between the Third Reich and Jewish Palestine* (New York: Macmillan, 1984). Some Zionist leaders

also opposed policies that allowed Jews attempting to escape from the Nazis to immigrate to British-occupied Palestine, maintaining that only Jews who wanted to settle and build the new Jewish State should immigrate there, versus those wishing mainly to find a place of refuge. See, e.g., Rabkin, *Threat from Within*, 168–183; Howard M. Sachar, *A History of Israel: From the Rise of Zionism to Our Time* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2007), 197.

Adolf Eichmann, of all people, was one of the Nazi officers who helped Jews flee to Palestine. He is perhaps best known today as the only person in Israeli history to have received the country's legally sanctioned punishment of the death penalty (different from military "targeted assassinations" that have become a normalized phenomenon in Israel since 2000). For more on Eichmann, see Notes, chapter 9, "This was not always the case."

**After 1948** Three ultra-Orthodox anti-Zionist communities today are the Satmar, Neturei Karta, and Lev Tahor. See, e.g., Israel Domb, *Transformation: The Case of the Neturei Karta* (Brooklyn, NY: Hachomo, 1989); Dovid Meisels, *The Rebbe: The Extraordinary Life and Worldview of Rabbeinu Yoel Teitelbaum, the Satmar Rebbe* (Lakewood, NJ: Israel Bookshop Publications, 2010); <http://nkusa.org>; Ted Robbins, "Dogged by Controversy, a Jewish Sect Is on the Move Again," National Public Radio, September 10, 2014, [www.npr.org/sections/parallels/2014/09/10/347123746/dogged-by-controversy-a-jewish-sect-is-on-the-move-again](http://www.npr.org/sections/parallels/2014/09/10/347123746/dogged-by-controversy-a-jewish-sect-is-on-the-move-again).

During the 1960s and 1970s, some ultra-Orthodox anti-Zionists in Israel attempted to make alliances with disgruntled Mizrahi Jewish Israelis, including the Israeli Black Panthers, a group with which they shared the goal of fighting a "state governed by Ashkenazim for Ashkenazim." See Ruth Blau, *Les gardiens de la cité: Histoire d'une guerre sainte* (Paris: Flammarion, 1978), 275, cited in Rabkin, *Threat from Within*, 38; also 53–54.

Few ultra-Orthodox groups publicly decry Zionism: Consider, for example, a statement recently made by Rabbi Shalom Cohen, the spiritual leader of Shas, a popular ultra-Orthodox political party in Israel, explaining that halakhic prayer is superior to declarations such as the Israeli national anthem ("Hatikvah"). One should, Cohen said, stand up to pay halakhic respect to God in prayer, and not while singing a nation-state anthem. This stance reflects a "religious Zionist" perspective rather than a Zionism understood in terms of a nonhalakhically sanctioned nation-state. See Jeremy Sharon, "Shas Spiritual Leader: 'Hatikvah is a Stupid Song,'" *Jerusalem Post*, February 22, 2015, [www.jpost.com/Israel-Elections/Shas-spiritual-leader-Hatikvah-is-a-stupid-song-391825](http://www.jpost.com/Israel-Elections/Shas-spiritual-leader-Hatikvah-is-a-stupid-song-391825). I thank Avi Jorisch for pointing me to this.

**Meanwhile the majority of Orthodox** See, e.g., Hartman and Hartman, "Denominational Differences," 394–417.

**Zionists such as Herzl** Ahad Ha-am, "The Jewish State and the Jewish Problem" (1897), in Hertzberg (ed.), *Zionist Idea*, 262–269.

**Building upon Ahad Ha-am's ideas** I use the term *Pal-*

*estinian Arab* when discussing (non-Jewish) Arabs living in Ottoman-controlled Palestine. At the time, many in these communities referred to themselves simply as Arabs rather than Palestinian Arabs, and some identified more with the region or province where they lived. Just when a distinctly "Palestinian Arab" identity emerged is beyond the scope of this book. See Lockman, *Comrades and Enemies*, 18, 21–23; also Khalidi, *Palestinian Identity*.

Buber quotes: Martin Buber, "The Jewish Woman's Zion," in *The First Buber: Youthful Zionist Writings of Martin Buber*, ed. and trans. Gilya G. Schmidt (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1999), 112–118; idem, "The Jew in the World" (1934) and "Hebrew Humanism" (1942), in Hertzberg (ed.), *Zionist Idea*, 453–463; Paul Mendes-Flohr, ed., *A Land of Two Peoples: Martin Buber on Jews and Arabs* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005); Michael Zank, *New Perspectives on Martin Buber* (Tübingen, Ger.: Mohr Siebeck, 2006).

Friedman quote: Maurice Friedman, *Martin Buber's Life and Work: The Early Years, 1878–1923* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1988), 45–46.

**Along with other important intellectuals** Not all of the individuals listed in this paragraph were official members of Brit Shalom. However, all supported the idea of a binational state, and most, if not all, supported this idea publicly. See Solveig Eggerz, "More than a Nation: The Cultural Zionism of Martin Buber," American Council for Judaism, Fall 1998, [www.acjna.org/acjna/articles\\_detail.aspx?id=98](http://www.acjna.org/acjna/articles_detail.aspx?id=98); Maurice Friedman, *Martin Buber's Life and Work: The Middle Years, 1923–1945* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1988), 11; Shalom Ratsabi, *Between Zionism and Judaism: The Radical Circle in Brith Shalom, 1925–1933* (Leiden, Neth.: Brill, 2002).

Even Chaim Weizmann: In a speech delivered in 1931, Weizmann said:

The Arabs must be made to feel, must be convinced, by deed as well as word that whatever the future numerical relationship of the two nations in Palestine, we, on our part, contemplate no political domination. Provided that the mandate is both recognized and respected, we would welcome an agreement between the two kindred races on the basis of political parity. It is our duty to explain our aims and ideals clearly and without ambiguity to the Arab peoples, and to neglect no opportunity of coming into touch with them and no channel of communication which may help towards a mutual understanding. . . . Only in this way shall we succeed in cooperating with the Arab peoples, who themselves are struggling toward the light and now, after many centuries, are reentering the political arena of the world. (Chaim Weizmann, in Friedman, *Martin Buber's Life and Work*, 11)

**Similar to the cultural and spiritual Zionism** First Mordecai Kaplan quote: Mel Scult, *Judaism Faces the Twentieth Century: A Biography of Mordecai M. Kaplan* (Detroit, MI: Wayne State University Press, 1993), 30, quoted in Noam Pianko, *Zionism and the Roads Not Taken: Rawidowicz, Kaplan, Kohn* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2010), 110–111.

Second Kaplan quote: Mordecai Kaplan, *Judaism as a Civilization* (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society Press, 1994), 413, in Pianko, *Zionism*, 111.

Other important figures who advocated a Zionism unte-



thered by a nation-state were Simon Rawidowicz and Hans Kohn. See, e.g., David N. Myers, *Between Jew and Arab: The Lost Voice of Simon Rawidowicz* (Waltham, MA: Brandeis University Press, 2008); Pianko, *Zionism*.

**On the other end of the Zionist spectrum** “Terrorists”: For more on the use of this term as applied to the Irgun and some of its offshoots, see “The Yishuv Responds,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-yishuv-responds/single-page](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-yishuv-responds/single-page). See also Morris, *Righteous Victims*, 128–151, 161, 173–180.

At the same time the Irgun are often labeled “terrorists”: For a piece highlighting Jabotinsky’s public statements on the need to accord Palestinian Arabs the same human rights as Jews, see Mordechai Kremnitzer and Amir Fuchs, “Ze’ev Jabotinsky on Democracy, Equality, and Individual Rights,” Israel Democracy Institute, 2013, <http://en.idi.org.il/media/2384931/Jabotinsky-IDI-2013.pdf>.

**The core Jewish narrative** Morris, *Righteous Victims*, 91.

**This observation was also quite obvious** As scholar Mark Tessler explains, “The absolute population size of the Arab population grew steadily during this period. Although it increased at a slower rate than did the Jewish community, the Palestinian Arab population grew at an annual rate that averaged almost 3 percent between 1922 and 1945, enabling it to nearly double during those years. The growth rate itself also increased steadily as improvements in health care lowered the number of deaths each year. Among Muslims, the annual rate of natural increase had risen to almost 4 percent by the end of the mandate” (Tessler, *History of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict*, 210). See also Baruch Kimmerling, *The Invention and Decline of Israeliness: State, Society, and the Military* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001), 35.

**This meant that the Zionist Jews** On “relational history,” see Lockman, *Comrades and Enemies*, 8–10.

**With regard to dominant Jewish narratives** For more on the “Hebron massacre” see, e.g., Noit Geva and Dan Geva, *What I Saw in Hebron* (1999) [film]; Morris, *Righteous Victims*, 111–118.

**The State of Israel was established** Following the 1949 ceasefire, most Palestinians in the region lived in the West Bank and Gaza, not in the new Jewish State. See State of Israel, Central Bureau of Statistics (CBS), “65th Independence Day—More than 8 Million Residents in the State of Israel,” April 14, 2013, [http://www1.cbs.gov.il/www/hodaot2013n/11\\_13\\_097e.pdf](http://www1.cbs.gov.il/www/hodaot2013n/11_13_097e.pdf).

**This demographic shift is primarily attributed** On physical removal by Jewish military forces and flight due to war, see, e.g., Simha Flapan, *The Birth of Israel: Myths and Realities* (New York: Pantheon, 1987), 101, 206; Morris, *Birth of the Palestinian Refugee Problem*, 141, 328; idem, *Righteous Victims*, 38, 142, 190, 207; Tom Segev, *The First Israelis: 1949* (New York: Free Press, 1998), 71–72; Ari Shavit, *My Promised Land: The Triumph and Tragedy of Israel* (New York: Random House, 2013); Avi Shlaim, *The Iron Wall: Israel and the Arab World* (New York: Norton, 2000), 31.

Invading Arab armies responsible for ordering some Palestinians to leave: See, e.g., Iris Fruchter-Ronen, “The Palestinian Issue as Constructed in Jordanian Textbooks, 1964–1994: Changes in the National Narrative,” *Middle Eastern Studies* 49, no. 2 (2013): 280–295; Rafi Nets-Zehngut, “Israeli-Approved Textbooks and the 1948 Palestinian Exodus,” *Israel Studies* 18, no. 3 (Fall 2013): 41–68.

Refugees: Palestinians living in East Jerusalem and the Golan Heights largely stayed put following the 1949 armistice agreements, as they were still living under the government rule of Jordan and Syria, respectively, who controlled these areas pre- and post-1949. As for Palestinians who left the area that was now under Israeli rule (i.e., as of 1948–1949 called the State of Israel), some of these refugees ended up in the West Bank (under Jordanian rule), some relocated to Gaza (under Egyptian rule), some fled to other Arab-majority countries in the Middle East, and some left the Middle East altogether. Among those Palestinians who remained in what was now the Jewish State, some continue to identify today as refugees—internally displaced peoples—even though they did not register with the United Nations Refugee Workers Agency in 1948–1949 and despite the stigma attached to this label within Arab communities generally and Palestinian communities specifically. For more on Palestinian refugees, see, e.g., “The United Nations and Palestinian Refugees,” Public Information Office, The United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (UNRWA), January 2007, [www.unrwa.org/userfiles/2010011791015.pdf](http://www.unrwa.org/userfiles/2010011791015.pdf).

**By some accounts** On the mixed support American Jews have given the new Jewish State over time, see Steven M. Cohen, “Relationships of American Jews with Israel: What We Know and What We Need to Know,” *Contemporary Jewry* 23, no. 1 (January 1, 2002): 133.

Greatest event in Jewish history: Hartman and Hartman, “Denominational Differences,” 394–417.

**In accord with this particular narrative** Some date the beginning of the intensification of violence between Jewish Zionists and Palestinian Arabs to the United Nations announcement of a “Partition Plan,” delivered in November 1947, a proposal that suggested the two communities divide up the land between the Jordan River and the Mediterranean Sea along specified borders (see figs. 10.5).

**For example, consider the following description** Ariel Sharon with David Charnoff, *Warrior: An Autobiography* (New York: Simon and Schuster, 1989), 165, 212–213.

**Sharon is one of the more important symbols** “Ariel Sharon Has a Successful Abdominal Surgery,” *Jewish Telegraphic Agency*, September 4, 2013, [www.jta.org/2013/09/04/news-opinion/israel-middle-east/ariel-sharon-has-successful-abdominal-surgery](http://www.jta.org/2013/09/04/news-opinion/israel-middle-east/ariel-sharon-has-successful-abdominal-surgery); Stephen Miller and Joshua Mitnick, “Former Israel Leader Ariel Sharon Dies,” *Wall Street Journal*, January 12, 2014, [www.wsj.com/articles/SB10001424052702304023504577319854032709334](http://www.wsj.com/articles/SB10001424052702304023504577319854032709334).

**Yet, Sharon is far from the only Jewish Israeli** Although

the historical veracity of the events depicted in the Hebrew Bible is certainly debatable, this story is nevertheless core to dominant narratives among Jewish Israelis, regardless of whether identifying as secular or religious (see chapters 1, 8, and later in this chapter). As such, many Jews felt, and continue to feel, that only after the war of June 1967 did Jews—*once again*—control these specific biblical regions.

More than doubled its geographical domain: Tessler, *History of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict*, 399–405.

**One cannot overstate the impact** Morris, *Righteous Victims*, 329. This increase in conquered land not only was seen to strengthen the country's security but also gave the Jewish State a major bargaining chip for future negotiations with their neighbors. As Morris (*ibid.*, 330) notes, "Israelis at last had something they could give the Arabs in exchange for peace."

**Jewish Israelis felt as if they had finally** The *Haaretz* editorial is cited in Morris, *Righteous Victims*, 329.

"Tremendous victory": Roger Friedland and Richard Hecht, *To Rule Jerusalem* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000), 163.

**Conquered land aside** Population figures can be found in Tessler, *History of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict*, 401–405.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 10.2 Occupation** as a technical military term: Adam Roberts, "Prolonged Military Occupation: The Israeli-Occupied Territories since 1967," *American Journal of International Law* 84, no. 1 (Jan. 1990): 44–103; *idem*, "What is Military Occupation?," *British Yearbook of International Law* 55 (1985): 250–305, available at [http://web.law.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/microsites/gender-sexuality/Roberts What is Military Occupation.pdf](http://web.law.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/microsites/gender-sexuality/Roberts%20What%20is%20Military%20Occupation.pdf).

Implications regarding the use of the term *occupation* with regard to Israel and Palestine: See, e.g., Alan Baker, "Op-Ed: 'Occupied Territories' Is a Flawed and Biased Term," Jewish Telegraphic Agency, April 8, 2014, [www.jta.org/2014/04/08/news-opinion/opinion/op-ed-occupied-territories-is-a-flawed-and-biased-term](http://www.jta.org/2014/04/08/news-opinion/opinion/op-ed-occupied-territories-is-a-flawed-and-biased-term).

Use of the term by Israeli leaders: See, e.g., Avinoam Sharon, "Why Is Israel's Presence in the Territories Still Called 'Occupation'?", Jerusalem Center for Public Affairs, 2009, <http://jcpa.org/text/Occupation-Sharon.pdf>.

Sharon quote: Kelly Wallace, "Sharon: 'Occupation' Terrible for Israel, Palestinians," CNN, May 27, 2003, [www.cnn.com/2003/WORLD/meast/05/26/mideast](http://www.cnn.com/2003/WORLD/meast/05/26/mideast).

Ben-Gurion quote: John McCook Roots, "David Ben Gurion Talks about Israel and the Arabs . . . 'Peace Is More Important than Real Estate,'" *Saturday Review*, April 3, 1971, 14.

Bush quote: "Bush Calls for an End to 'Occupation' of Arab Lands." Former Speaker of the House and Republican presidential candidate Newt Gingrich also used the term *occupied* in relation to the West Bank and Gaza when voicing his support for Israeli development: "I do not oppose any development in the Israeli-occupied areas, because I think that's part of the negotiating process. As long as the Palestinians

are waging war on Israel, they are in no position to complain about developments" (Wayne Barrett, "Is Gingrich's Hardline on Palestine Paid for by Sheldon Adelson," *Daily Beast*, January 18, [www.thedailybeast.com/articles/2012/01/18/is-gingrich-s-hard-line-on-palestine-paid-for-by-sheldon-adelson.html](http://www.thedailybeast.com/articles/2012/01/18/is-gingrich-s-hard-line-on-palestine-paid-for-by-sheldon-adelson.html)).

Obama reference: Edward-Isaac Dove, "Barack Obama's Top Aide Says Israeli 'Occupation' Must End," Politico, March 23, 2015, [www.politico.com/story/2015/03/denis-mcdonough-benjamin-netanyahu-israeli-occupation-116319.html](http://www.politico.com/story/2015/03/denis-mcdonough-benjamin-netanyahu-israeli-occupation-116319.html).

Washington Institute for Near East Policy: See, e.g., David Makovsky with Sheli Chabon and Jennifer Logan, "Imagining the Border: Options for Resolving the Israeli-Palestinian Territorial Issue," Washington Institute for Near East Policy Strategic Report, 2011, [www.washingtoninstitute.org/uploads/Documents/pubs/StrategicReport06.pdf](http://www.washingtoninstitute.org/uploads/Documents/pubs/StrategicReport06.pdf).

The following sources, for example, all from the Middle East Research and Information Project (MERIP), apply the term *occupation* to those ruling over Palestinians since 1948, whether Jordanian, Egyptian, or Israeli: Fred Halliday, "1967 and the Consequences of Catastrophe," Middle East Research and Information Project (MERIP) 146, [www.merip.org/mer/mer146/1967-consequences-catastrophe](http://www.merip.org/mer/mer146/1967-consequences-catastrophe); Joan Mandell, "Gaza: Israel's Soweto," MERIP 136, [www.merip.org/mer/mer136/gaza-israels-soweto](http://www.merip.org/mer/mer136/gaza-israels-soweto); "Primer on Palestine, Israel, and the Arab-Israeli Conflict," MERIP, [www.merip.org/primer-palestine-israel-arab-israeli-conflict-new](http://www.merip.org/primer-palestine-israel-arab-israeli-conflict-new).

**Meanwhile, the Palestinian population** 2013 population figures can be found at Israel, CBS, "65th Independence Day"; State of Palestine, Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics, "On the 65th Anniversary of the Palestinian Nakba," May 14, 2013, [www.pcbs.gov.ps/site/512/default.aspx?tabID=512&lang=en&ItemID=788&mid=3171&wversion=Staging](http://www.pcbs.gov.ps/site/512/default.aspx?tabID=512&lang=en&ItemID=788&mid=3171&wversion=Staging).

In terms of different numbers as to Palestinians living in Israel vs. those living in the occupied West Bank (also commonly called Palestine), sometimes discrepancies are based in where one draws the line between Israel and Palestine. More specifically, there are often differences in opinion as to which parts of Jerusalem "belong" to which group and/or nation-state.

**In the current realpolitik** Palestine declarations of independence: On November 15, 1988, the Palestine National Council issued a Declaration of Independence for the State of Palestine, which called for sovereignty and recognition as a legitimate country. Within two weeks, fifty-five nations had recognized Palestine, with more joining in subsequently. Neither Israel nor the United States was among these countries. See Tessler, *History of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict*, 723–729. On November 29, 2012, Palestine was approved by the United Nations General Assembly to have "non-member observer state" status, with 138 member states voting in favor of the proposal ("General Assembly Votes Overwhelmingly to Accord Palestine 'Non-Member Observer State' Status in United Nations," United Nations Department of Public Information, News and Media Division, New York, November 29, 2012, [www.un.org/News/Press/docs/2012/ga11317.doc.htm](http://www.un.org/News/Press/docs/2012/ga11317.doc.htm)).

**For example, between 2005 and 2014** Israel's control over the occupied West Bank and Gaza: See, e.g., Naseer H. Aruri, "Early Empowerment: The Burden Not the Responsibility," *Journal of Palestine Studies* 24, no. 2 (Winter 1995): 33–39; Rashid Khalidi, "The Palestinians Twenty Years Later," *Middle East Report* 146 (May 1987): 6–14; Nadim Rouhana and Asad Ghanem, "The Crisis of Minorities in Ethnic States: The Case of the Palestinian Citizens in Israel," *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 30, no. 3 (August 1998): 321–346; Sarah Roy, "Alienation or Accommodation," *Journal of Palestine Studies* 24, no. 4 (Summer 1995): 73–82; idem, "Palestinian Society and Economy: The Continued Denial of Possibility," *Journal of Palestine Studies* 30, no. 4 (Summer 2001): 5–20; Julie Trottier, "A Wall, Water, and Power: The Israeli 'Separation Fence,'" *Review of International Studies* 33 (2007): 105–127.

Tried in Israeli military courts: B'tselem, "The Legal Basis for Administrative Detention in Israeli and the Occupied Territories," July 22, 2012, [www.btselem.org/administrative\\_detention/israeli\\_law](http://www.btselem.org/administrative_detention/israeli_law); Human Rights Watch, "Country Summary: Israel/Occupied Palestinian Territories," January 2012, [www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/related\\_material/israel\\_opt\\_2012.pdf](http://www.hrw.org/sites/default/files/related_material/israel_opt_2012.pdf); Sharon Weill, "The Judicial Arm of the Occupation: The Israeli Military Courts in the Occupied Territories," *International Review of the Red Cross* 89, no. 866 (June 2007): 395–419.

"Settlers": "The Price of the Settlements (or) How Israel Favors Settlements and the Settlers," Peace Now, August 2013, <http://peacenow.org/WP/wp-content/uploads/Price-of-Settlements-2013-English.pdf>.

**For these reasons and more** On Jewish attitudes toward the establishment of an independent Palestinian state, see Pew Research Center, "A Portrait of Jewish Americans: Findings from a Pew Research Center Survey of U.S. Jews," October 1, 2013, 81–94, [www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey](http://www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey).

"Two-state solution": Though poll numbers regarding a Palestinian state have waxed and waned over the last few decades, the general trend among American and Israeli Jews has been in favor of Palestinian statehood. See Natasha Mozgovava, "Poll: Majority of U.S. Jews Support Mid-east Peace Plan based on 1967 borders," *Haaretz*, July 21, 2011, [www.haaretz.com/news/diplomacy-defense/poll-majority-of-u-s-jews-support-mideast-peace-plan-based-on-1967-borders-1.374554](http://www.haaretz.com/news/diplomacy-defense/poll-majority-of-u-s-jews-support-mideast-peace-plan-based-on-1967-borders-1.374554); Shibley Telhami, "The 2011 Public Opinion Poll of Jewish and Arab Citizens of Israel," Brookings Institution, December 1, 2011, [www.brookings.edu/research/reports/2011/12/01-israel-poll-telhami](http://www.brookings.edu/research/reports/2011/12/01-israel-poll-telhami); Yossi Verter and Jonathan Lis, "Survey: 55% of Israelis Say They're Inclined to Vote for a Peace Deal," *Haaretz*, July 24, 2013, [www.haaretz.com/news/diplomacy-defense/premium-1.537586](http://www.haaretz.com/news/diplomacy-defense/premium-1.537586). See also Geneva Initiative, [www.geneva-accord.org/mainmenu/polls](http://www.geneva-accord.org/mainmenu/polls).

On the creation of a Palestinian state in the West Bank and Gaza alongside the State of Israel, see "December Poll: 53% of Palestinians Support Mutual Recognition of Israel as State of Jewish People and Palestine as the State of Palestinian People," December 10–12, 2009, [www.geneva-accord.org/mainmenu/december-poll-53-of-palestinians-support-mutual-recognition-of-israel-as-state-of-jewish-people-and-palestine-as-the-state-of-palestinian-people](http://www.geneva-accord.org/mainmenu/december-poll-53-of-palestinians-support-mutual-recognition-of-israel-as-state-of-jewish-people-and-palestine-as-the-state-of-palestinian-people).

[www.geneva-accord.org/mainmenu/december-poll-53-of-palestinians-support-mutual-recognition-of-israel-as-state-of-jewish-people-and-palestine-as-the-state-of-palestinian-people](http://www.geneva-accord.org/mainmenu/december-poll-53-of-palestinians-support-mutual-recognition-of-israel-as-state-of-jewish-people-and-palestine-as-the-state-of-palestinian-people); Steven Kull, "The Potential for a Nonviolent Intifada II," Program on International Policy Attitudes and Search for Common Ground, December 9, 2002, [www.worldpublicopinion.org/pipa/pdf/deco2/Intifada2\\_Deco2\\_rpt.pdf](http://www.worldpublicopinion.org/pipa/pdf/deco2/Intifada2_Deco2_rpt.pdf).

**The Declaration of the Establishment of the State of Israel** Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs (IMFA), "Declaration of the Establishment of the State of Israel," May 14, 1948, [www.mfa.gov.il/MFA/ForeignPolicy/Peace/Guide/Pages/Declaration%20of%20Establishment%20of%20State%20of%20Israel.aspx](http://www.mfa.gov.il/MFA/ForeignPolicy/Peace/Guide/Pages/Declaration%20of%20Establishment%20of%20State%20of%20Israel.aspx).

Baruch Kimmerling quote: Kimmerling, *Invention and Decline of Israeliness*, 16.

**In Ben-Gurion's own words** Ben-Gurion is quoted in Derek J. Penslar, "Broadcast Orientalism: Representations of Mizrahi Jewry in Israeli Radio, 1948–1967," in *Orientalism and the Jews*, ed. Ivan Davidson Kalmar and Derek J. Penslar (Waltham, MA: Brandeis University Press, 2005), 185.

**Ben-Gurion imagined empowering** Jack Fellman, "Eliezer Ben Yehuda: A Language Reborn," IMFA, [www.mfa.gov.il/MFA/MFA-Archive/1998/Pages/Eliezer%20Ben-Yehuda-%20A%20Language%20Reborn.aspx](http://www.mfa.gov.il/MFA/MFA-Archive/1998/Pages/Eliezer%20Ben-Yehuda-%20A%20Language%20Reborn.aspx); IMFA, "Culture: Literature," [www.mfa.gov.il/MFA/AboutIsrael/Culture/Pages/CULTURE-%20Literature.aspx](http://www.mfa.gov.il/MFA/AboutIsrael/Culture/Pages/CULTURE-%20Literature.aspx); idem, "Facts about Israel: The State," [mfa.gov.il/MFA/AboutIsrael/State/Pages/The%20State.aspx](http://mfa.gov.il/MFA/AboutIsrael/State/Pages/The%20State.aspx); idem, "The Flag and the Emblem," [mfa.gov.il/MFA/AboutIsrael/IsraelAt50/Pages/The%20Flag%20and%20the%20Emblem.aspx](http://mfa.gov.il/MFA/AboutIsrael/IsraelAt50/Pages/The%20Flag%20and%20the%20Emblem.aspx); Alec Mishory, "Israel National Symbols: The Israeli Flag," [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/History/isflag.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/History/isflag.html); Rabkin, *Threat from Within*, 57.

**According to the dominant Israeli national narrative** Eliezer Ben-Yehuda quote is from Fellman, "Eliezer Ben Yehuda."

**Even before Israel was officially established** "Declaration of the Establishment of the State of Israel."

**A little more than two years** Jewish identities and the Law of Return: There is no official representative of the worldwide Jewish community; however, de facto, and to some extent de jure, the State of Israel plays this role more than any other body (see special topic 10.4). As mentioned, the Declaration of the Establishment of the State of Israel declares Israel to be "the" Jewish State, and the Law of Return gives Jews Israeli citizenship. By virtue of being Jewish, an individual has more legal right to become a citizen of the State of Israel than, for instance, a Palestinian Arab family whose ancestors had lived in Palestine for centuries yet in 1948 or 1967 was either expelled or fled the Jewish State and thus, according to Israeli law, relinquished their right to property and citizenship.

Put another way, the Law of Return expresses the idea that all Jews not living in Israel have a legal relationship with the State of Israel, whether they choose to enact that bond or not. In 1977, this ethos was expanded in the passing of a new



Israeli law that asserted “extraterritorial jurisdiction to criminally sanction anyone who has committed an offense against ‘the life, body, health, freedom or property of a Jew, as a Jew, or the property of a Jewish institution, because it is such’” (*Penal Law*, 5737–1977, § 13[b][2] [1977], quoted in Adeno Addis, “Imagining the Homeland from Afar: Community and Peoplehood in the Age of the Diaspora,” *Vanderbilt Journal of Transnational Law* 45, no. 963 [2012]: 1001 and 1030).

Text of the Law of Return (1950): IMFA, “Law of Return 5710–1950,” July 5, 1950, [www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/mfa-archive/1950-1959/pages/law%20of%20return%205710-1950.aspx](http://www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/mfa-archive/1950-1959/pages/law%20of%20return%205710-1950.aspx).

**Not until March 1970** Change to Law of Return (1970): IMFA, “Law of Return (Amendment No. 2) 5730–1970,” March 10, 1970, [www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/mfa-archive/1950-1959/pages/law%20of%20return%205710-1950.aspx](http://www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/mfa-archive/1950-1959/pages/law%20of%20return%205710-1950.aspx).

1970 amendment and unanswered questions: See, e.g., Andrew Sacks, “Eliminating Race as an Issue in Aliyah,” *Jerusalem Post*, February 21, 2013, <http://blogs.jpost.com/content/eliminating-race-issue-aliyah>; idem, “Let My People Go (to Israel),” *Jerusalem Post*, October 24, 2013, <http://blogs.jpost.com/content/let-my-people-go-israel>; idem, “To Hell with Logic,” *Jerusalem Post*, August 11, 2009; Avi Weiss, “End the Chief Rabbinate’s Monopoly,” *Times of Israel*, October 24, 2013, <http://blogs.timesofisrael.com/end-the-chief-rabbinate-monopoly/>.

**Since 1950, among the Israeli Supreme Court’s** Brother Daniel: See Notes, chapter 11, “As for how they are understood.”

Meir Lansky: David B. Green, “The Day in Jewish History: A Crime Boss Cashes in His Chips,” *Haaretz*, January 15, 2013, [www.haaretz.com/news/features/this-day-in-jewish-history/this-day-in-jewish-history-a-crime-boss-cashes-in-his-chips.premium-1.494050](http://www.haaretz.com/news/features/this-day-in-jewish-history/this-day-in-jewish-history-a-crime-boss-cashes-in-his-chips.premium-1.494050).

“Messianic Jews”: Each case has further concretized the borders to the government’s definition of a Jew. See Ruth Gavison, “The Law of Return at Sixty Years: History, Ideology, Justification,” trans. Gadi Weber, *Metzilah Center for Zionist, Jewish, Liberal, and Humanist Thought*, Jerusalem, July 2010. See also chapter 11.

Haim Cohen quote: R. S. Sharif, *Non-Jewish Zionism: Its Roots in Western History* (London: Zed Books, 1983), 5, cited in Robin Cohen, *Global Diasporas: An Introduction* (New York: Routledge, 1997), 117.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 10.3** Population figure of 800,000: See, e.g., The David Project and IsraTV, *The Forgotten Refugees* (2005) [film], [www.youtube.com/watch?v=KH8RL2XRr48](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KH8RL2XRr48); Michael R. Fischbach, “Palestinian Refugee Compensation and Israeli Counterclaims for Jewish Property in Arab Countries,” *Journal of Palestine Studies* 38, no. 1 (Autumn 2008): 6–24; Linda Gradstein, “Jews from Arab Countries Want Recognition of Refugee Status,” *Jewish Advocate* 205, no. 3 (December 5, 2014): 3; JIMENA, “FAQ on Jews from Arab Countries,” [www.jimena.org/faq](http://www.jimena.org/faq); Kathy Wazana, *They Were Promised the Sea* (2014) [film]. See also chapter 7.

**Interestingly, in 2013** Portugal: Jon Krich, “Jews Win

a Right of Return to Portugal Five Centuries after Inquisition,” *Time*, September 4, 2013, <http://world.time.com/2013/09/04/jews-win-a-right-of-return-to-portugal-five-centuries-after-inquisition>; Cnaan Lipshiz, “Portugal Becomes Second Country, after Israel, with a Jewish Law of Return,” *Times of Israel*, July 12, 2013, [www.timesofisrael.com/portugal-becomes-2nd-country-after-israel-with-a-jewish-law-of-return/](http://www.timesofisrael.com/portugal-becomes-2nd-country-after-israel-with-a-jewish-law-of-return/); idem, “In Portugal, Jewish Law of Return Moves from Facebook to Law Book,” *Jewish Telegraphic Agency*, July 11, 2013, [www.jta.org/2013/07/11/news-opinion/world/in-portugal-jewish-law-of-return-moves-from-facebook-to-law-book](http://www.jta.org/2013/07/11/news-opinion/world/in-portugal-jewish-law-of-return-moves-from-facebook-to-law-book).

Spain: Raphael Minder, “Spain Approves Citizenship Path for Sephardic Jews,” *New York Times*, June 11, 2015, [www.nytimes.com/2015/06/12/world/europe/spain-approves-citizenship-path-for-sephardic-jews.html?\\_r=0](http://www.nytimes.com/2015/06/12/world/europe/spain-approves-citizenship-path-for-sephardic-jews.html?_r=0).

**The process of identity formation** On the local population already identifying as Palestinian Arabs, see, e.g., Khalidi, *Palestinian Identity*; Baruch Kimmerling and Joel S. Migdal, *The Palestinian People: A History* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2003).

**After 1948, the Jewish State** Helga Tawil-Souri, “Uneven Borders, Coloured (Im)mobilities: ID Cards in Palestine/Israel,” *Geopolitics* 17 (2012): 156.

**Each card designated a single “nationality”** The only other countries to list an individual’s religion on their national identification cards are Afghanistan, Brunei, Egypt, Jordan, and Turkey, while only four countries list ethnicity (Bhutan, China, Ethiopia, and Vietnam), only two list race (Malaysia and Singapore), and only one lists color (the Dominican Republic) (Tawil-Souri, “Uneven Borders,” 159).

Distinguishing between Jews and Arabs on national identification cards: The idea that a Jew was unable to be both Jewish and Arab did not come from the founders of Israel but predated the establishment of the Jewish State by decades, if not centuries. See Gil Anidjar, *The Jew, the Arab: A History of the Enemy* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2003).

**Reasons for this policy aside** Oudeh Basharat, “November 8, 1966: Military Rule on Israeli Arabs Lifted,” *Haaretz*, June 16, 2013, [www.haaretz.com/jewish/history/1](http://www.haaretz.com/jewish/history/1); Ron Gerlitz, ed., “From Barriers to Opportunities: Summaries of Selected Policy Papers—2011,” Sikkuy—The Association for the Advancement of Civic Equality in Israel, March 2012, [www.sikkuy.org.il/wp-content/uploads/2014/04/from\\_barriers\\_to\\_opportunities2012.pdf](http://www.sikkuy.org.il/wp-content/uploads/2014/04/from_barriers_to_opportunities2012.pdf); “The Inequality Report: The Palestinian Arab Minority in Israel,” Adalah—The Legal Center for Arab Minority Rights in Israel, March 2011, [www.adalah.org/uploads/oldfiles/upfiles/2011/Adalah\\_The\\_Inequality\\_Report\\_March\\_2011.pdf](http://www.adalah.org/uploads/oldfiles/upfiles/2011/Adalah_The_Inequality_Report_March_2011.pdf); Yitzhak Reiter, “Israel Studies an Anthology: Israel and Its Arab Minority” (May 2009), [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/isdf/text/reiter.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/isdf/text/reiter.html); Ilan Saban, “Theorizing and Tracing the Legal Dimensions of a Control Framework: Law and the Arab-Palestinian Minority in Israel’s First Three Decades (1948–1978),” *Emory International Law Review* 25, no. 1 (2011): 299–378.

For more on the creation of the “Israeli Arab” identity, see Shira Robinson, *Citizen Strangers: Palestinians and the Birth of Israel’s Liberal Settler State* (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 2013).

**In the twenty-first century** On the perception of Jewish identities vis-à-vis Arab identities, see Yehouda Shenhav and Hannah Hever, “‘Arab Jews’ after Structuralism: Zionist Discourse and the (De)Formation of an Ethnic Identity,” *Social Identities* 18, no. 1 (January 2012): 101–118.

**MENA Jews had immigrated to a country** On the term *Mizrahi*, see Sami Shalom Chetrit, *Intra-Jewish Conflict in Israel: White Jews, Black Jews* (New York: Routledge, 2009); Amnon Raz-Krakotzkin, “The Zionist Return to the West and the Mizrahi Jewish Perspective,” in Kalmar and Penslar (eds.), *Orientalism and the Jews*, 172–173; Ella Shohat, “The Invention of the Mizrahim,” *Journal of Palestine Studies* 29, no. 1 (Autumn 1999): 5–20; idem, *Israeli Cinema: East/West and the Politics of Representation* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1989); Sammy Smooha, *Israel: Pluralism and Conflict* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978).

“Arab Jews”: Menachem Klein, “Arab Jew in Palestine,” *Israel Studies* 19, no. 3 (Fall 2014): 134–153; Salim Tamari, “Ishaq al-Shami and the Predicament of the Arab Jew in Palestine,” *Jerusalem Quarterly File* 21 (2004): 10–26.

**About this process** Raz-Krakotzkin, “Zionist Return,” 175.

**Pressure to assimilate** Ben-Gurion quote is from Eric Rouleau, “Interview with Ben-Gurion,” *Le Monde*, March 9, 1967, cited in Smooha, *Israel*, 88). See also Nissim Rejwan, “The Two Israels: A Study in Europocentrism,” *Judaism* 16, no. 1 (Winter 1967): 97–108; Gidi Weitz, “Newly Released Documents Show a Darker Side of Ben-Gurion,” *Haaretz*, April 24, 2015, [www.haaretz.com/news/features/.premium-1.653134](http://www.haaretz.com/news/features/.premium-1.653134).

**In a 1965 interview** Ben-Gurion is quoted in Robert J. Moskin, “Prejudice in Israel,” *Look*, October 5, 1965, 67–72. See also Rejwan, “Two Israels”; Smooha, *Israel*, 88.

**Ben-Gurion was not the only figure** Golda Meir quote is from Nissim Rejwan, “Israel’s Communal Controversy—an Oriental Appraisal,” *Midstream* 10, no. 2 (June 1964): 16, cited in Smooha, *Israel*, 88–89.

Another influential Jewish Israeli figure who voiced similar ideas was Abba Eban, Israel’s foreign minister and ambassador to the United Nations. In his 1969 book *Voice of Israel*, he wrote: “One of the great apprehensions which afflict us when we contemplate our cultural scene is the danger lest the predominance of immigrants of Oriental origin force Israel to equalize its cultural level with that of the neighboring world. So far from regarding our immigrants from Oriental countries as a bridge toward our integration with the Arabic-speaking world, our object should be to infuse them with an Occidental [Western] spirit, rather than to allow them to drag us into an unnatural Orientalism” (Abba Eban, *Voice of Israel* [New York: Horizon Press, 1969], 76).

**In countless instances** See, e.g., Ranen Omer-Sherman, “Longing to Belong: Levantine Arabs and Jews in the Israeli

Cultural Imagination,” *Michigan Quarterly Review* 49, no. 2 (Spring 2010): 254–291; Raphael Patai, *Israel between East and West: A Study in Human Relations* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1970); Rejwan, “Two Israels”; Abraham Shumsky, *Clash of Cultures in Israel* (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1972).

Some Ashkenazi Jews continue to make claims of superiority today”: See, e.g., Gregory Cochran, Jason Hardy, and Henry Harpending, “Natural History of Ashkenazi Intelligence,” *Journal of Biosocial Intelligence* 38, no. 5 (September 2006): 659–693; Charles Murray, “Jewish Genius,” *Commentary*, April 2007, [www.commentarymagazine.com/article/jewish-genius](http://www.commentarymagazine.com/article/jewish-genius).

MENA Jews as new Israeli working class: Shoshana Madmoni-Gerber, *Israeli Media and the Framing of Internal Conflict: The Yemenite Babies Affair* (New York City: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009), 25–27.

**One way scholars frame Ashkenazi hegemony** “Intra-Jewish Orientalism”: Take, for example, the name of the first major assisted immigration of Yemenite Jews to Israel, “Operation Magic Carpet” (Madmoni-Gerber, *Israeli Media*, 36). Similarly, one of the names for the first major airlifts to Israel of Iraqi Jews was “Operation Ali Baba” (“Immigration to Israel: Operation Ezra and Nehemiah—The Airlift of Iraqi Jews [1951–1952], [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/Immigration/ezra.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/Immigration/ezra.html)).

Deliberate segregation and subsequent placement: One could argue that this phenomenon actually predated the establishment of the State of Israel by more than half a century. Although small pockets of non-Ashkenazi Jews, such as Yemenites, arrived prior to the much larger waves of Jews of Russian and Polish descent, whether arriving under Ottoman rule (1881 to 1915) or immediately after Israel was established (1949 to 1951), Yemenites were consistently treated unequally by their Ashkenazi brethren. See, e.g., Gershon Shafir, “The Meeting of Eastern Europe and Yemen: ‘Idealistic Workers’ and ‘Natural Workers’ in Early Zionist Settlement in Palestine,” *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 13, no. 2 (1990): 172–197.

Policies in 1950s absorption centers: Smooha, *Israel*, 89.

**The Otherization** On the long-term effects of internalized oppression, see Madmoni-Gerber, *Israeli Media*, 5, 25–27.

Mizrahi history in Israeli textbooks: Some point out that most of the authors of these textbooks are Ashkenazi (e.g., Sami Shalom Chetrit, *The Mizrahi Struggle in Israel* [Tel Aviv: Am Oved, 2004], cited in Madmoni-Gerber, *Israeli Media*, 21), and more specifically, that they are Ashkenazi males, who likewise dominate Israeli academia (Smadar Lavie, “Academic Apartheid in Israel and the Lily White Feminism of the Upper Middle Class,” *Women in Judaism: A Multidisciplinary Journal* 3 [2002]: 1, cited in Madmoni-Gerber, *Israeli Media*, 4) and media (Madmoni-Gerber, *Israeli Media*, 43–67). Of course, such claims can also be problematic as they rely on the idea that Ashkenazi scholars marginalize non-Ashkenazi history based on identity alone, which is not always the case and is quite difficult to prove.

Negative treatment of Ethiopian Jews in Israel: This should be seen in contradistinction to Ashkenazi Jews immigrat-

ing to Israel since the 1960s, and particularly in the 1990s, such as Russians, who have been discriminated against much less and in very different ways. See Madmoni-Gerber, *Israeli Media*, 184–188; As'ad Ghanem, *Ethnic Politics in Israel: The Margins and the Ashkenazi Center* (New York: Routledge, 2010), 133–134. For example, one way that Russian Jews coming to Israel since the 1960s have experienced discrimination is in terms of their being accepted as Jews according to the “Law of Return.” This legal fixture has permitted them to become Israeli citizens (discussed above), but at the same time they are rejected as Jews according to strict understandings of Jewish law *cum* Israeli civil law, and thus excluded from such basic rights as the right to marry. One way Ethiopian Jews immigrating to Israel “dodged this bullet” was through their forced, community-wide conversion, after which point their Jewishness was accepted on all counts. For more on this, see chapters 1, 7, and 11.

Acknowledging that this domination and subordination even exists: Haim Fireberg, “Fighting Racism and Discrimination: In Praise of Transparency,” [http://ec.europa.eu/justice/fundamental-rights/files/monitoring\\_racism\\_in\\_israel\\_en.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/justice/fundamental-rights/files/monitoring_racism_in_israel_en.pdf).

#### According to two Israeli nongovernmental organizations

Tal Dahan, et al., “Situation Report: The State of Human Rights in Israel and the OPT,” Association for Civil Rights in Israel (ACRI), December 2014, available at [www.acri.org.il/en/wp-content/uploads/2014/12/Situation-Report-2014.pdf](http://www.acri.org.il/en/wp-content/uploads/2014/12/Situation-Report-2014.pdf); Libby Lenkinski, Tali Nir, Deborah Lyssy, and Tal Eisenzweig, eds., “NGO Information Submitted by the Association for Civil Rights (ACRI) to the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights for Consideration When Assessing the Compliance of the State of Israel under the International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights,” ACRI, October 2011, [www.acri.org.il/he/wp-content/uploads/2011/10/ICESCR2011.pdf](http://www.acri.org.il/he/wp-content/uploads/2011/10/ICESCR2011.pdf); Shlomo Swirski, “Israel in a Nutshell—A Different Introduction to Present Day Israeli Society and Economy,” The Adva Center—Information on Equality and Social Justice in Israel, May 30, 2011, <http://adva.org/en/post-slug-1647/>.

**Scholar Anthony Smith** Emile Durkheim, *The Elementary Forms of the Religious Life*, trans. Joseph Ward Swain (London: Allen and Unwin, 1915), 47, quoted in Anthony D. Smith, “The ‘Sacred’ Dimensions of Nationalism,” *Millennium: Journal of International Studies* 29, no. 3 (2000): 797. Smith’s four “sacred dimensions of nationalism” are described *ibid.*, 791–814.

**In this sense, all Zionists** Although there are important distinctions to be made between David Ben-Gurion’s understanding of Zionism and Martin Buber’s, my intention here is to blur the lines between religion and nationalism, in part because the normative way the Herzlian modern political Zionist movement is described is as a secular ideology, despite a great deal of evidence to the contrary.

God’s promise of the Land of Israel: See special topic 10.1. Yakov Rabkin quote: Rabkin, *Threat from Within*, 27.

**More to the point, for many Jews** Zionism, like other forms of nationalism, puts one nation—the State of Israel—above all others. The core ethos (the Zionist “Ten Commandments,” if you will) replaces God with the Jewish State. The development of this ideology played a role in Jewish Israeli ideologue Yeshayahu Leibowitz, among others, censuring of anyone who declared an object of any kind—whether a wall in the Old City of Jerusalem or the Land of Israel itself—to be sacred or “holy,” a reproach against Jews of many stripes. See, e.g., Yeshayahu Leibowitz, *Judaism, Human Values, and the Jewish State*, ed. Eliezer Goldman (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995).

**For much of medieval and modern European history** Various antisemitic stereotypes are explored in, e.g., Daniel Boyarin, *Unheroic Conduct: The Rise of Heterosexuality and the Invention of the Jewish Man* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997); Jonathan Boyarin and Daniel Boyarin, *Powers of Diaspora: Two Essays on the Relevance of Jewish Culture* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2002), 91–92; Robert Chazan, *Medieval Stereotypes and Modern Antisemitism* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997); John M. Efron, *Defenders of the Race: Jewish Doctors and Race Science in Fin-de-Siècle Europe* (New York: Yale University Press, 1994); Sander Gilman, *The Jew’s Body* (New York: Routledge, 1991); Joshua Trachtenberg, *The Devil and the Jews: The Medieval Conception of the Jew and Its Relation to Modern Anti-Semitism* (Philadelphia: The Jewish Publication Society of America, 1984).

**Max Nordau, for example** Michael Stanislawski, *Zionism and the Fin-de-Siècle: Cosmopolitanism and Nationalism from Nordau to Jabotinsky* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001), 92–93.

**Some of Josephus’s description** William Whiston, trans., “The Wars of the Jews,” Book 7, Chapter 9, in *The Works of Josephus* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1987), referenced in “Josephus Describes the Mass Suicide at Masada,” *Frontline: From Jesus to Christ*, [www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/shows/religion/maps/primary/josephusmasada.html](http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/shows/religion/maps/primary/josephusmasada.html).

**For decades, guides** Nachman Ben-Yehuda, *The Masada Myth: Collective Memory and Mythmaking in Israel* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1995); Glenda W. Friend and Steven Fine, “Masada,” *Oxford Encyclopedia of Archaeology in the Near East*, ed. Eric M. Meyers, Glenda W. Friend, and Steven Fine, [www.oxfordreference.com/view/10.1093/acref/9780195065121.001.0001/acref-9780195065121-e-677](http://www.oxfordreference.com/view/10.1093/acref/9780195065121.001.0001/acref-9780195065121-e-677); Yael Zerubavel, “The Death of Memory and the Memory of Death: Masada and the Holocaust as Historical Metaphors,” *Representations* 45 (Winter 1994): 72–100.

Critique of Josephus’s account: Shaye J. D. Cohen, “Masada: Literary Tradition, Archaeological Remains, and the Credibility of Josephus,” *Journal of Jewish Studies* 33, nos. 1–2 (1982): 385–405.

Loathed the Zealots: See chapter 8.



**As scholars Jonathan Boyarin and Daniel Boyarin explain** Boyarin and Boyarin, *Powers of Diaspora*, 47. See also Zerubavel, "Death of Memory," 75.

**Kibbutz:** A kibbutz is a collective community in Israel rooted in the combined ideologies of Zionism and socialism. For more, see [www.kibbutz.org.il/eng/welcome.htm](http://www.kibbutz.org.il/eng/welcome.htm).

**Today, the Boyarins** Boyarin and Boyarin, *Powers of Diaspora*, 47. See also Zerubavel, "Death of Memory," 75.

**For many Jews, the Zealots have come to symbolize** On Shoah survivors being criticized for going "like lambs to the slaughter," see Ben-Yehuda, *Masada Myth*, 142; Boyarin and Boyarin, *Powers of Diaspora*, 47–50; Zerubavel, "Death of Memory," 80.

**Masada:** Masada was popularized further, specifically in the United States, by Leon Uris and his best-selling novel *Exodus* (1958) and by the 1980s television miniseries *Masada*.

**Tourism aside, Masada is also used as a site** During military rituals, when new military recruits reach the summit, they swear their allegiance to the Jewish state and declare, "Masada shall not fall again!" See, e.g., "Masada Today," [www.arzaworld.com/israel-travel-guide/israel-travel-destinations/masada.aspx](http://www.arzaworld.com/israel-travel-guide/israel-travel-destinations/masada.aspx).

**Mandatory military service:** Exceptions include ultra-Orthodox Jewish Israelis, both men and women, who rarely enlist or perform national service. See Uta Klein, "The Gender Perspective of Civil-Military Relations in Israeli Society," *Current Sociology* 50, no. 5 (2002): 669–686.

**Only country to conscript women:** De jure, the Israeli military is also one of the most progressive in terms of soldiers' sexual orientations. When this point is advertised in North American communities, the charge of "pinkwashing" often arises—the claim that in proudly pointing to the military's good treatment of LGBT soldiers, Jewish Israelis "wash over" the human rights violations of Palestinians. (The term was originally coined in connection to raising money to combat breast cancer, a cause commonly linked to the color pink.)

**Not only are women** Anna Mulrine, "8 Other Nations that Send Women to Combat," *National Geographic News*, January 25, 2013, <http://news.nationalgeographic.com/news/2013/13/130125-women-combat-world-australia-israel-canada-norway>.

**Almost 50 percent:** Larry Abramson, "Women in Combat: Some Lessons from Israel's Military," National Public Radio, May 16, 2013, [www.npr.org/sections/parallels/2013/05/16/180045066/Women-In-Combat-Lessons-From-The-Israel-Defense-Forces](http://www.npr.org/sections/parallels/2013/05/16/180045066/Women-In-Combat-Lessons-From-The-Israel-Defense-Forces).

**In comparison to other countries' militaries:** For example, Australia, Canada, Denmark, France, Germany, New Zealand, Norway, and the United States; see Mulrine, "8 Other Nations."

**At the same time, the upper strata** Orna Barbivay: Gili Cohen, "Israeli Army Opens More Combat Roles for Women," *Haaretz*, September 1, 2014, [www.haaretz.com/news/diplomacy-defense/premium-1.613489](http://www.haaretz.com/news/diplomacy-defense/premium-1.613489); Israeli Defense Forces, "Newly Appointed Head of the Personnel Director-

ate . . .," May 26, 2011, [www.idfblog.com/blog/2011/05/26/newly-appointed-head-of-the-personnel-directorate-goc-northern-command-goc-home-front-command](http://www.idfblog.com/blog/2011/05/26/newly-appointed-head-of-the-personnel-directorate-goc-northern-command-goc-home-front-command).

Miri Eisen quote: Abramson, "Women in Combat."

**Study conducted on Israeli military:** Based on data collected between 2002 and 2005; see Mulrine, "8 Other Nations."

**Some point to early policies** Dafna N. Izraeli, "Gendering Military Service in the Israeli Defense Forces," *Israel Social Science Research* 12, no. 1 (1997): 129; idem, "Israel Defense Forces," Jewish Women's Archive, <http://jwa.org/encyclopedia/article/israel-defense-forces>. See also Yagil Levy, "Militarizing Inequality: A Conceptual Framework," *Theory and Society* 27 (1998): 873–904; Orna Sasson-Levy, "Constructing Identities at the Margins: Masculinities and Citizenship in the Israeli Army," *Sociological Quarterly* 43, no. 3 (2002): 357–383; idem, "Research on Gender and the Military in Israel: From a Gendered Organization to Inequality Regimes," *Israel Studies Review* 26, no. 2 (Winter 2011): 73–98; Nira Yuval-Davis, "Front and Rear: The Sexual Division of Labor in Israeli Army," *Feminist Studies* 11 (1985): 649–675.

**Hauser quote:** Orlee Hauser, "Lone Girls: Serving as the Protected in the Israeli Defence Forces," Paper presented at the Annual Conference of the American Sociological Association, Boston, 2008, 17–18. See also Martin Van Crevald, "A Woman's Place: Reflections on the Origins of Violence," *Social Research* 67, no. 3 (2000): 825–848.

**Women are also marginalized in terms of military narratives** Another example of marginalization is that only twenty-seven out of more than nine hundred military memorials built through 1998 are connected to women. See Judith Baumel-Schwartz, "'We Were There Too': Women's Commemoration in Israeli War Memorials," in *Jewish Women in Pre-State Israel: Life History, Politics, and Culture*, ed. Ruth Kark, Margalit Shilo, and Galit Hasan-Rokem (Waltham, MA: Brandeis University Press, 2008), 321–337. See also Anne R. Bloom, "Women in the Defense Forces," in *Calling the Equality Bluff: Women in Israel*, ed. Barbara Swirsky and Marilyn Safir (New York: Pergamon Press, 1991); Izraeli, "Israel Defense Forces."

**"National pantheon":** Interestingly, Aaronsohn challenged traditional gender roles by, for example, wearing "male clothing" and using masculine pronouns when writing about herself. See Baumel-Schwartz, "We Were There Too," 322–323; Billie Melman, "The Legend of Sarah: Gender, Memory, and National Identities (Eretz Yisrael/Israel 1917–1990)," in Kark et al. (eds.), *Jewish Women*, 285–320; idem, "Sarah Aaronsohn," Jewish Women's Archive, <http://jwa.org/encyclopedia/article/aaronsohn-sarah>.

**Archetype for military power:** Baumel-Schwartz, "We Were There Too," 321. Some might argue that images of females in the Israel military are just as common, if not more so, than those of males. One critical question to ask regarding such images, however, is whether they aim to represent strength or sexuality.

**As mentioned in chapter 8** On Jewish Immigration to

the United States, see Sidney Goldstein, “Jews in the United States: Perspectives from Demography,” in *American Jewish Year Book*, 1981, 9.

**For instance, according to a 1944 poll** Goldberg, *Jewish Power*, 117–120.

**Some have speculated** On post-Shoah philo-semitism, see, e.g., Melanie Kaye/Kantrowitz, *The Issue Is Power: Essays on Women, Jews, Violence, and Resistance* (San Francisco: Aunt Lute Books, 1992).

**Of course, Jewish assimilation** Jews “becoming white” is discussed in Theodore W. Allen, *The Invention of the White Race* (London: Verso, 1994); Karen Brodtkin, *How Jews Became White Folks and What That Says about Race in America* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2004); Barbara Jean Fields, “Ideology and Race in American History,” in *Region, Race, and Reconstruction: Essays in Honor of C. Vann Woodward*, ed. J. Morgan Kousser and James M. McPherson (New York: Oxford University Press, 1982), 143–177.

**As explored in chapter 1** Stephen J. Whitfield writes, “The culture of American Jewry was born in Eastern Europe and was then transplanted and refashioned in cities such as New York” (Stephen J. Whitfield, *In Search of American Jewish Culture* [Waltham, MA: University Press of New England, 1999], 1). This description—as if all American Jews are descendants of Ashkenazi Jewry—is a common take on Jewish American history, by historians and nonhistorians alike. Yet it is not factual. Not only is it New York-centric (or, more broadly, East Coast-centric), but it also homogenizes the American Jewish community under a single Ashkenazi umbrella. By some accounts, New York City has the second largest Jewish population in the world (after Tel Aviv); but approximately four million of America’s six million or so Jews live in other parts of the United States.

When asked about this bias, Whitfield said, “A distinctive style or slant to American culture coming from the Jewish minority doesn’t really become noticeable until after the massive Eastern European Jewish immigration. The Sephardim and the Germans of the nineteenth century were simply too few to constitute a recognizable body of creators and performers, which had to await the millions from Eastern Europe. Some of German background or with Sephardic roots made their contribution, of course (Emma Lazarus, Alfred Stieglitz, Walter Lippmann, Neil Sedaka) but more as individuals, in my opinion” (Stephen Whitfield, email to author, September 24, 2013).

**Becoming white played a significant role** On Jews’ distancing themselves from other minorities, see Eric L. Goldstein, *The Price of Whiteness: Jews, Race, and American Identity* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2006), 216–223.

Intellectual, scholarly, and artistic: We can point, for example, to intellectuals such as Hannah Arendt, Norman Mailer, Susan Sontag, and Lionel Trilling; scholars such as Nobel Laureates Melvin Calvin (chemistry) Gerty Cori, Joseph Erlanger, Herbert Glaser, Joshua Lederberg, Fritz Lipmann, Hermann Muller, Selman Waksman (physiology or

medicine), Felix Bloch, Isidor Rabi, Otto Stern (physics); and, in the arts, comedians such as Jack Benny, Milton Berle, and Sid Caesar.

See Edward Banfield with Laura Fasano Banfield, *The Moral Basis of a Backward Society* (Glencoe, IL: Free Press, 1958); Alexander Bloom, *Prodigal Sons: New York Jewish Intellectuals and Their World* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986); Brodtkin, *How Jews Became White Folks*; “Chemistry,” *Encyclopedia Judaica*, 2nd ed., ed. Michael Berenbaum and Fred Skolnick (Detroit: Macmillan Reference USA, 2007), 4:592–593, Gale Virtual Reference Library; Michael Denman, “Life Sciences,” *ibid.*, 13:6–11; Gabler, *An Empire of Their Own*; Nathan Glazer and Daniel Patrick Moynihan, *Beyond the Melting Pot* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1963); “Physics,” in Berenbaum and Skolnick (eds.), *Encyclopedia Judaica*, 16:131–141; Norman Podhoretz, “My Negro Problem—and Ours,” in *Bridges and Boundaries: African Americans and American Jews*, ed. Jack Salzman with Adina Back and Gretchen Sullivan Sorin (New York: George Braziller, 1992), 108–117.

**Assimilation in the United States** One such Haggadah was created by journalist Cokie Roberts and her husband, Steve Roberts: *Our Haggadah: Uniting Traditions for Interfaith Families* (New York: Harper, 2011).

**The highly publicized 2011 marriage** Jane Eisner, “When Marc Weds Chelsea,” *Jewish Daily Forward*, July 28, 2010, <http://forward.com/articles/129685/when-marc-weds-chelsea>.

**How do we know?** Hundreds of American companies certify the kashrut of food items. See, e.g., [www.kashrut.com/agencies/](http://www.kashrut.com/agencies/); <http://kosherquest.org/kosher-symbols>.

**Another way Jews have worked within** The prohibition against carrying objects on Shabbat applies particularly when going from a private to a public space, from a public to a private space, or within a public space. In order to set up an eruv, American Jews usually need legal permission from the local municipality. See Sharonne Cohen, “What Is an Eruv?,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/eruv/#](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/eruv/#).

**Finally, elements of dominant Jewish narratives**

Currently, five U.S. states—California, Florida, Illinois, New Jersey, and New York—require the study of the Shoah as part of their standard elementary, secondary, and/or high school curricula, and many others have integrated Shoah-specific topics as well. See Thomas D. Fallace, *The Emergence of Holocaust Education in American Schools* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008); Terri Susan Fine, “Creative Arts as Tools of Holocaust: Education in Primary, Middle, and High Schools (United States),” Yad Vashem—World Center for Holocaust Research, Documentation, Education, and Commemoration, [www.yadvashem.org/yv/en/education/conference/2004/26.pdf](http://www.yadvashem.org/yv/en/education/conference/2004/26.pdf); Alexander Hernandez, “Telling the Tale: Sharing Elie Wiesel’s *Night* with Middle School Readers,” *English Journal* 91, no. 2 (November 2001): 54–60; USHMM, “Beyond Our Walls: State Profiles on Holocaust Education,” [www.ushmm.org/educators/beyond-our-walls-state-profiles-on-holocaust-education](http://www.ushmm.org/educators/beyond-our-walls-state-profiles-on-holocaust-education).

**In the first half of the twentieth century** On “muscle men,” see Stanislawski, *Zionism*, 92–93.

“Murder, Inc.,” and Cohen quote: Daniel Brook, “Jewish Gangsters Get Their Day at Museum,” *Jewish Daily Forward*, April 3, 2012, <http://forward.com/culture/154101/jewish-gangsters-get-their-day-at-museum>. See also Rich Cohen, *Tough Jews: Fathers, Sons, and Gangster Dreams* (New York: Vintage Books, 1998).

**Some argue that Cohen** “Success” stories and “model Jews”: Adam J. Levitin, “Tough Jews by Rich Cohen,” *Commentary*, August 1, 1998, [www.commentarymagazine.com/article/tough-jews-by-rich-cohen](http://www.commentarymagazine.com/article/tough-jews-by-rich-cohen). Levitin writes: “Indeed, if Jewish gangsters were around today, Cohen argues, anti-Semites would have to think twice. Jewish children would not get beaten up in playground pogroms, and, in Israel, ‘there would be no Wailing Wall. It would be the Don’t-F[—]k-with-Me Wall!’”

“Still thrived today . . .”: Quoted in Vincent Patrick, “This You Call a Stick-up?,” *New York Times*, April 12, 1998, [www.nytimes.com/books/98/04/12/reviews/980412.12patrick.html](http://www.nytimes.com/books/98/04/12/reviews/980412.12patrick.html).

Goldberg quote: Jeffrey Goldberg, “Jews You Can Use,” *Slate*, April 12, 1998, [www.slate.com/articles/arts/books/1998/04/jews\\_you\\_can\\_use.html](http://www.slate.com/articles/arts/books/1998/04/jews_you_can_use.html). In stark contrast to Cohen, Goldberg then adds: “By the time I hit 16, my understanding of Jewish gangsters had become substantially more nuanced. Great nicknames and fists aside, I began to recognize these Jewish gangsters as fools and thugs who preyed on their own communities, robbed the Jewish poor, and murdered their own people. Rich Cohen, author of a new book titled *Tough Jews: Fathers, Sons, and Gangster Dreams*, doesn’t get this fact. For Cohen, a writer for *Rolling Stone* magazine, the Jewish gangsters are the purest expression of the Jewish spirit and the means through which he defines his own Jewishness.”

**This pride, conflicted or otherwise** A new Mob Museum in Las Vegas, formally called the National Museum of Organized Crime and Law Enforcement, is only slightly better at offering some of the details of these individuals’ crimes. But here, too, Jewish gangsters are glamorized.

*Wise Guys: Mobsters in the Mishpacha*: “JCCSF Matters Newsletter,” August 2010, [www.jccsf.org/the-center/jccsf-matters-newsletter/jccsf-matters-archives/august-2010](http://www.jccsf.org/the-center/jccsf-matters-newsletter/jccsf-matters-archives/august-2010) (accessed November 7, 2013).

**Jewish “tough guys” and “fighters”** Harry Brod, *Superman Is Jewish? How Comic Book Superheroes Came to Serve Truth, Justice, and the Jewish-American Way* (New York: Free Press, 2012); Michael Chabon, *The Amazing Adventures of Kavalier and Clay* (New York: Random House, 2012); Arie Kaplan, “How the Jews Created the Comic Book Industry, Part I: The Golden Age (1933–1955),” *Reform Judaism* 32, no. 1 (Fall 2003), <http://reformjudaismmag.net/03fall/comics.shtml>; idem, “Jews in Comic Books: How American Jews Created the Comic Book Industry,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jews-in-comic-books](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/jews-in-comic-books).

Jews’ desire for power as inspiration for superheroes: Some disagree with this premise. For example, according to writer

and artist Ben Katchot, the argument that Jews are the most important innovators in the field of comics “is a simplification of history made by people who think that comics were invented in 1938 by Siegel and Shuster [the creators of Superman]” (Derek Parker Royal, “Jewish Comics; or, Visualizing Current Jewish Narrative,” *Shofar: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Jewish Studies* 29, no. 2 [2011]: 4–5).

**This “wish fulfillment”** Samantha Baskind and Ranen Omer-Sherman, *The Jewish Graphic Novel: Critical Approaches* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2008); Arie Kaplan, *From Krakow to Krypton: Jews and Comic Books* (Philadelphia: Jewish Publication Society, 2008); idem, “How the Jews Created”; idem, “Jews in Comic Books”; Catherine Saunders, Heather Scott, Julia March, and Alastair Dougall, eds., *Marvel Chronicle: A Year by Year History* (New York: DK, 2008).

“Marvel Comics”: In 1938, when this company was founded, it went by the name Timely Comics. The “Daredevil” character was co-created by Stan Lee and Bill Everett; “Fantastic Four,” “Hulk,” and “X-Men” were co-created by Stan Lee and Jack Kirby; “Ironman” was created by Stan Lee, writer Larry Lieber, and artists Don Heck and Jack Kirby; “Spiderman” was co-created by Stan Lee and Steve Ditko; “Thor” was co-created by editor Stan Lee, writer Larry Lieber, and artist Jack Kirby.

**One indicator of Jewish power today** The USSR was the first country to recognize Israel de jure; see IMFA, “The State of Israel is Born,” [www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/aboutisrael/israelat50/pages/the%20state%20of%20israel%20is%20born.aspx](http://www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/aboutisrael/israelat50/pages/the%20state%20of%20israel%20is%20born.aspx).

United Nations Security Council resolution vetoes: American-Israeli Cooperative Enterprise, “U.N. Security Council: U.S. Vetoes of Resolutions Critical of Israel (1972–Present),” [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/UN/usvetoes.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/UN/usvetoes.html).

**Regarding foreign aid** \$3 billion annually: [www.foreignassistance.gov](http://www.foreignassistance.gov); Yoni Hirsch, “Israel Aid Remains Untouched in 2014 U.S. Budget Proposal,” *Israel Hayom*, April 11, 2013, [www.israelhayom.com/site/newsletter\\_article.php?id=8527](http://www.israelhayom.com/site/newsletter_article.php?id=8527); Shirl McArthur, “A Conservative Estimate of Total Direct U.S. Aid to Israel: Almost \$114 Billion,” *Washington Report on Middle East Affairs* 27, no. 8 (November 2008): 10–11; Jeremy M. Sharp, “U.S. Foreign Aid to Israel,” Congressional Research Service, Prepared for Members and Committees of Congress, RL33222, April 11, 2013, [www.fas.org/sfp/crs/mideast/RL33222.pdf](http://www.fas.org/sfp/crs/mideast/RL33222.pdf); Curt Tarnoff and Marian Leonardo Lawson, “Foreign Aid: An Introduction to U.S. Programs and Policy,” Congressional Research Service, Prepared for Members and Committees of Congress, R40213, February 10, 2011, [www.fas.org/crs/row/R40213.pdf](http://www.fas.org/crs/row/R40213.pdf).

Eight million in 2013: Israel, CBS, “65th Independence Day.”

One of the most powerful in the world: As scholar and journalist Fareed Zakaria wrote in 2012, “Money doesn’t begin to describe Israel’s real advantages, which are in the quality and effectiveness of its military, in terms of both weapons and people. Despite being dwarfed by the Arab population[s] of its neighbors], Israel’s army plus its high-quality reservists vastly outnumber those of the Arab



nations. Its weapons are far more sophisticated, often a generation ahead of those used by its adversaries. Israel's technology advantage has profound implications on the modern battlefield" (Fareed Zakaria, "Israel Dominates the New Middle East," *Washington Post*, November 21, 2012, [http://articles.washingtonpost.com/2012-11-21/opinions/35509426\\_I\\_iron-dome-israel-hezbollah-and-hamas](http://articles.washingtonpost.com/2012-11-21/opinions/35509426_I_iron-dome-israel-hezbollah-and-hamas)).

**There are many reasons** On serving U.S. geopolitical interests, see "Seven Questions: The Israel Lobby Revisited," *Foreign Policy*, September 12, 2007, [www.foreignpolicy.com/articles/2007/09/11/seven\\_questions\\_the\\_israel\\_lobby\\_revisited](http://www.foreignpolicy.com/articles/2007/09/11/seven_questions_the_israel_lobby_revisited); Stephen Zunes, "The Israel Lobby: How Powerful Is It Really?," *Mother Jones*, May 18, 2006, [www.motherjones.com/politics/2006/05/israel-lobby-how-powerful-it-really](http://www.motherjones.com/politics/2006/05/israel-lobby-how-powerful-it-really). Zunes quote: Stephen Zunes, "The Israel Lobby: A Progressive Response to Mearsheimer and Walt," *Tikkun* 22, no. 6 (2007): 47, [www.tikkun.org/nextgen/the-israel-lobby](http://www.tikkun.org/nextgen/the-israel-lobby).

**American governmental support** Frida Berrigan and William D. Hartung, "U.S. Military Assistance and Arms Transfers to Israel: U.S. Aid, Companies Fuel Israeli Military," World Policy Institute, July 20, 2006, [www.abudis.net/US\\_military\\_aid\\_to\\_israel.pdf](http://www.abudis.net/US_military_aid_to_israel.pdf); "Israel Defence and Security Report, Q1, 2015," *Business Monitor International*, London, 2014; Zunes, "Israel Lobby: A Progressive Response"; idem, "Israel Lobby: How Powerful?"

**Then too, millions of Evangelical Christians** Evangelical Christians: Zev Chafets, *A Match Made in Heaven: American Jews, Christian Zionists, and One Man's Exploration of the Weird and Wonderful Judeo-Christian Alliance* (New York: Harper-Collins, 2007); JNS.org, "Evangelical Zionism Rising, amidst Anti-Semitism and Risks to Israel, Says Christian Leader," *Jerusalem Post*, October 29, 2014, [www.jpost.com/Christian-News/While-threats-to-Israel-surge-so-does-Christian-Zionism-says-CUFIs-Hagee-380145](http://www.jpost.com/Christian-News/While-threats-to-Israel-surge-so-does-Christian-Zionism-says-CUFIs-Hagee-380145); Mohd Afandi Salleh and Hafiz Zakariya, "The American Evangelical Christians and the U.S. Middle East Policy: A Case Study of the Christians United for Israel (CUFI)," *Intellectual Discourse* 20, no. 2 (2012): 139–163. See also Nathan Guttman, "Israel's Grip on Evangelical Christians Loosens," *Jewish Daily Forward*, March 11, 2014, <http://forward.com/news/israel/194210/israels-grip-on-evangelical-christians-loosens>.

Another reason (not explored here) is the argument that since September 11, 2001, the U.S. government and the State of Israel have shared a common desire to defeat violent extremist Muslim organizations.

**In their controversial book** John J. Mearsheimer and Stephen M. Walt, *The Israel Lobby and U.S. Foreign Policy* (New York: Farrar, Straus, and Giroux, 2007).

Individuals from across the political spectrum disagree with Mearsheimer and Walt. See, e.g., Feingold, *Jewish Power*, 65–83; Samuel G. Freedman, "Conspiracy Theory," Review, *Washington Post*, October 7, 2007, [www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2007/10/04/AR2007100402101.html](http://www.washingtonpost.com/wp-dyn/content/article/2007/10/04/AR2007100402101.html); Jeffrey Goldberg, "The Usual Suspect," *New Republic*, October 8, 2007, [www.newrepublic.com/article/the-usual](http://www.newrepublic.com/article/the-usual)

-suspect; Michelle Goldberg, "Is the 'Israel Lobby' Distorting America's Mideast Policies?," *Salon*, April 18, 2006, [www.salon.com/2006/04/18/lobby\\_2/](http://www.salon.com/2006/04/18/lobby_2/); Christopher Hitchens, "Overstating Jewish Power," *Slate*, March 27, 2006, [www.slate.com/articles/news\\_and\\_politics/fighting\\_words/2006/03/overstating\\_jewish\\_power.html](http://www.slate.com/articles/news_and_politics/fighting_words/2006/03/overstating_jewish_power.html); Martin Kramer, "Do We Need a Pro-Israel Lobby," *Sandbox*, March 4, 2013, [www.martinkramer.org/sandbox/tag/israel-lobby/](http://www.martinkramer.org/sandbox/tag/israel-lobby/); Ned Lazarus, "The Irony of Great Power Politics," *Haaretz*, April 14, 2006, [www.haaretz.com/print-edition/opinion/the-irony-of-great-power-politics-1.185241](http://www.haaretz.com/print-edition/opinion/the-irony-of-great-power-politics-1.185241); Joseph Massad, "Blaming the Lobby," *Al-Ahram Weekly* 787 (March 23–29, 2006); "Seven Questions"; Zunes, "Israel Lobby: How Powerful?"; idem, "Israel Lobby: A Progressive Response"; idem, "The U.S. Invasion of Iraq: Not the Fault of Israel and Its Supporters," *Foreign Policy in Focus*, January 3, 2006, [http://fpif.org/the\\_us\\_invasion\\_of\\_iraq\\_not\\_the\\_fault\\_of\\_israel\\_and\\_its\\_supporters](http://fpif.org/the_us_invasion_of_iraq_not_the_fault_of_israel_and_its_supporters).

**At times the Israel Lobby is called** Pew Research Center statistics: Michael Lipka, "Strong Support for Israel in U.S. Cuts Across Religious Lines," Pew Research Center, February 27, 2014, [www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2014/02/27/strong-support-for-israel-in-u-s-cuts-across-religious-lines](http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2014/02/27/strong-support-for-israel-in-u-s-cuts-across-religious-lines).

**Israel's self-proclaimed "defenders"** See, e.g., Paul Delaney, "Arafat Has Plea for Arab Nations," *New York Times*, January 24, 1988, sec. 1, 10; Jackson Diehl, "Palestinians Turn Intifada against Their Own People; Accused Collaborators Being Put to Death," *Washington Post*, March 4, 1990, A1; Glenn Frankel, "Israeli Soldier Killed in West Bank; Sergeant Is First Army Fatality in Clashes in Occupied Territories," *Washington Post*, March 20, 1988, A1; Thomas L. Friedman, "For Arabs and Israelis, Maybe It Never Ends," *New York Times*, January 31, 1988, sec. 4; idem, "Palestinians and Unrest; Neither Side Appears Nearer to a Solution," *New York Times*, December 24, 1987, A1; Jonathan C. Randal, "Success of Protests Revives Palestinian Hopes; Struggle against Israeli Troops Kindles Feeling of Resurgence," *Washington Post*, January 17, 1988, A1; Tom Wicker, "In the Nation; The War on the Tube," *New York Times*, January 23, 1991, A19.

**As far back as 1967** A number of examples can be found in Karey Ann Sabol, "Slingshots and Giants: The David and Goliath Narrative as Discourse in American News Coverage of the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict," Master's thesis, San Diego State University, 20120, [http://sdsu-dspace.calstate.edu/bitstream/handle/10211.10/3541/Sabol\\_Karey.pdf](http://sdsu-dspace.calstate.edu/bitstream/handle/10211.10/3541/Sabol_Karey.pdf).

*My Promised Land*, by Jewish Israeli journalist Ari Shavit, reflects Israel as an embodiment of both David and Goliath. He lays out the cyclical nature of acknowledging this communal fear alongside recognition of the occupation of the West Bank and Gaza and how it has, in turn, fueled violence against Jewish Israelis, which has fanned the community's fear, and so on (see, e.g., ix–xiv).

**A few years ago** Abraham Foxman quote: Yoav Shamir, *Defamation: Anti-Semitism, the Movie* (2009) [film]. Similar remarks by Foxman are quoted in Goldberg, *Jewish Power*, 17.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 10.4** Representation: Yariv Levin, "Why

Benjamin Netanyahu Represents All Jews,” *Jerusalem Post*, February 16, 2015, [www.jpost.com/Opinion/Why-Benjamin-Netanyahu-represents-all-Jews-391226](http://www.jpost.com/Opinion/Why-Benjamin-Netanyahu-represents-all-Jews-391226); Noah Millman, “Does Bibi Speak for Me?,” *American Conservative*, February 11, 2015, [www.theamericanconservative.com/millman/does-bibi-speak-for-me/](http://www.theamericanconservative.com/millman/does-bibi-speak-for-me/); Anshel Pfeffer, “Jerusalem and Babylon: Netanyahu Speaks for All Jews Whether They Like It or Not,” *Haaretz*, February 12, 2015, [www.haaretz.com/blogs/jerusalem-babylon/.premium-1.642297](http://www.haaretz.com/blogs/jerusalem-babylon/.premium-1.642297).

Official state apologies: Danielle Celermajer, *The Sins of the Nation and the Ritual of Apologies* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 16–26, esp. 18–19.

Austria’s president, Thomas Klestil, said, “On behalf of the Republic of Austria, I bow my head with deep respect and profound emotion in front of the victims,” implying that those in the Israeli Knesset represented all victims of the Holocaust. See Alexander Karn, *Amending the Past: Europe’s Holocaust Commissions and the Right to History* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2015), 89. Germany’s president, Johannes Rau, implied similar notions of representation in his apology in the Knesset: “Before the people of Israel, I pay humble tribute to those who were murdered. . . . I ask forgiveness for what Germans have done. . . . I do this before you, the representatives of the State of Israel.” See “Speech in the Knesset by the President of Germany, Johannes Rau,” *Jerusalem*, February 16, 2000, available at [www.knesset.gov.il/description/eng/doc/speech\\_rau\\_2000\\_eng.pdf](http://www.knesset.gov.il/description/eng/doc/speech_rau_2000_eng.pdf); also Rebecca Trounson, “German President Visits Israel, Seeks Forgiveness,” *Los Angeles Times*, February 17, 2000, <http://articles.latimes.com/2000/feb/17/news/mn-65409>.

**Foxman is far from the first Jew** Herzl and Nahum Goldmann references: Biale, *Power and Powerlessness*, 130–136; Goldberg, *Jewish Power*, 16–17.

Self-promotion: A similar case example might be the so-called pro-gun lobby in the United States, led by groups such as the National Rifle Association (N.R.A.). In a 2013 analysis of the N.R.A.’s power, Robert Draper writes: “Though the N.R.A.’s opponents still question whether the group is really as indomitable as it is perceived, at a certain point, political mythology engineers its own reality” (Robert Draper, “Inside the Power of the N.R.A.,” *New York Times Magazine*, December 15, 2013, 50).

**As mentioned earlier, the word Zionism** Shaul Magid, “Goliath the Israel Slayer: Why Max Blumenthal’s New Book Is a Painful Read,” *USC Annenberg, Religion Dispatches*, November 8, 2013, <http://religiondispatches.org/igoliathi-the-israel-slayer-why-max-blumenthals-new-book-is-a-painful-read>.

For another ideological stream referred to as Postzionism, see, e.g., Laurence J. Silberstein, ed., *Postzionism: A Reader* (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2008).

**To complicate things** “One-stop” philanthropic granting agency: Jewish Federations of North America (JFNA), “The First Federation,” available at [www.jewishatlanta.org/who-we-are/our-history](http://www.jewishatlanta.org/who-we-are/our-history). See also chapter 12.

“Undermine the legitimacy of the State of Israel”: “FAQs: JCF Policy on Israel-Related Programming by its Grantees,” Jewish Community Federation and Endowment Fund (JCFF) [San Francisco], February 18, 2010, <http://jewishfed.org/faqs-jcf-policy-israel-related-programming-its-grantees/>; “JCF Policy on Israel-Related Programming by its Grantees,” JCFF, February 18, 2010, <http://jewishfed.org/news/blog/jcf-policy-israel-related-programming-its-grantees>. See also Dan Pine, “S.F. Federation: We Won’t Fund Anti-Israel Programming,” February 25, 2010, [www.jweekly.com/article/full/41503/s.f.-federation-we-wont-fund-anti-israel-programming](http://www.jweekly.com/article/full/41503/s.f.-federation-we-wont-fund-anti-israel-programming).

**Since that time** “Open Hillel”: Laurie Goodstein, “Members of Jewish Student Group Test Permissible Discussion on Israel,” *New York Times*, December 28, 2013, [www.nytimes.com/2013/12/29/us/members-of-jewish-student-group-test-permissible-discussion-on-israel.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2013/12/29/us/members-of-jewish-student-group-test-permissible-discussion-on-israel.html); “Hillel Israel Guidelines,” Hillel: The Foundation for Jewish Campus Life, [www.hillel.org/jewish/hillel-israel/hillel-israel-guidelines](http://www.hillel.org/jewish/hillel-israel/hillel-israel-guidelines); “How Hillel Is Losing Touch with the People It Purports to Embrace,” *Daily Beast*, December 16, 2013, [www.thedailybeast.com/articles/2013/12/16/how-hillel-is-losing-touch-with-the-people-it-purports-to-embrace.html](http://www.thedailybeast.com/articles/2013/12/16/how-hillel-is-losing-touch-with-the-people-it-purports-to-embrace.html); Shaul Magid, “Who Is Boycotting Whom? National Hillel Guidelines, Dissent, and Legitimate Protest,” *Zeek*, January 10, 2014, <http://zeek.forward.com/articles/117993>.

Disaffiliated from Hillel: Jewish Telegraphic Agency, “Swarthmore Hillel Votes to Rename Itself ‘Kehilah,’” *Jewish Daily Forward*, March 23, 2015, <http://forward.com/news/breaking-news/217265/swarthmore-hillel-votes-to-rename-itself-kehilah>.

**The question of whether the State of Israel** Of course, what it means to “support Israel” includes a range of opinions. Those identifying as conservative often maintain that it means backing policies of the Israeli government, whereas those identifying as liberal commonly argue that to support Israel one must be critical of Israeli policies as well.

**Some Jews are comfortable** Leon Uris quotes are from Paul Breines, *Tough Jews: Political Fantasies and the Moral Dilemma of American Jewry* (New York: HarperCollins, 1990), 54.

**In contrast, another acclaimed Jewish writer** Philip Roth quotes are from Breines, *Tough Jews*, 54–55.

## Chapter 11. Borders

**After putting my shoes** Mourad El-Kodsi, *The Karaite Jews of Egypt: 1882–1986*, 2nd ed. (New York: Self-published, 2007), 156–160, 366–369, 375–381; Daniel Frank, “Karaite Prayer and Liturgy,” in *Karaite Judaism: A Guide to Its History and Literary Sources*, ed. Meira Polliack (Boston, MA: Brill, 2003), 559–589; *An Introduction to Karaite Judaism: History, Theology, Practice, and Custom* (Troy, NY: Al-Qirqisani Center for the Promotion of Karaite Studies, 2003), 128–143.

**In fact, this group was extraordinary** For more on the debate over whether to call the particular communities explored in this chapter “sects,” “movements,” or something else altogether, see Notes, chapter 8, “Scholars of modern Jewish groups.”

“The rabbis”: The notion of “the rabbis,” also code for “rabbinic authority,” is explored in chapter 5.

“Little Boxes”: Though first popularized in a version sung by Pete Seeger, “Little Boxes” was written and composed by Malvina Reynolds.

**On October 27, 1958** The text of David Ben-Gurion’s letter can be found in Sidney B. Hoenig, ed., *Jewish Identity: Modern Responsa and Opinions on the Registration of Children of Mixed Marriages* (New York: Feldheim, 1970), 11–15.

State of Israel’s definition of a Jew: See chapter 10 under “A New Legal Jewish Identity: The Law of Return.”

**This leads us to a critical question** An ancillary question is whether those outside a group also need to recognize someone as a member of a group for that identity to be legitimized, which will also be discussed in this chapter. See, e.g., Laurence J. Silberstein and Robert Cohn, eds., *The Other in Jewish Thought and History: Constructions of Jewish Culture and Identity* (New York: New York University Press, 1994).

**One way to understand** “Binary opposites”: when a word is understood in relation to its opposite. For example, many define good as something that is not evil, or evil as an absence of good. See, e.g., John Lyons, *Semantics*, vol. 1 (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1977), 270–277.

Multiple centers and margins simultaneously: See, e.g., chapter 3.

**Claims of authenticity** Regarding the shift from Hebrews to *bnei yisrael* (Children of Israel) to Israelites to Judeans to Jews, see Shaye J. D. Cohen, *The Beginnings of Jewishness: Boundaries, Varieties, and Uncertainties* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001). See also chapter 2.

**But as we have seen** Afghani Pathans: Navras Jaat Aafreedi, “Traditions of Israelite Descent among Certain Muslim Groups in South Asia,” *Shofar: An Interdisciplinary Journal of Jewish Studies* 28, no. 1 (2009): 1–14.

British Israelites: O. Michael Friedman, *Origins of the British Israelites: The Lost Tribes* (San Francisco: Mellen Research University Press, 1993).

Church of Latter Day Saints of Jesus Christ: Margaret Barker, “Joseph Smith and Preexilic Israelite Religion,” *BYU Studies* 44, no. 4 (2005): 69–82; Arnold H. Green, “Gathering and Election: Israelite Descent and Universalism in Mormon Discourse,” *Journal of Mormon History* 25, no. 1 (1999): 195–228; Robert N. Hullinger, “Lost Tribes of Israel and the Book of Mormon,” *Lutheran Quarterly* 22, no. 3 (August 1970): 319–329.

Rastafaris: Douglas R. A. Mack, *From Babylon to Rastafari: Origin and History of the Rastafarian Movement* (Chicago: School Times Publications, 1999); Nathaniel Samuel Murrell, Eilliam David Spencer, and Adrian Anthony MacFarlane,

eds., *Chanting Down Babylon: The Rastafari Reader* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1998).

**Aside from the “good Samaritan”** Good Samaritan: Luke 10:25–37.

Samaritan quote: Husney W. Cohen, conversation with author, June 22, 2011, Mount Gerizim, occupied West Bank.

Descendants of the tribes of Ephraim, Menashe, and Levi: Robert T. Anderson and Terry Giles, *The Keepers: An Introduction to the History and Culture of the Samaritans* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 2002), 6.

**Some scholars reject the Samaritans’ claim** On the Samaritans’ origins in relation to the Assyrians, see L. L. Grabbe, “The Samaritan Origins and Identity,” *Journal for the Study of the Old Testament* 30, no. 5 (June 2006): i, xxxiv, 281 (review of Choon Shik Chang, *The Samaritan Origins and Identity* [Seoul: PaiChai University Publishers, 2004]).

Assyrians brought in a foreign group: Stefan Schorch, “The Origin of the Samaritan Community,” in *Linguistic and Oriental Studies from Poznań* 7, ed. Alfred F. Majewicz, Maciej Gaca, and Elzbieta Majewicz (Poznań, Pol.: Adam Mickiewicz University, 2006).

Tradition based on passages found in the Hebrew Bible: According to one biblical passage, the Assyrian king “brought men from Babel, and from Kuta, and from Avva, and from Hamat, and from Sefarvayim and settled them in the cities of Shomeron, in place of the children of Yisrael” (II Kings 17: 24). See also II Kings 17: 24–34, and chapter 3.

**Dominant trends in scholarship** Both Samaritans and Jews trace the priestly lineage back to the biblical figure Aaron, who, according to the Torah, was the first Israelite High Priest.

Regarding “Zion,” see chapter 3.

**According to one Samaritan representative** The Torah’s mention of Mount Gerizim’s importance: Husney W. Cohen, conversation with author, June 22, 2011.

The split happened . . . during the time of the biblical prophets: Yairah Amit, “The Samaritans—Biblical Positions in the Service of Modern Politics,” in *Samaritans: Past and Present*, ed. Menachem Mor and Friedrich V. Reiterer (New York: Walter de Gruyter, 2010), 247–266; Anderson and Giles, *The Keepers*, 22–23; Ingrid Hjelm, *The Samaritans and Early Judaism: A Literary Analysis* (London: Sheffield Academic Press, 2000), 183–238.

Whether Samaritan, Israelite, or Canaanite: Fred Astren, email with author, June 7, 2012; Nathan Schur, *History of the Samaritans* (New York: Peter Lang, 1989), 17–33.

**Some scholars continue this line of argument** Destruction of Samaritan temple on Mount Gerizim: Reinhard Pummer, “Samaritanism—A Jewish Sect or an Independent Form of Yahwism,” in Mor and Reiterer (eds.), *Samaritans: Past and Present*, 3; see also below.

**Others espouse a different position altogether** On Samaritans as a “Jewish sect,” see Pummer, “Samaritanism,” 1–24.

Talmudic rabbis: Moshe Lavee, “The Samaritan May Be



Included: Another Look at the Samaritan in Talmudic Literature,” in Mor and Reiterer (eds.), *Samaritans: Past and Present*, 148.

Sharing of communal meals: In some Talmudic passages the Samaritans are understood inclusively, as a group that can join Jews in prayers, specifically those recited after one shares a communal meal (Lavee, “Samaritan May Be Included,” 149–154; see also Anderson and Giles, *The Keepers*, 43–49; Pummer, “Samaritanism,” 16). As with the Karaites (see later in this chapter), rabbinic opinions regarding the Samaritans run the gamut. See, e.g., Lawrence A. Schiffman, “Rabbinic Literature, Samaritans in,” in *A Companion to Samaritan Studies*, ed. Alan D. Crown, Reinhard Pummer, and Abraham Tal (Tübingen, Ger.: J. C. B. Mohr, 1993), 198–199.

Episodes of physical violence: Schur, *History of the Samaritans*, 87–91.

**To complicate matters** Jarl Fossum, “Sects and Sectarianism,” in Crown et al. (eds.), *Companion to Samaritan Studies*, 215–216; James Alan Montgomery, *The Samaritans, the Earliest Jewish Sect: Their History, Theology, and Literature* (Charleston, SC: BiblioLife, 2009), 167–179; Pummer, “Samaritanism,” 5–6; Schur, *History of the Samaritans*, 62–66.

Hjlem quote: Ingrid Hjelm, “What Do Samaritans and Jews Have in Common? Recent Trends in Samaritan Studies,” *Currents in Biblical Research* 3, no. 1 (October 2004): 29. See also Pummer, “Samaritanism,” 1–8.

**Today, a major difference** Both Mount Gerizim and Mount Sinai are mentioned in the Torah, whereas Mount Zion is not. See Gary N. Knoppers, “Mt. Gerizim and Mt. Zion: A Study in the Early History of the Samaritans and Jews,” *Canadian Society of Biblical Studies* 64 (2004–2005): 5–32; Israel Tsedaka, “Mount Gerizim and Jerusalem,” in *Proceedings of the Fifth International Congress of the Société d’Études Samaritaines*, ed. Haseeb Shehadeh and Habib Tawa (Paris: S.N. Librairie Orientaliste Paul Guethner), 21–26.

According to the Samaritan version of the Torah, the tenth commandment in the Decalogue states that Mount Gerizim is the community’s sacred center; see Mordecai Roshwald, “Marginal Jewish Sects in Israel (II),” *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 4, no. 2 (April 1973): 328–329, 335–337. Michael Corinaldi notes that the Samaritan Pentateuch and the normative Jewish Pentateuch differ in six thousand instances; see Michael Corinaldi, “Samaritan Halakhah,” in *An Introduction to the History and Sources of Jewish Law*, ed. Neil S. Hecht, Bernard S. Jackson, Stephen M. Passamanek, Daniela Piattelli, and Alfredo Mordechai Rabello (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), 62. The Samaritans date the origins of their Torah scroll to the biblical character Abisha, the great-grandson of Aaron (i.e., Abisha son of Pinhas son of Eleazar son of Aaron). Some scholars date the Samaritan’s oldest Torah scroll back to the ninth century CE and others to c. 1150 CE (Anderson and Giles, *The Keepers*, 105–116; Alan D. Crown, “Abisha Scroll,” in Crown et al. [eds.], *Companion to Samaritan Studies*, 4–6).

Different times of the year and in different ways: Both Jews and Samaritans base their yearly calendar on the Torah. Yet

because they have different versions of the Torah and interpret this text differently, their communal calendars are not the same. In addition, the Jewish community, in contrast to Samaritans, observes a few holidays that are not mentioned in the Torah, such as Hanukkah.

**As for which group has had more devotees** One million adherents: Husney W. Cohen, conversation with author, June 22, 2011; Shomron and Osher Sassoni, “The Samaritan-Israelites and Their Religion: Educational Guide,” [shomrono.tripod.com/educationalguide.pdf](http://shomrono.tripod.com/educationalguide.pdf), 2.

300,000: “The best estimate of the Samaritan population in the fifth and sixth century [CE] is three hundred thousand souls in the homeland alone. This compares with an estimate for a total Jewish population in the Roman Empire before 70 [CE] of some six to seven million souls, of whom five million are estimated to have been in Palestine” (Michael Avi-Yonah, “The Samaritan Revolts against the Byzantine Empire,” *Eretz Israel* 4 [1956]: 128 [Hebrew] and Jean Juster, *Les Juifs dans L’Empire Romain* [New York, 1914], 210, in Alan D. Crown, “The Samaritan Diaspora to the End of the Byzantine Era,” *Australian Journal of Archaeology* 2, no. 3 [1974–75]: 117).

Romans slaughtering Samaritans alongside Jews: Schur, *History of the Samaritans*, 82–91.

Earliest census records still in existence: Anderson and Giles, *The Keepers*, 91.

Approximately 777: According to a Samaritan community website, as of January 1, 2015, there were 777 Samaritans in existence (Benyamim Tsedaka, A.B., Institute of Samaritan Studies, Holon, Israel, available at <http://thesamaritanupdate.com>).

**Their very small numbers** According to one scholar, the Samaritans’ “inbreeding coefficient is the highest recorded for any human population” and they “represent the oldest and smallest true genetic isolate in the world” (Batsheva Bonné-Tamir, “Genetics,” in Crown et al. [eds.], *Companion to Samaritan Studies*, 98–99).

One theory accounting for their population diminishment: Roshwald, “Marginal Jewish Sects in Israel (II),” 328–329, 335–337; Schur, *History of the Samaritans*, 35–91.

**Regarding whether they are accepted** This contrasts with the effort made by the Sephardi Chief Rabbi in Ottoman-controlled Palestine, in 1842, to protect the Samaritans; he wrote, “Samaritans are a branch of the Jewish people who acknowledge the Torah” (Michael Corinaldi, “The Problem of the Patrilineal or Matrilineal Decent and Inter-Marriage according to the Samaritan and Rabbinic Halakah,” in Shehadeh and Tawa [eds.], *Proceedings of the Fifth International Congress*, 178).

1994 restoration: Amit, “The Samaritans,” 255–260.

**Despite their legal designation** Instead they have a peculiar status: Shomron and Sassoni, “Samaritan-Israelites and Their Religion,” 28. As the Israeli government does not make a distinction between religious law and civil law, but adjudicates both simply as state law, it is particularly difficult for someone from one legally distinct Israeli community to

marry someone from another, since the law designates that each has its own separate “religious” authority. (And, in this case, the Samaritan religious authority in Israel cannot adjudicate their own community’s religious law without the Ministry of Interior’s approval.)

#### **Like Samaritans, African Hebrew Israelites of Jerusalem**

Note that the African Hebrew Israelites of Jerusalem that are described here are distinct from and not part of those American-based groups who also identify as Black Hebrews, such as the Black Hebrew Nation of Yahweh. Aside from the former group having immigrated to the biblical Land of Israel, the latter groups are often explicitly anti-white and anti-Zionist. See, e.g., Henry Goldschmidt, “The Voice of Jacob on the Streets of Brooklyn: Black and Jewish Israelites in and around Crown Heights,” *American Ethnologist* 33, no. 3 (August 2006): 378–396; A. Paul Hare, ed., *The Hebrew Israelite Community* (New York: University Press of America, 1998), 1; John L. Jackson, Jr., “All Yah’s Children: Emigrationism, Afrocentrism, and the Place of Israel in Africa,” *Civilisations* 58, no. 1 (2009): 101–107; Martina Könighofer, *The New Ship of Zion: Dynamic Diaspora Dimensions of the African Hebrew Israelites of Jerusalem* (Berlin: Lit, 2008), 107–118.

Real descendants of the ancient biblical Israelites: According to scholar John L. Jackson, Jr., this group has recently begun claiming to be the true descendants of Judeans rather than Israelites; see John L. Jackson, Jr., *Thin Description: Ethnography and the African Hebrew Israelites of Jerusalem* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2013).

Relocation to the State of Israel: Hare (ed.), *Hebrew Israelite Community*, 2; Morris Lounds, Jr., *Israel’s Black Hebrews: Black Americans in Search of Identity* (Washington, DC: University Press of America, 1981), 2.

Ben Ammi’s death: Andrew Esensten, “Spiritual Leader of African Hebrew Israelites Dies,” *Haaretz*, December 28, 2014, [www.haaretz.com/jewish/news/.premium-1.634084](http://www.haaretz.com/jewish/news/.premium-1.634084).

**AHIJ do not say** Rather than rooting the claim that all African Americans are descended from the Israelites in academic scholarship, the community utilizes the Hebrew Bible to support their belief. See, e.g., Fran Markowitz, “Israel as Africa, Africa as Israel: ‘Divine Geography’ in the Personal Narratives and Community Identity of the Black Hebrew Israelites,” *Anthropological Quarterly* 69, no. 4 (1996): 193–205.

**Ben Ammi extended this conviction** Ben Ammi, *God, the Black Man, and Truth* (Takoma Park, MD: Communicators Press, 2008); idem, *Yeshua the Hebrew Messiah or Jesus the Christian Christ* (Washington, DC: Communicators Press, 1996), 27–35.

“Caucasian Jews”: Yosef A. A. ben-Jochannan, *We the Black Jews*, 2 vols. (Baltimore: Black Classic Press, 1993); Ella J. Hughley, *The Truth about Black Biblical Hebrew-Israelites (Jews): The World’s Best-Kept Secret!* (Springfield, NY: Hughley Publications, 1982), 10, 35, 45.

**Initially arriving in Israel** According to one source, the first group of African Hebrew Israelites arrived with the visa status of “new immigrants,” pending the Israeli government’s

decision on whether they would be permitted to become citizens under the Law of Return; see Lounds, Jr., *Israel’s Black Hebrews*, 161–163.

Population: Jackson (“All Yah’s Children,” 100) estimates that in 2005 there were approximately three thousand members of the African Hebrew Israelite community in Israel.

AHIJ in Ghana: Könighofer, *New Ship of Zion*, 56–64.

AHIJ in Chicago: Curtis Lawrence, “Finding a Home in the Promised Land,” *Chicago Sun-Times*, August 21, 2003.

**This community observes a set of rituals** According to Lounds (*Israel’s Black Hebrews*, 61), aside from the Sabbath, the African Hebrew Israelites do not follow any of the holidays described in the Hebrew Bible.

Unique practices: Hare, *Hebrew Israelite Community*, 2; Israel Ministry of Foreign Affairs (IMFA), “The Hebrew Israelite Community,” September 29, 2006, [www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/aboutisrael/people/pages/the%20black%20hebrews.aspx](http://www.mfa.gov.il/mfa/aboutisrael/people/pages/the%20black%20hebrews.aspx); Könighofer, *New Ship of Zion*, 11–12; Morris Lounds, Jr., “Hebrew Israelites/Black Jews: A Case Study in the Formation of Group Identity,” PhD diss., Massachusetts Institute of Technology, 1976, 6; idem, *Israel’s Black Hebrews*, 58–68.

#### **Perhaps not surprisingly, they have never been accepted**

Quote: *Jerusalem Post*, January 9, 1973, quoted in Lounds, “Hebrew Israelites/Black Jews,” 8.

**For more than two decades** “Legal status came about in May 1990 with first B/1 visas, followed by temporary residency a year later. That status was extended until August 2003 when the Ministry of Interior granted them permanent residency” (IMFA, “Hebrew Israelite Community”).

**The reasons behind** Another possible reason why the African Hebrew Israelites of Jerusalem finally received permanent Israeli residency in 1990 was that the minister of the interior at the time, Avraham Poraz, was more lenient than his predecessors. Poraz was a member of the Shinui political party, which at the time was more liberal in its position on naturalization and citizenship than the party with which the previous ministers of interior identified. See Haim Shadmi, “Poraz to Grant Black Hebrews Permanent Residence,” *Haaretz*, July 28, 2003, [www.haaretz.com/print-edition/news/poraz-to-grant-black-hebrews-permanent-residence-1.95492](http://www.haaretz.com/print-edition/news/poraz-to-grant-black-hebrews-permanent-residence-1.95492). I thank Netanel Fisher for suggesting this theory to me (conversation with author, October 28, 2012, Omaha, NE).

**In mourning Elis** Chief Sephardi rabbi of Dimona is quoted in Stephen Franklin, “Death Bridges Gap for Black Hebrews,” *Chicago Tribune*, January 21, 2002, [http://articles.chicagotribune.com/2002-01-21/news/0201210160\\_1\\_hebrews-palestinian-gunman-bat-mitzvah](http://articles.chicagotribune.com/2002-01-21/news/0201210160_1_hebrews-palestinian-gunman-bat-mitzvah).

Dimona’s mayor quote: Lawrence, “Finding a Home in the Promised Land.”

His sister Aviva: Quoted in Uri Dan, “Bat Mitzvah Terror Touches Ex-U.S. Black Hebrews,” *New York Post*, January 20, 2002, O22.

**Since then, this group has experienced** IMFA, “Hebrew Israelite Community.” Contrary to this government statement, Könighofer (*New Ship of Zion*, 119) maintains that it

is illegal for members of the African Hebrew Israelite community to serve in the Israeli Defense Forces (IDF), though they are permitted to perform National Service. Jackson ("All Yah's Children," 107) maintains that the first African Hebrew Israelite of Jerusalem was inducted into the IDF in 2006.

Peres's visit to the Village of Peace: Andrew Esenstein, "Once Reviled, Black Hebrews Now Fêted," *Daily Jewish Forward*, March 18, 2009, <http://forward.com/news/104067/once-reviled-black-hebrews-now-feted>.

Aside from their outspokenness and residency issues, AHJ battled with the Israeli government on a number of other fronts for years. See, e.g., Shalek Ben-Yehuda, *Black Hebrew Israelites: From America to the Promised Land* (New York: Vantage Press, 1975); I. J. Gerber, *The Heritage Seekers: American Blacks in Search of Jewish Identity* (Middle Village, NY: Jonathan David, 1977); Hare, *Hebrew Israelite Community*, 1–3; Markowitz, "Israel as Africa, Africa as Israel," 46–59; Robert G. Weisbord, "Israel and the Black Hebrew Israelites," *Judaism* 24, no. 1 (Winter 1975): 23–38.

**One of the first such divides** On Jewish centers of authority in several places in the Middle East, see Michael Fishbane, *Judaism: Revelation and Traditions* (San Francisco: HarperSan Francisco, 1987), 4, 30–37.

**In existence for centuries** Etymology of *Rabbanite* and *Karaite*: As mentioned in Chapter Five, the root of the word *Rabbanite* is *rav* or *rab*, meaning "teacher," which some say points to the Rabbanites' historical acceptance of the authority of "the rabbis" regarding halakhah. The root of the word *Karaite* is *qara*, meaning "to read," which suggests that the Karaites are more literal in interpreting Jewish law than Rabbanites. Others note that *qara* can also mean call, thereby reflecting the influence by a sectarian Muslim Shi'i community present in the eighth- through tenth-centuries on the Karaites, a group that also referred to their religious leader as a *da'i* or caller (Adina Hoffman and Peter Cole, *Sacred Trash: The Lost and Found World of the Carol Geniza* (New York: Schocken Books, 2011), 154).

Mishnah and Talmud: Karaites argue that Rabbanite interpretations of the Torah—in particular those juridical responses found in the Talmud—are much too interpretive, far too removed from the original intention of the Pentateuch text. Consequently, Karaites consider their understanding of the Hebrew Bible to trump that of the Talmudic rabbis (Fred Astren, *Karaite Judaism and Historical Understanding* [Columbia: University of South Carolina Press, 2004], 14).

That said, the Karaites have had, and continue to have, a detailed system of Jewish law that is unabashedly interpretive, a fact argued, for example, in Astren, *Karaite Judaism*, 13–14; Daniel Frank, "Karaite Exegetical and Halakhic Literature in Byzantium and Turkey," in Polliack (ed.), *Karaite Judaism: A Guide*, 529–558; and Meira Polliack, "Major Trends in Karaite Biblical Exegesis in the Tenth and Eleventh Centuries," in *ibid.*, 363–413).

Fifty thousand Karaites worldwide: This figure was relayed to me by Abraham Massuda, president of the board of directors of the Karaite Jews of America, in 2011 (conversation

with author, November 15, 2011, Congregation B'nai Israel, Daly City, CA); see also *Introduction to Karaite Judaism*, 39–43. Others estimate that in Israel alone there are 15,000 to 30,000 Karaites. In his comprehensive guide to the Karaites, scholar Joel Beinin estimates that there are 20,000 Karaites worldwide (Joel Beinin, *Dispersion of Egyptian Jewry: Culture, Politics, and the Formation of a Modern Diaspora* [Berkeley: University of California Press, 1998], 298). See also Polliack, "Preface," in Polliack (ed.), *Karaite Judaism: A Guide*, xvii.

**Similar to Samaritans** On Karaism as the original form of Judaism, see Shawn Lichaa, Nehemia Gordon, and Meir Rekhavi, *As It Is Written: A Brief Case for Karaism* (N.p.: Hilkiah Press, 2006), 7–8. This tradition is echoed in many texts written about the Karaite community by Karaites, e.g., *Introduction to Karaite Judaism*; El-Kodsi, *Karaite Jews of Egypt*, 1–3.

Unnamed sect of Jews: Daniel J. Lasker, "The Dead Sea Scrolls in the Historiography and Self-Image of Contemporary Karaites," *Dead Sea Discoveries* 9, no. 3 (2002): 281–294, esp. 285–286.

Descendants of the Sadducees or reaction to the Pharisees and Sadducees: Yoram Erder, "The Karaites and the Second Temple Sects," in Polliack (ed.), *Karaite Judaism: A Guide*, 119–143; Lichaa et al., *As It Is Written*, 9; Bernard Revel, *The Karaite Halakah and Its Relation to Sadducean, Samaritan, and Philonian Halakah* (Philadelphia: Cahan Printing Co., 1913), 6–8.

**As to why they appeared** Fred Astren writes, "Karaite Judaism emerged in the late ninth century from the confluence of a number of trends within Judaism. These include scripturalism, messianism, quasi-asceticism, a renewed focus on Palestine, anti-rabbinism of various types (some perhaps regional), and possibly the influence of so-called rationalism. The last point is debatable. Also included in the mix are the Ananites, followers of Anan ben David and his family. Anan [goes] back to the eighth century, but his movement is not Karaism" (Astren, email with author, December 23, 2011).

**Origins aside** Lack of strict boundaries: Marina Rustow, "Karaites Real and Imagined: Three Cases of Jewish Heresy," *Past and Present* 197, no. 1 (November 2007): 40–42.

**Yet evidence also exists** According to scholar Elinoar Bareket, "The Karaites had different customs to the Rabbanites. The main areas of variance that were noticeable related to fixing the festival calendar, the laws of ritual slaughter and foods in general, marriage laws and the laws of incestuous relationships, inheritance laws, and the overall perception of the world, especially regarding Palestine and their attitude toward it" (Elinoar Bareket, "Karaite Communities in the Middle East," in Polliack (ed.), *Karaite Judaism: A Guide*, 242).

At times, however, they embraced positions similar to those of the Rabbanites, sometimes integrating Rabbanite responsa into their own. See, e.g., Bernard Revel, "Inquiry into the Sources of Karaite Halakah," *Jewish Quarterly Review* 3, no. 3 (January 1913): 319–337; Rustow, "Karaites Real and Imagined," 42–43; Ofra Tirosh-Becker, "The Use of Rabbinic



Sources in Karaite Writings,” in Polliack (ed.), *Karaite Judaism: A Guide*, 319–337.

Early twentieth-century Egypt: El-Kodsi, *Karaite Jews of Egypt*, 8.

**One major distinction** Delineation of a Jew via matrilineal descent has been the norm for most Jews for centuries; see, e.g., Cohen, “The Matrilineal Principle,” in *Beginnings of Jewishness*, 263–340. The notion of being “born to a Jewish mother” has become more complicated since the advent of in vitro fertilization, in which case halakhic authorities consider a number of factors when determining a baby’s Jewish identity; see Fred Rosner, “In Vitro Fertilization: Legal and Ethical and Considerations,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/in-vitro-fertilization-legal-and-ethical-considerations](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/in-vitro-fertilization-legal-and-ethical-considerations).

Karaite attitude regarding conversion: *Introduction to Karaite Judaism*, 225–230.

Chief Karaite rabbi in Israel: Rabbi Moshe Firrouz, email with author via Daniel Lasker, January 1, 2012 [Hebrew].

**But identities also exist** On the Crusades, see Abraham Danon, “The Karaites in European History: Contributions to Their History Based Chiefly on Unpublished Documents,” *Jewish Quarterly Review* 15, no. 3 (January 1925): 291; Yoram Erder, “The Mourners of Zion,” in Polliack (ed.), *Karaite Judaism: A Guide*, 233.

Data indicate that in Palestine and Constantinople Karaites were murdered and mistreated precisely because non-Jews perceived them as Jews, rather than deeming them guilty of being merely non-Christian (Danon, “Karaites in European History,” 285–360). Some argue, in contrast, that Jews were not necessarily killed because they were Jewish, but rather because they were not Christians of the type with which their attackers identified (Astren, email with author, June 7, 2012).

**During World War II** Crimea: Warren Green, “The Fate of the Crimean Jewish Communities: Ashkenazim, Krimchaks, and Karaites,” *Jewish Social Studies* 46, no. 2 (Spring 1984): 169–176; idem, “The Nazi Racial Policy Toward the Karaites,” *Soviet Jewish Affairs* 8, no. 2 (1978): 36–44.

France, Poland, Lithuania: Kiril Feferman, “Nazi Germany and the Karaites in 1938–1944: between racial theory and Realpolitik,” *Nationalities Papers* 39, no. 2 (March 2011): 277–294; Alexander Lesser, “Don’t Call Us Jews,” *The Jerusalem Report*, June 18, 1992, 36–38.

“Mountain Jews”: Kiril Feferman, “Nazi Germany and the Mountain Jews: Was There a Policy?” *Holocaust: Genocide Studies* 21, no. 1 (2007): 96–114.

Vichy France: Donna F. Ryan, *The Holocaust and the Jews of Marseille: The Enforcement of Anti-Semitic Policies in Vichy France* (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1996), 38, cited in Judy Scales-Trent, “Racial Purity Laws in the United States and Nazi Germany: The Targeting Process,” *Human Rights Quarterly* 23, no. 2 (May 2001): 259–307.

**Less than a decade later** Some Egyptian mistreatment of Karaites was undoubtedly due to the Egyptian government’s

capture of Moshe Marzuq, a Karaite Jew accused of spying for Israel; he was ultimately executed in 1955 for his role in Operation Suzannah, better known in Israeli history as the Lavon Affair. See Beinín, *Dispersion of Egyptian Jewry*, 90–117; Shabtai Tevet, *Ben Gurion’s Spy: The Story of the Political Scandal That Shaped Modern Israel* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996).

Rejection of Egyptian Karaite requests: On one occasion, in referring to Karaite immigration to Israel, the Ashkenazi Chief Rabbi of Israel said: “Heaven forbid that we should bring this deadly plague into Israel’s vineyard” (Tom Segev, 1949: *The First Israelis* [New York: Free Press, 1986], 144. See also, Sumi Elaine Colligan, “Living Liminality: Karaite Jews Negotiate Identity and Community in Israel and the United States,” in Polliack [ed.], *Karaite Judaism: A Guide*, 451–469.

Intracommunal opposition: Beinín, *Dispersion of Egyptian Jewry*, 183.

**To this day, Karaite and non-Karaite Jews** On the advantages Jews have in the Jewish State, see, e.g., Mordecai Roshwald, “Marginal Jewish Sects in Israel (I),” *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 4, no. 2 (April 1973), 226–227.

Inability to legally marry non-Karaite Jews: The State of Israel made an explicit exception to this law when Joseph Marzuq, the brother of Moshe Marzuq (see Notes, chapter 11, “Less than a decade later”), requested permission to marry a Rabbanite woman; see Roshwald, “Marginal Jewish Sects in Israel,” 232.

**On a side note** On Karaite Americans, see *Introduction to Karaite Judaism*, 42.

Population of Karaite American community: Best estimates are that there are about 1,000 Karaites living in the United States, about 450 of whom live in the San Francisco Bay Area (Beinín, *Dispersion of Egyptian Jewry*, 185; Abraham Massuda, conversation with author, November 15, 2011). This would make Karaites .017 percent of American Jewry.

**Without question** Conventional Jewish organizations: See, e.g., Dvir Abramovich, “Jesus-Believing Jews in Australia: Celebrate Messiah as a Case Study,” *Studies in Christian-Jewish Relations* 4 (2009): 1–28.

Rabbinic paradigm: Although Reform Judaism maintains that halakhah is not obligatory, Reform Jews still work within a rabbinic framework (e.g., observation of holidays is determined according to a rabbinic calendar, not, e.g., a Karaite one). I thank Shawn Lichaa for sharing this insight with me.

**Perhaps the only thing that most Jews** In January 2012, I conducted an informal survey of rabbis at eight San Francisco synagogues of various normative movements. One of the questions I asked was “Is it your opinion that ‘Messianic Jews’ are not Jews (i.e., are not Jews in the way you understand and define the term ‘Jew’)?” Rabbis from all eight synagogues answered yes to this question, with minor caveats noted for situations involving individuals born Jewish according to halakhah but who believe in Jesus Christ.

Heretics, apostates, or even members of a cult: See, e.g.,

Dan Cohn-Sherbok, *Messianic Judaism* (New York: Cassell, 2000), 79–81.

**In practice** Anonymous rabbi, email with author, January 12, 2012.

Menachem Mendel Schneerson: See chapter 4.

**But the label *Messianic Jew*** Scholar Rachel Adler defines Messianic Jews as a “theological community extruded by Judaism . . . who believe that God is Christ and who are both doctrinally and structurally interlinked with Christian ecclesiastical organizations” (Rachel Adler, *Engendered Judaism: An Inclusive Theology and Ethics* [Boston: Beacon Press, 1998], 102).

Dvir Abramovich reference: Abramovich, “Jesus-Believing Jews in Australia.”

**Some of the reasons** Shraga Simmons, “Why Jews Don’t Believe in Jesus,” Aish Hatorah, [www.aish.com/jw/s/48892792.html](http://www.aish.com/jw/s/48892792.html).

**A number of groups** Cohn-Sherbok, *Messianic Judaism*, 87–166.

Jews for Jesus: Cohn-Sherbok, *Messianic Judaism*; Ruth Rosen, *Called to Controversy: The Unlikely Story of Moishe Rosen and the Founding of Jews for Jesus* (Dallas: Thomas Nelson, 2012).

**Estimates regarding Messianic Jews’ worldwide population** Tamar Fox, “Messianic Judaism: A Sect of Christianity with some Jewish Practices,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/messianic-judaism](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/messianic-judaism); Tim McGirk, “Israel’s Messianic Jews under Attack,” *Time*, June 6, 2008, <http://content.time.com/time/world/article/0,8599,1812430,00.html>; David H. Stern, *Messianic Judaism: A Modern Movement with an Ancient Past* (Clarksville, MD: Lederer Books, 2007), 197. Jeffrey Wasserman contends that from 1948 through 1999 the number of Messianic Jewish congregations grew from two to eighty-one and the number of Messianic Jewish adults from 200 to 2,178 (Jeffrey S. Wasserman, *Messianic Jewish Congregations: Who Sold the Business to Gentiles* [New York: University Press of America, Inc., 2000], ix, citing Kai Kjaer-Hansen and Bodil F. Skjøtt, *Facts and Myths: About the Messianic Congregations in Israel* [Jerusalem: Caspari Center for Biblical and Jewish Studies, 1999], 17).

65: “Congregations,” Union of Messianic Jewish Congregations (UMJC), <http://congregations.umjc.org>.

153: “Congregations,” International Alliance of Messianic Congregations and Synagogues (IAMCS), [www.google.com/maps/d/u/o/viewer?hl=en&gl=us&mid=zuqgwVa\\_v9rE.kRi9EDAO3XWw](http://www.google.com/maps/d/u/o/viewer?hl=en&gl=us&mid=zuqgwVa_v9rE.kRi9EDAO3XWw) via [www.iamcs.org/#/congregations-rabbis](http://www.iamcs.org/#/congregations-rabbis).

According to Jews for Jesus, which does not identify with UMJC or IAMCS, there are twenty-five Jews for Jesus branches worldwide ([www.jewsforjesus.org/branches](http://www.jewsforjesus.org/branches)); see also Stern, *Messianic Judaism*, 197; Wasserman, *Messianic Jewish Congregation*, ix.

According to another source, as of 1996 there were three hundred Messianic Jewish congregations worldwide (1996–1997 *International Messianic Directory* [Virginia Beach, VA: Messianic Bureau International, 1996], 3). Although Messi-

anic Jewish groups have been accused of exaggerating their numbers, Jewish anti-missionary organizations have been charged with doing so as well; see Wasserman, *Messianic Jewish Congregations*, ix, 46.

**As for the movement’s origins** Natalia Yangerber-Hicks, “Messianic Believers: Reflections on Identity of a Largely Misunderstood Group,” *Journal of Psychology and Theology* 33, no. 2 (2005): 128.

**While some scholars argue** Emerged in the 1800s: H. Bruce Stokes, “Gentiles in the Messianic Movement,” 1996, [www.hbrucestokes.com/images/Gentiles\\_in\\_the\\_Messianic\\_Movement.pdf](http://www.hbrucestokes.com/images/Gentiles_in_the_Messianic_Movement.pdf), 2.

Quote: J. Gordon Melton, *Encyclopedia of Protestantism* (New York: Facts on File, 2005), 373. See also Pauline Kollontai, “Messianic Jews and Jewish Identity,” *Journal of Modern Jewish Studies* 3, no. 2 (July 2004): 195–205.

Origins of Jews for Jesus: “A Brief History of Jews for Jesus,” [www.jewsforjesus.org/about-jews-for-jesus/history-and-timeline/history](http://www.jewsforjesus.org/about-jews-for-jesus/history-and-timeline/history).

Connection between Messianic Judaism and the 1967 war: Cohn-Sherbok, *Messianic Judaism*, 1.

**As for how they are understood** The 1989 High Court case was arguably not finalized until 1992; see Cohn-Sherbok, *Messianic Judaism*, 200.

Further, since the late 1950s the Israeli Supreme Court has rejected the Jewishness of those born Jewish who convert to another religion, such as Roman Catholicism. The most famous case revolves around Brother Daniel, who first applied for citizenship in 1958. Born to Jewish parents and raised a Jew with the name Oswald Rufeisin, during World War II, while hiding from the Nazis in a Polish convent, he began to identify as a Christian. Shortly thereafter, he formally converted to Catholicism and became a priest, changing his name to Daniel. When he applied for Israeli citizenship under the Law of Return, the court denied his request, saying that someone who identified with a religion other than Judaism could not be received as a Jew. They added that an individual born to a Jewish mother who converts to another religion prior to giving birth will also not be accepted as a Jew under the Law of Return. Since the 1970s Israeli Supreme Court justices have expressed various viewpoints as to what it means to be “part of another religion.” Despite the Supreme Court’s ruling, the Israeli rabbinate ruled that, despite his Christian beliefs, Brother Daniel should be accepted as a Jew because he was born to a Jewish mother, as should someone born to a Jewish mother who converts to another religion prior to giving birth. See S. Zalman Abramov, *Perpetual Dilemma: Jewish Religion in the Jewish State* (Teaneck, NJ: Farleigh Dickinson, 1976); Cohn-Sherbok, *Messianic Judaism*, 192–202; Michael Corinaldi, *Jewish Identity: The Case of Ethiopian Jewry* (Jerusalem: Magnus Press, 1998), 27–50; Nehama Tec, *In the Lion’s Den: The Life of Oswald Rufeisen* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993); Saint James Vicariate for Hebrew Speaking Catholics in Israel, [www.catholic.co.il/index.php?lang=en](http://www.catholic.co.il/index.php?lang=en).

In 2011, Israeli author Yoram Kaniuk (who died in 2013)

won the right to list himself with the Ministry of Interior as “without religion” rather than “Jew” on the Israeli Population Registry. Legally speaking, this can potentially open the door to situations where someone not identifying as a Jew in terms of religion but ethnicity or another category might seek citizenship. See, e.g., Rose L. Levinson, *Death of a Holy Land: Reflections in Contemporary Israeli Fiction* (Lanham, MD: Lexington Books, 2013); Tomer Zarchin, “Ruling for Yoram Kaniuk Hailed as Major Victory for Separation of State and Religion,” *Haaretz*, October 3, 2011, [www.haaretz.com/print-edition/news/ruling-for-yoram-kaniuk-hailed-as-major-victory-for-separation-of-state-and-religion-1.387764](http://www.haaretz.com/print-edition/news/ruling-for-yoram-kaniuk-hailed-as-major-victory-for-separation-of-state-and-religion-1.387764). I thank Rose Levinson for sharing this insight with me.

The Israeli High Court on Jews for Jesus: Associated Press, “Israeli Court Rules Jews for Jesus Cannot Automatically Be Citizens,” *New York Times*, December 27, 1989, [www.nytimes.com/1989/12/27/world/israeli-court-rules-jews-for-jesus-cannot-automatically-be-citizens.html](http://www.nytimes.com/1989/12/27/world/israeli-court-rules-jews-for-jesus-cannot-automatically-be-citizens.html).

Most Jewish Israelis disagree: One year prior to this landmark decision, the Israeli Dahaf Research Institute conducted a study in which Jewish Israelis were asked what they thought the parameters should be for individuals applying for Israeli citizenship under the Law of Return. Most respondents said that people born to a Jewish mother, even if they didn’t believe in God, belonged to a religion other than Judaism, or identified as Messianic Jews (i.e., believed that Jesus is the messiah), should be allowed to legally immigrate to Israel under the Law of Return. See Dahaf Research Institute, “Dahaf Report on Israeli Public Opinion Concerning Messianic Jewish Aliyah,” trans. Amikam Tavor (Jerusalem: David H. Stern, 1988); Lausanne Consultation on Jewish Evangelisms, “Bulletin 20,” May 1990, 1–16, available at [www.lcje.net/LCJE\\_Bulletin\\_No\\_20\\_May\\_1990.pdf](http://www.lcje.net/LCJE_Bulletin_No_20_May_1990.pdf). See also Walter Riggans, “Messianic Judaism and Jewish-Christian Relations: A Case Study in the Field of Religious Identity,” PhD diss., University of Birmingham, 1991, 335–340.

Jewish Americans and belief in the messiah: Ben Zehavi, “Rise of ‘Jews of No Religion’ Most Significant Find of Pew Study, Says Director,” *Times of Israel*, October 3, 2013, [www.timesofisrael.com/rise-of-jews-of-no-religion-most-significant-find-of-pew-study-says-director](http://www.timesofisrael.com/rise-of-jews-of-no-religion-most-significant-find-of-pew-study-says-director).

**Perhaps the two main reasons** Cohn-Sherbok, *Messianic Judaism*, 81; Stern, *Messianic Judaism*, 13–16.

**In his treatise** Jean-Paul Sartre, *Anti-Semite and Jew: An Exploration of the Etiology of Hate*, trans. George J. Becker (New York: Schocken Books, 1995), 69.

**Although Samaritans** The term *al-yahud al-qara’in* is discussed in Lital Levy, “Edification between Sect and Nation: Murad Farag and al-Tahdhib, 1901–1903,” in *Intellectuals and Civil Society in the Middle East: Liberalism, Modernity, and Political Discourse*, ed. Mohammed Bamyeh (New York: I. B. Tauris, 2012), 58–59.

*Al-yahud al-samarah*: Although sometimes Palestinians call the Samaritans *a-samarah* or *e-samarah* for short, they typically refer to them as *al-yahud a-samarah* and perceive them

to be an ancient “Jewish” sect, despite the community’s objections otherwise.

**The question of their identity** Nablusi Samaritans identifying and not identifying as Palestinian: Husney W. Cohen, conversation with author, June 22, 2011.

Identifying as Israeli and not Palestinian: Alan D. Crown, “Abisha Scroll,” in Crown et al. (eds.), *Companion to Samaritan Studies*, 4–6; idem, “Holon,” *ibid.*, 128.

Identity of Samaritans living in the occupied West Bank: Hussein Ahmad Yousef and Iyad Barghouti, “Minority under Occupation: The Socio-politics of the Samaritans in the Palestinian Occupied Territories,” An-Najeh National University, 2005, available at [www.zajel.org/article\\_view.asp?newsID=4429&cat=18](http://www.zajel.org/article_view.asp?newsID=4429&cat=18).

**In contrast to the Karaites** “Deception”: Yossi Klein-Halevi, “Like a Prayer: Kabbalah Goes Hollywood,” *New Republic*, May 10, 2004, [www.tnr.com/article/politics/prayer](http://www.tnr.com/article/politics/prayer).

“Charlatanism,” “commercialism,” “brainwashing”: Ovadiah Yosef, “Decree against the Kabbalah Center,” *She’elot utshuvot yehave de’ah*; Yeshivat Bnei N’vi’im Online, [www.koshertorah.com](http://www.koshertorah.com); [www.rickross.com/groups/kabbalah](http://www.rickross.com/groups/kabbalah); Interview, Professor Yoseph Dan, *Ma’ariv*; Interview, Professor Moshe Idel, *Ba-mah*, April 27, 1989, [Hebrew]: all cited in Boaz Huss, “All You Need Is LAV: Madonna and Postmodern Kabbalah,” *Jewish Quarterly Review* 95, no. 4 (Fall 2005): 623nn.39–40.

An analogy for the alleged disconnect between the Kabbalah Centre’s practices and Jewish tradition may be found in the way, for many Americans, yoga has become detached from Hinduism. I thank Andrew Ramer for sharing this insight with me.

**There are a number of obvious linkages** Scholar Jody Myers notes that although the Centre practices the ritual of setting aside sacred time each week between Friday evening and Saturday evening (i.e., the Centre staff observe the halakhic observances connected to Shabbat, such as ceasing from carrying out actions of “work,” etc.), most within the Orthodox Jewish community who are critical of the Centre and unaffiliated with it are unaware of this. It is reasonable to assume that these Jews would be even more upset if they knew about this practice because this would be seen as another reappropriation of an “authentic” Jewish ritual by an “inauthentic” Jewish group (Jody Myers, email with author, April 22 and April 24, 2012; note that Myers did not use the terms *reappropriation*, *authentic*, or *inauthentic*).

**First established** It is not uncommon for Jews to change one or more of their names when moving to or living in the State of Israel. Both Philip and his second wife, Karen, changed their first and last names in this process (Karen’s name had been Tova). See Jody Myers, *Kabbalah and the Spiritual Quest: The Kabbalah Centre in America* (Westport, CT: Praeger, 2007), 16–38, 51.

Yehudah Ashlag: Ashlag arrived in Palestine in 1921 (Myers, email with author, April 22, 2012).



Teaching non-Jews Kabbalah: Myers, email with author, April 22, 2012.

**From the 1980s onward** Los Angeles as world headquarters: Myers, *Kabbalah and the Spiritual Quest*, 50–54, 62–73, 119.

*Zohar* as a universal text: Myers, *Kabbalah and the Spiritual Quest*, 50–54, 66–68, 109–110. See also Huss, “All You Need,” 611–624; idem, “The New Age of Kabbalah: Contemporary Kabbalah, the New Age, and Postmodern Spirituality,” *Journal of Modern Jewish Studies* 6, no. 2 (July 2007): 107–125.

**Berg did not stop** The Centre leadership has, to some degree, redefined a number of ideas and terms, including the signifiers *Jew* and *Judaism*. At the same time, the Centre maintains a distinction between Jews and non-Jews in their practices. For instance, a number of rituals during Jewish prayer services, according to Jewish law, can be carried out only by Jews, such as saying the blessings before and after one reads from the Torah; the Centre follows this tradition. At the same time, they permit anyone to join the communal service itself, regardless of whether they are Jewish (Myers, email to author, March 13, 2012).

Coincidental: Myers, *Kabbalah and the Spiritual Quest*, 54–73, 115–121.

**American music legend Madonna** On the Hebrew letters tattooed on her body, see Huss, “All You Need,” 611–624.

Explicitly professed: When asked by an interviewer if studying Kabbalah was a step on her way to becoming Jewish, Madonna responded:

Oh, no, please. Don't make me sick! I'm never gonna be Jewish, and I hate that phrase. And I have not converted to Judaism and I am not a member of any religion. . . . [Kabbalah's] not religion. It is, you know, it's a belief system that has been around, a philosophy or body of wisdom that has been around for thousands of years, and it pre-dates religion. And in fact most, a lot of religious beliefs get their ideas from the Kabbalah. . . . It's actually quite fascinating and amazing to realize how many people were actually studying Kabbalah over the last thousand years, or the last couple of thousand years. (Interview with Terry Gross, “Fresh Air from WHYY: Interview with Madonna,” National Public Radio, November 23, 2004, [www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=4183844](http://www.npr.org/templates/story/story.php?storyId=4183844))

Karen Berg quote: Myers, *Kabbalah and the Spiritual Quest*, 123.

Cognitive dissonance: According to Myers, the Centre's instructors make a clear separation between what they teach and its relation to Judaism. They emphasize that it was not Jews or Jewish mystics who wrote kabbalistic texts such as the *Zohar*, but rather Kabbalists, implying that these mystics were not Jewish. Centre teachers also say that Judaism is a false construct that has been manipulated over the centuries, a “calcified or shallow religious belief and observance,” a critique that they “believe wholeheartedly was also shared by [previous generations of] kabbalists.” The Centre's dominant narrative scorns Jews who say that Kabbalah is strictly Jewish, framing this claim of communal ownership a type of false pride (Myers, email with author, March 14, 2012).

**Paradoxically, despite the Centre's disassociation** On the Kabbalah Centre's devotees, see Myers, *Kabbalah and the Spiritual Quest*, 75.

Karen Berg quote: Myers, *Kabbalah and the Spiritual Quest*, 125.

The phenomenon of *ba'alei teshuvah*: Aaron Joshua Tapper, “The ‘Cult’ of Aish HaTorah: Ba'alei Teshuvah and the New Religious Movement Phenomenon,” *Jewish Journal of Sociology* 44, nos. 1 and 2 (2002): 5–29.

**Ultimately, the way one answers** “To some degree, all conflicts are about the relationship between power and identity. As individuals and communities, we enact a constructed sense of identity, or self, through our behavior, which in turn is shaped by cultures, value and belief systems, histories, and narratives” (Aaron J. Hahn Tapper, “The War of Words: Jews, Muslims, and the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict on American University Campuses” in *Muslims and Jews in America: Commonalities, Contentions, and Complexities*, ed. Reza Aslan and Aaron J. Hahn Tapper [New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011], 71).

**“Professional Jews”** Jubus: Some attribute the popularization of the term *Jubu* to Roger Kamenetz's 1994 book *The Jew in the Lotus*. Others say it emerged from the fact that a number of prominent twentieth-century American Buddhist leaders were born Jewish. In terms of pop culture, people such as Leonard Cohen, Allen Ginsberg, and Adam Yauch have also played a role in popularizing Jewish-Buddhist identities (Roger Kamenetz and Emily Sigalow, “After the *Jew in the Lotus*: American Jews, Eastern Religions, and a New Culture of Jewish Spirituality,” Paper presented at the 46th Annual Conference of the Association for Jewish Studies, Baltimore, 2014).

**Some people with multiple social identities** Juliano Mer-Khamis quote: Conal Urquhart, “Friends Mourn Juliano Mer-Khamis, the Palestinian Israeli Who Used Drama to Foster Peace,” *Observer*, April 10, 2011, [www.theguardian.com/world/2011/apr/10/juliano-mer-khamis-west-bank-freedom-theatre](http://www.theguardian.com/world/2011/apr/10/juliano-mer-khamis-west-bank-freedom-theatre).

## Chapter 12. Futures

**Northern California** These numbers are approximate estimates made in 2013 by senior administrators at both my daughter's former preschool (Zvi Weiss, email with author, December 9, 2013) and my son's school (Steve Bogad, conversation with author, December 10, 2013), based on both anecdotal and hard evidence. The large number of non-Jewish parents at the preschool is partly due to the excellent reputation of this preschool rather than its status as a Jewish school. At my son's school, the 20 percent figure rises to 25–30 percent when we're talking about how many students have at least one non-Jewish grandparent.

**In the San Francisco Bay Area** According to data from 2000–2001, 27 percent of Jewish Americans between the ages of six and seventeen attended Jewish parochial schools.

Within this group, only 4 percent of students had intermarried parents. See Laurence A. Kotler-Berkowitz, "The Jewish Education of Jewish Children: Formal Schooling, Early Childhood Programs, and Informal Experiences," Report No. 11, Series on the National Jewish Population Survey 2000–2001, United Jewish Communities, May 2005, available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=3098](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=3098).

**These issues are important** Jeffrey S. Passel, Wendy Wang, and Paul Taylor, "Marrying Out: One-in-Seven New U.S. Marriages is Interracial or Interethnic," Pew Research Center, 2010, [www.pewsocialtrends.org/files/2010/10/755-marrying-out.pdf](http://www.pewsocialtrends.org/files/2010/10/755-marrying-out.pdf).

**One way to determine the strength of a community** 15 million: See Central Bureau of Statistics, State of Israel, "Population of Israel on the Eve of 2014—8 Million," December 29, 2013, [www1.cbs.gov.il/reader/newhodaot/hodaa\\_template\\_eng.html?hodaa=201311357](http://www1.cbs.gov.il/reader/newhodaot/hodaa_template_eng.html?hodaa=201311357); Arnold Dashefsky, Sergio DellaPergola, and Ira Sheskin, "World Jewish Population, 2013," Current Jewish Population Reports No. 9, Berman Jewish DataBank, New York, available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=18230](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=18230); "Number of Jews in the World, with Emphasis on the United States and Israel," Jewish People Policy Institute, 2011, [http://jppi.org.il/uploads/Number\\_of\\_Jews\\_in\\_the\\_world\\_with\\_emphasis\\_on\\_the\\_United\\_States\\_and\\_Israel\\_EN.pdf](http://jppi.org.il/uploads/Number_of_Jews_in_the_world_with_emphasis_on_the_United_States_and_Israel_EN.pdf); and Diane Tobin, Gary A. Tobin, and Scott Rubin, *In Every Tongue: The Racial and Ethnic Diversity of the Jewish People* (San Francisco: Institute for Jewish and Community Research, 2005). See also Notes, chapter 1, "Although being a majority member."

One out of three: Michael Berenbaum and Fred Skolnik, eds., "Population," *Encyclopedia Judaica* (Detroit: Macmillan Reference USA, 2007), 397–398. See also Notes, chapter 9, "Under the leadership of Adolf Hitler."

11 to 12 million: Dashefsky, DellaPergola, and Sheskin, "World Jewish Population," 5. This study actually says that, post World War II, the "core" Jewish population was 11 million, defined as those individuals who exclusively identified as Jews and did not have "multiple cultural identities." Later in the same section, the figure is given as being closer to 11 to 12 million individuals. For more on the study's definition of "core Jewish" identities, see *ibid.*, 10–15.

"Relative share . . .": *Ibid.*, 5.

**If we assume** Statistics of 5 and 31 percent: Sergio DellaPergola, "Jewish Out-Marriage: A Global Perspective," in *Jewish Inter-marriage around the World*, ed. Shulamit Reinharz and Sergio DellaPergola (New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 2009), 27.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 12.1** See, e.g., Kohler Kaufmann and Joseph Jacobs, "Intermarriage," *Jewish Encyclopedia* (1906), [www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/8137-intermarriage](http://www.jewishencyclopedia.com/articles/8137-intermarriage).

**In the United States** The 50 percent figure comes from Pew Research Center, "A Portrait of Jewish Americans: Findings from a Pew Research Center Survey of U.S. Jews," October 1, 2013, 7–13, [www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey](http://www.pewforum.org/2013/10/01/jewish-american-beliefs-attitudes-culture-survey).

Barely four percent in 1937: Chaim I. Waxman, "Is the Cup Half-Full or Half-Empty? Perspectives on the Future of the American Jewish Community," in *American Pluralism and the Jewish Community*, ed. Seymour Martin Lipset (New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 1990), 71–85.

**But one can justly argue** According to a 2013 Pew study ("Portrait of Jewish Americans," 7–9), of those Jews who have been married since 2000, 60 percent married non-Jews, as opposed to 40 percent in the 1980s and 17 percent before 1970. At the same time, a 2014 study found that 65 percent of all Jewish Americans who are married are partnered with another Jew; see "2014 U.S. Religious Landscape Study" in Uriel Heilman, "1 in 6 American Jews are Converts—and 9 Other Findings in Pew Study," Jewish Telegraphic Agency, May 12, 2015, [www.jta.org/2015/05/12/news-opinion/united-states/1-in-6-jews-are-new-to-the-faith-and-9-other-new-pew-findings](http://www.jta.org/2015/05/12/news-opinion/united-states/1-in-6-jews-are-new-to-the-faith-and-9-other-new-pew-findings).

**In short, Jewish Israelis aside** Robert H. Schram, *Mixed Marriage . . . Interreligious, Interracial, Interethnic* (New York: Xlibris, 2013), 50–51.

**As the preceding chapters have shown** On studies that allow self-identification, see Sergio DellaPergola, "World Jewish Population, 2000," in *American Jewish Year Book*, ed. David Singer and Lawrence Grossman, vol. 100 (New York: American Jewish Committee, 2000), 484–487; Jennifer Thompson, "Look Who's Raising Jews," *Jewish Daily Forward*, May 19, 2010, <http://forward.com/articles/128173/look-who-s-raising-jews>; Julie Wiener, "Jewish World: More US Families 'Doing Both,'" *Jerusalem Post*, November 7, 2013, [www.jpost.com/Features/Front-Lines/Jewish-World-With-more-US-dual-faith-families-doing-both-outreach-groups-reconsider-approach-330941](http://www.jpost.com/Features/Front-Lines/Jewish-World-With-more-US-dual-faith-families-doing-both-outreach-groups-reconsider-approach-330941).

Virtually all of the studies published: These studies have allowed self-identification, usually also relying on whether or not the identifying Jew also has at least one Jewish parent, a Jewish spouse, or converted to Judaism. I thank Steven M. Cohen for assisting me in qualifying these data.

**As for the second assumption** The major denominations have policies on intermarriage. Reform institutions commonly embrace interfaith couples, Orthodox ones frequently reject them, and, until recently, Conservative groups have often encouraged the non-Jew to convert from the outset. See also Pew Research Center, "Portrait of Jewish Americans," 7–9; special topic 8.4.

Boston area study: Katherine N. Gan, Patty Jacobson, Gil Preuss, and Barry Shrage, "The 2005 Greater Boston Community Study: Intermarried Families and Their Children" (Boston: Combined Jewish Philanthropies, 2008), available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=13174](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=13174); Michael Paulson, "Jews Tackle Intermarriage Debate: Consider Impact Interfaith Brings," *Boston Globe*, March 10, 2008, [www.boston.com/news/local/articles/2008/03/10/jews\\_tackle\\_intermarriage\\_debate](http://www.boston.com/news/local/articles/2008/03/10/jews_tackle_intermarriage_debate).

As supported by the 2013 Pew study results, according to an October 2015 study focused on children of marriages between

a Jew and a non-Jew, those in the millennial generation are “far more likely to identify as Jewish compared to the children of intermarriages in previous generations.” See *EJewish-Philanthropy*, “Children of Intermarriage are Reshaping the Contours of American Jewish Life,” October 20, 2015, <http://ejewishphilanthropy.com/children-of-intermarriage-are-reshaping-the-contours-of-american-jewish-life/>; Theodore Sasson, Leonard Saxe, Fran Chertok, Michelle Shain, Shahar Hecht, Graham Wright, “Millennial Children of Intermarriage: Touchpoints and Trajectories of Jewish Engagement” (October 2015), available at [www.brandeis.edu/cmjs/pdfs/intermarriage/MillennialChildrenIntermarriage.pdf](http://www.brandeis.edu/cmjs/pdfs/intermarriage/MillennialChildrenIntermarriage.pdf).

**Of course, it can be damaging** On Jewish parochial schools, see Alex Pomson and Howard Deitcher, eds., *Jewish Day Schools Jewish Communities: A Reconsideration* (Portland, OR: Littman Library of Jewish Civilization, 2009), 1–3; Pew Research Center, “Portrait of Jewish Americans,” 66.

In contrast to the American Jewish community, in Australia, South Africa, and Latin America roughly 70 percent of Jewish youth attend Jewish parochial school; in Great Britain, more than 50 percent (versus 25 percent in 1975) do; and in France, almost 40 percent (versus 16 percent in 1986) do. See Pomson and Deitcher (eds.), *Jewish Day Schools*, 1–3.

**The term intermarried** Celebration of both Hanukkah and Christmas: Steve Bogad, conversation with author, December 10, 2013. See Notes, chapter 12, “Northern California.”

**Two of the most commonly studied experiences** Steven M. Cohen, Ron Miller, Ira M. Sheskin, and Berna Torr, “Camp Works: The Long-Term Impact of Jewish Overnight Camp, Evidence from 26 U.S. Jewish Population Studies on Adult Jewish Engagement” (New York: Foundation for Jewish Camp, 2011); Jack Wertheimer, Sarah Bunin Benor, Steve M. Cohen, Sylvia Barack Fishman, Ari Y. Kelman, and Shaul Kelner, “Generation of Change: How Leaders in Their Twenties and Thirties Are Reshaping American Jewish Life” (New York: AVI Chai Foundation, 2010), available at <http://avichai.org/wp-content/uploads/2010/08/Generation-of-Change-FINAL.pdf>.

**The third experience** Since it was established in 1999 and the first cohort was sent to Israel in 2000, considerable attention has been paid to the Taglit-Birthright Israel program and its impact on strengthening Jewish identities. See, e.g., Shaul Kelner, *Tours That Bind: Diaspora, Pilgrimage, and Israeli Birthright Education* (New York: New York University Press, 2012); Alex Pomson and Howard Deitcher, “Day School Education in the Age of Birthright,” *Journal of Jewish Education* 7, no. 1 (2010): 52–73.

Quote from TBI website: Taglit-Birthright Israel, “The Educational Journey,” [www.birthrightisrael.com/TaglitBirthrightIsraelStory/Pages/Education.aspx](http://www.birthrightisrael.com/TaglitBirthrightIsraelStory/Pages/Education.aspx). See also “About Taglit-Birthright Israel” on same website.

**An explicit goal of TBI** Leonard Saxe, Theodore Sasson, Shahar Hecht, Benjamin Phillips, Michelle Shain, Graham Wright, and Charles Kadushin, “Jewish Futures Project—The

Impact of Taglit-Birthright Israel: 2010 Update” (Waltham, MA: Maurice and Marilyn Cohen Center for Modern Jewish Studies, Brandeis University, 2011), 12–15, available at [www.brandeis.edu/cmjs/pdfs/jewish%20ofutures/Jewish.Futures.02.08.11.pdf](http://www.brandeis.edu/cmjs/pdfs/jewish%20ofutures/Jewish.Futures.02.08.11.pdf).

**Studies show that Israel** “Less important” does not mean “not important.” Whereas 80 percent of Jews over sixty-five said that “caring about Israel is an important part of being a Jew,” 60 percent of Jews under thirty-five felt the same way. Similarly, whereas 40 percent of Jews over sixty-five said their overall attachment to Israel was “high,” the rate drops to approximately 20 percent for Jews under thirty-five (Steven M. Cohen and Ari Y. Kelman, “Beyond Distancing: Young Adult American Jews and Their Alienation from Israel” [New York: Andrea and Charles Bronfman Philanthropies, 2007], 9–10, available at [www.acbp.net/pdf/pdfs-research-and-publications/Beyond\\_Distancing.pdf](http://www.acbp.net/pdf/pdfs-research-and-publications/Beyond_Distancing.pdf)).

“Birthright bump”: Steven M. Cohen and Samuel Abrams, “Youngest Adults Show Evidence of a Birthright Bump in Attachment to Israel along with Decreased Relative Trust in Israel,” American Jews’ Political Values Survey (New York: Workmen’s Circle/Arbeter Ring, 2012), available at [http://probeinternational.org/library/wp-content/uploads/2012/07/Questionnaire-and-Breakdown-2012-The-Workmens-Circle\\_Arbeter-Ring.pdf](http://probeinternational.org/library/wp-content/uploads/2012/07/Questionnaire-and-Breakdown-2012-The-Workmens-Circle_Arbeter-Ring.pdf).

**Those who look to population size** As Rabbi Ed Feinstein, among others, has pointed out, the cover story for a 1964 edition of *Look* magazine was titled, “The Vanishing American Jew.” The accompanying article argued that no new immigrant group in America makes it past the third generation without assimilating away from their subcommunity. Yet now, more than forty years later, there are still millions of Jews in the United States, and *Look* magazine is out of print. See Edward Feinstein, ed., *Jews and Judaism in the 21st Century: Human Responsibility, the Presence of God, and the Future of the Covenant* (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 2007), 143).

David Passig is referenced in Dan Pine, “Israeli Professor Uses Hard Science to Predict the Future,” January 20, 2011, [www.jweekly.com/article/full/60586/israeli-professor-uses-hard-science-to-predict-the-future](http://www.jweekly.com/article/full/60586/israeli-professor-uses-hard-science-to-predict-the-future). Passig is not alone in having an optimistic projection. Demographers Sergio Della-Pergola, Uzi Rebhun, and Mark Tolts (“Prospecting the Jewish Future: Population Projections, 2000–2080,” in Singer and Grossman [eds.], *American Jewish Year Book*, 100:103–146), echo Passig’s speculation that the worldwide Jewish community will increase in size in the decades to come, projecting a 2080 Jewish community 17 percent larger than that of today. Though this number is not as hopeful as Passig’s, their projections, published in 2000, underestimated the number of Jews there would be by 2013, giving some reason to assume they perhaps underestimated their 2080 projections as well.

**Examining data** Optimistic and “distinctiveness”: Leonard Saxe, “U.S. Jewry 2010: Estimates of the Size and Characteristics of the Population,” Presentation at the Associa-



tion for Jewish Studies, Boston, December 2010, available at <http://bir.brandeis.edu/handle/10192/24297>.

Leonard Saxe quote: Saxe et al., “Jewish Futures Project,” 3. See also “New Poll of 1,874 Jews: Young Jews More Likely to Go to Jewish Day School and Camp than Their Parent’s Generation but Are Still Less Connected to Israel and Jewish Identity,” August 27, 2013, [www.prweb.com/releases/online\\_poll\\_jews/Jerusalem\\_U/prweb11064591.htm](http://www.prweb.com/releases/online_poll_jews/Jerusalem_U/prweb11064591.htm).

**Then there are those such as scholar Shaul Magid** See, e.g., Shaul Magid, *American Post-Judaism: Identity and Renewal in a Postethnic Society* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2013), 219.

**Magid contends that such figures as Schachter-Shalomi** Quotes are from Magid, *American Post-Judaism*, 219 (“offers a systematic critique”), 242 (“American Jewry and Judaism”), and 21 (“the Jewish collective in America”).

**For instance, younger Jewish Americans** See, e.g., Sidney Schwartz, “Jewish Megatrends: Charting the Course of the American Jewish Future,” in *Jewish Megatrends: Charting the Course of the American Jewish Future*, ed. Sidney Schwartz (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 2012), 4–16.

**Some would argue** On “unaffiliated” Jews, see Pew Research Center, “Portrait of Jewish Americans.”

Religiously “unaffiliated” Americans: Robert D. Putnam and David E. Campbell, *American Grace: How Religion Unites and Divides Us* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2010). Youth in the African American and Latino communities overwhelmingly accept the religious identity of their parents; Putnam and Campbell did not include them to prevent a skewing of results. See also Pew Research Center, “Religion among the Millennials: Less Religiously Active than Older Americans, but Fairly Traditional in Other Ways,” February 2010, [www.pewforum.org/files/2010/02/millennials-report.pdf](http://www.pewforum.org/files/2010/02/millennials-report.pdf); Schwartz, “Jewish Megatrends,” 14–16.

“Unaffiliated” trends worldwide: Pew Research Center, “The Future of World Religions: Population Growth Perspectives, 2010–2050,” April 2, 2015, [www.pewforum.org/2015/04/02/religious-projections-2010-2050](http://www.pewforum.org/2015/04/02/religious-projections-2010-2050).

**During the twentieth century** Jewish Federations of North America (JFNA), “The First Federation,” available at Jewish Federation of Greater Atlanta, [www.jewishatlanta.org/who-we-are/our-history](http://www.jewishatlanta.org/who-we-are/our-history).

**One of the rationales** These institutions have been established for every American community with more than one thousand Jews. See JFNA, “About Us,” <http://jewishfederations.org/about-jfna>; and idem, “First Federation.”

**By the 1980s** For trends among younger Jewish Americans, see Donald Feldstein, *The American Jewish Community in the Twenty-First Century: A Projection* (New York: American Jewish Congress, 1984); Anna Greenberg, “‘Grand Soy Vanilla Latte with Cinnamon, No Foam . . .’: Jewish Identity and Community in a Time of Unlimited Choices,” *Reboot*, 2006, available at [www.issuelab.org/resource/latte\\_report\\_jewish\\_identity\\_and\\_community\\_in\\_a\\_time\\_of\\_unlimited\\_choices](http://www.issuelab.org/resource/latte_report_jewish_identity_and_community_in_a_time_of_unlimited_choices); Steve Windmueller, “Some Reflections on the State

of the Jewish Federation System,” April 3, 2013, <http://ejewishphilanthropy.com/some-reflections-on-the-state-of-the-jewish-federation-system>.

**For Jewish Federations** On decreases in support for Jewish Federations in the United States, see Jacob Berkman, “Jewish Federations Try a Sin City Adventure to Woo a New Generation of Donors,” *Chronicle of Philanthropy*, March 20, 2011, <http://philanthropy.com/article/Jewish-Charity-Gambles-on/158711>; Sandy Cardin, “Jewish Family Foundations: ‘Come Together, Right Now,’” in Schwartz (ed.), *Jewish Megatrends*, 69; Eric Fleisch and Ted Sasson, “The New Philanthropy: American Jewish Giving to Israeli Organizations” (Waltham, MA: Maurice and Marilyn Cohen Center for Modern Jewish Studies, Brandeis University, 2012), available at [www.brandeis.edu/cmjs/pdfs/TheNewPhilanthropy.pdf](http://www.brandeis.edu/cmjs/pdfs/TheNewPhilanthropy.pdf); Schwartz, “Jewish Megatrends,” 27–28.

**To the professional Jewish world’s credit** For a sampling of these organizations, see Wertheimer et al., “Generation of Change.”

**One reason for this policy shift** Steven M. Cohen, “Jewishly Engaged and Congregationally Unaffiliated: The Holy Grail of Jewish Engagement Efforts” (New York: Workmen’s Circle/Arbeter Ring, 2012), available at [www.bjpa.org/publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=14041](http://www.bjpa.org/publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=14041).

**SPECIAL TOPIC 12.2** “Extravagant” Bnei and Bnot Mitzvah: See, e.g., Stefanie Cohen, “\$1 Million Parties—Have New York Bar Mitzvahs Gone Too Far?,” *New York Post*, April 18, 2010, <http://nypost.com/2010/04/18/1-million-parties-have-nyc-bar-mitzvahs-gone-too-far>.

On Kaplan’s daughter’s Bat Mitzvah and pre-twentieth-century Italian Bnot Mitzvah, see “Judith Kaplan Celebrates First American Bat Mitzvah Ceremony,” March 18, 1922, *Jewish Women’s Archive*, <http://jwa.org/thisweek/mar/18/1922/judith-kaplan>; Zachary Silver, “The Excommunication of Mordecai Kaplan,” *American Jewish Archives Journal* 62, no. 1 (2010): 21–48; Francesco Spagnolo, “Music and Synagogue Life,” in *Italia*, ed. Roni Weinstein (Jerusalem: Ben Tzvi Institute, 2013), 143–150; idem, email to author, September 23, 2013. I thank Andrew Ramer for introducing me to Spagnolo’s research on this issue.

Marriage and death: See, e.g., “Burial and Mourning,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/burial-and-mourning](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/burial-and-mourning); “Death and Birth,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/death-and-birth](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/death-and-birth); “Weddings,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/weddings](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/weddings).

**As Rabbi Noa Kushner** Kushner goes on to explain: “By analogy, if yoga studios asked people to become yogis as a condition for taking classes, those studios would lose much of their popularity. But yoga is marketed as something one can just do; it doesn’t necessitate an identity shift. As a result, people feel comfortable trying it out. Of course, once they try it, some continue in their yoga practice and it becomes a part of their lives. The same operative principle is true for us—if we want people to grow Jewishly, we need to encourage them to do Jewish first” (Noa Kushner, “‘Doing Jewish Stuff’—An

Experiment Called NITA,” *S3K Report* 9 [November 2010]: 1–6).

**Perhaps it is just as Jewish communal leader** Covenantal or spiritual vs. tribal: Schwartz, “Jewish Megatrends,” 10–14. Barry Shrage points out that although there is wisdom in Schwartz’s dichotomy of “tribal” and “covenantal” Jews, more often than not individual Jews of all generations reflect both of these trends in their day-to-day lives; see Barry Shrage, “The Federation System: Loving Humanity and the Jewish People,” in Schwartz (ed.), *Jewish Megatrends*, 188–201.

Multiple ways to express one’s Jewishness: Greenberg, “‘Grand Soy Vanilla Latte with Cinnamon.’”

**Another significant change** Dan Mendelsohn Aviv, *End of the Jews: Radical Breaks, Remakes, and What Comes Next* (Toronto: Key Publishing House, 2012), 216; see also 155–213.

**FIGURE 12.2** For more on these five Jewish organizations, all of which primarily rely on social media to reach their constituents, see Jdate, “The leading Jewish singles network,” [www.jdate.com](http://www.jdate.com); Jewcy, “A platform for ideas that matter to young Jews today,” <http://jewcy.com/about>; Jewlicious, “A grassroots organization changing the way young adults affiliate and participate in Jewish life,” [www.jewlicious.com/about](http://www.jewlicious.com/about); Kveller, “A website for those who want to add a Jewish twist to their parenting,” [www.kveller.com/about-kveller](http://www.kveller.com/about-kveller); My Jewish Learning, “The leading transdenominational website of Jewish information and education,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/about-us](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/about-us).

**Another major trend** “The Jewish Farm School teaches about contemporary food and environmental issues through innovative trainings and skill-based Jewish agricultural education” ([www.jewishfarmschool.org](http://www.jewishfarmschool.org)).

Passow quote: Nati Passow, “A Movement Takes Root: The Growth of Jewish Environmentalism,” November 17, 2010, <http://ejewishphilanthropy.com/a-movement-takes-root-the-growth-of-jewish-environmentalism/#sthash.ZzOno7RJ.dpuf>.

A partial sampling of these organizations includes Adamah, Jewish Farm School, Hazon, Eden Village Camp, Teva Learning Center, Urban Adamah, and Wilderness Torah, as well as retreat centers such as the Pearlstone Center and Isabella Freedman Jewish Retreat Center; see Nigel Savage, “On Tribes, Food, and Community,” in Schwartz (ed.), *Jewish Megatrends*, 174–187.

**Passow goes on to point out** Some of these twenty-first-century organizations are more intent on educating participants about better ways to treat the natural world or methods to grow their own food than necessarily to show how these things are also Jewish.

Ellen Bernstein reference: Passow, “A Movement Takes Root.”

**Educator Gabe Goldman** Goldman, email with author, December 18, 2013. When asked what he thought were the main differences between the development of Jewish environmentalism in Israel and in the United States, Goldman added:

Few of the hundred or so Israeli environmental organizations currently active . . . view their work as an expression of Jewishness. And it is this point that distinguishes the place of environmentalism in Israeli society from that which it has in American Jewish life. From the beginning, American Jewish environmentalists have insisted on centering environmentalism within Jewish tradition: connecting the acts of conservation to the Torah principles of *bal tashchit* (to not destroy) and *tsaar ba’alei hayyim* (to not engage in inhumane animal-rearing and slaughtering practices); as well as linking organic gardening to the *mitzvot of Peah* [lit., “corner”: leaving a portion of one’s agricultural harvest for the poor] and feeding the hungry. American Jewish environmentalism has been a way to energize a generation of Jews to find meaning in Judaism at a time when traditional Jewish institutions have failed to inspire them, and there is an increasing number of American Jews whose essential Jewish identity is expressed in their living environmentally conscious and healthy lives.

**Since 2000** Some of the more important books (academic or otherwise) related to the Jewish American queer community that emerged since 2000 include: Daniel Boyarin, Daniel Itzkovitz, and Ann Pellegrini, eds., *Queer Theory and the Jewish Question* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003); Marla Brettschneider, *The Family Flamboyant: Race Politics, Queer Families, Jewish Lives* (Albany: State University of New York, 2006); Gregg Drinkwater, Joshua Lessor, and David Shneer, eds., *Torah Queeries: Weekly Commentaries on the Hebrew Bible* (New York: New York University Press, 2009); Steven Greenberg, *Wrestling with God and Men: Homosexuality and the Jewish Tradition* (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 2004); Warren Hoffman, *The Passing Game: Queering Jewish American Culture* (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2009); David Shneer and Caryn Aviv, *Queer Jews* (New York: Routledge, 2002).

As of 2011, scholarship related to this genre also included: Noach Dzmura, ed., *Balancing on the Mechitzta: Transgender in Jewish Community* (Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic Books, 2010); Miryam Kabakov, ed., *Keep Your Wives Away from Them: Orthodox Women, Unorthodox Desires, an Anthology* (Berkeley, CA: North Atlantic Books, 2010); Yoel H. Kahn, *The Three Blessings: Boundaries, Censorship, and Identity in Jewish Liturgy* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011); Andrew Ramer, *Queering the Text: Biblical, Medieval, and Modern Jewish Stories* (Maple Shade, NJ: White Crane Books, 2010). Important films also appeared during this same time, including *Trembling Before G-d* (Simcha Dubowski, 2001) and *Hineini: Coming Out in a Jewish High School* (Irena Fayngold, 2005).

See also sociological studies examining gay and lesbian Jews, such as: Caryn Aviv “LGBT Alliance Study: A Needs Assessment of the San Francisco Bay Area LGBT Community,” Jew Mosaic: The National Center for Sexual and Gender Diversity, 2010, available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=7312](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=7312); Steven M. Cohen, “Gays, Lesbians, and the Conservative Movement: The JTS Survey of Conservative Clergy, Students, Professionals, and Lay Leaders,” The Jewish Theological Seminary, United Synagogue of Conservative Judaism, and the Rabbinical Assembly, 2007, available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=327](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=327); Steven M. Cohen, Caryn Aviv, and Ari Y.

Kelman, "Gay, Jewish, or Both? Sexual Orientation and Jewish Engagement," *Journal of Jewish Communal Service* 84, nos. 1–2 (Winter/Spring 2009): 154–166, available at [www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=3872](http://www.bjpa.org/Publications/downloadFile.cfm?FileID=3872). Other research focused on gendered, sexed, and sexualized issues within the Jewish community, such as those regularly conducted by Advancing Women Professionals and the Jewish Community, are also integral to this field.

**SPECIAL TOPIC 12.3** 1969 Stonewall Uprising and 1976: "Gay and Lesbian Jews," Union for Reform Judaism, [www.urj.org/what-we-believe/resolutions/gay-and-lesbian-jews](http://www.urj.org/what-we-believe/resolutions/gay-and-lesbian-jews); "LGBT Rights and Position of the Reform Movement," Religious Action Center of Reform Judaism, [http://rac.org/Articles/index.cfm?id=3231&pge\\_prg\\_id=12687&pge\\_id=2413](http://rac.org/Articles/index.cfm?id=3231&pge_prg_id=12687&pge_id=2413).

**As of 2014, American Jews support civil** Rates higher than most other American communities: See, e.g., Robert P. Jones, "Attitudes on Same-Sex Marriage by Religious Affiliation and Denominational Family," Public Religion Research Institute, April 22, 2015, <http://publicreligion.org/2015/04/attitudes-on-same-sex-marriage-by-religious-affiliation-and-denominational-family>; Pew Research Center, "Portrait of Jewish Americans," 101; Sam Schulman, "Same-Sex Marriage and the Jews," *Mosaic Magazine*, February 2, 2014, <http://mosaicmagazine.com/essay/2014/02/same-sex-marriage-and-the-jews/>.

**Interestingly, the success** Atlanta-based synagogue: Michal Lemberger, "Gay Synagogues Uncertain Future," *Tablet*, March 11, 2013, [www.tabletmag.com/jewish-life-and-religion/126512/gay-synagogues-uncertain-future](http://www.tabletmag.com/jewish-life-and-religion/126512/gay-synagogues-uncertain-future).

**One of the more important innovations** This is not to say that *Siddur Sha'ar Zahav* is the first Jewish text to approach the situations addressed by these blessings. Rather, this prayer book is unique in the way it did so, using the traditional Jewish framework of a blessing and integrating previously marginalized gender- and sexuality-related identities and issues. Michael Tyler and Leslie Kane, eds., *Siddur Sha'ar Zahav* (San Francisco: Congregation Sha'ar Zahav, 2009). Arguably the first text that integrated traditional Hebrew prayers with accessible, nongendered language, presenting them alongside contemporary poems, is Marcia Falk, *The Book of Blessings: New Jewish Prayers for Daily Life, the Sabbath, and the New Moon Festival* (San Francisco: HarperSanFrancisco, 1996).

A number of such prayers: *Siddur Sha'ar Zahav* includes prayers applicable to coming out, coming into our sexuality, queer elders, transgender transitioning, the partner of someone in gender transition, being single, marriage equality, the adoption of a child, donor fathers and surrogate mothers, the childless, letting go of having a biological child, a torn family, questioning sexuality, and adult renaming.

One challenge with *Siddur Sha'ar Zahav* (2009) is that terms used to describe particular queer subidentities are now (2015), at least in certain places, such as the San Francisco Bay Area (where Congregation Sha'ar Zahav is based), passé. This is largely a reflection of the ever-changing terminology used

by those in queer communities. I thank Andrew Ramer for sharing this insight with me.

See also caption for image on book's front cover, top right corner: Rabbi Tsipi Gabai, the first female rabbi of Moroccan descent, blessing Tom Chai Sosnik during a gender transition ceremony at Tehiyah Day School (El Cerrito, CA) in March 2015, with proud parents Esti and Udi in the background. While a handful of Jewish parochial schools in the United States have taken steps to accommodate transgender students, such as creating nongendered bathrooms, Sosnik's transition ceremony is thought to be the first time a Jewish school performed a ritual of this kind in a communal setting. Created by Gabai, the forty-minute ceremony included various Jewish traditional blessings and readings about transitions and new beginnings.

**Over the last sixty years** None of this means that a large number of Jews are marrying other Jews outside their immediate subgroup. However, because this was so rare prior to the twentieth century, and because the State of Israel was founded during this time—thereby creating a context for regular intramarriage of Jews across subcultural lines—any increase must be understood as a significant development from previous norms.

**The best data we have** Orly Benjamin and Tamar Barash, "‘He Thought I Would Be Like My Mother’: The Silencing of Mizrahi Women in Israeli Inter- and Intra-Marriages," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 27, no. 2 (March 2004): 266–289; Rina Shachar, "The Attitudes of Israeli Youth towards Inter-ethnic and Intra-ethnic Marriage: 1975 and 1990," *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 16, no. 4 (October 1993): 683–695.

**Although we don't have analogous evidence** Jewish intramarriage in the United States: Tobin et al., *In Every Tongue*, 50–51.

Interestingly, some scholars maintain that the increase in intramarriage among Jews in Israel is influenced by the American context; see, e.g., Stan L. Albrecht and Tim B. Heaton, "The Changing Pattern of Interracial Marriage," *Social Biology* 43, nos. 3–4 (1996): 203–217.

**In the United States** Tobin, et al., *In Every Tongue*, 50–51.

**Some professional Jews have suggested** A recent study (Heilman, "1 in 6 American Jews") found that 17 percent of Jewish Americans were raised in a religion other than Judaism. This said, there is no data supporting the conclusion that this is the result of a conversion outreach plan of any kind.

**Contrary to the popular notion** Bernard J. Bamberger, *Proselytism in the Talmudic Period* (New York: Ktav Publishing House, 1939); Salo W. Baron, "Population," *Encyclopaedia Judaica*, vol. 13 (Jerusalem: Keter, 1971), 869; William G. Braude, *Jewish Proselytizing in the First Five Centuries of the Common Era, the Age of Tannaim and Amoraim* (Providence, RI: Brown University Press, 1940); Louis H. Feldman, "The Contribution of Professor Salo W. Baron to the Study of Ancient Jewish History: His Appraisal of Anti-Judaism and Proselytism," *AJS Review* 18, no. 1 (1993): 1–27.



**Some scholars point to the biblical Abraham** See Bamberger, *Proselytism*; Baron, “Population”; Braude, *Jewish Proselytizing*; M. Herbert Danzger, *Returning to Tradition: The Contemporary Revival of Orthodox Judaism* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1989); Lawrence J. Epstein, *Readings on Conversion to Judaism* (North Bergen, NJ: Jason Aronson, 1995); Feldman, “Contribution of Professor Salo W. Baron.”

**Whatever the case** On proselytism among Reform and Conservative Jews, see Lila Corwin Berman, “Mission to America: The Reform Movement’s Missionary Experiments, 1919–1960,” *Religion and American Culture: A Journal of Interpretation* 13, no. 2 (2003): 205–239; Danzger, *Returning to Tradition*, 80–81; Epstein, *Readings on Conversion to Judaism*.

Tobin quote and reference: Gary A. Tobin, “The Case for Proactive Conversion,” *Shm’a: A Journal of Jewish Ideas* 30, no. 565 (October 1999), <http://shma.com/1999/10/the-case-for-proactive-conversion>. See also idem, *Opening the Gates: How Proactive Conversion Can Revitalize the Jewish Community* (San Francisco: Jossey Bass, 1999); Review of *Opening the Gates*, Institute for Jewish and Community Research, [www.jewishresearch.org/Book-Gates.htm](http://www.jewishresearch.org/Book-Gates.htm).

**Among academics** Simon Rawidowicz, “Israel: The Ever-Dying People,” in *State of Israel, the Diaspora, and Jewish Continuity: Essays on the Ever-Dying People*, ed. Benjamin C. I. Ravid (Waltham, MA: Brandeis University Press, 1986), 53–54.

**Although this essay begins by underscoring** Rawidowicz, “Israel,” 62–63.

**Whereas Rawidowicz looks to the past** Referring to one of the founders of Future Studies, Fred Polak, David Passig adds that by concentrating on ideas in the present we can visualize a yet-to-come reality that is radically different from what we see before us: “These images transcend the present by providing detailed descriptions of ideal future worlds. Such images, although introduced by a creative minority, are eventually embraced by the masses, and then provide guidance and motivation for cultural innovation” (David Passig, “Teaching Future Jewish Life through a Cross-Generation Future-Oriented Curriculum,” *Religious Education* 95, no. 2 [2000]: 193). According to this understanding, the future is the nexus of a community’s expectations, rooted in their perception of the past and present, and their hopes, their radical ideals for what lies ahead.

**Perhaps the best way** Marshall Meyer is quoted in Peter S. Temes, *The Future of the Jewish People in Five Photographs* (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 2012), 45.

**Jews have been incredibly successful** Jonathan Sacks, *Future Tense: Jews, Judaism, and Israel in the Twenty-First Century* (New York: Schocken Books, 2009), 33.

**The twentieth-century Jewish genocide** Sacks, *Future Tense*, 59.

**Ultimately, the future of this community** Feinstein, *Jews and Judaism in the 21st Century*; Akiba J. Lerner, *Redemptive Hope: From the Age of Enlightenment to the Age of Obama* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2015); J. J. Lynx, ed.,

*The Future of the Jews: A Symposium* (London: Lindsay Drummond, 1945); David Sidorsky, ed., *The Future of the Jewish Community in America* (New York: Basic Books, 1973); Berel Wein, *Patterns in Jewish History: Insights into the Past, Present, and Future of the Eternal People* (Jerusalem: Maggid Books, 2011).

**As the renowned twentieth-century Yiddish writer** Isaac Bashevis Singer is quoted in Erica Brown and Misha Galperin, *The Case for Jewish Peoplehood: Can We Be One?* (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 2009), 39, in turn quoting Devorah Telushkin, *Master of Dreams* (New York: William Morrow, 1997), 96.

## Activities

### Introduction

Activity 4, *What Is “Jewish” Music?* I thank Oren Kroll-Zeldin for introducing me to this article.

### Chapter 1

Activity 1, *Race in the United States: “What Is ‘Blackness’? What Is ‘Whiteness’?”* Cornel West, *Keeping Faith: Philosophy and Race in America* (London: Routledge, 1993), 19, quoted in Melanie Kaye/Kantrowitz, *The Colors of Jews: Racial Politics and Radical Diasporism* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2007), 4.

James Baldwin, “On Being ‘White’ . . . and Other Lies,” *Essence*, April 1984, quoted in Kaye/Kantrowitz, *Colors of Jews*, 1.

Some of the suggested questions in this activity are taken almost verbatim from Maurianne Adams, Lee Anne Bell, and Pat Griffin, eds., *Teaching for Diversity and Social Justice*, 2nd ed. (New York: Routledge, 2007), 132. This book contains a number of other activities that are relevant for chapter 1 of *Judaisms*.

### Chapter 2

Activity 1, *What Does It Mean to Interpret a Text?* Newspaper article: [www.nbcnews.com/id/23244309/ns/us\\_news-weird\\_news/t/con-artists-use-fake-rip-girl-scouts/#.VkTyTKaT5NE](http://www.nbcnews.com/id/23244309/ns/us_news-weird_news/t/con-artists-use-fake-rip-girl-scouts/#.VkTyTKaT5NE).

Isaac Bashevis Singer reference: Sarah Blacher Cohen, “The Jewish Folk Drama of Isaac Bashevis Singer,” in *From Hester Street to Hollywood: The Jewish-American Stage and Screen*, ed. Sarah Blacher Cohen (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1983), 198. I thank Menachem Creditor for bringing this quote to my attention.

Activity 2, *PaRDeS Methods of Interpretation*. The four interpretations of the Garden of Eden narrative are from David A. Cooper, *God Is a Verb: Kabbalah and the Practice of Mystical Judaism* (New York: Riverhead Books, 1997), 42–44. For

another excellent example, in this case interpretations of Gen. 28:16, see Lawrence Kushner, *God Was in This Place and I, I Did Not Know* (Woodstock, VT: Jewish Lights Publishing, 1994).

Activity 5, *Gender and Representing God*. Mary Daly, *Beyond God the Father* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1973), quoted in *On Being a Jewish Feminist*, ed. Susannah Heschel (New York: Schocken, 1983), xxi; Judith Plaskow, *Standing Again at Sinai: Judaism from a Feminist Perspective* (New York: HarperOne, 1991), 121–123.

Activity 7, *What Does It Mean to Be Chosen?* First rabbinic passage: Gen. Rab. 83:5, in Hayim Nahman Bialik and Yehoshua Hana Ravnitzky, eds., *The Book of Legends: Legends from the Talmud and Midrash*, trans. William G. Braude (New York: Schocken Books, 1992), 337.

Second rabbinic passage: This is a widely known *midrash*. See, e.g., *Mekhilta d'Rabbi Shimon bar Yochai* 24:7, in Jill Jacobs, “Do First, Understand Later,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/do-first-understand-later/#](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/do-first-understand-later/#).

## Chapter 3

Activity 1, *A Sacred Classroom?* I thank Andrew Ramer for introducing this activity to me.

Activity 5, *Counting Time*. Dating of the biblical patriarchs to the twentieth through sixteenth centuries BCE: John H. Hayes and J. Maxwell Miller, eds., *Israelite and Judean History* (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1971), 95, 240–245.

## Chapter 4

Activity 2, *A Twentieth-Century Jewish Messiah?* Lamm is quoted in Sue Fishkoff, *The Rebbe's Army: Inside the World of Chabad-Lubavitch* (New York: Schocken Books, 2003), 263. Ezagui is quoted in “What Does the Concept of Messiah Mean Today?” *Moment Magazine*, March/April 2012, [www.momentmag.com/what-does-the-concept-of-the-messiah-mean-today](http://www.momentmag.com/what-does-the-concept-of-the-messiah-mean-today).

Activity 7, *The Messianic Paradox*. Franz Kafka, *Parables and Paradoxes* (New York: Schocken Books, 1971), 81, quoted in Elliot R. Wolfson, *Open Secret: Postmessianic Messianism and the Mystical Revision of Menahem Mendel Schneerson* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2009), 268.

Yeshayahu Leibowitz, “*Lishmah* and Not-*Lishmah*,” in Leibowitz, *Judaism, Human Values, and the Jewish State*, ed. Eliezer Goldman (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1992), 72.

Amos Oz, quoted in “What Does the Concept of Messiah Mean Today?” *Moment Magazine*, March/April 2012, 31, [www.momentmag.com/what-does-the-concept-of-the-messiah-mean-today](http://www.momentmag.com/what-does-the-concept-of-the-messiah-mean-today).

## Chapter 5

Activity 5, *The Rebellious Son*. The biblical passage is based on Jeffrey H. Tigay, trans., *The JPS Torah Commentary: Deuteronomy*, ed. Nahum M. Sarna (New York: Jewish Publication Society, 2003), 197.

My translation of the Talmudic passage is based on Adin Steinsaltz, ed. and trans., *The Talmud: Tractate Sanhedrin*, vol. 19, pt. 5 (New York: Random House, 1999), 32–36.

**Not only does the passage demonstrate the extent** Death penalty in Jewish law: Louis Jacobs, “The Death Penalty in Jewish Tradition,” [www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-death-penalty-in-jewish-tradition](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/the-death-penalty-in-jewish-tradition).

**When living under the Romans** Berachyahu Lifshitz, “The Age of the Talmud,” in *An Introduction to the History and Sources of Jewish Law*, ed. Neil S. Hecht, Bernard S. Jackson, Stephen M. Passamanek, Daniela Piattelli, and Alfredo Mordechai Rabello (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), 184–188; Alfredo Mordechai Rabello, “Jewish and Roman Jurisdiction,” *ibid.*, 141–167.

**Because Jews have been living as a minority** Many halakhic discussions are theoretical only: Lifshitz, “Age of Talmud,” 174; Peretz Segal, “Jewish Law during the Tannaitic Period,” in Hecht et al. (eds.), *Introduction to the History and Sources of Jewish Law*, 101–107.

Activity 7, *What Ambiguities Do These Midrashim Answer?* My translation of the midrash is based on Gerald Friedlander, ed. and trans., *Pirke De Rabbi Eliezer* (New York: Benjamin Blom, 1971), 156.

Activity 10, *Gender and Jewish Law*. Judith Plaskow, “The Right Is Theological,” in *The Coming of Lilith: Essays on Feminism, Judaism, and Sexual Ethics, 1972–2003*, ed. Judith Plaskow and Donna Berman (Boston: Beacon Press, 2005), 231–232.

Activity 11, *Assumptions and Jewish Beliefs*. Judith Plaskow, “Jewish Theology in Feminist Perspective,” in *Feminist Perspectives on Jewish Studies*, ed. Lynn Davidman and Shelly Tenenbaum (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1994), 64.

## Chapter 6

Activity 4, *A Contemporary Hasidic Interpretation*. See also Rami Shapiro, trans. and annot., *Hasidic Tales: Annotated and Explained* (Woodstock, VT: Skylight Paths and Jewish Lights, 2004), 3–6.

## Chapter 7

Activity 3, *Jewish “Norms” Regarding Gender and Sexuality*. Melanie Kaye/Kantrowitz, *The Colors of Jews: Racial Politics and Radical Diasporism* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2007), 25.

Activity 5, *December 25*. Origins of December 25 for Christmas: Donald R. Morse, “Mithraism and Christianity: How

are They Related?,” *Journal of Religion and Psychical Research* 22, no. 1 (Jan. 1999): 33–43; C. P. E. Nothhaft, “The Origins of the Christmas Date: Some Recent Trends in Historical Research,” *Church History* 81, no. 4 (December 2012): 903–911; Gail Corrington Streete, “Women as Sources of Redemption and Knowledge in Early Christian Traditions,” in *Women and Christian Origins*, ed. Ross Shepard Kraemer and Mary Rose D’Angelo (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999), 334.

Hanukkah’s rise in the United States in relation to Christmas: David Greenberg, “Christmas for the Jews,” *Slate*, December 16, 1998, [www.slate.com/articles/news\\_and\\_politics/history/lesson/1998/12/christmas\\_for\\_jews.html](http://www.slate.com/articles/news_and_politics/history/lesson/1998/12/christmas_for_jews.html). See also Jeffrey Schandler and Aviva Weintraub, “‘Santa, Shmanta’: Greeting Cards for the December Dilemma,” *Material Religion* 3, no. 3 (November 2007): 380–403.

## Chapter 9

Activity 5, *What Did a German Jew Look Like?* George Mosse, *Toward a Final Solution: A History of European Racism* (New York: Fertig, 1985), 92–99, cited in Melanie Kaye/Kantrowitz, *The Colors of Jews: Racial Politics and Radical Diasporism* (Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2007), 15–16.

Activity 6, *Defining “Cultural” and “Spiritual” Genocide*. Lemkin quote: John Docker, *Raphael Lemkin’s History of Genocide and Colonialism* (Washington, DC: United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, 2004), 3, cited in Dan Stone, “Raphael Lemkin on the Holocaust,” *Journal of Genocide Research* 7, no. 4 (2005): 549n.9.

## Chapter 10

Activity 2, *What Is Power?* Hannah Arendt on power’s connection to strength, force, authority, and violence: Arendt, “On Violence,” in *Crises of the Republic* (San Diego: Harvest/Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1972), 142–145.

Michel Foucault quote (“In a science like medicine . . .”): Foucault, *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972–1977*, ed. Colin Gordon (New York: Pantheon Books, 1980), 112.

Michel Foucault on truth and power: Foucault, “Truth and Power,” in *The Foucault Reader*, ed. Paul Rabinow (New York: Pantheon Books, 1984), 72–73.

Michel Foucault on truth and dominant narratives: Fou-

cault, *The Archaeology of Knowledge*, trans. A. M. Sheridan Smith (New York: Pantheon Books, 1972), 49, in Alison Leigh Brown, *On Foucault: A Critical Introduction* (Belmont, CA: Wadsworth, 2000), 30–31.

Hannah Arendt on authority: Arendt, “Authority in the Twentieth Century,” *Review of Politics* 18, no. 4 (October 1956): 406–416. See also Paulo Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (New York: Continuum, 2006); Abraham Joshua Heschel, *The Insecurity of Freedom* (New York: Schocken Books, 1987).

The different forms of power are delineated in Carolyn Schrock-Shenk, ed., *Mediation and Facilitation Training Manual*, 4th ed. (Akron, PA: Mennonite Conciliation Service, 2000), 80–81.

Activity 4, “*Freedom Fighters*” or “*Terrorists*”? For more on the Irgun, see Bruce Hoffman, “The Rationality of Terrorism and Other Forms of Political Violence: Lessons from the Jewish Campaign in Palestine, 1939–1947,” *Small Wars and Insurgencies* 22, no. 2 (2011): 258–272; Benny Morris, *Righteous Victims: A History of the Zionist-Arab Conflict, 1881–2001* (New York: Vintage Books, 2001); idem, *The Birth of the Palestinian Refugee Problem, 1947–1949* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989); Donald Neff, “Hamas: A Pale Image of the Jewish Irgun and Lehi Gangs,” *Washington Report on Middle East Affairs*, May/June 2006, 14–15, [www.wrmea.org/2006-may-june/hamas-a-pale-image-of-the-jewish-irgun-and-lehi-gangs.html](http://www.wrmea.org/2006-may-june/hamas-a-pale-image-of-the-jewish-irgun-and-lehi-gangs.html); Ami Pedahzur and Arie Perliger, *Jewish Terrorism in Israel* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2009). See also American-Israeli Cooperative Enterprise, “Ze’ev (Vladimir) Jabotinsky,” [www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/biography/jabotinsky.html](http://www.jewishvirtuallibrary.org/jsource/biography/jabotinsky.html); Jabotinsky Institute in Israel, [en.jabotinsky.org](http://en.jabotinsky.org). (Jabotinsky helped found the Irgun and was involved in both of the violent operations mentioned in this activity.)

For a piece on terrorism, see Scott Shane, “Words as Weapons: Dropping the ‘Terrorism’ Bomb,” *New York Times*, April 3, 2010, [www.nytimes.com/2010/04/04/weekinreview/04shane.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2010/04/04/weekinreview/04shane.html).

Activity 5, *Will the Israeli-Palestinian Conflict Go On Forever?* Ben-Gurion quote: In Tom Segev, *One Palestine Complete* (Boston: Little Brown, 2000), 116.

Activity 15, *Zionism and Jewish Nationalism*. Arik Ascherman quote: “Q&A: Rabbi Arik Ascherman,” Mission Catalyst, BMS World Mission, [www.bmsworldmission.org/engagecatalyst/mission-catalyst-israel-palestine/qa-rabbi-arik-ascherman](http://www.bmsworldmission.org/engagecatalyst/mission-catalyst-israel-palestine/qa-rabbi-arik-ascherman).